# **TEODOR MATEOC**

editor

\_\_\_\_\_

Cultural Texts and Contexts in the English

**Speaking World** 

(IV)

Teodor Mateoc editor

# CULTURAL TEXTS AND CONTEXTS IN THE ENGLISH SPEAKING WORLD (IV)



Editura Universității din Oradea 2015

#### **Editor: TEODOR MATEOC**

#### Editorial Board: IOANA CISTELECAN DAN NEGRUT GIULIA SUCIU EVA SZEKELY MĂDĂLINA PANTEA

#### **Advisory Board**

JOSE ANTONIO ALVAREZ AMOROS	University of Alicante, Spain
ANDREI AVRAM	University of Bucharest
ROGER CRAIK	University of Michigan, Ohio, USA
SILVIE CRINQUAND	University of Bourgogne, Dijon, France
SEAN DARMODY	Trinity College, Dublin, Ireland
ANDRZEJ DOROBEK	Instytut Neofilologii, Plock, Poland
STANISLAV KOLAR	University of Ostrava, Czech Republic
MIRCEA MIHĂIEȘ	Universitatea de Vest, Timișoara
VIRGIL STANCIU	Babeş-Bolyai University, Cluj Napoca
PAUL WILSON	University of Lodz, Poland
DANIELA FRANCESCA VIRDIS	University of Cagliari, Italy
INGRIDA ZINDZIUVIENE	Vytautas Magnus University, Kaunas,
	Lithuania

#### Publisher

The Department of English Language and Literature, Faculty of Letters University of Oradea

#### ISSN 2067-5348

## CONTENTS

#### Introduction

Cultural Texts and Contexts in the English Speaking World. What's in a Name? / 9

#### I. BRITISH AND COMMONWEALTH LITERATURE

Carmen-Narcisa Albert, 'Waterland' – The History Teacher-The Storyteller – Small Stories, Grand Stories / 19 Monica Busoiu, Aspects of the Ritual of Initiation in Alice Munro's Short Story A Red Dress / 35

*Elisabetta Marino*, Rejuvenating the Stage: 'The Descent of Liberty, a Mask' (1815) by Leigh Hunt / 45

*Titus Pop*, Transliterated Coinages in Amitav Ghosh's 'Ibis Trilogy' -A Text- mining Research / 53

Dan H. Popescu, Images of the Jews in Patrick Leigh Fermor's 'Between the Woods and the Water' / 61

*Eva Szekely*, W. B. Yeats: 'At the Hawk's Well': an Eastern Mythical Play / 71

*Ingrida Eglė Žindžiuvienė*, Restatement of Traumatic Experience in Victoria Hislop's Novel 'The Island' / 81

#### **II. AMERICAN LITERATURE**

Ioana Cistelecan, John Green, Simply Narrating Life, Romance and Cancer / 101

Andrzej Dorobek, Beatific or Beaten? Encounters with Nature from Transcendentalists to the Beats and Hippies / 109

*Amelia Precup,* The Manipulation of World-Building Conventions in Woody Allen's Short Fiction / 127

#### **III. CULTURAL STUDIES**

Sorin Ciutacu, Geoffrey Chaucer - the Astrolabe and the Arab Connection / 139

Peter Gaál-Szabó, Black Female Ethics and Subjectivity in the Black Church / 147

Valeria Palut, Gulliver Travels Well in the 21st Century, Thanks to Jack Black / 157

Delia Maria Radu, What's in a Name? or Defining Others through their Dietary Practices / 165

*Giulia Suciu,* Miss Representation of Women in Today's Romanian Mainstream Media / 173

Sonia Vass, "An Elegant Suicide is the Ultimate Work of Art".Symbolic Meanings of the Movie "Stay" / 179

# **IV. LANGUAGE STUDIES**

Ioana Alexandrescu, Octavio Cano Silva, 'Gringo' Words: On Anglicisms in Mexican Spanish / 187

Andrei A. Avram, Issues in the Identification of Varieties of English / 199

Claudia Leah, To Be Between Conventional and Unconventional / 219

Madalina Pantea, Translator as a Cultural Mediator / 225

Irina Stoica, THAT-omission - the View from Manner of Speaking Verbs / 233

Anca Tomoioaga, On Lexical Blends / 247

#### Introduction

## Cultural Texts and Contexts in the English Speaking World. What's in a Name?

At the end of March, 2015, the English Department of the Faculty of Letters at the University of Oradea held its fourth biennial conference on Anglophone Studies under the same generic title of *Cultural Texts and Contexts in the English Speaking World*.

More often than not, we tend to take titles for granted and only rarely do we stop to actually ponder on their actual meaning(s). What do we mean by cultural texts? Aren't all texts, including literary texts, cultural after all? To what extent do they reflect or surpass their temporal and geographical contexts? And how is that done: by subversion, distortion, projection or revisions? All these, more or less legitimate questions are being considered by all those working in the field of humanities whether we approach it from a literary or cultural perspective and their offshoots: gender, area, feminist, postcolonial or ethnic studies.

For some time now, it has become clear that Contemporary *Cultural Studies* must be taken as a particular critical discourse, different from previous discourses both in intention and methodology. First, because it displays a certain suspicion of theory, of general discussions that may be too distant from the actual cultural contexts. Secondly, it borrows from existing critical discourses and uses them for its specific purposes. As a result, it displays a variety of theoretical orientations and its method is inevitably interdisciplinary and eclectic. What has also been noticed is that literariness, the aesthetic or moral dimension of a work of fiction tends to be marginalized and only used as pretext to discuss relations of power, ideological affiliations, ethnic considerations or gender issues.

Long gone is the Arnoldian and Leavisite tradition according to which literature was the main form of expression of a given culture which was itself primarily defined in moral and aesthetic terms. The criticism of literature was therefore held to be a vehicle for an ethical critique of contemporary culture, for all genuine literature emerged as the cultural expression of an organic community seen as the repository of the finest human experience of the past, preserved and disseminated by an educated elite.

Gradually, such an elitist view came to be challenged by a more social definition of culture, seen by Raymond Williams as the complex set of expressions we all employ to make sense of experience: culture is always a particular way of life containing certain meanings and values best represented by a *structure of feeling*, i.e., the ways in which the ensemble of the values, beliefs and practices of a culture colours, as it were, the experience of its members. More than anywhere else, the structures of feeling are best embodied in literary texts which, however, are not a simple reflection of an already constituted external model, since they both reflect and build up the structure of feeling of their cultural contexts.

In time, Williams's *culturalism* was challenged by Stuart Hall and his *structuralism*. This new paradigm, rather than emphasizing human experience as the source of culture, stressed the ideological component as the ultimate influence of human praxis. Rather than makers of culture, we are its ideological products. Against culturalism's insistence on the holistic nature of culture based on human agency, structuralism emphasizes the role of differences. As for certain poststructuralist approaches, Hall's critique was that they exaggerated the notion of difference which led to extreme relativism and radical heterogeneity.

Avoiding both extremes, it was Richard Johnson in *What Is Cultural Studies Anyway*? who argued that the complex nature of culture require that its study remain interdisciplinary and pluralistic. As opposed to earlier culturalism, Johnson argued that Cultural Studies was, in general, concerned with the various forms in which subjectivity is (re) produced in the dynamics of culture. Following from here, he viewed culture as moving through a cycle of production/ textualization/ reception and appropriation. As for the text-based approaches, he considered that the usual practice of close-reading was too focused on texts as such, while neglecting their broader cultural relevance.

On the American scene, cultural criticism has always been, in the words of Alfred Kazin, "the great American philosophy", a kind of "histoire moral that sums up the spirit of the age in which we live and then ask us to transcend it".

Ever since the days of Thoreau and Emerson in the 19<sup>th</sup> century, the tradition of cultural criticism was carried on by thinkers from various fields of inquiry: cultural and political journalism (Walter Lippman); literary criticism (Alfred Kazin); sociology (David Reisman); cultural history (Richard Hofstadter, Christopher Lasch). As a result, cultural criticism is not just another intellectual discipline, but the basis for the general reevaluation of traditional values which must take place in every generation. Although it cannot be restricted to a single methodological approach, it can still be defined in loosely intellectual terms that also imply an ethical dimension. Lionel Trilling, too, believed that literary situations should be seen as cultural situations and cultural situations as great elaborate fights about moral issues. But he may well be a minority voice in defense of moral reflection in the analysis of culture. Most critical orientations, from the new Critics to the Poststructuralists, have evaded the moral imperatives of criticism. From Barthes to Derrida and Cioran, all literary and cultural products are marked by a radical skepticism that permeates any epistemological claim of the individual.

In the postmodern context that accommodates such assumptions, the genres of thought and discourse have become blurred and, consequently, what is at stake is not the *what* but the *how* of what we say. It is what Terry Eagleton meant when he remarked that, nowadays, "literary studies....are a question of the signifier, not of the signified".

Attempts to reconnect literature to values, art to morality were first made, in the modern era, by the new critics and then by a next generation of thinkers and writers (Edmund Wilson, Lionel Trilling, Kenneth Burke) who uphold Henry James' conviction that all great art performs a reconciliation of the aesthetic and the ethic. As for literature, it does this not so much by preserving the legacy of tradition, as by challenging its tenets and by suggesting how it might be revised. Such a critical orientation- carried on by Richard Poirier, Irving Howe or Philip Rahv- see literary criticism as a form of cultural criticism and cultural criticism as a branch of moral philosophy. Their humanism is grounded in the idea that our human potential cannot be defined only in relation to our circumstances, be they psychological (Sigmund Freud, Jacques Lacan, or historical (Michel Foucault), but only in relation to our efforts to surpass them through the power of imagination.

For all these critics, the role of imagination and of the moral will is essential: it makes clear that culture is tantamount to life's continuous re-evaluation of itself. It also points to the idea that there always remains a residual core of the self that resists the culture's pressures to cast it into socially desirable forms.

Such positions seeking to correlate the moral meaning of literary criticism with the possibility of achieving an imaginative transcendence of culture have come under attack from thinkers that have turned criticism into a 'science' concerned with the study of the grammars of discourse. The descentering technique of the poststructuralists subverts the cognitive pretensions of all cultural forms by exposing their false claims to epistemic and ontological privilege. In its extreme forms (the later Barthes, Derrida, Lacan) poststructuralism uses what Paul Ricoeur called the *hermeneutics of suspicion* to the point of turning disbelief into the only operative intellectual category and playful cynicism into the only viable critical stance. They represent a radically revisionist view of experience and turn to the linguistic dimension that, for them, constitute cultural experience.

But, as Hayden White shows in his *Tropics of Discourse*, language provides us with only a limited number of ways to make sense of experience, and these mental configurations are clearly figurative (he invokes Kenneth Burke's famous four tropes: metaphor, metonymy, synechdoche and irony). This means we can only make sense of experience through the mediation of constructions that are inevitably 'fictive'. The writer, must find the 'story' that would transform a mere chronicle of events into a narrative that makes use of one of the basic tropes and thus makes the story is credible and recognizable. In the extreme, the question is whether we can ever know the actual except by means of the imaginative or the fictive.

Similarly, our knowledge of other cultures depends not so much on our capacity to empathize with the subjective life of someone else, but as Geertz says, on the degree to which we understand the symbolic forms in which they represent themselves. (Clifford Geertz, *On the Nature of Anthropological Understanding*). Hence, the knowledge of other minds and cultures is acquired by way of a dialectic between the general form of a culture and the specific representations in which it is embodied.

The only way of coming to terms with cultural particularities lies in the exercise of 'the moral imagination', a fundamental notion for Geertz's theory of culture. He finds fault both with the New Critics' notion of the self-interpreting text and with the poststructuralists' idea of the self-deconstructing text. For, if the text is so distinctive, how can it be known at all if it is so unique; similarly, if it is indeterminate, how can it be deconstructed if it is self-elusive in the first place. His own view of culture is semiotic, i.e., that of an imaginative world in which acts are constantly translated into signs so that humans can attach a meaning to things that is not inherent in them. By bringing selected experiences into focus, cultural and aesthetic forms become what Aristotle called the recurrent or universal human event. The result is an enhancement of understanding through dialogical encounter. Such a conversation is important because man cannot reach its full potential without interacting with different and sometimes conflicting symbolic constructions of other individuals trying to make sense of their own experiences.

Therefore, the interpretive role of humanistic studies is to deepen understanding of the relationship between consciousness and otherness by creating frameworks, or 'templates' that make their dialogue possible.

The various contributions made to this edition of our conference are grouped into four sections and focused on three areas of research: literature (British and American), cultural studies and linguistics. The *British and Commonwealth Literature* section displays an interesting variety of genres: novels, short fiction, theatre or travel writing. Graham Swift's modern 'classic', "Waterland" introduces the reader into "a realm of in-betweenness" weaving personal history into "objective history" so as to illustrate the concept of "mind relevance" (N. Albert).

Victoria Hislop's *The Island*, "demonstrates distinct features of the trauma novel" while dealing specifically with "the theme of identity" and that of "transition". The use of "fundamental issues of the narrative theory" highlight "the analysis of the role of the site of trauma in the novel". (I. Zindziuviene)

The short story discussed in M. Busoiu's article is illustrative of wide-spread cultural practices: "puber rites mark not only the biological changes... but also the socio-cultural changes" preparing the individuals for "the new social roles that they have to play in the life of the....community".

An early 18<sup>th</sup> century theatrical allegory, or 'masque' is the topic is E.Marino's article. The author believes that Leigh Hunt's 'The Descent of Liberty' "should be actually acknowledged as one of the first, noteworthy steps the so-called "Hunt-circle" took towards the fulfilment of the.... project of communal regeneration and reform".

Also concerned with drama is E. Szekely's article on one of Yeats's plays which curiously brings together both Gaelic mythology and "the highly stylized Japanese Noh drama"

One article in the *American Literature* section revisits an old and constant preoccupation of its author with unorthodox and subversive texts and writers that have always challenged mainstream culture and literary assumptions by expanding the limits of the human and by redefining its relation to what lies outside it. Here, the relation between man and nature is traced down from the first encounters in the 17<sup>th</sup> century, to the Beat literature, "presented both as an attempt at the restoring of the transcendentalist concept of divine harmony between man and nature and as an example of the writers being alienated in the 'disenchanted world' of the mid-20<sup>th</sup> century America". (A. Dorobek).

What can be more far apart than cancer and romance? By looking at the way in which a contemporary writer deals with the topic, I. Cistelecan argues that in this narrative, which would belong to the genre of the so-called young adult novel, sickness and terminal suffering or death paradoxically make possible "extra-ordinary lives" and "incredible love stories". Such novels "do not designate the paradigm of the outcast" but are, ultimately, "about humanity, its simplicity and its charm".

A. Precup's analysis of Woody Allen's short fiction is sustained on the idea that, "his world building strategies represent both a disruption and a continuation of the techniques of modernist narrative." The humour underlying "the dialectic of connection and separation" allows for "the displacement of the real and the perverting of experience" and could be seen as performing "a critical revision of reality".

Two of the six articles in *Cultural Studies* deal with the relation between fiction and the movies: the film version of 'Gulliver's Travels' is used to "discuss the relation between high and low culture using Umberto Eco's 'Travels in Hyper-reality'" (V. Palut), while S. Vass aims to do justice to what she considers to be an "underrated" Marc Forster movie by "unveiling its psychological depths and penetrating symbolic imagery".

Feminist or gender issues are central to G. Suciu's article. She thinks women are misrepresented in the Romanian mainstream media which only serves at "reinforcing dominant ideas about masculinity and femininity". P. Gaal-Szabo reaches a similar conclusion although the context is totally different: despite the progress made in what concerns " the roles of women in the black church and in the broader community....they still remain in adjacent positions most of the time".

The unlikely connection between Geoffrey Chaucer and the Arab world is discussed by S. Ciutacu; the use of a navigation instrument, the astrolabe, he argues, "throws up clues regarding the outlook on Cosmos displayed by the medieval mind". The last article in the section comments on the issue of otherness by discussing dietary practices, labeling and stereotyping as means "to identify (and usually disconsider and marginalize) certain groups, not only in everyday life, but also in fiction and films" (D. Radu).

Language Studies: faithful to the tradition of having two key-note speakers at our conference, a literature person and a linguist, this time we all benefited from the presence of the reputed professor Andrei Avram from the University of Bucharest who challenged us with new "issues in the identification of varieties of English". I do not know whether we are all the wiser now, but we certainly appreciated his academic, thoroughly documented and convincing presentation: a "critical examination of the relevance of the various criteria and classifications proposed in the literature to the study of the speech forms that are frequently lumped together under the name 'varieties of English', with a focus on the socalled 'New Englishes' and on English-lexifier pidgins and creoles".

The other articles in the *Language Studies* section show how focused and dedicated their authors are to issues pertaining to the field of English linguistics: I. Stoica discusses a class of verbs which we all thought we knew but which, henceforth, we'll also know as "manner of speaking verbs" which "do not generally allow the omission of the complementizer of their clausal complement". For, as C. Leah reminds

us, English grammar "is conventional, normative and restricted to rules, patterns, structures" and, consequently, accuracy should always be on a par with fluency.

"A marginal lexical phenomenon" is the concern of A. Tomoioaga's study, but the author should not be excessively modest, since the presence of lexical blends, portmanteau words or telescoped words in English are increasingly present "in various domains such as marketing, entertainment, media, and advertising". Such linguistic constructs are important because they "express not only human creativity and spontaneity, but also the contemporary human need for extending the limits of language as much as to make it able to express the inexpressible"

The translatability of texts in general and the role of the translator as "cultural mediator" is the topic of M. Pantea's article whose conclusion is that "cultural implications for translation" are various, "ranging from lexical content and syntax to ideologies and ways of life in a given culture".Linked to the above is I. Alexandrescu and Octavio Cano Silva's article dealing with lexical Anglicisms in Mexican Spain.

#### **Teodor Mateoc**

# BRITISH AND COMMONWEALTH LITERATURE

# *Waterland* – The History Teacher The Storyteller – Small Stories, Grand Stories

#### **Carmen-Narcisa Albert**

Colegiul Tehnic de Comunicații "Augustin Maior" Cluj-Napoca

**Abstract**: Waterland represents a storyworld that engrosses the reader into a realm of in-betweenness, recording the self-exposure of a history teacher on the verge of collapsing into an identity crisis, a crisis similar to any major historical crisis, only that it dwells in the private domain of a single individual that is dismissed from his job as a history teacher, but also from his self-assumed identity as a history teacher, being thus denied further existence under a life-time constructed identity.

Key words: storyworld, relationship, perspective, existence

Out of all Swiftean novels, *Waterland* (1983) is also the one that directly focuses on the intimate identity and ontological relationship between the storytelling subject and the story or stories that are being told. To be more exact, the protagonist of this particular story world, Tom Crick emerges as a result of conflicting and complementary stories, be they real or fictional, belonging either to the supposedly objective history or to the imaginative side of the human consciousness. Furthermore, this novel fully and practically displays the concept elaborated on by David Herman, namely that of *mind relevance*(Herman): for Tom Crick telling stories is nothing less than existing, accumulating and storing life, experientiality (Fludernik) in little or larger narrative fragments, weaving an intricate network in which each story is connected with the others, the types of relationship varying.

Furthermore, acting and storytelling are, apparently, rather in the teller mode (Alber, Fludernik) than in the reflector mode. From this point of view, Tom Crick's consciousness represents a filter not only of his private existence, but also, seemingly, of the entire humankind history, the latter quality being conferred to him by his status of history teacher. However, the teller mode of rendering stories (disregarding their nature) is just a surface one, mostly instantiating Tom into the narrator role. But

all these fragments of lived life are just multiple facets of a general, grand history that is gradually and asymptomatically individualized by Tom, revealing, in fact, a deep reflector mode, exhibiting a unique self– perspective aspect: the protagonist grasps his own socially and historically situated identity rather from an external, explicative, history– like objective point of view. In order to understand himself as a human being in its own right and as a human being belonging to a community and to its history, Tom distances himself from the "here(s) and now(s)" of his own life to the "there(s) and then(s)" of the story. And this idea moulds perfectly on what Duchan explains under the "deictic shift theory" (Duchan).

What is more, from this standpoint, the novel is constructed on the principle of *mise en abyme*, catering for two ontological levels: on the one hand, Duchan confers it the status of reality within the actual encyclopedia (Doležel), while Tom Crick inserts it in the fictional encyclopedia and, subsequently in its corresponding internal encyclopedia, arguing its legitimacy through the numerous stories he embarks upon recounting.

My earliest acquaintance with history was thus, in a form issuing from my mother's lips, inseparable from her other bedtime makebelieve – how Alfred burnt the cakes, how Canute commanded the waves, how King Charles hid in an oak tree – as if history were a pleasing invention. And even as a schoolboy, when introduced to history as an object of Study, when nursing indeed an unfledged lifetime's passion, it was still the fabulous idea of history that lured me, and I believed, perhaps like you, that history was a myth. Until a series of encounters with the Here and Now gave a sudden urgency to my studies. Until the Here and Now, gripping me by the arm, slapping my face and telling me to take a good look at the mess I was in, informed me that history was no invention but indeed existed – and I had become a part of it. (Swift 1984: 53)

Moreover, Tom's identity as a storyteller is externally caused, his present condition being induced, as the reader later finds out, by his mother's death (the death of the main element that kept their family united). In addition, she was also the coherent storyteller figure that assured the continuity of past events, being configured as the source of past, both personal and general, drained into present. And it is exactly this role that Tom assumes after his mother's death, trying to keep history alive, trying to keep him alive (by continuing his mother's stories about their family history).

Thus, using the same technique of gapped informational display of the story world (both on the concrete level of the accounted for contents and on the abstract level of the causal connections of inner and external events and states), Graham Swifts invests in Tom the traits of a vessel allowing other existences, past ones, to emerge into present. And these selves are experienced as internalized aspects of Tom's own identity, ranging from historical figures such as Napoleon to more closely related figures such as those of the Cricks (Jacob Cricke, James and Samuel Cricke, Francis, George and Henry, Tom's father) and the Atkinsons (Josiah, Thomas and Sarah, George and Alfred, Ernest, Helen, Tom and Dick's mother), his ancestors symbolizing two irreconcilable natural forces, water and, respectively, land.

Therefore, Tom appears to be another *mise en abyme* figure, reiterating in the present the same contradictory ontological principle at work with his forefathers, continuing the shifting, reclaiming movement that shaped their life and, also the water land of the Fens (thus, local as well as national topography and history): water reclaiming stolen territories, land taking them back; the grand narrative recuperating its constitutive small stories into a unifying perspective, small stories striving for themselves, for being individually assigned and appropriated by each individual; Tom craving for a coherent storyline just to be able to make sense of his private story and, what is more, he does so while "mouthing" autonomous narratives, already-experienced fragments, struggling though for explanations.

Nevertheless, there is an interesting interplay of grand and small histories, creating a reversible relational network. Thus, grand history is restrained to one comprehensive and explicative consciousness, but, simultaneously, that single subjectivity expands and defines itself by relating to the grand, external history, often instantiated in local fragments of history, in this case that of the Fens –

A chance to get on with that book of yours – what was it now? – A *History of the Fens*?"" (Swift 1984: 5); "So forget, indeed, your revolutions, your turning-points, your grand metamorphoses of history. Consider, instead, the slow and arduous process, the interminable and ambiguous process – the process of human siltation – of land reclamation. (Swift 1984: 8)

As a matter of fact, Tom embodies the human agent that tailors his identity and self according to a tensed relation between grand and small narratives or history/ histories. And although all Swiftean characters are caught in this relational net, Tom is the one that is directly, constantly and predominantly 'poured' into it, asking for explanations, demanding an answer form history, an answer that should order his life, setting it on a graspable, meaningful direction.

Dealing with this double reversibility, the world inhabited by the homodiegetic actor-narrator Tom Crick is put under the sign of constant shift, acquiring a certain flexibility that belongs neither to the stable ground or land nor to the ever mobile water. Hence, the sense of inbetweenness of belonging, of identity that Tom experiences all through his life.

From a structural point of view, this story world is the first one that is ordered by titles given to each chapter, titles that create a story of their own and that confer a sense of ordered history and events, inducing a fake impression of historicity and of classical narrative flow.

Firstly, being the son of a lock-keeper guarding the sluice and thus preventing any possible damage by water, but also the son of a father skilled in telling stories of any kind, Tom Crick chooses a jolting narrative movement in recounting his own past, offering only glimpses of his present, also combining them with fragments of the history of the Fens, inheriting, this time, his father's gift and capturing the listener with a voracious need for storytelling –

For my father, as well as being a superstitious man, had a knack for telling stories. Made-up stories, true stories; soothing stories, warning stories; stories with a moral or with no point at all; believable stories and unbelievable stories; stories which were neither one thing nor the other. It was a knack which ran in his family. But it was a knack which my mother had too - [...] Because when I was very small it was my mother who first told me stories, which, unlike my father, she got from books as well as out of her head, to make me sleep at night." (Swift 1984: 1-2)

Thus, even from his early childhood, Tom has been exposed to the gesture of storytelling, a gesture that has its very own deeply rooted identity marks, a gesture that was issues from a double perspective, both the mother's and the father's, a gesture that unveils events with different statuses – real, unreal, allegoric, non-allegoric, conveying a certain message, fantastic, plausible, absurd or coherent. Building up his childhood identity, the exposure to a double perspective on narrating and on the inner and outer realities allowed Tom to develop a heightened sense of apprehension and comprehension of himself, as well as of his realities (disregarding their nature, concrete or abstract).

Moreover, his world became so imbued with stories that a symbiotic relationship arose between his own self and the need of narrating it under various forms, as internalized or externalized stances, expanding itself outside the borders of the subjectivity containing it. It is, as a matter a fact, a fully embedded self, with an intricate sense of identity, including in its other selves, past or present, real, fictional or fictitious and, at the same time, being included in them too.

From another point of view, while recounting a story of lost innocence (life confronted with death), namely the story of Freddie Parr whose body was found in the lock of Ouse, Tom brings forth a loss of identity too. Thus, if he himself is faced for the first time with the bare, simple, yet irreversible fact of death, with Freddie's lifeless body – his mother's death was only conceptually perceived, and not physically too –, Tom tries to revive the old status of his forefathers, not by reclaiming land out of the waters of Ouse, but by conveying life back to Freddie; still, his desperate attempt fails– "For when a body floats into a lock kept by a lock-keeper of my father's disposition, it is not an accident but a curse. [...] But whereas they reclaimed land, my father could not reclaim a life ..." (Swift 1984: 27)

Secondly, being a history teacher, Tom Crick adopts the innate tone of history teaching, recounting grand events, as well as small, local events to any listener or pupil he may have. What is more, he also launches, for those who are able to follow his train of thought, the challenge of theorizing history and philosophizing on its status, contents, form and end, mingling into it bits of personal history that add up to a dispersed image of himself and of his own experiences – "Children. Children, who will inherit that world." (Swift 1984: 4)

In recreating the history of the Fens, Tom applies a historical frame that is not an objective one, focused on bare facts and years, neutrally recording events and establishing dispirited relations of the cause-effect type, but a frame that is fully subjective, his own consciousness, as formatted by his childhood stories, acting as a filter, centered on personal histories, on the characters that helped create the region of the Fens, on those that fought water and stole land out of it, engaging in a constant, permanent struggle to keep the gained land and to use it properly – "For the chief fact about the Fens is that they are reclaimed land, land that was once water, and which, even today, is not quite solid." (Swift 1984: 7); "The problem of the Fens has always been the problem of drainage." (Swift 1984: 8)

In addition, Tom can be also considered the image resulting from the common traits shared by the people inhabiting the Fens quite from its beginning, descending from the Cricks that first took the task of reclaiming the silt from the waters (during the reign of Charles the First). Therefore, writing or re-writing the history of the Fens through writing or re-writing the individual histories of those who created is Tom's way of ascertaining his own ancestors, of reconnecting with his past up to its initial point of origin. Along this process, he also re-invents himself, generating a new self to replace the dismissed history teacher with no place to belong to in the new order of things, in the new era of living and experiencing. This new self, although it is not so much thematically different from the old one (there are the same ontological experiences to be accounted for), is entirely framed by the narrative comprehensive and self-comprehensive gesture, veiling their experiences with its narrated, hence subjective counterpart.

I am speaking of my ancestors, of my father's forefathers. [...] My ancestors were water people." (Swift 1984: 9); "They ceased to be water people and became land people; [...] They joined in the destiny of the Fens, which was to strive not for but against water. [...] Or perhaps they did not cease to be water people. Perhaps they became amphibians. [...] When you work with water, you have to know and respect it. When you labour to subdue it, you have to understand that one day it may rise up and turn all your labours to nothing. For what is water, children, which seeks to make all things level, which has no taste or colour of its own, but a liquid form of Nothing. (Swift 1984: 11)

Discussing the other branch of Tom's ancestors (the maternal ones), namely the Atkinsons, (the opposite of the Cricks), originating from Norfolk, one discovers that they represent the long-lasting tradition of the farmers and maltsters (though they are spoken of as having been originally Fenmen who migrated and settled in Norfolk). Moreover, they also stand for technology, innovation and market exchanges, economically and geographically transforming not only their land, but also the map of their surroundings, expanding themselves and financially conquering new land.

Thus, if the Cricks are water people who eventually become land people or, rather, amphibian people, the Atkinsons are definitely land people, not extracting land out of water, but conquering land by economic means and by subduing both water and land. As a matter of fact, the Atkinsons ultimately subject people to their own ends.

Continuing the comparison between the two branches of Tom's ancestors, the first official mention of the Cricks, namely of James and Samuel Cricke, appears in the wage records of 1748 and it is related to the reconstruction of the Denver Sluice on the Ouse River, whereas the Atkinson family, more exactly Thomas Atkinson is mentioned only in the 1780s records as initiating a navigation project on the Leem River which flows westwards and meets the Ouse River, thus allowing the free and rapid transportation of his own products to the market of the Fens – "One of them is called Atkinson. He is not a Fenman. [...] But, in 1780s, for

reasons both self-interested and public-spirited, he forms the plan of opening up for navigation the River Leem, as a means of transport for his produce between Norfolk and the expanding market of the Fens." (Swift 1984: 13)

Nevertheless, Atkinson's project has another important effect, at least concerning the Cricks. By offering well-paid jobs, he indirectly produces a split into the Cricke family – while Jacob remains behind, in the Fens, the others navigate up the Ouse into Norfolk to work for the Atkinsons; at this point another split occurs though, and some of the nomadic Cricks go north (at Eau Brink Cut), others go south in the village of Apton to be recruited by Thomas's agents –

And the Cricks come to work for Atkinson. They make their great journey across the Ouse, leaving old Jacob at his solitary outpost; [...] And that is how, children, my ancestors came to live by the River Leem. That is how when the cauldron of revolution was simmering in Paris, so that you, one day, should have a subject for your lessons, they were busy, as usual, with their scouring, pumping and embanking. That is how, when foundations were being rocked in France, a land was being formed which would one day yield fifteen tons of potatoes or nineteen sacks of wheat an acre and on which your history teacher-to-be would one day have his home. It was Atkinson who put Francis Crick in charge of the new steam-pump on Stott's Drain. When I was a boy a pump still worked on Stott's Drain –" (Swift 1984: 14)

However, the last and the most important differentiating thread between the two families is related to the most important aspect of one's identity. be it individual or collective: pragmatic actions and recounting actions, more precisely facts, events and, respectively their recording, or, differently put, history making and storytelling it in a make-belief frame. If the Atkinsons were fully involved into making history, the Cricks survived history by narratively exposing it, both strategies ensuring them an ever-growing genealogic tree throughout time itself - "How did the Cricks outwit reality? By telling stories. Down to the last generation, they were not only phlegmatic but superstitious and credulous creatures. Suckers for stories, while the Atkinsons made history, the Cricks spun yarns." (Swift 1984: 15) This is also one of the main reasons for which Tom's inner eyes filter his realities (inner and outer, past and present) through the prism of stories, allowing himself only short glimpses of reality, glimpses that mostly act as nods around which new stories can be spun, but also as intricate knowledge to apprehend – "Superstition's easy, children; to know what's real – that's hard." (Swift 1984: 50)

It is, nevertheless, interesting to notice that when the waters return, between 1916 and 1918 (simultaneously with the second part of the First World War), George and Henry Crick are summoned to help fight them back "to be fitted out with uniforms and equipped with rifles." (Swift 1984: 16), a fight that drains Henry out of life, or rather out of the narrative substance he is made of. For him, there are, at least apparently, no stories left to tell –

He is sent to a home for chronic neurasthenics. He thinks: there is only reality, there are no stories left. About his war experience he says: "I remember nothing." [...] But much will happen to Henry Crick. He recovers. He meets his future wife – there indeed is another story. In 1922 he marries. [...] But in 1922 my father is appointed keeper of the New Atkinson Lock. (Swift 1984: 17)

#### **Theorizing History**

There is, however, another part of Tom-the history teacher, other than the applied one (in narrating the Fens), namely the theorizing part, spread throughout the narrative world as figments of a certain personal philosophy of history, both individual and inductive. Being fired from his own professional position on the ground that a history teacher is no longer necessary, as well as on the ground that History itself will merge, as a subject, with General Studies, Tom Crick resorts to teaching history altogether differently, insisting on its local, private aspects, but, at the same time, indulging in comparison with the events of the grand history.

Thus, one of the facets history embraces for Tom is that of a garment of the same substance, of a veil into which he cloaks his being in order to face the world, his world, a garment that can be easily discarded, at least formally, but also torn apart by the intense emotional insertions of the now into its weaving – "I have not brought history with me this evening (history is a thin garment, easily punctured by a knife blade called Now). I have brought my fear." (Swift 1984: 31)

Furthermore, there is also an inevitable approach of the relationship between history, that is, the actively recorded history, and reality, namely the passively recorded reality. Only that, for Tom, these two aspects are complementary, yet antinomic, one couldn't be brought into existence without the other. And, if reality presents itself as a vast canvas, flat, monotonous, neutral and voided of any trace of eventfulness, history is the sheer result of the human consciousness impinging itself into reality, applying its need for diversity and for eventfulness from the

standpoint of an intricate subjectivity in need of self-exposure and self-representation. History is the effect of the human being painting himself/ herself on the canvas of reality with subjective hands, paints, brushes and colours. In doing so, it pours reality into individual moulds that come to a blending point when they interact–

Reality is uneventfulness, vacancy, flatness. Reality is that nothing happens. How many of the events of history have occurred, ask yourselves, for this and for that reason, but for no other reason, fundamentally, than the desire to make things happen? I present to you History, the fabrication, the diversion, the reality-obscuring drama. History, and its near relative, Histrionics...(Swift 1984: 34)

As any teacher would do and as any human being following a certain instinct of surviving and surpassing death would do, Tom Crick chooses one of his students to be the main recipient for his own molding of the empty vessel of reality into a vessel of stories about the Fens. Price, the chosen student is, unlike the story-anchored teacher, living in the vivid flow of events happening, siding with the rebellious aspects of life, actively pushing reality into eventfulness – "prompted as he was by the challenging remarks of a student called Price, ceased to teach history and started to offer you, instead, these fantastic-but-true, these believe-it-ornot-but-it-happened Tales of the Fens." (Swift 1984: 35)

The counterpoint of Tom's specific past ontology, Price is a creature living in the present, impregnated with the spirit of now, of direct and immediate experience of life, existing outside explanations and rejecting Tom's accounts of the past. Moreover, Price is the one that is a constant reminder of the pragmatic aspects of history, always, inquisitively inquiring about the meaning of history, the same repetitive question arising: why? –

Because explaining's a way of avoiding the facts while you pretend to get near to them."" (Swift 1984: 145); "And when you ask, as all history classes ask, as all history classes should ask, What is the point of history?" (Swift 1984: 92); "Your thesis – am I right? – is that history, as such, is a red-herring; the past is irrelevant. The present alone is vital." (Swift 1984: 143); ""I want a future" [...] "And you – you can stuff your past!"" (Swift 1984: 123); ""You know what your trouble is, sir? You're hooked on explanation. Explain, explain. Everything's got to have an explanation."" (Swift 1984: 145)

Nevertheless, Tom is so much identity-centered on stories and storytelling that, even though he recognizes the truth in Price's words, his symbiotic

relationship with these elements does not allow him to existentially step outside them. And, in an indirect, partially anonymous self-definition, created according to the social label attached to him (a label to which he fully and comfortably offers subjective contents), Tom admits that, instead of completely enjoying life he rather analyzes it, emphasizing a formulaic redundancy of errors (in thinking, in acting, in feeling, in judging): "What is a history teacher? He's someone who teaches mistakes. While others say, Here's how to do it, he says, And here's what goes wrong." (Swift 1984: 203)

Furthermore, extending the degree of generalization of the above mentioned definition (of the history teacher and, implicitly of himself). Tom also offers a wide, somehow Aristotelian definition of man, signaling its distinguishable, unique inner quality of storytelling. But, above all these, the human being has developed an individualized ability of using these stories as landmarks for measuring time and space, for comprising and accounting for changes (be they subjective or objective, internal or external, general or particular). In addition, they became tools for knowing one's own self, each human being transforming them into "immersions into consciousness"(Herman) and, simultaneously, into "potions [...], meanings, myths, manias" (Swift 1984: 35) that are solely meant to populate the individual's surrounding reality (or realities) with interconnected, tangential lives, generating ontological interstices, identities and stories to be ingested, internalized. The sense of intermental identity (Palmer 2004) and community clearly emerges as a result of these psychological and physical aspects, filling in the "empty but fillable vessel" (Swift 1984: 35) of reality. It gradually becomes clear that Tom delves into storytelling in order to escape the fear that the world he is inhabiting is just an illusion - telling stories represents his manner of surviving and of being remembered, of marking his individual presence into the others' consciousness.

Children, only animals live entirely in the Here and Now. Only nature knows neither memory nor history. Man – let me offer you a definition – is the story-telling animal. Wherever he goes he wants to leave behind not a chaotic wake, not an empty space, but the comforting marker-buoys and trail-signs of stories. He has to go on telling stories. He has to keep on making them up. As long as there's a story, it's all right." (Swift 1984: 53); "It's all a struggle to make things not seem meaningless. It's all a fight against fear. [...] and what do you think all these stories are for [...]. I don't care what you call it – explaining, evading the facts, making up meanings, taking a larger perspective, dodging the here and now, education, history, fairy-tales – it helps eliminate fear. (Swift 1984: 208) In defining reality as moments of the now, moments which the subjective individual comes to comprehend in backward movements, Tom deals not only with the nature of storytelling, with its absence from the now of everybody's existence, but also with its overwhelming presence in every past and future aspect, outlining a particular sense of identity coherence of every consciousness. Simultaneously, it seems to be as difficult to define the ontological now as it is difficult to define its corresponding reality or realities, its fleeting quality being graspable only in captures of the memory – "But what is this much-adduced Here and Now? What is this indefinable zone between what is past and what is to come, this free and airy present tense in which we are always longing to take flight into the boundless future?" (Swift 1984: 51)

Furthermore, if history has a fixed, unchangeable quality, the "here and now" represents, once again, an empty locus to be filled in by the human being, creating room for the pure experience, outside cognition, but deeply rooted in emotion, behind any conceivable inner gesture of comprehension; in fact, the "here and now" of existence is as ethereal as it can be and one can draw his/ her identity substance out of the quality of his/ her memory of past and projected experiences – "life includes a lot of empty space. We are one-tenth living tissue, nine-tenths water; life is one-tenth Here and Now, nine-tenths a history lesson. For most of the time the Here and Now is neither now nor here." (Swift 1984: 52)

Nevertheless, if filling the empty space of reality with external gestures and events, that is, with history, represents one way of creating existence, there is one more way of living one's reality and transforming it into a pulsating entity, namely storytelling which confers not only a coherence of one's own, but also a counter punctual, fictional perspective on life, balancing the external by means of internal, by means of inner actions, cognitions, feelings, *etc.* that manifest themselves on the realm of stories, bound by no strict rules or borders –

I believed, perhaps like you, that history was a myth. Until a series of encounters with the Here and Now gave a sudden urgency to my studies. Until the Here and Now, gripping me by the arm, slapping my face and telling me to take a good look at the mess I was in, informed me that history was no invention but indeed existed – and I had become part of it. [...] So I began to demand of history an Explanation. [...] that history is a yarn. [...] But man – let me offer you a definition – is the story-telling animal. [...] He has to go on telling stories. He has to keep on making them up. As long as there's a story, it's all right." (Swift 1984: 53); "There are those who fashion history and those who contemplate it; there are those who make things happen and those who ask why."(Swift 1984: 173)

Immersed in the continuous act of storytelling history, Tom Crick keeps sustaining himself alive by constantly pouring down fragments from both the separate and combined stories/ histories of the Cricks and of the Atkinsons, of the Ouse, Leem and the Fens, of the conquerors and of the conquered, of those who subdue and of those who are subdued, of winners and losers, of instantiating moments giving significance to every emerging identity and, ultimately to Tom's own identity. These moments are not the concern of any great history, but, nonetheless, they imitate, on a smaller scale, the moments of the great history – "the only reason why the Atkinsons built that asylum was to put their mother in it, because they wanted to take away our saintly, blameless Sarah and lock her up in a cage for cretins," (Swift 1984: 82); "The Cricks – my father's grandfather and his brethren – are spitting into the mud and saying to themselves there is work to be done." (Swift 1984: 84)

In addition, when asking history for explanations, Tom, lapsing once again in one of his theorizing moods, asserts that the question "why?" has the status of initial input for history, or rather that it stirs the human being into becoming aware of creating history through the means offered by storytelling and memory combined. Moreover, as in any simple binary system, this awareness is made visible only when contrasted with its complementary opposite. Thus, history is acknowledged only when life turns significantly and eventfully negative -"History begins only at the point where things go wrong; history is born only with trouble, with perplexity, with regret." (Swift 1984: 92) -, a turn marked invariably by its corresponding why? which requires clear-cut, viable explanations, answers that should bring forth coherence and order to events otherwise chaotic. Nevertheless, these answers only lead one's consciousness deeper into the realm of stories, further away from reality and event proper. With every explanation demanded of history, there comes a story, and, with it, another story until the web they create is submersed irremediably into thick layers of subjective filters, until great history descends into small history, until a king is no more than a person.

I taught you that by for ever attempting to explain we may come, not to an Explanation, but to a knowledge of the limits of our power to explain. Yes, yes, the past gets in the way; it trips us up, bogs us down; it complicates, makes difficult. But to ignore this is folly, because, above all, what history teaches us is to avoid illusion and make-believe, to lay aside dreams, moonshine, cure-alls, wonderworkings, pie-in-the-sky – to be realistic." (Swift 1984: 94); "Because explaining's a way of avoiding the facts while you pretend to get near them -" (Swift 1984: 145)

One more principle of self-definition, as well as of a general definition of the human kind is unveiled by the subjective attitude of curiosity, of inquiry and discovery. According to Palmer, mind is the originator of external realities (Palmer 2004) and what Tom Crick states is that the vivid human spirit, characterized by curiosity is always encountered by either the nature' s or the history's answers; life and its conscious bearers emerge out of their reunion: "Children, be curious. Nothing is worse (I know it) than when curiosity stops. Nothing is more repressive than the repression of curiosity. Curiosity begets love. It weds us to the world." (Swift 1984: 178)

Another trait that history seems to acquire, in Tom's view, is that of flexibility, of bouncing borders, of disorder, looping both backwards and forwards, fitting different patterns, in fact as many patterns as the number of subjects containing and perceiving them. Thus, history discards its objective, chronological display, its neatly traced cause-effect relationships, and puts on the human frame of recording past and projected events

It goes in two directions at once. It goes backwards as it goes forwards. It loops. It takes detours. Do not fall into the illusion that history is a well disciplined and unflagging column marching unswervingly into the future. [...] But how do we know – only some imaginary figure looking down from the sky (let's call him God) can know – that we are not moving in a great circle? (Swift 1984: 117)

#### Meaning and Ancestry. Memory and Forgetfulness

The human constant need for meaning is adjacent to history and storytelling – creating meaning, extracting it, looking for it, discovering it, but ever in pursuit of it. In a circular movement, man, "the animal who craves meaning" (Swift 1984: 122), is restless in his search for coherence, the outcome being the weaving of one's own identity. The element that generates this need of meaning is a deeply rooted state of mind and spirit, namely curiosity, a thirst for knowing and making sense that begets only more curiosity, that seems inexhaustible, that keeps the world, as well as the human beings moving, instilling in them the further need of transforming their realities into past and future by assuming inner and

outer gestures – "when curiosity is exhausted (so, long live curiosity), that is when the world shall have come to its end." (Swift 1984: 176)

The concepts of history, storytelling, meaning, curiosity and memory are accompanied by another one, pairing with memory, namely forgetfulness, thus making both of them visible, allowing new spaces to be filled in by other memories, allowing erasure of experiences that cannot be remembered and should not be remembered (in order to preserve a certain sanity of mind and body), infusing self and consciousness into nothingness – "And maybe that's just the point: it's oblivion he'd like to forget, it's a sense of the dizzy void he can't get away from. He could do without this feeling of nothing." (Swift 1984: 193); "No, don't forget. Don't erase it. You can't erase it. But make it into a story. Just a story. Yes, everything's crazy. What's real? All a story. Only a story..." (Swift 1984: 194)

What is interesting though, as in Bill Unwin's case (*Ever After*), Tom also inherits a diary from one of his ancestors, testifying, in much the same way a historical source would, the true story behind the rumors, recording actual facts in their own emerging point, offering a subjective, yet accurate account of the Atkinsons and the Cricks (in this case). Thus, private history comes to be authenticated by structural means that are similar to those authenticating grand history – "(This is no supposition. No wild invention. I have my grandfather's own authority: a journal, which he almost destroyed, but in the end didn't [...])" (Swift 1984: 189)

Delving into the world of self-narration, a world which also includes the narration of the others, Tom Crick, a history teacher anchored in facts, abandons them in favour of subjective stories only to discover that reality itself, which is made out of them, turns out to exceed fiction or any rule of plausibility and verisimilitude – "this world which we like to believe is sane and real is, in truth, absurd and fantastic." (Swift 1984: 202) And the explanation behind this observation resides in the fact that every initial point in everything, story or history, held the status of truth or reality only at the moment of its occurrence, the end in eventfulness signifying only the end in happening and not in storytelling –

But all the stories were once real. And all the events of history, the battles and costume-pieces, once really happened. All the stories were once a feeling in the guts. [...] But when the world is about to end there'll be no more reality, only stories. All there'll be left to us will be stories. Stories will be our only reality. (Swift 1984: 257)

Thus, the end of one's existence would narratively mean only his/ her turning into a sum of stories to be told and listened to by others, stories

that are altogether the others' interpretations of that person, namely his embedded consciousness.

Eventually, the gesture of stepping into another world, into another story or history leaves behind it other story traces wherein the experiencing subject is extracted from, remaining only the recounting subjects. The left-behind world continues to exist, but it revolves around somebody else as, simultaneously, the new world that the experiencing I enters focuses its attention on the new-comer. It is not only a change of perspective, but it is also a crossing of borders, different with every individual who indulges in fabricating the truth and displaying it as such.

Children, have you ever stepped into another world? Have you ever turned a corner to where Now and Long Ago are the same and time seems to be going on in some other place?" (Swift 1984: 262); "But then we've stepped into a different world. The one where things come to a stop; the one where the past will go on happening..."(Swift 1984: 263); "Bur officers, there are different versions." (Swift 1984: 271); "Hey, this is good stuff, this is real-life drama. Let's have more (Swift 1984: 272)

Ultimately, Tom identifies himself (though as indirectly as before, assigning himself the role of the explainer, the observer, the history teacher rather than the one of the participant, of the experiencing human being) with the amphibian life of the inhabitants of the Fens, adjusting to both land and water, past and present in a continually ambivalent identity movement – "They ceased to be water people and became land people; they ceased to fish and fowl and became plumbers of the land. They joined in the destiny of the Fens, which was to strive not for but against water. [...] Or perhaps they did not cease to be water people. Perhaps they became amphibians." (Swift 1984: 11)

Gathering all these philosophical threads of life, past and present, as displayed by Tom Crick in his attempt of making sense of his own present, of his own existence, as well as of the causes that generated the actual state of affairs, an intricate symbiotic entity is born: the human being, determined and shaped by perspectival stories that mould reality into patterns, both stories and reality being exhibited onto a canvas with blurred borders, both of them simultaneously assuming the role of cause and effect (in a similar manner to thought/ emotion and action/ gesture(Palmer 2004)

All the stories once were real. [...] All the stories were once a feeling in the guts. [...] But when the world is about to end there'll be no

more reality, only stories. All there'll be left to us will be stories. Stories will be our only reality." (Swift 1984: 257)

#### References

# (This article is part of my PhD thesis, *The Interplay of Perspectives in Graham Swift's Novels*)

- Alber, J., Fludernik, M. 'Mediacy and Narrative Mediation', in *the living* handbook of narratology. P. Hühn *et al.* (eds.). Hamburg: Hamburg University Press. URL = <u>hup.sub.uni-hamburg.de/lhn/index.php</u> <u>?title=Mediacy and Narrative Mediation&oldid=798</u> [last view date: 2010-10-05].
- Doležel, L. 1998. Heterocosmica—Fiction and Possible Worlds, Baltimore MD, Johns Hopkins University Press. Quoted in A. Palmer, 2004. Fictional Minds, University of Nebraska Press, Lincoln and London, Frontiers of Narrative, Series Editor D. Herman, North Carolina State University.
- Duchan, J.F. *et al.* eds. 1995. *Deixis in Narrative: A Cognitive Science Perspective*, Hillsdale, Lawrence Erlbaum. Quoted in D. Herman, 'Cognitive Narratology', in *the living handbook of narratology*. P. Hühn, Peter *et al.* (eds.). Hamburg: Hamburg University Press. URL = <u>hup.sub.uni-hamburg.de/lhn/index.php?title=Cognitive</u> Narratology <u>&oldid=724</u> [last view date: 2010-10-05].
- Fludernik, M. 1996. Towards a 'Natural' Narratology. London, Routledge. Quoted in J.C. Meister, 'Narratology', in the living handbook of narratology. P. Hühn et al. (eds.):. Hamburg: Hamburg University Press. URL = <u>hup.sub.uni-hamburg.de/lhn/index.php</u> ?title=Narratology&oldid=850 [last view date: 2010-10-05]
- Herman, D. 'Cognitive Narratology' in *the living handbook of narratology*. P. Hühn *et al.* (eds.). Hamburg: Hamburg University Press. URL = <u>hup.sub.uni-hamburg.de/lhn/index.php?title=Cognitive</u> Narratology <u>&oldid=724</u> [last view date: 2010-10-05]
- Palmer, A. 2004. *Fictional Minds*. Lincoln and London: University of Nebraska Press, Frontiers of Narrative, Series Editor David Herman, North Carolina State University.
- Swift, G. 1984. Waterland. Picador, Pan Books Ltd, London, 1984.

# Aspects of the Ritual of Initiation in Alice Munro's Short Story A Red Dress

Monica Buşoiu University of Oradea

**Abstract**: Although the modern man changed fundamentally his way of life, due to science and technology, the need to mark certain events in the life of an individual still remains. The sacred, traditional societies became profane and modern, magical beliefs and rituals being replaced by scientific facts. In spite of these transformations, the human mind did not suffer dramatic changes. We still feel the need to order the chaos around us, by structuring the time that was given to us, by putting milestones along our way in life.

Key words: community, girl, initiation, red, ritual

Initiation is the ritual of acceptance in a group, or a community. It marks also a moment of change in the life of an individual, for instance the transformation of a child into an adult. All human communities around the Earth mark this very important change in the life of an individual. The rites of puberty can be communal, where all the members of the community may participate, or separate for boys and girls, rites through which the pubers are introduced to their specific future roles as men or women. They are accepted not only in the world of adults, but also in the smaller group of men and women that belong to the community. Therefore puber rites mark not only the biological changes that take place in the human body, but also the socio-cultural changes in their lives and the new social roles that they have to play in the life of the grown-up community.

The community itself celebrates with the occasion of puber-rituals its own rebirth and the renewal of the circle of life. With the acceptance of new members in it, the whole community regenerates itself, continuity and survival being therefore assured. Each participant has a clearly established role during the ritual, which implies also a certain order that has to be strictly respected each time. Maintaining order is a major task in the life of a traditional community, Order being seen as the opposition of Chaos. For the mythical mentality, the Chaos does not disappear after the act of cosmogony. (...) The Universe (or any micro universe: the body, the house, the village, etc.) is seen as being in a fragile stability, always wavering between Chaos and Cosmos, (that is the ordered universe). In the old and traditional societies, man is not a passive observer of this "Cosmic performance", but, with his magic-ritual instruments, he is an active participant at the rebirth of the Cosmos and the re-establishing of the cosmic order, which is temporarily, sometimes recurrently, disturbed. (Oişteanu 2013: 11)<sup>1</sup>

Ceremonial circumcision plays often a central part in male's puberty rituals, while the rituals for girls are mostly related to the first menstrual cycle. Sometimes the ritual is actually a process that lasts several years, in which the girls and boys are taught about the history of their community and about how to be prepared for the social role they are supposed to play in the community. An interesting initiation is taking place in the community of the Cree tribe from Canada, (living North and West from Lake Superior). The girls,

...since they turn 8, 9 spend a part of each day with a specially selected Grandma representing the elders. She teaches them the origin story of the tribe, the story of First Woman, First Mother and the origins of Mother Earth. She teaches them what it means to become a woman, about changes in the body and the development of the psyche. Girls learn self-defence and practice it on the tribe's boys. They gain knowledge about herbs soothing pain and preventing pregnancy. When they are finally ready they spend time alone, in cleansing lodges. Only after two years of such preparation they are accepted into the tribe as women. They are perceived as those becoming Mother Earth, fertile, capable of creating and giving life.<sup>2</sup>

The important role of the elderly woman who shared her knowledge with the young girls is to be found also in the tribe of the Pygmies in Africa. The girls went to spent several days in a hut where an elderly woman prepared them for the First Blood Ceremony, at which the whole tribe

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> "Pentru mentalitatea mitică, Haosul nu dispare odată cu actul cosmogenezei. (...) Universul (sau orice microunivers:corpul, casa, satul, etc.) este văzut ca fiind un echilibru labil, oscilând mereu între starea de Haos și cea de Cosmos ("univers ordonat", în sensul pitagoreic al conceptului *kosmos*). În societățile arhaice și tradiționale, omul nu se comportă ca un spectator pasiv la acest "spectacol cosmic", ci participă activ, cu mijloace mito-rituale, la regenerarea Cosmosului uzat și la restabilirea ordinii cosmice care este temporar, uneori ciclic, disturbată." (traducerea în lb. engl. îmi aparține)

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> http://www.miesiaczka.com/index.php?option=com\_content&view=article&id=77% 3Arituals-for-girls-in-different-cultures&catid=5%3A1-miesiaczka&Itemid=62
participated. Pygmies believed that the first blood was a gift and therefore it was joyfully accepted by the members of the community. After the ceremony the celebrations continued with feasts and dances.

It is a general belief that a girl menstruating for the first time has special powers and blesses the tribe. It is considered that the first blood regenerates the tribe, that it brings wealth, renewal and rebirth to all of its members.

The Apache Indians in North America, called the ceremony dedicated to the young girls, Mascalero. It lasted four days in which people danced, feasted and celebrated and men-singers told the history of the tribe.

One of the most important religious annual ceremonies, the Kinaalda, was the one for the girls reaching puberty, also in the Navajo tribe. The Kinaalda ceremony is still being celebrated among the Navajo Indians. It lasts also four days in which the girls are honored because they become the Changing Women, the most prominent Navajo goddess, who symbolizes the life cycle: birth, life, death, rebirth, as well as the four seasons. During these days the girls receive teachings from an elderly woman, and on the last day, the most important day of the ceremony, the girls, being now considered to be an emanation of the Changing Mother, are dressed in a traditional dress, combed in a special way, offer each participant a piece of corn cake, the symbol of fertility.

In Kerala, India, ceremonies for young girls are the most important celebrations of the year and take place in all casts. Girls are given scented baths, dressed in beautiful red dresses and receive presents: jewelry and clothes. They have meetings with women, family members and friends. The ceremonies culminate with a procession of young girls through the city.

Although the modern man changed fundamentally his way of life, due to science and technology, the need to mark certain events in the life of an individual still remains. The sacred, traditional societies became profane and modern, magical beliefs and rituals being replaced by scientifical facts. In spite of these transformations, the human mind did not suffer dramatical changes. We still feel the need to order the chaos around us, by structuring the time that was given to us, by putting milestones along our way in life.

The initiation ceremonies still exist. Some are religious, like baptism, confirmation, bar mitzvah; some are not, like the rituals of initiation of girls and boys. These rituals suffered a transformation and were adapted to the Western life style and the needs of the urban, modern people. The boys and girls, after reaching the age of adolescence, are introduced to the society of adults and taught about their future role as grown-up men and women. This introduction takes place for a girl mostly at her first ball and many are the well known stories that describe the first ball, beginning with *Cinderella*.

In her short story *A Red Dress*, Alice Munro renders the emotions of a girl before, during and after a ball. Published in the short story collection *Dance of the Happy Shades*, in 1968, along with other fourteen short stories, *A Red Dress*, as well as the other stories of the collection, shows glimpses of everyday life of ordinary people.

The main character, a thirteen years old girl, is going to her first"ball", that is a Christmas dance at her school. Alice Munro chooses to let her protagonist to be the narrator of the story. She is unnamed, that means that she could be any girl of this age and is the typical adolescent girl. The tone of the narration is personal, diary-like (adolescent girls usually reveal their intimate secrets to a diary). She narrates about her feelings, regarding this big event and about everything around it: her mother, her best friend, the boys at the school. Her feelings are mixed and contradictory, and change along the story. At the beginning, before the ball, she is anxious, unsure, with a low self-esteem while at the end, she is happy and relieved.

The ball could be seen as a ritual of initiation for the protagonist, a ritual very much changed from that of a traditional one. The role of the elderly woman who uses to introduce young girls to their future social roles of mother and wife was taken over partially by the mother and partially by peers and papers. Unlike the traditional young girls, who had to accept the traditions of the parents, modern ones, girls like our protagonist, reject them, feeling rather embarrassed by the "old-fashioned" adults, with their old-fashioned habits, wishing instead to wear bought clothes. Our narrator herself wishes rather to wear a bought dress, just like her best friend, Lonnie, who has no mother to sew a dress for her.

The dress especially prepared for this event is a red dress sewed by the protagonist's mother. She is a good and caring mother, who projects in the dress all her good wishes of happiness and success for her daughter. ("The dress was princess-style") The dress sewed by the mother is a product of her creativity ("She was not really a good sewer. She liked to make things: that is different"). It was not for the first time that the mother sewed a dress for her daughter. She had had bursts of inspiration before:

She had made me, at various times when I was younger, a flowered organdie dress with a high Victorian neckline edged in scratchy lace, with a poke bonnet to match; a Scottish plaid outfit with a velvet jacket and tam; an embroidered peasant blouse worn with a full red skirt and black laced bodice. Usually debutants wear white dresses, so the question is why is the mother sewing a red dress and not a white one? We do not know much about the mother's past, but according to her appearance, we may conclude that she had a difficult life:

...her knees were creaking, her breath coming heavily. She muttered to herself. Around the house she wore no corset or stockings, she wore wedge-heeled shoes and ankle socks; her legs were marked with lumps of blue-green veins. I thought her squatting position shameless, even obscene; I tried to keep talking to Lonnie so that her attention would be taken away from my mother as much as possible.

At the same time we do not know whether she has a husband or not. As a teenager the mother could not afford to buy a dress and had to sew it by herself: ("Well, nobody ever made me a dress when I was going to high-school"..."I made my own, or I did without.")

The fact that the mother creates garments for her daughter is not only the manifestation of her love and care for her offspring, but, at a deeper psychological level, it is an attempt to go back in her own youth and a try to make things better. The red dress is her own unfulfilled wish. It is a link between the mother's youth and that of the daughter's. She identifies herself with her daughter and sews the dress actually for her past self in an attempt to re-live her own first ball.

The dress is red, a color symbolizing the vital principle, the joy of life, the fire, the blood. It contrasts with the blue-green veins from the mother's legs. Red is the color of happiness and by sewing it, she hopes that it will bring the daughter a better future. Red is seen therefore as a color of good omen.

Red suggests femininity, sexuality. It is a color destined to seduce. At a certain moment, while trying it, the mother considers it being to grown-up and tries to mild it, to make it look more proper for an adolescent. ("My mother, never satisfied, was sewing a white lace collar on the dress; she had decided it was to grown-up-looking.").

The girl herself has ambivalent feelings regarding her own identity. She does not feel like being a child any longer, but in the same time she does not feel comfortable with the idea of being an adult. The scene in which she has to try the dress illustrates this fact: "My head was muffled in velvet, my body exposed, in an old cotton school slip. I felt like a great raw lump, clumsy and goose-pimpled." She is aware of the changes she goes through and she discusses them with Lonnie. They made a pact with each other and use to talk about boys and the first date, they do questionnaires in magazines about their personalities, and they read on sex, frigidity, menopause and abortion, being interested in matters of adulthood.

Comparative with the traditional communities where the information regarding sexuality and maturity were kept secret and revealed in front of the youngsters only at the moment of initiation, in the modern, open societies these information are available to anyone, through the mass-media. The adults do not participate directly to the initiation of the youngsters, but indirectly, through the offer of a large amount of information which is available to anyone interested. The source of information has lost its authority, it is not any longer the unique one of an elderly, wise person, because it has been multiplied and dissipated in a large amount of different information sources, from journals and books, to peers and friends.

Adults may think, that being confronted with such a deluge of information sources, having the freedom to chose according to their common sense, youngsters of modern times would find themselves in the difficult situation of selecting the right information, in making somehow order in this chaos, but it seems that they are doing very fine in reaching this task. They are no longer obliged to follow the footsteps of their ancestors, which is a good think, but it also confronts them with the tough situation of option.

When asked by a reporter in a recent interview, about the fact that many of her characters seem to be even wiser than the adults around them, Alice Munro admits that:

I suppose it's just a memory. I never remember being innocent. I always remember things being very complicated. Mostly I remember having a self as a child who was completely hidden from the world of adults and teachers and people around me. But that may have something to do with the generation and the place. But the earliest thing I can remember is the need to protect, the need to hide, the need to disguise. And this is so your self will not perish. Sometimes even now I think about the way children are treated. So much is done in terms of manipulation, not punishment, as would have been done with me. You know, not letting them alone with the things that have happened to them. This is perhaps the viewpoint of my age.<sup>3</sup>

Indeed, in many of her short stories, and particularly in *A Red Dress*, teenagers are left to experiment of their own. They go to their first ball held at school, in their familiar environment, in "that old building, with its rock-walled clammy basements and black cloakrooms and pictures of dead royalties and lost explorers, (...) full of the tension and excitement

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>3</sup>http://www.theatlantic.com/entertainment/archive/2001/12/bringing-life-to-life/378234/

of sexual competition." The participants are teenagers, students from the school, left by themselves, without much interference from the adults. The main goal of the ball and in the same time the great challenge for the participants is for the boys to invite a girl to dance, and for girls to be invited. This is what they expect from themselves and from each other.

While her red dress is being sewed, being afraid of failure, the main character of the story tries to avoid going to the ball and voluntarily exposes her to the cold air of the Canadian December night with the intention to catch a cold. On these occasions her skin becomes cadaveric blue, a color opposite to the vivid color of the dress. In a ritual matter she repeatedly opens the window at night, kneels down in front of it and lets the wind rush in and around her bare throat. She repeats like in an incantation certain words:"I said to myself the words "blue with cold" and as I knelt there, my eyes shut, I pictured my chest and throat turning blue, the cold, grayish blue of veins under the skin." No use. She rises up every morning in perfect health, so that she has no excuse not to go to the dance.

The time and the space of the rite is well delimitated. The place of the dance is an ordinary one, the school, now being decorated for the sake of the event:"The gymnasium smelled of pine and cedar. Red and green bells of fluted paper hung from the basketball hoops; the high, barred windows were hidden by green boughs." As a result of the decorations, the space becomes sacred, out of the ordinary. The time is also a sacred one, the dance taking place before Christmas. The sacred time is an extraordinary one, different from the everydayness. It is a time of celebration, when expectancy is great, when unusual, extraordinary things may happen, when people hopes and wishes wait to be fulfilled. The girl's big hope is that she is going to be invited to dance. The mother's big hope, manifested in the red dress, is that it will be a good start for a further happy life. She delegates her girl to accomplish happiness.

The girl knows about her mother's wishes regarding her and feels on her shoulders the burden of this difficult mission. Although in a state of indecision regarding the dance, having mixed feelings about it, refusing to go there ("in spite of daydreams of vast successes, I had premonitions of total defeat."), being almost obliged by her mother to take part at it, finally she goes and has the time of her life.

Initiation is not a task, but a way. Special preparations are made before the big event: "The day of the dance I did my hair up in steel curlers. I had never done this before, because my hair was naturally curly, but today I wanted the protection of all possible female rituals. (...) I have a red velvet dress, I did my hair in curlers, I used a deodorant and put on cologne." Interested in winning the first important game, the ball, of what she calls"sexual competition", our girl keeps the female rituals, relies on them and hopes for the best. She prays to be invited and locks her fingers at the back for good luck, feeling the importance of the moment for her future life, feeling that she has to pass a test, much more important than a math test, in order to better her self-esteem and to have a further happy life.

Not every girl at the party feels like her. There is Mary Fortune, officer of the Girls' Athletic Society, one of the organizers of the dance. Mary is the opposite of the main character. She smokes and, as she confesses, she came only to watch over the decorations. Being not at all "boy-crazy", like the majority of the girls, not interested in dancing with boys. Mary is the representative of the typical independent young woman, free and indifferent towards social success. ("she planned to work her own way through, she wanted to be independent anyway, she would work in the cafeteria and in the summer she would do farm work, like picking tobacco.") With this character, Munro shows an alternative behavior of the young girls. Unlike the archaic community, where each boy and girl had to follow the footsteps of the predecessors no exceptions being tolerated, in modern society's alternative, untypical behavior can be possible. Mary rejects the ritual of initiation of youngsters, fact that is possible in modern times. By doing this, she actually constructs for herself a different ritual and implicit an identity different from the majority one. She assumes courageously to be the other.

Our girl admires Mary Fortune for her high self-esteem and just when she feels attracted to Mary's strong personality and decides to follow her, when she believes that she lost her interest in boys and wants to become like her new friend, she is asked to dance.

She succeeds when less expected, after she decided to leave the dance and does not keep her fingers crossed, after she forgets about all the rituals and superstitions. A boy dances with her, takes her back home and even kisses her. And she is happy.

Happiness seems to be the supreme task of our young girl. ("a mysterious and oppressive obligation I had, to be happy.") The mission was accomplished. This is what her mother wants for her, what the red dress was made for. Her mission in life is that of being happy in her on way and a first step was made in the evening of the dance, while wearing that particular red dress, which was one of good omen.

# **References**:

http://www.narrativemagazine.com/issues/stories-week-2012-2013/red-dress-1946-alice-munro (retrieved on 2015-02-02) http://mb-soft.com/believe/txo/primitiv.htm (retrieved on 2015-02-02)

- http://www.miesiaczka.com/index.php?option=com\_content&view=article&id= 77%3Arituals-for-girls-in-different-cultures&catid=5%3A1miesiaczka&Itemid=62 (retrieved on 2015-02-02)
- http://www.theatlantic.com/entertainment/archive/2001/12/bringing-life-tolife/378234/ (retrieved on 2015-02-02)
- http://www.amazon.com/exec/obidos/ISBN=067978151X/theatlanticmonthA/ (retrieved on 2015-02-05)
- http://mookseandgripes.com/reviews/2013/02/01/alice-munro-dance-of-thehappy-shade/ (retrieved on 2015-02-05)
- Lévi-Strauss, C. 1962. The Savage Mind. University of Chicago Press
- Oișteanu, A. 2013. Ordine și Haos, Mit și magie în cultura tradițională românească, Iași, Polirom

# Rejuvenating the Stage: *The Descent of Liberty, a Mask* (1815), by Leigh Hunt

#### Elisabetta Marino

University of Rome "Tor Vergata"

Abstract: This paper sets out to demonstrate that The Descent of Liberty by Leigh Hunt – a neglected masque that, up until recently, has often been dismissed by scholars "as a curiously anachronistic work" (Bohm 2009: 133) – should be actually acknowledged as one of the first, noteworthy steps the so-called "Hunt-circle" took towards the fulfilment of the above-mentioned project of communal regeneration and reform. A brief account of Leigh Hunt's parallel engagement in theatre and politics at the beginning of his career as a journalist, followed by a concise outline of the circumstances leading to the writer's imprisonment (the masque was written while he was detained in Horsemonger-Lane Gaol) will provide the necessary information to contextualize the play and support its analysis.

Key words: theatrical performance, crisis, theatre, emergence

Starting from the last few decades of the eighteenth century, theatrical performances in London underwent substantial transformations. While the two patented institutions (Drury Lane and Covent Garden) habitually colluded with the repressive government, thus turning into potent instruments of indoctrination and propaganda, the managers of the minor houses (where only melodramas, pantomimes and other *illegitimate* dramas could be staged) frequently resorted to dazzling backgrounds, spectacular horse shows, impressive costumes, and complex machinery, in order to attract a large audience that, without exerting any intellectual effort, wished to be entertained rather than instructed. The supposedly unstageable dramas on mythological and pastoral subjects composed by several Romantic writers have long been interpreted as a disdainful reaction to the crisis of the theatre, as a retreat into an idealized - albeit secluded - world of poetic imagination. Due to their allegedly private character and marginal role, they have been categorized as "closet drama", "mental theatre", or "the theatre of the mind" (Moody 1996:

224). As Jeffrey Cox (1996: 247) has compellingly argued, however, far from signifying the writers' aristocratic withdrawal from the public sphere, as well as their lack of social commitment, mythological and pastoral plays are meant to be considered as a collective "attempt to remake", to rejuvenate the stage. By negotiating between tradition and innovation while attempting to reform the canon, by embedding political considerations into their texts, by prompting readers to actively conjure up visions and thoughts (thus becoming part of the cultural product, instead of being passive spectators), artists strived to foster a powerful "countercultural message" (Cox 1996: 247).

The emergence of Leigh Hunt as a public figure is associated with the 1801 publication of his collection of poems entitled Juvenilia; nevertheless, he gained much wider notoriety when he began to write theatrical criticism for the News, a periodical he contributed to in the timespan between May 1805 and December 1807. His articles (which formed the core of his Critical Essays on the Performers of the London Theatres, released in 1807) proved to be groundbreaking on many fronts: longer and more detailed than customary, they devoted unbiased attention to the actors and their performances (which he never refrained from criticizing, when deserved), to the scenery, the musical accompaniment, the stage directions, and the costumes. Adopting an independent stance almost unknown to his fellow-critics, Hunt launched himself into a crusade against the widespread practices of theatrical journalism, namely bribery, undeserved partiality, and *puffing* (exaggerated praise for promotional purposes). As Michael Eberle-Sinatra (2005: 25) has elucidated, Hunt regarded drama not just as mere entertainment, but rather "as one of the major social influences on the citizens of a country"; he believed performances had to "bring something to the audience, whether an emotional experience or an education-or an improvement in their manners" (Eberle-Sinatra 2005: 12). Hence, in his capacity as reviewer, he felt entrusted with an enlightening mission: he wished to revive the critical spirit of his readers, promoting their capacity for reflection, selection, and independent judgment. Moreover, as Kathryn Pratt (2001: 29) has pointed out, Hunt also lamented the loss of the traditional role of the theatre as an institution aimed at consolidating the sense of community, by bringing together the different social classes through their shared participation in a cathartic, uplifting experience. In those days, shows were in fact chosen by profit-driven managers and targeted to satisfy the needs of specific groups. What is more, plays (even classical works) were tailored to suit the talent and the peculiarities of contemporary star performers such as Sarah Siddons and John Kemble, who turned into the real sources of attraction for most playgoers, often indifferent to the contents and the messages of the plots.

In Autumn 1808 Leigh Hunt and his brother John founded *The Examiner*, whose subtitle – *A Sunday paper, on politics, domestic economy, and theatricals* – further strengthened the same connection between politics and the theatre the writer had only implicitly alluded to in the pages of the *News*. In his 1807 "Prospectus of *The Examiner*" Hunt (vii) stated that just as he had already challenged the grossly partial theatrical criticism of his times, so would he attempt to reform contemporary political journalism, "disgraced by those abandoned hypocrites, whose greatest quackery [was] their denial of being quacks". On March 22 1812, in reply to the sycophantic columnists of the *Morning Post* who, besides overlooking the many vices and the excesses of the Prince Regent, had just falsely praised him as a "conqueror of hearts" and an "Adonis in loveliness"<sup>1</sup>, Hunt thundered from *The Examiner* contending that

this *delightful, blissful, wise, pleasurable, honourable, virtuous, true,* and *immortal* prince, was a violator of his word, a libertine over head and ears in disgrace, a despiser of domestic ties, the companion of gamblers and demireps, a man who had just closed half a century without one single claim on the gratitude of his country, or the respect of posterity! (cit. in Ingpen 1903: 256)

The author's remarks resulted in a storm of outrage on the part of the government. Following three previous unsuccessful prosecutions against the editors of *The Examiner*, both Leigh Hunt and his brother were convicted of libel, fined 500 pounds each, and sentenced to two years' imprisonment (from February 3 1813 to February 3 1815). After a few miserable weeks of isolation in a gloomy cell in Horsemonger-Lane Gaol, he was moved to a two-room apartment in the prison infirmary, where he was joined by his family. Hunt was even allowed to receive visitors until ten in the evening (his friends Charles and Mary Lamb, William Hazlitt, Lord Byron and Thomas Moore were among his notable guests). In the words of Ann Blainey (1981: 9), the writer forcefully managed to transform his place of captivity and humiliation "into a poetic bower", painting the ceiling like a blue sky interspersed with clouds, choosing a wallpaper with trellis of roses, and disguising the hideous bars on his windows with Venetian blinds. A piano, a lute, huge bookcases, couches,

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> This is how the Prince Regent was described in the *Morning Post* on March 19 1812: "You are the *glory of the People* – you are the *Protector of the Arts* – You are the *Maecenas of the Age* – Wherever you appear, you *conquer all hearts*, wipe away all tears, excite *desire and love*, and win *beauty* towards you – You breathe *eloquence* – You inspire the Graces – You are an *Adonis in loveliness!*" (Roe 2005: 231).

colourful flowers, a bust of Homer, and a portrait of Milton contributed to creating a fairy-tale-like, almost utopian atmosphere. Quoting Greg Kucich (2003: 125), Leigh Hunt's extraordinary cell hosted a "countercourt of sociality and wit (not deference and obsequiousness)": it soon became "something like *the* fashionable place to be seen in reformist circles" (Kucick 1999: 244). The seeds of what would become disparagingly known as the *Cockney School of Poetry and Politics*<sup>2</sup> were, therefore, planted by Hunt while in custody. He himself turned into a sort of myth: a "liberal icon" (Stewart 2012: 26), "the poet patriot"<sup>3</sup> (Monkhouse 1893: 104), "the wit in the dungeon" (as Byron christened him in a poem dedicated "To Thomas Moore"<sup>4</sup>), the "amazing prisoner" (Hunt 1870: 220), as the artist later described himself in his *Autobiography*.

When he heard of Napoleon's abdication, Hunt composed his "Ode for the Spring of 1814". Originally printed in The Examiner, on April 17 1814, the ode was republished together with The Descent of Liberty, a Mask, whose dedication to Thomas Barnes<sup>5</sup> (a friend of Hunt's, as well as being both a political writer and a theatrical reviewer) is dated "Surrey Jail, 10th July 1814" (Hunt 1816: iv). The Descent of Liberty was released in January 1815 and proved to be quite successful, with a second edition the following year. Even though "the downfall of the great Apostate of Liberty" (Hunt 1816: v), Napoleon, is advertised in the "Preface" as the subject of the drama, the scope of the masque seems to be much broader, inextricably connected with the *countercultural* project Leigh Hunt had carried out through the pages of the News, consisting in the recovery of the social and political potential of the theatre, coupled with the awakening of the spectators' critical and imaginative faculties. The dull and unreceptive attitude of his prospective audience, utterly uninterested in "allusions to public matters" (Hunt 1816: vi) is highlighted in the Preface: "in proportion as they are fond of poetry are averse from politics" (Hunt 1816: vi). For that reason, the writer reveals his strategic choice of a genre in which "fancy and imagery [are] so predominant" (Hunt 1816: vii) that "even those who might wish to meet with no politics at all, may not be unwilling to encounter [the artist] for

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> The *Blackwood Magazine* coined that disparaging epithet in 1817, while attacking the supposedly ill-educated Hunt and Keats.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>3</sup> This is the way Charles Cowden Clarke called Leigh Hunt.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>4</sup> As written in the subtitle, the poem was written "the evening before [Byron's] visit to Mr. Leigh Hunt in Cold Bath Fields Prison, May 19, 1813" (Byron 1840: 433).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>5</sup> Barnes died on May 7 1841. In his obituary, in *The Gentleman's Magazine*, he was described as "the most accomplished and powerful political writer of the day" (Urban 1841: 96).

the sake of his poetry" (Hunt 1816: vii). A few scholars have tried to further explain why Hunt opted for a masque; in Nicholas Roe's opinion (2005: 298), it "had the additional appeal in that it didn't conform to prescriptive neoclassical rules about literary decorum"; Andr Bohm (2009: 134) has claimed that, while melodrama was an essentially conservative genre, masques "eras[ed] the boundary between the represented and the representation, between the stage and the audience, between theatre and the politics", thus upsetting long-established hierarchical relationships. Conversely, Lisa Vargo (1987: 50) has underlined the author's ironic intentions in selecting "one of the most elite forms of literature, a pageant in praise of a monarch, to write a pagean to democracy". Nonetheless, in his introductory essay on the "Origin and Nature of Masks" (which precedes the actual text). Hunt himself offers a thorough - albeit indirect - account of the reasons that induced him to compose such a play. He, first of all, emphasizes "the lawlessness" (Hunt 1816: xxi), the freedom of that genre, the most appropriate (one would be tempted to add) to the subject of his drama: liberty triumphing over despotism. He, then, recalls its origin, mixing popular masquerades with high and elitist "Pageants or Public Shows" (Hunt 1816: xxi): by mingling and balancing entertainment with instructive allegories, masques succeeded in attracting all the various strands of society (it should be remembered that Hunt fostered the *communal* participation of all social groups in the theatrical experience). Moreover, in harmony with his battle against flattery, he writes that "the Mask was not of necessity to be complimentary, though it was generally produced on complimentary occasions" (Hunt 1816: xxxv). Finally, after mentioning the existence of two classes of masque ("those written to be seen only, and those that had the ambition also to be read" [Hunt 1816: xxxii]) he ascribes his work to the second category. Despite his initial intention of staging his play, he had eventually decided "to make the stage of his own in the reader's fancy" (Hunt 1816: liii): by so doing, Leigh Hunt effectively manages to shift the focus of attention from the machinery and the choreographic effects that he should have employed, to the readers' imagination and intellectual faculties, which are rejuvenated as well as invested with responsibility.

The plot of *The Descent of Liberty* is quite simple. Following a prologue in which Liberty looks down on the Earth about to be freed from a cruel Enchanter (Napoleon), the first scene is centred on some shepherds and Eunomus (a gentle nobleman), who sense in the air "a new freshness" (Hunt 1816: 11) and hear a "sweet music" (Hunt 1816: 14), indicating the imminent release of their country from the grip of the tyrant. In the second scene, the Enchanter, shrouded in a dark cloud that

hangs over the land, is defeated by the "four Genii of the kingdom" (the Allied nations) wrapped in another cloud. After their clash, "the Enchanter falls headlong" and "the twilight over the country" (Hunt 1816: 21) vanishes. The third scene is a sort of *masque within the masque*: in front of the whole community, from noblemen to peasants, the figure of Liberty, who has descended "on her cloud of silver" (Hunt 1816: 37), crowns the four Spirits of the Nations. Spring, Peace, Poetry, Experience, Education, and other gods and goddesses parade in a pageant.

Despite the pastoral and mythological setting, references to the contemporary political scenario can be noticed from the very beginning of the masque. When entering on stage, the shepherds "loo[k] cautiously about" (Hunt 1816: 7) and, a few lines later, one invites the others to be careful, since the oppressor has ears "in every corner" (Hunt 1816: 9). This seems to be an allusion to the practice of espionage during the reign of George III and the Regency period, besides being a clear hint to Napoleon's dictatorship. In the words of the shepherds, the "cursed Enchanter" (Hunt 1816: 9), who deluded his subjects with the pretence of grandeur and freedom, is contrasted with "Old Eunomus" (Hunt 1816: 10) whose name, according to Stuart Curran (2013: 296), "is an allegorical cipher for good government". The elderly man is described as the true champion of democracy, as the ruler Leigh Hunt wished for, "a lover of us all both high and low,/ and one that would all live well together,/ the high in rank, the low in liberty" (Hunt 1816: 10). In the third scene, just before the *masque within the masque*, Eunomus is rejoined with his son, whom he deemed lost or dead: their felicitous reunion seems to be auspicious of a new and happier era for the human family, which will certainly be long-lasting, provided that freedom and honest principles continue to be nurtured. Hunt was unquestionably hostile to Napoleon who, in his drama, is even deprived of the power of speech, being a mute character. Nonetheless, he was also cautious in endorsing his opponents. Consequently, when Liberty crowns the four Genii (who, incidentally, like the Enchanter, never utter a word during the play), she warns them to respect and cherish what they fought for. This is what she recommends to the Prussian Spirit: "recollect for those you rule,/ what you learnt in Sorrow's school,/ and acquaint their homes with me,/ Triumph-teaching Liberty" (Hunt 1816: 40). The Austrian Spirit is invited to secure his authority by keeping the air "pure for me/ Life-supplying Liberty" (Hunt 1816: 42). The Russian Spirit is prompted to make his conquest "nobler still" (Hunt 1816: 43) by releasing Poland, "a land [that] was heaped with ill/ By sinning pow'rs that ruled before you,/ whose repentant pains implore you" (Hunt 1816: 43). Readers gather that the British Spirit has long worn the laurel on his brow; yet, the writer cannot but acknowledge

that "some under leaves [are] torn/ here and there" (Hunt 1816: 45). Even his crowning, therefore, is accompanied with the usual formula already pronounced in the previous cases: "So our Goddess, wise and free,/ Wills that every crown should be:-/ *This* is the true sovereignty" (Hunt 1816: 46). Far from celebrating the triumph of hereditary rights, the pomp of kings, as well as the restoration of the old regimes, Leigh Hunt focuses his readers' attention solely on the idea of liberty, as *the* supreme value any government worthy of that name should cultivate.

Fears for the newly-established harmony, in the shape of the Sable Genius' ominous vision of destruction, are presented in the conclusive pages of the play, at the end of a long pageant in which gods and spirits are significantly presented alongside with rustic figures, without hierarchical divisions. Nonetheless, showing the contrasting pictures of *False Glory* (characterized by forgery and slavery) and *Real Glory* (with "poets, painters, and musicians [...] wearing an air of frankness and trading with a firm step" [Hunt 1816: 78]), Liberty can close the story with a clear moral; as she concludes, "Mortals dear,/ think on all I've done and said,/ and keep my blessings on your head" (Hunt 1816: 80).

Through *The Descent of Liberty*, a masque written in one of the most miserable moments of Hunt's life, the "wit in the dungeon", who had provocatively turned his cell into the perfect setting for his countercourt, succeeded in staging a utopia of peace, democracy, and freedom in the theatre of his readers' minds.

# **References**:

- Blainey, A. 1981. "The Wit in the Dungeon: Leigh Hunt in Surrey Gaol." *Books at Iowa*. 34, 9-14.
- Bohm, A. 2009. "Hunt's The Descent of Liberty and the Seasonal Politics of Keats's 'To Autumn." *Romanticism* 15:2, 131-143.
- Byron, GG. 1840. *The Complete Works of Lord Byron*, Vol. II. Paris: Baudry's European Library.
- Cox, J.N. 1996. "Staging Hope: Genre, Myth, and Ideology in the Dramas of the Hunt Circle." *Texas Studies in Literature and Language* 38:3/4, 1996, 245-264.
- Curran, S. 2013. "Lyrical Drama: *Prometheus Unbound* and *Hellas*" in *The Oxford Handbook of Percy Bysshe Shelley*. M. O'Neill and A. Howe (eds). Oxford: Oxford University Press. 289-298.
- Eberle-Sinatra, M. 2005. Leigh Hunt and the London Literary Scene: A Reception History of his Major Works. London: Routledge.
- Hunt, L. 1807. "Prospectus of The Examiner a New Sunday Paper" in *Critical* Essays on the Performers of the London Theatres: Including General

Observations on the Practise and Genius of the Stage. Leigh Hunt. London: John Hunt, i-viii.

- ----- 1816. *The Descent of Liberty, a Mask*. London: Gale and Fenner.
- ----- 1870. The Autobiography of Leigh Hunt. London: Smith, Elder & Co.
- Ingpen, R. 1903. The Autobiography of Leigh Hunt: With Reminiscences of Friends and Contemporaries, and with Thornton Hunt's Introduction and Postscript, Vol. I. Westminster: Constable & Co.
- Kucich, G. 1999. "*The Wit in the Dungeon*': Leigh Hunt and the Insolent Politics of Cockney Coteries." *European Romantic Review* 10, 242-253.
- ----- 2003. "Cockney Chivalry: Hunt, Keats, and the Aesthetics of Excess" in Leigh Hunt: Life, Poetics, Politics. Nicholas Roe (ed.). New York: Routledge, 118-134.
- Monkhouse, C. 1893. Life of Leigh Hunt. London: Walter Scott Ltd.
- Moody, J. 1996. "'Fine Word, Legitimate!': Toward a Theatrical History of Romanticism." *Texas Studies in Literature and Language* 38:3/4, 223-244.
- Pratt, K. 2001. "Leigh Hunt's Melancholia and English Musical Theater." *The Wordsworth Circle* 32.1, 29-33.
- Roe, N. 2005. Fiery Heart, the First Life of Leigh Hunt. London: Pimlico.
- Stewart, D. 2012. "Leigh Hunt's Accidental Poetry." Essays in Criticism 62.1, 25-40.
- Urban, S. 1841. *The Gentleman's Magazine*, Vol. XVI. London: William Pickering, John Bowyer Nichols and Son.
- Vargo, L. 1987. "Unmasking Shelley's Mask of Anarchy." English Studies in Canada 13, 49-64.

# Transliterated Coinages in Amitav Ghosh's *Ibis Trilogy* - A Text- mining Research<sup>1</sup>

#### **Titus Pop**

Partium Christian University, Oradea

**Abstract:** The linguistic diversity displayed by Amitav Ghosh in his trilogy entitled *Ibis* establishes the author as a hybrid writer par excellence. The vocabulary employed in the first novel of the trilogy, *Sea of Poppies*, which has its own lexicon, an addendum entitled "The Ibis Chrestomathy", abounds in transliterated coinages which seem unreadable to an unadvised non-native English-speaking reader. Some helpful tools to disambiguate these coinages are the study of the sources used by the author to track their etymology as well as the use of the latest text-mining research software such as AntConc or MONK. This research paper is a presentation of the digital charts resulting from the etymological study of the multilingual entries appearing in Ghosh's trilogy.

Key words: multilingual, transliterated coinage, language mix, text-mining, etymology

Amitav Ghosh is an Indian writer whose work reflects a postcolonial consciousness. His fiction highlights colonial and postcolonial issues of identity, rootlessness and multiculturalism. The *Ibis* trilogy is an intertextual saga where different characters, of different social background such as Deeti, a young widow of an opium dealer, Kalua, an over-sized low-caste, Paulette , an orphan French girl or a bankrupt *raja*, and of different ethnic origin end up in a medley setting and as a motley crew on a slave ship. In the first novel, *Sea of Poppies*, the reader is carried back in time in the South Indian opium trade period, where, after advancing on the social scale, all characters collide and start to see each other as comrades, forming an unlikely alliance that goes beyond conventional bonds of family and nation. Destiny brings these characters

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup>This article is a revised and updated version of the subchapter "The Ibis Chrestomathy-A Glossary of Migrant Words" from my book: *Cultural and Linguistic Hybridity in Postcolonial Text* published at Lambert Academic Publishing, Saarbrucken, 2015(pp. 17-24).

and many others together on *Ibis*, an old slaving ship which sails across the Indian Ocean, towards the Mauritius ("Mareech") Islands. Their only way out of it is to cross their own ethnic, cultural and most significantly, *linguistic* borders.

Beside its narrative features, the most outstanding aspect of the novel is its multilingualism. This setting, the vessel, is portrayed by Ghosh as a metaphor for a huge womb where the characters are socially reborn while the language mix embedded in this narrative turns the reader into a multilingual and multicultural researcher and establish the author as a significant representative of the category of "hybrid" writers (Bhabha, 2004: 55). What strikes the unadvised reader is the multilingual and multicultural mix which Ghosh manages to build in spite of the limits of the period of the events. William Rycroft notices the disorienting effect that the language style of the novel hason the reader, an effect similar to the nadsat language introduced by A. Burgess in A Clockwork Orange which gradually turns into a rich and exciting mix of languages.(Rycroft Just William's). By mixing so many languages and dialects, Ghosh is able to paint the full range of diversity on board with differences in class, caste, nationality or religion indicated by the words, dialect or language used to communicate. From the first pages of the novel, we are bombarded with an abundance of words and terms from East-Asian, Pacific and pidgin languages which apparently turn the text into an unreadable Finnegan's Wake-like narrative. The author himself states in his acknowledgements page that the cultural and linguistic mix from his book owes a lot to the 19<sup>th</sup> century scholars and many reference books, dictionaries as well as to modern sources. (Ghosh 2009: 531)

Sea of Poppies has its own lexicon, an addendum that Ghosh entitled *The Ibis Chrestomathy*. Taking an inquisitive look both at the novel and at this lexicon, one is more than puzzled by the transliterated coinages which seem unreadable to an unadvised non-native English-speaking reader. Therefore, I believe that some helpful tools to disambiguate these coinages are the study of the sources used by the author to track their etymology as well as the use of the latest text-mining research software such as AntConc or MONK(Metadata Offers New Knowledge). I focused then on the *addendum* Ghosh equipped his novel with, by digitally charting the diverse etymology of the transliterated coinages appearing in the novel using the digital version of the novel and the AntConc 3.2.4wsoftware (text-mining freeware developed by the Literary and Linguistic Computing Department at Princeton University). Moreover, I will discuss the division the author makes between the entries labeled as *the* + and the rest.

As I mentioned earlier, when discussing the multicultural and multilingual aspects of *Sea of Poppies*, the linguistic *heteroglossia* (in Bakhtinian terms) of the novel reflects the diversity on board the Ibis schooner. Readers are stunned by the abundance of words and terms from East-Asian, Pacific and *pidgin* languages and their transliteration puzzles most readers. *The Ibis Chrestomathy* clarifies these misunderstandings. However, I consider that a closer look at the etymology of these words and phrases and a taxonomy of their origin might offer more insight on the linguistic hybridism of the novel.

#### *Text -mining research tools used for etymological analysis: Sea of Poppies*-digital Kindle e-book (published by Amazon) *The Ibis Chrestomathy (online version)* AntConc 3.2.4wsoftware

# Results

Origin of words and the number of entries:

Hindi	Bengali	Persian	Laskari	Arabic	Portuguese	Mandarin	Cantonese	Malay	Turkish	Italian	Tamil	Other
116	22	10	36	18	26	5	10	5	4	4	5	10

# Fig. 1

In figures 1 and 2, one may notice the linguistic hybridism of the text which, of course, reflects the multilingual nature of the content of the novel. Hindi is the logical dominant as the author himself is a native Hindi speaker followed by Laskari, the language of the lascars<sup>2</sup> or the sailors' *pidgin* dialect, Portuguese, another 'sailing' language and Bengali, the second major language spoken on the Indian sub-continent. As far as the usage of Laskari language in sailing context is concerned, Ghosh explains:

Laskari (...) was really just a language of command. For the rest, the *lascars* probably used, amongst themselves, a series of contact languages and pidgins, made up of elements of Swahili, Malay, and

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> Lascar n. a sailor from India or SE Asia. *Concise Oxford English Dictionary* (ed. Soanes, c. and Stevenson, A.), 2004. p.804.

Hindusthani. To communicate with officers and white passengers (...) they probably used variants of the Sino-Portuguese-English pidgin that came to be associated with the South China Coast. (Ghosh, *Of Fanas and For castles* 56)

We also encounter a mixture of sea slang and words and phrases of many different origins, from English Creole to South Asian languages and dialects.







At the outset of *The Ibis Chrestomathy*, the author explains how his transliterated coinages rely on the entries in his glossary, entries which "deserved" to be part of it:

But let there be no mistake: the Chrestomathy deals solely with words that have *a claim to naturalization* within the English language. Indeed the epiphany out of which it was born was Neel's discovery, in the late 1880s, that a complete and authoritative lexicon of the English language was under preparation: this was of course, the **Oxford English Dictionary** ...(called the **Oracle**). Neel saw at once that the Oracle would provide him with an authoritative almanac against which to judge the accuracy of his predictions. (Ghosh *The Ibis Chrestomathy*)

Therefore, most words had already found a place in an English dictionary, lexicon or a word-list. Thus, the first category is *the* +*entries* category

and this refers to the words which had been included in the so-called "Oracle"- *The Oxford English Dictionary*. He disambiguates this matter as follows:

After the **Oracle** has spoken the name of a word, the matter is settled: from then on the expression in question is no longer (or no longer only) Bengali, Arabic, Chinese, Hind, Laskari or anything else – in its *English incarnation*(italics mine), it is to be considered *a new coinage*(italics mine), with a new persona and a renewed destiny. (Ghosh The *Ibis*)

The second category is the *Roebuck entries* category which consists of words and expressions included in Thomas Roebuck's work of lexicography: *An English And Hindostanee Naval Dictionary Of Technical Terms And Sea Phrases.* 

A third category of entries is the *Glossary entries*. *Glossary* is the shortened title from Henry Yule and A.C.Burnell's *Glossary Of* Colloquial Anglo-Indian Words And Phrases, And Of Kindred Terms, Etymological, Historical, Geographical And Discursive.

A fourth category is the *Barney-Book entries* and it refers to the words included in Albert Barrère and Charles Leland's *Dictionary of Slang, Jargon & Cant.* 

Admiral entries are words appearing in Admiral W.H. Smyth's Sailor's Word-Book while Linkister entries category contains a list of words used by *liaison* men and pidgin translators in business talk.

Apart from these categories, there is a category which I named *untagged entries* as there is no link as to their inclusion in a dictionary or lexicon. (See figure 3).

Entries category	Samples	Origin	English transl. (Ibis Chrestomathy)		
+ entries	+ bobachee + bandanna + sahib + Hookum + oolta-poolta + bankshall + seersucker +kameez/kameeze + shamshoo + chop-chop +cumra/kamra/camera + sepoy/seapoy + calico	Hindi Hindi Laskari Laskari Bengali Persian Arabic Mandarin Cantonese Portuguese Turkish Malay	Chrestomathy) n. cook n. scarf n. master n. command adv.upside down n. shed n.cotton material n. chemise n. bad wine adv. quickly n. chamber n.colonial		
			mercenary n. cotton cloth		
*Roebuck	*agil	Hindi	adv. forward		
entries	*begaree *boya *kalmariya *mura	Bengali Laskari Portuguese Italian	n. beggar n. buoy adj. calm n. tack		
Glossary	chownee galee/girley/gali shoke/shauq buncus	Hindi Bengali Arabic Malay	n. encampment n. obscenities n. hobby v. to cheer		
Barney- Book	cursy/coorsy/kursi arkati	Laskari Hindi	n.cross- tree(nautical) ship's pilot		
Admiral	nuddee	Bengali	n. ditch		
Linkister	cow-chilo	Cantonese	n. light woman		
untagged entries	Girmitiya Priya Karibat	Bhojpuri Sanskrit Tamil	n.a language guru adj. free n. Indian meal		

# Fig. 3

To conclude with, in Sea *of Poppies* and *The Ibis Chrestomathy*, Ghosh creates a unique lexicon of the early 19th-century cultural references where its multicultural and multilingual dimension is in the limelight. By doing this, he may well be equated with other postcolonial writers such as Salman Rushdie or Derek Walcott whose lifetime quest has been that of cultural border crossing and multicultural communion. This hybrid mix Ghosh builds in this novel has both an illuminating and a dizzying effect on the readers which turns them into intratextual and intertextual textminers.

# References

Bhabha, H. K.2004. The Location of Culture. Abingdon: Routledge.
Ghosh, A.2009. Sea of Poppies. London: John Murray Publishers.
Ghosh, A.2012. Sea of Poppies. Kindle e-book.(Amazon).
TheIbisChrestomathyat http://www.amitavghosh.com/chrestomathy.html
Of Fanas and Forecastles: The Indian Ocean and Some Lost
Languages of the age of Sail at
http://www.jstor.org/discover/10.2307/40277589?uid=3738920&uid=2
&uid=4&sid=21103487698663.
Rycroft. W. "Just William's Luck" at
http://justwilliamsluck.blogspot.ro/2008/09/children-of-ship.html.

# Images of the Jews in Patrick Leigh Fermor's *Between the Woods and the Water*

## **Dan H. Popescu** Partium Christian University, Oradea

**Abstract:** Images of the Jews have often been employed in literature written in English, in various genres, travelogue among them. Patrick Leigh Fermor's book, *Between the Woods and the Waters*, starts in Hungary and ends in Transylvania, where Jewish communities have found themselves a place along the centuries, up to their today's vanishing point. The author's narrative is made even more challenging by the predominantly conservative background of the historical realities of the prewar world, against which they are presented.

Key words: travelogues, Central Europe, 1930s, images of the Jews

#### 1. Introduction

Our paper is devoted to a travelogue that happens to deal with Central European realities of the 1930s, yet with the observation that the story was told almost half a century after Patrick Leigh Fermor had concluded his travel. Nevertheless, just like any other adventure or enterprize, travel and its writing are processes of self-definition during which figures of the Other emerge, "as the self specifies, and often rejects, what is not," according to John Neubauer (Neubauer, Pope 2010: 289) In this respect, two categories of the Others could be described with reference to Central Europe, as the author of the last statement also believes. First come the *types*, in which Dracula and Golem played the mythic dimension, and then the *stereotypes*, for which the Roma and the Jews ethnically performed a transnational function.

What Patrik Leigh Fermor more or less uncovered during the pre-WWII Golden Age, in termes of the representation of *stereotypes*, had not been new either to countries from Mittel Europe or to his British background back home. When comparing, for instance, the ways Gypsies and Jews were represented in nineteenth-century literature in Britain, Deborah Epstein Nord notices that the two ethnic groups "haunted each other throughout [it] as persecuted and stateless people" and that they provided an interesting opportunity to theorists for pairing the analysis of the discourses of orientalism and anti-Semitism. (apud Jusova, in Neubauer, Pope 2010: 374)

Such theoretical guesses were far from being a major concern for the young Leigh Fermor, who had turned nineteen two months before crossing the border from Slovakia into Hungary, on the Easter evening of 1934, when the second part of his travel, as described in *Between the Woods and the Water*, actually started. Still, both in that book and its sequel, *The Broken Road*, he could not help noticing that anti-Semitism was rampant and striking when talking to many of his wonderful hosts, first in Hungary and later in Romania. For them, "a dislike of Jews was seen not as a prejudice but as a natural response" (Cooper, 2013: 88) Too young to engage in a constructive argument, he must have dropped it before reaching a critical point. Fifty years later, he probably was too wise and sadly aware of the tragedies that had devastated Europe during the war as to insist on them in a book that was looking back *in bliss*, not in *anger*:

A subconscious wisdom might almost have been guiding this stretch of the journey and when it came to an end south of the Danube, it struck me, climbing through Balkan passes at my earlier brisk pace, how unusual were the regions I had just traversed: they had begun to take on a glow of retrospective magic which the intervening halfcentury had enhanced. (Leigh Fermor: 12)

# 2. Brits and anti-Semites

On December 9 1933, the future master of the travel genre was leaving Britain aboard *Stadhouder Willem*, waving from the deck to his friends "who were shouting their last goodbyes from the top of Tower Bridge." (Cooper 2013: 38) He was going to walk through the Netherlands for the next five days and reach the German border on 15 December. Soon he would notice the parading of storm troopers and a very interesting episode in a tavern revealed the complex atmosphere of the time.<sup>1</sup> While listening to a group of them singing in stunning harmony, he was intrigued by "the charm [that] made it impossible (...) to connect the singers with

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> The episode can be found in *A Time of Gifts*, the first part of his intended trilogy.

organized bullying of Jewish shop windows and nocturnal bonfires of books" (as qtd in Cooper: 42)

In the same December 1933, the future Dame Edith Sitwell was writing to an anguished Jewish friend, sharing her feelings towards the cruelty and the cretinism of the Nazis, which she claimed to understand. She also wanted to reassure her friend "that such outrages against decency and sense will (n)ever occur in England. We know too well what our Jewish citizens have done for us." (as qtd in Hackett, Hauser, Wachman 2010: 213) Edith Sitwell seemed to have completely forgotten the omnipresent anti-Semitism that, in 1926. had accompanied Gertrude Stein when the American author had responded to her invitation to visit Britain. While recording the Sitwells' tea party, Virginia Woolf wrote that "Jews swarmed. It was in honour of Miss Gertrude Stein (...) Leonard, being a Jew himself, got on very well with her. But it was an anxious, exacerbating affair." (Wagner-Martin 1995: 184)

The paradoxical stance of Virginia Woolf, apparently appaled by the overwhelming presence of the Jews, among whom her husband was to be counted, speaks forth about the ambiguous attitude of the British and European cultural elites with regard to the issue of anti-Semitism. A rather notorious case nowadays, but either gently or cowardly overlooked at the time, was the ocurrence of anti-Semitic lines in T.S. Eliot's poems *Gerontion* and *Burbank*, as well as in the lectures delivered in the same 1933 and published one year later under the title *After Strange Gods*.<sup>2</sup> Nevertheless, Eliot would sometimes issue statements such as 'anti-Semitism is incompatible with a perfect Christian faith' or 'anti-Semitism is not possible in my Christian faith' (as qtd in Julius 1996: 32) The weirdness of this attitude, especially in relation to his work, has been therefore sharply exposed:

Of the many different kinds of anti-Semite, Eliot was the rarest kind: one who was able to place his anti-Semitism at the service of his art. Anti-Semitism supplied part of the material out of which he created poetry. I do not ask the biographical question: what made Eliot an anti-Semite? Instead, I ask: of what was Eliot's anti-Semitism made, and what did Eliot make out of his anti-Semitism. These are the literary criticism's questions. (Julius 1996: 11)

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> Interestingly enough, Eliot was a good friend of Ezra Pound, who was to become infamous for his anti-Semitic discourses/broadcasts during WWII.

# **3. Defining Anti-Semitism and locating it in Central Europe**

# 3.1. Defining Anti-Semitism

Coined in 1860 by the Jewish German scholar Moritz Steinschneider, in response to Ernest Renan's prejudices with regard to the inferiority of the Semitic races, the term *anti-Semitism* – although confusing in the sense that it covered, initially, the idea of language not race –, became fully functional in the years to follow, and was accepted by both parties involved in the argument. Stil, temporal and spatial variations in anti-Semitism are difficult to explain, although in the beginning modernisation seemed to thoroughly account for its rising. Jews were probably more adaptable to economic circumstances, the result of their being forced to relocate so many times in the course of history, and consequently they were more prone to take over *even* better positions.

And if misogyny is "a contempt of women deriving from an adverse and false conception of them as sex [...] anti-Semitism likewise is a [...] contempt of Jews deriving from an adverse and false conception of them as a people." (Julius 1996: 24) Being rootless, i.e. without a motherly soil, and sometimes ruthless (read *pragmatic*), their actions could have been perceived as either desecrating or economically and socially destructive. For Alphonse Toussenel, the anglophobic and anti-Semitic French naturalist, writer and journalist "the destruction of pristine [French] nature [was] primarily the work of foreigners, to a large degree Jews, capitalists and industrialists who had contempt for the common people" (apud Lindemann 221, as qtd by Pynsent in Neubauer, Pope: 348)

Toussenel's reaction in the second half of the 19th century might be underestimated as a mere individual one, and the same could be thought of Eliot's, in the third decade of the 20th century. The distinction between an individual and a popular response to the presumed threat is something worth pondering over, yet even for some Jewish scholars their dynamics is hard to understand. "Nor does any theory explain why levels of popular anti-Semitism tended to be higher in Germany and Romania than in Great Britain and Italy.", says William Brustein when referring to the 1930s and highlighting the fact that Germany and Austria were not the only countries in Europe to enact anti-Semitic laws at the time. A special mention in his book is on the Goga-Cuza government, installed on December 28, 1937 in Romania, a government that lasted only fourtyfour days, although it must have had some popular support: The revocation of the press privileges of Jewish journalists, the ban on nearly all the Jewish newspapers, the dismissal of Jews from public payrolls, the withdrawal of liquor licenses from Jewish proprietors, and the ban on Jews employing non-Jewish female servants under the age of forty were among the first measures adopted by the new government. (Brustein 2003: 247)

# 3.2. Figures, history and (non)fiction

Patrick Leigh Fermor had been living for one year already in 1937 Romania. He had concluded his walk across Europe, from Rotterdam to Constatinople, started in December 1933, as previously mentioned. Yet just like a long distance runner, who goes for one more lap instead of stopping in order to take a deep breath and enjoy the finish, he reverted to Mount Athos and then to Athens. It was there that he met, in the spring of 1935, Balasha Cantacuzene, a Romanian princess with imperial Byzantine roots who was to become his first great love. After spending some months together at a mill in Lemonodassos, painting and writing, they moved to Băleni, Balasha's estate near Galați, in Romania, from where he left in 1939 when the war broke out.

So, all in all, a Romanian time span for Patrick Leigh Fermor of aproximately three years, during which extreme legal provisions were taken against Jews, who, according to official records (Brustein 2003: 246) constituted two-thirds of the white-collar workers, almost 80 percent of employees of banks and commercial enterprises and even 40 percent of lawyers. The brokers on the Bucharest stock exchange were probably all Jewish, and with "such statistics in hand, Romanian anti-Semites had little difficulty in making their case against Jewish domination" (ibid).

Not much of all these seemed to stir Leigh Fermor's curiosity, as he continued – in a kind of splendid spiritual oasis as in *Les Grandes Meaulnes* –, to read French books at Băleni, ride and write, travel to remote corners of Romania, and interact with aristocratic and cultural elites. However, he produced produced very few pages on his long *staying* in Romania, during which he must have found out about so many aspects, anti-Semitism included. He wrote almost exclusively about his *travels* across Europe, Romania included, only fifty years after that.

He does mention, in *The Broken Road*, for instance, that Jews must have filled in the gap between aristocracy and peasantry, i.e. the lack of a proper middle class. And it is in *The Broken Road* that he tells us, against the background of his travel in southern Romania<sup>3</sup> in the autumn

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>3</sup> In Wallachia/Muntenia, which together with Moldavia used to be known as Vechiul Regat/the Older Kingdom.

of 1934,<sup>4</sup> that one of his Hungarian (aristocrat) hosts, probably portrayed in *Between the Woods and the Water*,<sup>5</sup> had given him emblematic books to read, such as *The Protocols of the Elders of Sion* or the *Semi-Gotha*. The latter had, apparently, been written with the purpose "to illustrate the deliberate infiltration [of the aristocratic families] by the Jews as part of their scheme to dominate the world" (Cooper, 2013: 88).

In 1936, while in Britain for a brief period, Leigh Fermor met Edith Sitwell's brother, Sacheverell,<sup>6</sup> a famous poet and art critic, who was glad to collect as much as possible first-hand information about Romania. *Sachie*, as friends used to call him, had been invited to travel to it by princess Anamaria Callimachi, and he managed to write an entire book, published in 1938, based on his (only) four-week journey in 1937. He wrote about places such as Voroneţ, for instance, making exquisite remarks on the exceptional beauty of the late Byzantine mural paintings/frescoes. But he also wrote about minorities like Gypsies, Lipovens and Jews, and some of his considerations on the last ethnic group are rather creepy:

This Jewish population has begun to swarm, and it is difficult to see what form of emigration can be of any help to it. Palestine has, already, absorbed more than its fair proportion of colonists. (...) The question of the Jews in Eastern Europe would seem, in fact, to be insoluble. But it is a problem which becomes, yearly, of increasing importance and, soon, it will have to be faced, resolutely, and some attempts made to cope with its dangers and mutual hardships. When that happens it is certain that the question must be treated as a whole, and not in part. (Sitwell 2011)

## 4. From a scholarly impromtu to a full academic sesssion

## 4.1. Strangers in the dark

Unlike Sacheverell Sitwell's book, which contains a considerable number of pages on the Jewish population in Romania, Patrick Leigh Fermor has

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>4</sup> Where it was the peasants who seemed to be more affected by the prejudice against Jews,

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>5</sup> And probably from Transylvania, which joined Vechiul Regat/the Older Kingdom in 1918 to form Romania.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>6</sup> "I can't exactly remember when I first met Sachie, which is odd, because I had been an admirer of his poetry from the age of thirteen. [...] I feel I must have met Sachie and Georgia at last in the house of Princess Anne Marie Callimachi and Costa Achillopoulo, in 1936" (Patrick Leigh Fermor, "Notes on Sachie", in File 328 from Patrick Leigh Fermor archive at the National Library of Scotland)

rather few episodes on the subject, both in his notes and the travelogues. Nevertheless, the most powerful image the reader retaines from his first night in Romania, when crossing the border from Hungary, in *Between the Woods and the Water*, is that of a group of "bearded and spectacled rabbis in long black overcoats and wide hats" who "had climbed out of the end-carriage" and "were attended by students with elf-locks corkscrewing down their wax-pale cheeks" (Leigh Fermor 1988: 84) Later in the book, when meeting two young man about his age with a similar look, he would confess of feeling guilty for "wishing their corkscrew-locks away", i.e. expressing his incapacity to accommodate a truly benign image of an Other.

The elders provided an even more striking picture, and at the time Leigh Fermor could not possibly know that he was going to see that again in northern Moldavia and Bukovina and in Jerusalem in front of the Wailing Wall. The sentence "they wore soft-legged Russian boots and black caftans and the foxes' brushes coiled round their low-crowned beaver hats exactly matched the beard of one of them" (ibid) highlights the picturesque and the pictorial dimension of the scholarly impromptu on the platform in Decebal<sup>7</sup> railway station. Their unusual appearance and the attempts at guessing their origin – Southern Poles from Cracow or Przemysl" –, and religious denomination – "perhaps belonging to the zealot sect of Hasidim" –, somehow resonates with a fragment from Sacheverell Sitwell's description of Hotin, viewed as a place that entertains a sort of "wild fantasy. [...] It resembles the paintings of Marc Chagall, who, I believe, is a Galician Jew. No doubt Hotin would be a discovery to a painter. (Sitwell 2011)

Anyway, in his book, Patrick Leigh Fermor appeared to be less concerned with their appearance than it was with their history and culture. While at Kápolnás/Căpâlna as a guest to Count Jenö Teleki, he would discuss with his host various theories about the origin of different Jewish groups, such as the Ashkenazi, who were thought to spring from the inhabitants of the old Khazar empire. A certain fascination with languages and documents is obvious when reading Leigh Fermor's travelogue. He never abandons a theory that might lead him, at least on the path of imagination, to even more remote geographical and spiritual places. In a note to this Căpâlna episode he remembers how that particular theory later surfaced in another discussion and then in a book by a famous British, born Hungarian, Jewish writer:

The memory of Count Jenö's prepossesions croped up at luncheon with Arthur Koestler in an Athens taverna about twenty years ago.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>7</sup> A temporary name of Curtici before WWII, given by the Romanian authorities of the time.

Immediately allert, Koestler said it had interested him too, but he didn't know as much about it as he would like. A year or two later *The Thirteenth Tribe* appeared, causing a stir among Jewish historians. Could this taverna conversation have been the impulse that prompted him to take it up again? It is too late to ask him. (Leigh Fermor 1988: 113)

# 4.2. "Ye mountains of Gilboa, let there be no dew..."

It was somewhere in the Carpathian mountains, going down south, on his way to the Danube, that Patrick Leigh Fermor had the opportunity to interact with a Jewish scholar, bearded and black beaver hatted, who, "most incongruously seated at a table [...] was poring over a large and well-thumbed book, his spectacles close to the print." (Leigh Fermor 1988: 196) He had come from Satu-Mare, together with his two sons, to spend two weeks in the company of his brother, the foreman of a timber concession. In a stereotypified prediction, yet enforced by a cultural reference to a pre-Raphaelite painting, Leigh Fermor managed to capture the iconicity of the rabbi's image: "In a few years' time he would look exactly like one of the elders in The Temple by Holman Hunt and this is exactly what he was." (ibid)

The gap between the two cultures and religions is highlighted when the author's interlocutors want to find out the reasons for his traveling. Since he was not clear himself whether it was about seeing the world, studying or learning languages, and all he managed to produce for an answer was "for fun", their reaction was understandable and also predictable, i.e. within the frames of their spirituality. ""Es ist a goyim naches!", they said (...) something that the goyim like but which leaves Jews unmoved." (Leigh Fermor 1988: 197) Unlike the young British, the two sons of the rabbi "were marked for religion" and that did not relate only to their appearance. It was something internalized after centuries of persecution, after having realized that skill and flair were an illusion, in spite of offering "chances of survival, prosperity and brilliant achievement" (Leigh Fermor 1988: 202)

The preoccupation of the Rabbi and his sons – the columns of blackletter, hedged about with the glosses and footnotes and rubrics of two or three thousand years, represented the true aim of existence; something to be pursued and loved in secret and behind barred shutters: their scriptures, their poetry, their philosophy and their laws. (Leigh Fermor 1988: 203) No wonder the climax of the meeting is reached when the Torah is approached and some fragments, also popular in England,<sup>8</sup> are recited by the Jews, who felt elated by the young British's passion for languages and books. They even regretted for the day not being the Sabbath so that they could ask him to perform the role of the *shabas goy*, "the Sabbath-gentile whom well-off Jews [...] employed in their houses to light fires and lamps and tie and untie knots or perform the many tasks the Law forbids on the Seventh Day." (Leigh Fermor 1988: 199) Nevertheless, the excitement of the intensely intellectual debate is somehow to be read against the remark on his former prejudices: "I had thought I could never get on friendly terms with such unassailable-looking men." (ibid)

# 5. Conclusion

Although aware of the anti-Semitic actions of the Nazis and of their followers, the Jews' reaction, as accounted by Leigh Fermor fifty years later, did not seem to properly assess the dangers, i.e. the upcoming tragedy of the Holocaust. "In Germany, meanwhile, terrible omens were gathering, though how terrible none of us knew." (Leigh Fermor 1988: 197) Hitler is dismissed as if it were a bad dream, a "transitory aberration". Moreover, they were not pleased with their change of citizenship, as they still felt patriotic about Hungary. The reasons for such an attitude could be found in the better positions they used to have as Hungarian citizens, in spite "of an endemic anti-Jewish feeling in Hungary". (Leigh Fermor 1988: 201)

Actually, Central Europe before and during WWII was well known for such ambivalence toward ethnic identity, as it was documented from different sorts of writings. A notorious case is that of the poet Miklós Radnóti, who was killed in 1944, while marching in a labor batallion, to which he had been asigned although he had converted to Catholicism in 1943:

I never denied my Jewishness and I still belong to the Jewish faith [...] but I do not feel like a Jew [...]. My Jewishness has become a "problem of life," forced upon me by circumstance, the [Jewish] laws, the world itself. [...] In all other respects I consider myself a Hungarian poet. (in *Napl*ó 210 – as qtd by Jolanta Jastrezębska, in Neubauer, Pope 2010: 488)

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>8</sup> "Ye mountains of Gilboa, let there be no dew..." among them.

#### Dan H. Popescu

According to his biographer, Patrick Leigh Fermor expressed his unhappiness, with regard to some of the Central European realities of the 1930s that ended in Holocaust, "in his later writing more than in the diary written at the time" (Cooper 2013: 88) The truth is that only one has been preserved, *The Green Diary*<sup>9</sup>, as as series of unfortunate events led to the loss of all the others. So we can not be sure about the extent of the information received on the topic of Jewishness and anti-Semitism and of his reaction to it. Through the looking glass of the late 1970s and the late 1980s, while in his early sixties and early seventies, respectively, the writer might have preferred to leave behind traumatic images and interactions and retain only the glow of an enchanting age. Central Europe's Golden age and his as well. That glow is to be felt even in the words he used to ponder over the fate of the Jewish people, after the encounter analyzed in our paper, giving his readers a little bit of Sahkespeare and quite enough sorrow:

Their period of mundane glory passed away; hard days followed; and by the time it had given birth to Christianity and then to Islam, Judaism was in the position of a King Lear hag-ridden by Goneril and Regan, but with no part written for Cordelia, or anyone to act it. (Leigh Fermor, 1988: 201)

## References

- Brustein, William Roots of Hate: Anti-Semitism in Europe Before the Holocaust, Cambridge: Cambridge University Press 2003
- Cooper, Artemis Patrick Leigh Fermor. An Adventure, London: John Murray 2013
- Cornis-Pope, M. & Neubauer, J. History of the Literary Cultures of East-Central Europe: Types and Stereotypes, Vol IV, Philadelphia & Amsterdam: John Benjamins Publishing, 2010
- Hackett, R. & Hauser, F. & Wachman, G. (eds) *At Home and Abroad in the Empire: British Women Write the 1930s*, Newark, Cranbury NJ: University of Delaware Press 2010
- Julius, Anthony T. S. Eliot, Anti-Semitism, and Literary Form, Cambridge & New York: Cambridge University Press 1996
- Leigh Fermor, Patrick Between the Woods and the Water, London & New York: Penguin Books 1988
- Sitwell, Sacheverell A Romanian Journey, Bloomsbury Publishing 2011
- Wagner-Martin, Linda Favored Strangers: Gertrude Stein and Her Family, New Brunswick, N.J.: Rutgers University Press 1995

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>9</sup> Made available online in August 2016, on the site of the National Library of Scotland.

# W. B. Yeats: At the Hawk's Well: an Eastern Mythical Play

Éva Székely University of Oradea

**Abstract:** W.B. Yeats was both a cultural nationalist dramatist and an experimental playwright. The two sides of his creative personality can be well-observed in his first dance play: At the Hawk's Well, which is also one of his eastern mythical plays. The content of the play was inspired by Gaelic mythology, while its form was influenced by the highly stylized Japanese Noh drama of which Yeats was particularly fond of. My paper is a short analysis of the way in which our playwright managed to bring on the stage a specifically Irish content with the means of the symbolic Japanese Noh.

**Key words**: W.B. Yeats, Anglo-Irish Drama, dance plays, Noh theatre, At the Hawk's Well

Yeats's mythical plays comprise all his dramas that were inspired from Gaelic myths, more precisely from the Gaelic myths he read in Lady Gregory's collections of translations of Irish myths entitled *Cuchulain of Muirthemne* and *Gods and Fighting Men*. Dramatizing heroic legends was one of Yeats's ways to fight on behalf of Irish nationality against the cosmopolitan spirit which was rapidly obliterating all distinctions.

I may say, to give a little weight to my words, that the greater portion of my own writings has been founded [sic!] upon the old literature of Ireland. I have had to read it in translations, but it has been the chief illumination of my imagination all my life. The movement I am connected with, the whole poetic movement of modern Ireland, has drawn a great portion of its inspiration from the old Bardic literature. (Yeats: *Senate Speeches* 44)

The Irish Literary Revival of the late nineteenth century sought to redefine the country's present by recalling the past world of nobility and bravery. For writers of the period, recovery of the era of legend was recovery of heroic Ireland. They appropriated from the sagas the exemplary figure of Cuchulain, the only active warrior hero of the tales, a hero for whom honor was more important than life. From the mythic world of alleged male valor, moreover, a female figure was also appropriated – Deirdre, the tragic heroine. She, too, was celebrated in poetry, prose and drama of the Revival.

By dramatizing famous Irish myths Yeats desired to achieve more than merely reminding his contemporaries of the glories of a past age. He wanted to provide his nation with a set of heroic dramas that he hoped would bring international recognition for the long forgotten cultural heritage of Ireland. Hence his obsession to create a distinctive dramatic form that would match a distinctive national content.

The material he worked with was of a peculiar nature. Unlike Greek or Roman mythology that present the reader with the heyday of an ancient imaginary realm. Irish mythical tales tell of a world past its prime, a world in which the Gods, the inhabitants of the Sidhe (the fairy mounds of Ireland), "exert no moral authority, and while they can injure and heal, they do not have the power over life and death characteristic of the Greek Olympians. Often they seem just like ordinary humans" (Gantz 15-6). On a par with their languid deities, the warrior heroes of Irish mythology, excepting Cuchulain, talk more than they act. Cuchulain himself falls short of true heroism, his deeds being more often superhuman than heroic. As they feature a society in decline, "in many of the best-known and important [Irish mythical] tales", observes Jeffrey Gantz, "there are clear instances of parody" (25). Withering as the Irish mythical world may be, it is still an alluring world, especially alluring for an author with a marked interest in mystical cults such as theosophy or Rosicrucianism. The ancient Gaels had an unusual view of the Otherworld, which in most mythologies appears as the exclusive realm of the gods and the dead. The Otherworld of Irish mythology appears as an alternative to and not a continuation of reality, i.e. real life experience. Irish heroes do not enter it upon their death, but upon the invitation of one of its supernatural inhabitants, and they can leave it at will. The deliberate move of Irish heroes between the two realms (historical Ireland and the mythic otherworld of the Sidhe) and the infirmity of the Gaelic gods is most probably the explanation of the "tension between reality and fantasy that characterizes all Celtic art" (Gantz 1), a tension that must have appealed to Yeats, ever-sensitive to supernatural and spiritual experience.

Scholars of Irish mythology have classified Irish mythical tales into four groups called cycles: *TheMythological Cycle*, comprising stories of the Gaelic gods and of the origins of the Irish; *TheUlster Cycle*, made up of a group of heroic tales dealing with the lives of Conchubar mac Nessa, the indolent king of Ulster, the great hero Cuchulain and of their
friends, lovers, and enemies; *TheKing's Cycle*, which focuses on the activities of the Gaelic historical kings; and *The Fenian Cycle*, which contains stories about Find mac Cumaill and his band of soldiers: the Fianna. As a playwright, Yeats took inspiration mainly from the tales of *The Ulster Cycle*, which he read in Standish O'Grady's and Lady Gregory's renderings, and from the stories of Lady Francesca Wilde's collection of mythical and folk tales entitled: *Ancient Legends, Mystic Charms, and Superstitions of Ireland*.

Yeats's dramatic oeuvre contains nine mythical plays: *The King's Threshold, On Baile's Strand, Deirdre, The Green Helmet, At the Hawk's Well, The Only Jealousy of Emer, Fighting the Waves, The Death of Cuchulain Diarmuid and Grania.* According to their dramatic form they can be classified into two groups: western and eastern plays.

Yeats's Western mythical plays include those mythical dramas for which he adopted a Western dramatic form. Thus *The King's Threshold* is reminiscent of medieval morality plays, *On Baile's Strand* reminds one of the tragedies of Shakespeare, *Deirdre* was written on the model of ancient Greek tragedies, and the form of *The Green Helmet* was inspired by the verse farces written in medieval France. The protagonists of these plays are all idealized heroes pitted against a relentless society, a society that tries to profiteer from their plight. Embittered by contemporary Irish society and contemporary Irish politics, Yeats's Western mythical plays<sup>1</sup> were meant not only to provide the audience with exemplary heroes that they could be proud of, but also to remind as well as warn the Irish people about the disastrous consequences to society that the neglect or wrongful treatment of dedicated leaders and artists can bring about.

The Irish mythical realm depicted in Yeats's Eastern mythical plays, plays the form of which was inspired by Japanese Noh dramas, is markedly different from the mythical world described in his Western mythical plays. If the latter presented men on a par with the gods, the world conjured up in *At the Hawk's Well, The Only Jealousy of Emer*and *The Death of Cuchulain* is a fatalist world, a world in which men are mercilessly manipulated by the all-powerful folk of the Sidhe. (In this respect, the plays deviate from the mythical realm depicted in Irish mythology.) The human protagonists are far from being idealized. (And this is very much in accordance with the way they are portrayed in Irish mythical tales.) They are weak, flawed and gullible. And yet, squalid as this world and its inhabitants may be, there is an inherent beauty to it, an inherent beauty to them. Actually this seems to be the aim of our playwright: to prove that one can find beauty (yugen or

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> at least three of them: *The King's Threshold*, *On Baile's Strand* and *The Green Helmet* 

 $r\bar{o}jaku$ ) in the folly and recklessness of youth, in the embittered jealousy of women, and in the demise of world-weary men.

Yeats's Eastern mythical dramas – in his terminology, dance-plays – were meant for private, non-profit performances in the drawing rooms of his wealthy friends, where the playwright could bank on the presence of a sympathetic audience. But the plays fell short of becoming popular even with his like-minded, cultivated friends. Yeats was fully aware of this:

In writing these little plays I knew that I was creating something which could only fully succeed in a civilization very unlike ours. I think they should be written for some country where all classes share in a half-mythological, half-philosophical folk-belief which the writer and his small audience lift into a new subtlety. All my life I have longed for such a country, and always found it quite impossible to write without having as much belief in its real existence as a child has in that of the wooden birds, beasts, and persons of his toy Noah's Ark. (Yeats: *Four Plays for Dancers*, 106)

Even so, the plays can be relished, if one takes the trouble of deciphering their hidden meanings as F.A.C. Wilson does in *Yeats's Iconography* and in *Yeats and Tradition*, or, and I think this was what Yeats expected his audience to do, by switching off the intellectual part of one's mind and by letting oneself be carried away by whatever emotion the imagery, the sound or the movements of the performance stirs up in us.

### At the Hawk's Well

Produced for the first time in Lady Cunard's drawing-room<sup>2</sup> in 1916 (Yeats: *Collected Works* 871), *At the Hawk's Well* was Yeats's first admitted attempt (Few of his plays were audiences' favorites.) at writing an 'unpopular' play, i.e. a play intended for sympathetic poetry-loving friends and not for Abbey audiences:

I want to create for myself an unpopular theatre and an audience like a secret society where admission is by favour and never to many ... an audience of fifty, a room worthy of it (some great dining-room or drawing-room), half-a-dozen young men and women who can dance and speak verse or play drum and flute and zither, and all the while,

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> Cavendish Square, London (Yeats: *Collected Works* 871)

instead of a profession, I but offer them 'an accomplishment.' ... In most towns one can find fifty people for whom one need not build all on observation and sympathy, because they read poetry for their pleasure and understand the traditional language of passion. I desire a mysterious art, always reminding and half-reminding those who understand it of dearly loved things, doing its work by suggestion, not by direct statement, a complexity of rhythm, colour, gesture, not space-pervading like the intellect but a memory and a prophecy... (P&C 212-3)

It was also his first attempt (and in fact the first attempt in English literature) to write a play on the model of Japanese Noh drama. With it he made a thorough breakthrough in terms of dramatic structure and in the demands that structure made on performers.<sup>3</sup> The audience was presented with a type of dance-drama that was new and unusual in its use of dance, songs, masks, ritual and the austere stylization in terms of design and staging. There had been nothing remotely like this in the English-speaking theatre, as Yeats knew only too well. He could not withhold his excitement over it, and in a letter written to John Quinn<sup>4</sup> before the first performance of the play he said:

I am tired out with the excitement of rehearsing my new play – *The Hawk's Well* [sic!] in which masks are being used for the first time in serious drama in the modern world. Ainley,<sup>5</sup> who is the hero, wears a mask like an archaic Greek statue ... The play can be played in the middle of a room. It is quite short – 30 or 40 minutes ... I hope to create a form of drama which may delight the best minds of my time, and all the more because it can pay its expenses without the others. ... No press, no photographs in the papers, no crowd. I shall be happier than Sophocles. I shall be as lucky as a Japanese dramatic poet at the Court of the Shogun. (Yeats: *Collected Works* 871)

The play starts with the ritual of the unfolding and folding of the cloth meant to set the stage in the imagination of the audience and to introduce the characters of the play. Three musicians carrying musical instruments (a drum, a gong and a zither) and a folded black cloth enter the stage. While slowly unfolding the black cloth they sing:

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>3</sup>One of his innovations was his requirement that actors wear masks which resulted and was meant to depersonalize them as actors.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>4</sup> an Irish-American friend of Yeats, a successful New York lawyer, art patron and collector of manuscripts

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>5</sup> the English Shakespearean actor Henry Ainley

I call to the eye of the mind A well long choked up and dry And boughs long stripped by the wind, And I call to the mind's eye Pallor of an ivory face, Its lofty dissolute air, A man climbing up to a place The salt sea wind has swept bare. (Yeats: *Collected Works* 297-8)

One by one the characters, the Guardian of the well, the Old Man and Cuchulain, emerge. We find out that Cuchulain has traveled across the sea to the holv well to drink from the miraculous water and become immortal. He meets the destitute Old Man who is also craving for eternal life and who has been waiting for fifty years for the well to fill up. They wait for the coming of the holy water but at the crucial moment are distracted by the machinations of Fand, the Hawk-woman, who is the goddess of the locality. The Old Man is distracted by a magical sleep but for Cuchulain's failure to drink of the miraculous water no one can be blamed except himself. Cuchulain as a warrior is not capable to meditate or to govern his own senses. His lack of self-control makes it possible for Fand to drive him away from the well at the very moment when it fills up with miraculous water. She possesses the body of the guardian of the well and playing on Cuchulain's sexual desires, manages to distract him from the well<sup>6</sup> with her luring dance. Cuchulain is distracted both by the desire for the possessed guardian and by his determination to fight the army of Aoife that the Goddess has sent against him. His lack of self-discipline is responsible for his ensuing career of violent and meaningless action and the developing tragedy of his life.<sup>7</sup> The play ends with the ritual of the unfolding and folding of the cloth.

The Irish source of inspiration for the play was the story entitled *The Boy Deeds of Cuchulain* in Lady Gregory's *Cuchulain of Muirthemne*. According to this tale the young Cuchulain overhears the druid Cathbad foretelling that if a young man took up arms on that day, his name would be greater than any in Ireland but his span of life would be short. He immediately goes to Conchubar and asks him to allow him to take up arms. His request is granted. In the play Cuchulain's ambition is to become immortal. This is the reason for which he visits the miraculous well. His wish to be immortal is granted but not in the way he expected.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>6</sup>This kind of supernatural possession is quite common with Noh plays.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>7</sup>Taken in this way, *At The Hawk's Well* supplies the psychological data for Yeats's whole Cuchulain cycle.

He is presented with a choice and instinctively he chooses to become a warrior, and gain an enduring name in legend.

Matching the degree of Yeats's departure from his mythical source, the setting of the play is Ireland and not Scotland (Aoife's country) as one would expect after being told by the Musicians that it is Aoife's army that Cuchulain would battle with at the end of the play. According to Natalie Crohn Schmitt, the well in the play is the ancient Tullaghan Well in Co. Sligo:

In county Sligo, at the north-east end of the Ox mountains one mile northeast of Coolaney ... is Hawk's Rock (Carraig-an-Seabhach), about fifteen miles southwest of the town of Sligo. ... The rise of land nearest Hawk's Rock is Tullagan Hill, 430 feet above sea level. ... Approximately ten feet from the top of his hill on the east side and marked by a cairn and a cross, is ... Tullagan Well, one of the marvels of early medieval Ireland. ... The property of that well is, it fills and ebbs like the sea a mile and a half distant. (345-6)

Yeats's well in the play fills less often, only three times in fifty years:

OLD MAN. ... I have lain in wait For more than fifty year to find it empty ... Thrice I have awakened from a sudden sleep To find the stones were wet. (Yeats: *Collected Works* 301-2)

The Hawk's Well can also be sourced to the many supernatural wells that Irish mythology teems with, especially to Connla's Well (or the Well of Segais), which, according to legend, is a source of inspiration and knowledge. Connla's Well is surrounded by magic hazel trees, the nuts of which contain wisdom, knowledge and inspiration. The nuts drop into the well, and the salmon swimming in it eats the nuts. Wisdom, knowledge, and inspiration come to the person who drinks the water of the well or eats the salmon or the nuts. (Davidson 26)

Connla's Well is guarded – supernatural wells usually are. Wisdom, knowledge and inspiration come at a cost, and they are not meant for everyone. A similar message can be deciphered from Yeats's play. Both Cuchulain and the Old Man desire eternal life, but lack of patience and self-control in the case of the former and a total want of courage in the case of the latter prevent them from partaking of it. And this is the point at which one starts to wonder. Why did Yeats choose to write a Noh play? Why not a Greek tragedy? If anything Cuchulain is guilty of hubris: he believes himself entitled to luck through birth. I think Yeats's choice for writing a dance-play inspired by Noh drama is significant in this sense. It is not Cuchulain's hubris that he wants to emphasize, but to suggest the tragic beauty of his failure and the outcome of his failure: a short albeit heroic life. And the principle of 'yugen', which is central to Noh drama, shows that real beauty exists when, through its suggestiveness – only a few words, or a few movements – the play can suggest what has not been said or shown, and hence awaken many inner thoughts and feelings.

Indeed. At the Hawk's Well is suggestive on several levels: on the level of the stage set, the costumes and the masks of the characters, on the level of the characters stylized movement on the stage and on the level of the text of the drama, especially "the elevated, liturgical measures of its choric verse" (Brown, 224), i.e. the songs of the three Musicians. The stage, as Yeats specifies can be "any bare space before a wall against which stands a patterned screen" (Yeats: Collected Works 297). There are no stage props, save for a black cloth with "a golden pattern suggesting a hawk" (Yeats: Collected Works 298), which the musicians unfold at the beginning of the play and fold back at the end in place of the curtain-rise and the curtain-fall of conventional theatre productions, and "a square blue cloth to represent the well" (Yeats: Collected Works 298). The Musicians and the Guardian of the Well (later-on possessed by the Hawkwoman) have "their faces made up to resemble masks" (Yeats: Collected Works 297). The costumes of the Musicians are not specified, but the reader is told that the Guardian of the Well is wearing "a black cloak" (Yeats: Collected Works 298) and under the cloak a dress that "suggests a hawk" (Yeats: Collected Works 304). The Young Man (i.e. Cuchulain) and the Old Man are wearing masks. All the characters move as puppets worked by strings: the Musicians pace "with a rhythmic movement of the arms" (Yeats: *Collected Works*298), the movements of the Old Man "suggest a marionette" (Yeats: *Collected Works* 299), the Guardian possessed by Fand (i.e. the Hawk-woman) dances her climactic dance "moving like a hawk" and Cuchulain acts "as if in a dream" (Yeats: *Collected Works* 305).

The Musicians' songs in the drama, when not delineating the mythical landscape in which the action unfolds, suggest various interpretations of Cuchulain's and the Old Man's decisions and acts. Does it make sense to seek eternal life? Yes, it does and no, it doesn't, the answer is a mere matter of one's point of view, at least this is what the Musicians' songs suggest. Mothers would relish the idea of eternally young and eternally living sons:

A mother that saw her son Doubled over a speckled shin, Cross-grained with ninety years, Would cry, 'How little worth Were all my hopes and fears And the hard pain of his birth' (Yeats: *Collected Works* 298)

The Old Man, who wasted his life in the pursuit of a dream he was incapable to fulfill, should take comfort in the oblivion of sleep: "Why wander and nothing to find? / Better grow old and sleep." (Yeats: *Collected Works* 299) As for Cuchulain's act of daring to look in the Hawk-woman's eyes – an act that not only prevents him from drinking from the miraculous water but also curses him to live a short life and to become the murderer of his own son – the musicians offer two starkly opposing commentaries. First they praise him for his folly of giving up eternal life – "Folly alone I cherish .../I choose a pleasant life / Among indolent meadows" (Yeats: *Collected Works* 306) – but eventually they condemn him for his thoughtlessness of having given up the prospect of family life:

'The man that I praise', Cries out the leafless tree, 'Has married and stays By an old hearth, and he On naught has set store But children and dogs on the floor ...' (Yeats: *Collected Works* 306)

Suggestive on multiple planes, *At the Hawk's Well* succeeds in conjuring up the Irish mythical realm in a way that does justice to the remoteness of

a world in which, according to Jeffrey Gantz "the pride and energy of reality are allied with the magic of beauty and fantasy" (3).

#### References

- Brown, Terence. The Life of W.B. Yeats. Oxford: Blackwell Publishers Ltd, 2001.
- Crohn Schmitt, Natalie. "'Haunted by Places': Landscape in Three Plays by W.B. Yeats". *Comparative Drama*. 31.3 (fall 1997
- Gantz, Jeffrey. Early Irish Myths and Sagas. London: Penguin Books Ltd., 1981;
- Komparu, Kunio. The Noh Theatre: Principles and Perspectives. New York: Waterhill, 1983
- Yeats, W.B. Four Plays for Dancers. London: Macmillan, 1921
- Yeats, W.B. Plays and Controversies. New York: Macmillan, 1924
- Yeats, W.B.&Senate Speeches(ed. Donald R. Pearce). Bloomington: Indiana University Press, 1960
- Yeats, W.B. *The Collected Works of W.B. Yeats Volume II. The Plays* (ed. David R. Clark and Rosalind E. Clark). New York: Scribner, 2001.

# Restatement of Traumatic Experience in Victoria Hislop's Novel *The Island*

### Ingrida Eglė Žindžiuvienė

Vytautas Magnus University, Lithuania

**Abstract.** The article analyses representation of the sea and the island of Crete in the novel *The Island* (2005) by a contemporary British writer Victoria Hislop. The main theme of the novel being the search for identity, the article examines the transformation of human values and discusses restatement of trauma. The fundamental issues of the narrative theory related to the discussion of the place are used in the analysis of the role of the site of trauma in the novel, in which the characters' movement from one place to another acquires the traits of the metaphorical transition. The role of the sea and both islands is described as one of the major issues in the search for personal and national identity: the physical movement from one island to another and strong dependence on the sea symbolize the boundaries of self-definition in order to take up a new identity or rather rediscover the old one. The theme of transition goes alongside the one of restatement of national trauma. Disclosure of the traumatic unknown or the forgotten part of the European history demonstrates distinct features of the trauma novel.

**Key words:** trauma fiction, trauma novel, contemporary fiction, search for identity, collective trauma, personal trauma

#### Introduction

The aim of this article is to provide the interdisciplinary analysis of the representation of the sea and the island of Crete in the novel *The Island* (2005) by a contemporary British writer Victoria Hislop (b. 1959), the author of four well-received novels *The Island* (2005), *The Return* (2008), *The Thread* (2011) and *The Sunrise* (2014). In her first best-seller novel *The Island*, she tells a dramatic story of a traumatic phenomenon in the history of Greece, that is the leprosy, and the history of the colony for these people on the island of Spinalonga, close to Crete. The main theme of the novel being the search for identity, the article examines the

transformation of human values, based on the restatement of trauma on different levels. The fundamental issues of the narrative theory related to the discussion of trauma and the site of it are used in the analysis of the role of the setting in the novel, in which the characters' movement from one place to another acquires the traits of the metaphorical transition.

The protagonist in the novel, Alexis Fielding, a young British woman, discloses the secrets of her family's past when she travels from the UK to Greece and then to Crete, where she finds out more facts about the mysterious family relationship based on the long-time transition between Crete and the small island of Spinalonga, Greece's former leper colony. The novel contains many historical and geographical facts about Crete, and this aspect may bring the novel closer to the genre of historical novel or, partly, travel fiction. However, the symbolic role of the sea and both islands is described as one of the major issues in the search for personal and national identity: with a sensitive description of Spinalonga, a leper colony, the author discloses some parts of the long-forgotten European history and introduces new aspects in the search for European identity. The physical movement between the islands and strong dependence on the sea symbolize the expansion of the boundaries of selfdefinition in order to take up a new identity or rather rediscover the old one. The theme of transition goes alongside the one of restatement of national trauma. This urge to disclose the traumatic unknown or the forgotten part of the European history moves the novel further away from the popular genre of travel literature, as it definitely contains elements of trauma fiction.

First, the article briefly examines features of the trauma novel and surveys the sociohistorical context of Victoria Hislop's novel *The Island*. Further, the collective trauma of the country will be analysed, with the focus on transition from one place to another, which discloses the transgenerational transmittance of traumatic experience.

### **Collective Trauma through Personal Experience in Trauma Fiction**

The "collective memory", including both memoirs and fiction, can in itself become a valuable object of history (Nora 2011: 303). Thus, a nonstraightforwardly referential fictionalized narrative "offers a powerful mode of access to history and memory", so that "referential truth or experience is no longer opposed to fiction but is inextricable from it" (Caruth in Whitehead 2004: 13). Dominick LaCapra observes that trauma fiction can "offer significant insights [...], suggesting lines of inquiry for the work of historians" (LaCapra 2001: 15). Reader-response criticism remains of significant value in the interpretation of contemporary fiction, especially trauma novel, which describes collective traumatic experience. The "community of witnesses" (Whitehead 2004: 8) may include several possible types of readers: a reader-victim, still haunted by traumatic events; a person whose family members were victims; a person who remembers the period of the traumatic events, but was not a victim himself/herself; and a present-day reader of the novel who becomes emotionally involved and turns into a partial participant of the traumatic responses can continue for generations" (Vickroy 2002: 19); therefore, it is possible to expect new forms of fictionalized narratives of multidimensional trauma as well as various forms of restoration of truth.

Trauma fiction is often based on the memories of experiencing a personal or collective traumatic event; thus, usually, the fictional narratives of collective traumas explore both personal and collective dimensions. Anne Whitehead states that "the memory of the Holocaust has been transformed into a cipher for other collective traumas" (Whitehead 2009: 150). Therefore, theorizing trauma fiction may often contain reference to the analysis of Holocaust studies: "the Holocaust has thus become a powerful lens through which we look at other instances of oppression and genocide" (Whitehead 2009: 150). Although the unification of traumatic events may be a dangerous method, Whitehead's standpoint is of great value in discussion of other types of occurrences of collective trauma. A trauma narrative always includes both the reader/listener, whose role may be the one in whom the victim/narrator confides or the one with whom the victim/narrator shares the traumatic experience. Dori Laub observes that "the listener to [or the reader of] the narrative of extreme human pain, of massive psychic trauma, faces a unique situation" (Laub 1992: 57). Dori Laub discusses the acknowledgement of the password, which signals the mutual recognition of shared knowledge. Thus, reading traumatic narratives may result in the "re-externalization" and then, later, in "historicization" of the event (Laub 1992: 69-70). Laub defines the testimonial process as one needing "a bonding, the intimate and total presence of an other - in the position of one who hears" (Laub 1992: 70; italic in the original). Often a trauma novel originates from published memoirs, diaries, reminiscences or manuscripts of the experiences.

The term "trauma novel" refers to a work of fiction that represents an emotional and/or cognitive response to profound loss, disaster, disruption, or devastations on the individual or collective level. Laurie Vickroy states that trauma narrativists "sharpen victims' pain with readers, shifting between what can and cannot be revealed" (Vickroy 2002: 4). The aim of trauma fiction, as Vickroy observes, is "to reshape cultural memory through personal contexts" (Vickroy 2002: 5). Vickroy determines different approaches undertaken by trauma fiction writers: transfer of traumatic responses, an informational approach, or an empathic approach since "literary texts can provide pathways for reader empathy" (Vickroy 2002: 21). Analysing stylistic devices in trauma fiction, Vickroy emphasizes the use of symbols, metaphorical language, flashbacks, and elaboration of "the dynamic relationship between individual and collective memory" (Vickroy 2002: 33). Symbols, when carefully chosen, become a powerful tool in disclosing different dimensions of trauma. Bárbara Arizti notices that "repetition concerning language, imagery or plot is one of the commonest strategies for translating trauma into narrative (Arizti 2011: 177).

In his book Writing History, Writing Trauma (2001), Dominick LaCapra points to the "empathic unsettlement" that a reader of a trauma novel is likely to experience (LaCapra 2001: 78); thus, a trauma novel is based on different levels of the "affective memory" (Nora 2011: 307). Although various types of readers may possess different emotions, the degree of empathy is one of the factors in better understanding the scope and effects of the traumatic event. Vickroy emphasizes dialogism (especially, the narrator-reader dimension) as a structural element of trauma fiction, which becomes particularly significant in describing historical traumas (Vickroy 2002: 183-185). Making a reader experience, or rather re-experience, a traumatic event, a trauma novel, in this case, turns a reader not only into a witness, but also into a victim of a widescope collective trauma. Anne Whitehead has rightly observed that "trauma fiction overlaps with and borrows from both postmodern and postcolonial fiction in its self-conscious deployment of stylistic devices as modes of reflection" (Whitehead 2004: 8); therefore, the forms of reflection can also be interpreted as certain ways of coping with or restating trauma.

An accurate representation of trauma can never be achieved without recreating the event. A textualist approach or, according to Tom Toremans, "a-historical textualism" can supply the readers with other forms of access to history (Toremans 2003: 337). Toremans observes that the reference to a traumatic event is an "ethical charge" that is present as a code in the process of rethinking or restating trauma (Toremans 2003: 339). Facts, or elements of referential truth, are emphasized in trauma fiction. In the trauma novel, the dimension of transmission or even translation of trauma happens simultaneously with the recognition of reality, referential truth, and the "duality between cognition and trope" (Toremans 2003: 340). The aim of this dimension is to achieve a better understanding of a historical reference to the traumatic event: "a process

of imaginative elaboration", which may happen in the collective memory, aims not at excluding historical facts, but, on the contrary, turns history into a tool to help comprehend the scope of a traumatic event, its consequences and its representation in a literary text (Hartman 2003: 260). Thus, a trauma novel as a cultural artifact bears witness to traumatic histories, and contains a series of "retroactive shocks (the après coup dimension), complicating any monocausal picture of that 'first' happening" (Hartman 2003: 262). Geoffrey H. Hartman observes that a literary text can also represent "its [trauma's] double and redoubled blow" (Hartman 2003: 262). In this way, readers and critics can gain access to extreme events and experiences that defv understanding and representation, and consider their belayed effects on the traumatized ones. The basis for a literary text may be the testimonies of the survivors, which, if being "receivable only today" means that "the event begins to be historically grasped and seen" (Laub 1995: 69; italic in the original).

For the survivor of trauma, Cathy Caruth observes, "the truth of the event may reside not only in its brutal facts, but also in the way that their occurrence defies simple comprehension" (Caruth 1995: 153). This reasoning may aid in understanding the dangers that a trauma novel may encounter: as van der Kolk and van der Hart argue, "traumatic memories are the unassimilated scraps of overwhelming experiences, which need to be [...] transformed into narrative language" (van der Kolk and van der Hart 1995: 176). Van der Kolk and van der Hart pose a question whether "it is not a sacrilege of the traumatic experience to play with the reality of the past" and, in doing this, they predict the possible reactions to a trauma novel (van der Kolk and van der Hart 1995: 179).

Trauma narratives can recreate the experience for those who were not there – for example, readers of a trauma novel encounter someone's experience, which may supplement their knowledge or inform them of the tragic event. Historical traumatic experience is the source that marks and defines contemporary individual identity as well as cultural identity. Trauma novels containing the transgenerational sharing of experience of violence, loss and suffering, disclose ethnic identity. Collective memories of massive trauma haunt descendants and re-inscribe the trauma on later generations. Thus, a trauma novel, the theme of which is based on traumatic events, describes how they "change both individual and social (Vickroy 195); often identity" 2002: such novels explore multidimensional pain, creating "continuing legacies of pain" that are passed from one generation to another (Vickroy 2002: 218). Cathy Caruth observes that "the story of trauma, then, as the narrative of belated experience, far from telling of an escape from reality [...] rather attests to its endless impact on a life" (Caruth 1996: 7).

In trauma fiction, the protagonist becomes "a historical marker to unspeakable experience" and "a marker for potential change if healed" (Vickroy 2002: xiii). S/he expresses a unique personal traumatic experience and may also function to represent and convey an event that was experienced by a group of people. The traumatized protagonist brings to awareness the specificity of individual trauma that is often connected to larger social factors and cultural values. As Geoffrey H. Hartman states, "a larger, transhistorical awareness of the incidence of trauma, personal or collective, should make us realize the extent of human suffering" (Hartman 2003: 262). The fictional figure magnifies a historical event in which thousands of people have suffered similar violence.

Consideration of the multiple models of trauma and memory presented in the trauma novel draws attention to the role of place, which functions to portray trauma's effect through metaphoric and material means. Descriptions of the geographical place(s) of traumatic experience and their remembrance may express a larger cultural context, built on the clash of different social values that influence the recollection of the event and the reconfiguration of the self. The physical environment offers the opportunity to examine both the personal and cultural histories attached to the described landscapes. Thus, in the trauma novel, the place or setting becomes a structural element that organizes the memory and meaning of trauma.

In her recent book *Literature in the Ashes of History* (2013), Cathy Caruth discusses structural devices that determine the organization of trauma narrative, outlining "disappearance and return" as the basic standpoints (Caruth 2013: 57). Therefore, the recurrence of traumatic experience and the essence of transgenerational trauma are grounded in the return. Dominick La Capra observes that "traumatic memory [...] may involve belated temporality and a period of latency" (LaCapra 2004: 119). Close attachment to the setting of trauma may extend the post-traumatic period or even act as an agent for the transgenerational transmittance of trauma.

According to Marianne Hirsch, when massive traumas are disclosed in literary texts, "narrative becomes the space where the anonymous deaths are marked and mourned" (Hirsch 2001: 12). Thus, such a text becomes both a record of the massive trauma and a possibility to mourn. For the readers of this text, it ensures the recovery of memory and reconsideration of the multiplicity of the trauma's effects (often on personal and nation identity).

Petar Ramadanovic rightly observes that "what makes literature into the privileged, but not the only, site of trauma is the fact that literature as an art form can contain and present an aspect of experience which was not experienced or processed fully" (Ramadanovic 2001 :1). In this way, fiction with different forms of character development and figurative language becomes "a channel or a medium for a transmission of trauma" (Ramadanovic 2001: 1). In contemporary literature, new perspectives on traumatic events and their representations and different forms of restatement appear, describing not only the traumatic events, but also suggesting and questioning the meaning of their restoration.

## Traumatic Period in Greece's History during the First Half of the 20<sup>th</sup> Century

In her novel *The Island*, Victoria Hislop discloses the painful period of Crete and Greece, when people diagnosed with leprosy were separated from their families and moved to remote colonies, one of them, a small island of Spinalonga, close to the northern coast of Crete. A certain period of life in Spinalonga that stretches from the beginning of the 20<sup>th</sup> century to the period of World War Two and until the 1950s is described in the novel. The central character, Alexis Fielding, wants to know the past of her mother Sofia and, accordingly, to understand her own identity; however, there are no records, no information which may help her. It indicates that her mother wants to forget the past and this is because the events of the past are painful.

Leprosy, the remedy of which appeared only in the 1940s, when first types of effective treatment were introduced, had occurred in many countries during different time periods. However, most effective antileprosy drugs were invented only in the 1960s-1970s. Traditionally, people, diagnosed with leprosy, had to be isolated - either sent to certain asylums or to remote places. Until the late 1940s, the diagnosis meant that these people were condemned to be separated from their families and society, without any hope of seeing their homes again. The diagnosis for the sick family members was a terrible blow: they experienced the trauma of separation and solitude, while their family members, who were not affected by the disease, had to bear a life-time stigma of remaining the family whose members had been diagnosed with leprosy. Mainly, this aspect is discussed in Victoria Hislop's novel. Thus, the history of the island of Spinalonga tells the story of people who had suffered from leprosy in Greece. A leper colony was established on the island of Spinalonga in 1903 and functioned until 1957:

The island could provide a welcome refuge from a life of vagrancy; many of the lepers had spent months or even years living outside society, sleeping in shacks and surviving off pilfered scraps. For these victims of the disease, Spinalonga was a relief, respite from the abject misery they had endured as outcasts. (Hislop 2005: 66)

Approximately, 400 people inhabited the island over the half-century. The island is close to the coast of Crete – only the distance of 10 km separates the island from the mainland of Crete. The short distance from the island meant both convenience and distrust or even fear from the inhabitants of close villages, Plaka and Elounda.

Victoria Hislop's novel provides much information about the everyday life of lepers, their community, life-style and problems. Real facts about the disease help the reader better understand the harsh reality on the island:

The government had declared that all lepers in Crete should be confined on Spinalonga. The moment that doctors were certain of the diagnosis, people had to leave their families for good and go there. It was known as "The Place of the Living Dead" and there was no better description. (Hislop 2005: 50)

Lepers had been allowed to live in Crete earlier; however, after the government's decision they were exiled to the island of Spinalonga. The word "confined" (Hislop 50) implies the meaning of isolation from the outside world. The characterization of the island as "The Place of the Living Dead" creates negative emotions and feelings, at the same time, it demonstrates that the prevailing attitude to these sick people leads to the assumption that there is no hope left – Spinalonga means the sad end of lepers' life, and death.

Ethnographic details explain the form of government on the island of Spinalonga. Spinalonga, as a part of Crete, functioned according to the law system of Greece and Crete. Reference to "three hundred" (Hislop 2005: 67) shows the amount of lepers on the island who created their community: "in Spinalonga, vacancies were only created by death. People continued to arrive regardless of whether there was space, and this meant that the island was overcrowded" (Hislop 2005: 68). These details demonstrate that the government of Crete was not interested if there was enough space for lepers to live, whether they felt comfortable or if it was a suitable place to inhabit – in other words, lepers were rejected by the society and left alone to die. As in most leper colonies, on Spinalonga, lepers "believed themselves abandoned, feeling their needs were met only minimally" (Hislop 2005: 74).

In addition to the number of lepers growing on the island, they had problems with water supply, a fact which indicates that the government al institutions of Crete and Greece neglected the colony: "water and electricity were not luxuries but necessities, and they were all aware that inadequacy of the water supply in particular could shorten their lives" (Hislop 2005: 75). Thus, the inhabitants of Spinalonga had to live on their own without any help. Yet before the start of World War Two, the colony had its own governing body, which made the contact with the governmental institutions in the mainland easier:

Within week, the proposals, which included specifications for building and reconstruction, were ready to be submitted to the government. Papadimitriou knew how to lean on the politicians, and his law firm in Athens, a family practice of some influence, became involved. (Hislop 2005: 106-107)

A small society of lepers consisted of representatives of different social layers. Leprosy was not the disease which spread only among poor people; this disease affected all social classes. Thus, people from different social backgrounds were transferred to Spinalonga:

We have already made Spinalonga a more civilized place, and in some ways it is now an even better place to live than the towns and villages that serve us.' He waved his hand in the direction of Plaka. 'We have electricity when Plaka does not. We have diligent medical staff and the most dedicated of teachers. On the mainland, many people are living at subsistence level, starving when we are not. Last week, some of them rowed out to us from Elounda. Rumours of our new prosperity had reached them and they came to ask *us* for food. [...] 'No longer are we the outcasts with begging bowls crying, "Unclean! Unclean!" he continued. 'Now others come to us to seek alms.' (Hislop 2005: 116; italic in the original text)

The community became united not only by leprosy but also by the improvement of their social standing: for many inhabitants of Spinalonga living conditions were even better than back at home. Nevertheless, the island of Spinalonga remained a place of disgust for the people living on the mainland.

Describing the life on Spinalonga, the author supplies the reader with many historical facts and geographical information about Crete and Greece. Therefore, it is possible to state that alongside empathic approach the author uses informational approach. Description of different periods in the history of Greece and Crete make the novel a valuable source of information:

War had raged in Europe for some time, but that very month Greece itself was overrun. The people of Crete were now living under the sword of Damocles; the colony's newspaper, *The Spinalonga Star*, carried regular bulletins on the situation, and the newsreels that came with the weekly film stirred the population into a state of anxiety. What they feared most then happened: the Germans turned their sights on Crete. (Hislop 2005: 142; italic in the original text)

During the period of World War Two Cretans, threatened by Germans, created resistance troops, a fact which is described in the novel. Naturally, awareness of the complicated situation caused the lepers' fear related to their relatives who lived on the mainland, however, not to themselves: "we're almost completely unaffected by the war here. I feel more isolated than ever. I can't even share the danger you're in" (Hislop 2005: 155).

Spinalonga isolated lepers from their homes, families, and friends, and also from the war. Germans did not dare to attack the island of lepers, because it was too risky:

The Germans feared Spinalonga with its hundreds of lepers living just across the water and allowed deliveries to continue, since the last thing they wanted was for any of them to leave the island to search out their own supplies on the mainland. (Hislop 2005: 164)

The period of World War Two was significant in the history of Spinalonga. The whole Europe and especially Crete was under the threat of destruction. Events continued until "the eighth of May 1945, [when] the Germans have officially surrendered" (Hislop 2005: 182). However, for the inhabitants of Spinalonga complete freedom meant health: "we have been given permission to release you from the colony" (Hislop 2005: 389). Sadly, treatment from leprosy started only after the war.

Making the issue of leprosy one of the central themes of her novel, Victoria Hislop discusses the scope of this collective trauma and its effects on personal and national identity. Grounding on the fictional four-generation family story, she emphasizes different types of personal trauma: search for the lost or hidden/secret identity, loss of family members, loss of home and loss of hope. Moreover, the restatement of trauma is achieved through different stylistic means in the novel, such as the choice and description of the setting, meticulous commentaries on events and problems on the island, character set, intertwined plot lines, narrative structure and, especially, the emphasis on the metaphorical transition from one island to another. This transition may emphasize the idea of the transmittance of trauma from one generation to another.

## Representation of Historical Trauma in Victoria Hislop's Novel *The Island*

The island of Spinalonga may imply the symbolic or metaphorical meaning. According to J. E. Cirlot, the island is "a symbol of isolation, of solitude, of death" (Cirlot 2001: 160). Water around it guards the inner place and, at the same time, functions as the transmitter of trauma in the novel. The story begins in 2001 when Alexis, the main character, visits the island of Crete and ends up with finding out the family's secretive past about the family members who were closely related to lepers on the island of Spinalonga. The narrator starts with certain details, which emphasize the backcloth role of the setting: "Unfurled from its mooring," "droplets of seawater," and "Alexis was the only passenger in the small, battered boat" (Hislop 2005: 5). These details are related with the location on the island, while references to "mooring", "seawater" and "boat" help to visualize a place and present first instances of the transit into some hidden secrets of the past. The site is described as "the lonely, unpeopled island," where the adjective "lonely" leads to further insights into the trauma of loneliness (Hislop 2005: 5):

The island lay directly ahead, and as the boat approached the great Venetian fortification which fronted the sea, she felt both the pull of its past and an overpowering sense of what it still meant in the present. This, she speculated, might be a place where history was still warm, not stone cold, where the inhabitants were real not mythical. (Hislop 2005: 5)

Here, the references to "past" and "present," which indicate the narrative time and suggest the shift in time, seem to start this long-awaited transition from the present into the secrets of the past.

Alexis Fielding, the protagonist, gradually comes closer to the painful and long-hidden details, which disclose the tragic life story of her great-grandmother Eleni, who was deported to the island, after contracting leprosy. Her husband, Giorgis, and two daughters, Anna and Maria, experienced the trauma of being separated from her forever: "Their faces were contorted with grief and their eyes swollen with crying. There was nothing left say. Almost nothing left to feel. Their mother was leaving. She would not be coming back early that evening [...]. There would be no return" (Hislop 2005: 59). Her husband, a fisherman, who worked parttime as a supplier for the leper colony and who used to transfer lepers to Spinalonga, considers this boat trip, when he has to take his own wife there, the saddest moment in his life: "he had been to Spinalonga a

thousand times, for years supplementing his meagre fisherman's income by making regular deliveries to the leper colony, but he had never imagined making a journey such as this" (Hislop 2005: 61). Mainly through Giorgis' character the author displays the issue of transition into the past. His constant travels to the island and back symbolize references to the tragic period of history (both collective and personal) or Alexis' return to the long-forgotten past. Also, this constant transition between the islands may symbolize restatement and sharing of traumatic experience.

As Alexis comes to the now-abandoned island, she is struck by the prevailing atmosphere there:

She was at the lower end of a long street lined on both sides with small two-storey houses. At one time this might have looked like any village in Crete, but these buildings had been reduced to a state of semi-dereliction. Window frames hung at strange angles on broken hinges, and shutters twitched and creaked in the slight sea breeze. She walked hesitantly down the dusty street, taking in everything she saw: a church on her right with a solid carved door, a building which, judging by its large ground-floor window frames, had evidently been a shop, and a slightly grander detached building with a wooden balcony, arched doorway and the remains of a walled garden. A profound, eerie silence hung over it all. (Hislop 2005: 26)

Adjectives such as "dusty", "profound" and "eerie silence" stand out and may lead to the assumption that she is very close to opening the crypt of her past, to use Gabriele Schwab's considerations on "cryptic memories and memories from the crypt" (Schwab 2010: 61).

It seems that Alexis is slowly opening each window (or each door) into the secluded place of her past. She is both overwhelmed and anxious to know everything: "The impregnable safe of her mother's past, which had been so resolutely locked for her entire life, was now to be opened" (Hislop 2005: 43). Having unlocked this well-hidden safe of the past, "Alexis felt herself being pulled into Eleni's vortex of grief and suffering" (Hislop 2005: 51):

What had it felt like? To sail away from your home and be effectively imprisoned within sight of your family, everything that was precious to you stripped away? She thought not only of the woman who had been her great-grandmother, but also of the boy, both of them innocent of any crime and yet condemned. (Hislop 2005: 52)

Fragment by fragment the family's painful history has been disclosed – "leaving no pebble unturned – from the small shingle of childhood

minutiae to the larger boulders of Crete's own history" (Hislop 2005: 53). Alexis steps into the horrors of her family's secretive past and, at the same time, enters the altered identity.

The island takes up the role of the instrumental character: remote and at the same time close, surrounded by the sea, unreachable, but at the same time, easy to reach, mysterious and secluded, infusing fear and a wish to be somewhere else, menacing and as a symbol of the lost hopes. The scenery, to use Gabriele Schwab's definition" is "composed of cryptic architecture" - remains of the houses, dilapidated streets and objects, caves and tombs, broken windows, or a dark tunnel. The tunnel seems to be of special importance in the novel. First, it may be regarded as a form of communication: lepers who reached the island had to pass through a long and dark tunnel to enter the small village of lepers. When Eleni, Alexis' great-grandmother, was taken to the island, she had to enter it and pass through it, as if stepping into another, very different stage of her life, similar to crossing the borderline between life and death. Later, she would cross through the tunnel to wait from afar for her husband – just to have a glimpse of him. They would stand and look at each other, sharing their basic news, a large distance separating them - this was the only form of communication left for them. The tunnel may also symbolize a sinister path into the hidden history, with two types of stories at each end. Without knowing the details of those stories, this path into the hidden past remains secretive, frightening and silent.

In her book *Haunting Legacies*. Violent Histories and Transgenerational Trauma, Gabriele Schwab discusses the instances of "cultural reeducation" during the process of disclosing "a national secret" (Schwab 2010: 70-71). This approach is useful in considering the collective trauma, described in Victoria Hislop's novel. When Alexis, the protagonist in the novel, comes to the site of traumatic experience and gets closer to the tragedy of previous generations, it is possible to view this process as "the transgenerational transmission of trauma (Schwab 2010: 72). In disclosing the tragic life-story of her great-grandmother, Alexis becomes both the witness and the person who transmits the terrible experiences of the earlier generations and inscribes these experiences into the cultural memory and mourning sites of the later ones. In such a way, the previously existed "cultural unconscious" turns into the so-called cultural conscious (Schwab 2010: 77). The "inward psychic haunting" comes to the surface, so that "the ghostly legacies and secrets of their parents and the parental generation" are disclosed (Schwab 2010: 77). Schwab rightly notices that "[m]ost cultures share a tendency to silence traumatic histories" and that "[t]raumatic amnesia seems to become

inscribed as cultural practice" (Schwab 2010: 79). As Schwab further states,

Recognizing the psychic life of our ancestors in our own psychic life means uncovering their unspoken suffering and secret histories, as well as their guilt and shame, their crimes – hence the importance of a family's, a community's, or a nation's "secret" histories. Secrecy in this context does not necessarily mean that there is no conscious knowledge of the past at all. It may also mean that this knowledge is silenced and removed from public life. (Schwab 2010: 79).

The above-mentioned aspects point to a definite informational approach undertaken by the author: the traumatic history of the country is described and shared with the reader. Thus, the reader becomes, as Anne Whitehead states "a learning witness" (Whitehead 2004: 8). Moreover, the reader takes part in this "unburial", "digging into a community's or a nation's deadly secrets" (Schwab 2010: 80). Following these considerations, it is possible to assume that "[t]he exhumation of the buried ghosts of the past is [...] indispensable for trying to avoid the repetition of traumatic history or its displacement onto other people" (Schwab 2010: 80-81). From this aspect, Victoria Hislop completes many important tasks: she informs the reader on the hidden and secretive period of the country's history, educates the reader, offering various considerations on the traumatic experience, transmits the traumatic experience, and arouses the reader's empathy. Mainly, these points help to answer the rhetorical question posed by Gabriele Schwab: "How can one tell the story of a history of which one is a protagonist without ever having experienced it directly?" (Schwab 2010: 81). The author's role in transmitting the transgenerational trauma becomes of utmost importance and discloses the significance of trauma fiction in general. Any piece of trauma fiction might be also viewed as "monumentalization of victimage" (Schwab 2010: 84). The latter aspect puts great demands both on the author and the reader. The reader is required to empathically react, participate in the opening of the crypt of the national tragic period and, probably, to act as an agent in transmitting this cultural memory of haunting.

Returning to the author's role, it becomes of special significance in the case of Victoria Hislop's novel *The Island*. It may be considered that an English author describes the national trauma from the outsider's perspective. However, the author renders the traumatic haunting and makes it internalized. The novel closely discusses the issues of personal and national identity: Alexis, the protagonist in the novel, searches for the family's secrets and in doing this, she can better understand her own identity or even undertake an altered one; the processes in Greece during the time span described in the novel disclose the scope of the national trauma. Domick LaCapra determines close connections between "experiential processes and processes of identity formation" (LaCapra 2004: 37). The identity formation or rather understanding of one's identity is grounded in the externalization of personal and collective trauma in the novel. Hislop's novel also examines the denial of the traumatic experience and its effect on the transgenerational transmittance of trauma. The ability or inability to mourn over the tragedy on both personal and national levels and shifting the burden of one's past onto the shoulders of compassionate others (including the readers) make this novel a valuable source of insights into the personal and collective trauma. The outsider's position undertaken by the author may cause the universalization of the described traumatic experiences. Such position ensures socio-political and historical explanation, which is fundamental for the trauma narrative.

### Conclusion

Victoria Hislop's novel *The Island* contains elements of three literary genres: historical novel, travel fiction and trauma novel; however, the aim of this article has been to examine features of trauma fiction and the display of them in Hislop's novel. The historical facts and realistic description of the setting in the novel *The Island* discloses secret facts about the use of the island of Spinalonga as the colony of lepers. Therefore, the novel tells the history of Crete in a special way – through different levels of transmission of trauma. Two types of trauma – personal and national – have been disclosed from the aspect of the influence of traumatic experience on personal and national identity.

In her novel *The Island*, Victoria Hislop merges two approaches, informational and empathic, in transmitting the transgenerational personal and national trauma. The author has chosen a symbolic geographical place (the island of Spinalonga) both as a password and a transmitter of trauma. The site of trauma, the island of Spinalonga, symbolizes solitude and rejection; however, transfer to the island contains the aspect of return to the long-forgotten past. This return, consists of different steps and layers, and includes restatement of the shared emotional inheritance. Uncovering the secretive period in the country's history and supplying the reader with a number of valuable facts, the author of the novel demonstrates empathic transmittance of trauma and offers a possibility of mourning and remembrance, questioning one's own reaction and, therefore, one's own identity. Similarly, the reader becomes an agent in transmitting this trauma, sharing the universals of traumatic experience. The application of

trauma theory has enabled the research into the author-reader dialogue and roles.

### References

- Arizti, B. 2011. "Personal Trauma/Historical Trauma in Tim Winton's Dirt Music." The Splintered Glass. Facets of Trauma in the Post-Colony and Beyond. Eds. Dolores Herrero and Sonia Baelo-Allué. New York. 175-189. Print.
- Caruth, C. 1995. "Trauma and Experience: Introduction." *Trauma. Explorations in Memory*.Ed. Cathy Caruth. Baltimore: The Johns Hopkins University Press. 3-12. Print.
- Caruth, C. 1995. "Recapturing the Past: Introduction." *Trauma. Explorations in Memory*. Ed. Cathy Caruth. Baltimore: The Johns Hopkins University Press. 151-157. Print.
- Caruth, C. 1996. Unclaimed Experience. Trauma, Narrative, and History. Baltimore: The Johns Hopkins University Press. Print.
- Caruth, C. 2013. *Literature in the Ashes of History*. Baltimore: The Johns Hopkins University Press. Print.
- Cirlot, J. E. 2001. *A Dictionary of Symbols*. Trans. From Spanish by Jack sage. Taylor & Francis e-Library. We. Accessed 10 June 2015.
- Felman, Sh. 1995. "Education and Crisis, or the Vicissitudes of Teaching." *Trauma. Explorations in Memory*. Ed. Cathy Caruth. Baltimore: The Johns Hopkins University Press. 13-60. Print.
- Hartman, G. 2003. "Trauma within the Limits of Literature." *European Journal* of English Studies 7 (3): 257-274. Print.
- Hirsch, M. 2001. "Surviving Images: Holocaust Photographs and the Work of Postmemory." *The Yale Journal of Criticism 14*, No. 1: 5-37. Web. Accessed 20 April 2015.
- Hislop, V. 2005. The Island. London: Headline Publishing Group.
- Kaplan, E. A. 2005. Trauma Culture. The Politics of Terror and Loss in Media and Literature. New Brunswick: Rutgers University Press. Print.
- LaCapra, D. 2001. *Writing History, Writing Trauma*. Baltimore: Johns Hopkins University Press. Print.
- LaCapra, D. 2004. *History in Transit: Experience, Identity, Critical Theory.* Ithaca: Cornell University Press. Print.
- Laub, D. 1992. "Bearing Witness or the Vicissitudes of Listening." *Testimony. Crises of Witnessing in Literature, Psychoanalysis, and History.* Eds. Shoshana Felman and Dori Laub. New York: Routledge. 57-74. Print.
- Laub, D. 1995. "Truth and Testimony: The Process and the Struggle." *Trauma. Explorations in Memory.* Ed. Cathy Caruth. Baltimore: The Johns Hopkins University Press. 61-75. Print.
- Nora, P. 2011. *Présent, nation, mémoire*. Lonrai: Éditions Gallimard. Print.
- Ramadanovic, P. 2001. "Introduction: Trauma and Crisis." *Postmodern Culture 11 (2)*: n. pag. Web. Accessed 14 April 2015.

- Schwab, G. 2010. *Haunting Legacies: Violent Histories and Transgenerational Trauma*. New York: Columbia University Press. Print.
- Toremans, T. 2003. "Trauma Theory Reading (and) Literary Theory in the Wake of Trauma." *European Journal of English Studies* 7 (3): 333-351. Web. Accessed 14 April 2015.
- van der Kolk, B. A. and O. van der Hart. 1995. "The Intrusive Past: The Flexibility of Memory and the Engraving of Trauma." *Trauma. Explorations in Memory*. Ed. Cathy Caruth. Baltimore: The Johns Hopkins University Press. 158-182. Print.
- Vickroy, L. 2002. *Trauma and Survival in Contemporary Fiction*. Charlottesville: University of Virginia Press. Print.
- Whitehead, A. 2004. *Trauma Fiction*. Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press. Print.
- Whitehead, A. 2009. Memory. London: Routledge. Print.

### **AMERICAN LITERATURE**

### John Green, Simply Narrating Life, Romance and Cancer

**Ioana Cistelecan** University of Oradea

**Abstract:** The paper focuses on a relatively young and mostly "fresh" American novelist, John Green and his best-seller The Fault in Our Stars; the book received plenty of critical acclaim in U.S.A. being above all praised for its humor, strong characters, language, thematic and new perspective on cancer and romance. It is both the novelist's and the present paper's inner intention to prove that sick, dying children are in fact living extra-ordinary lives, incredible love stories, that they do not designate the paradigm of the outcast, they do not represent "the others" and that ultimately it's all about humanity, its simplicity and its charm.

Key-words: cancer, romance, young adult fiction, tragic love story, meta-fiction.

John Green<sup>1</sup> is a relatively young and mostly "fresh" American author of *young adult fiction*, historian and creator of on-line educational videos. He won the 2006 Printz Award for his debut novel, *Looking for Alaska* (released in 2005), while his most recent novel, *The Fault in Our Stars* launched as number 1 on *The New York Times* Best Seller list in January 2012. The 2014 film adaptation took the 1-st position at the box office. In 2014, John Green was included in *Time magazine*'s list as being one of the 100 most influential people in the world.<sup>2</sup>

John Green's rapid rise to fame and idiosyncratic voice are credited with creating a major shift in the young adult fiction market. Nevertheless, some critics<sup>3</sup>, would "credit him with ushering in a new golden era for contemporary, realistic, literary teen fiction, following more than a decade of dominance by books about young wizards, sparkly vampires and dystopia.", his books consequently producing the so-called

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> born August 24, 1977

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> See Cowles, Gregory (July 29, 2012), Best Sellers – Children's Paperback Books, The New York Times!

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>3</sup> See\_Alter, Alexandria (May 14, 2014), John Green and His Nerdfighters Are Upending the Summer Blockbuster Model, The Wall Street Journal.

'John Green effect' in the sense that "there's more of a public interest in authentic, genuine, translatable characters."<sup>4</sup>

It seems to have become a habit in drawing a sort of a cultural proximity between our author to be discussed, on one hand, and Salinger, on the other hand: Margaret Talbot, for instance, noticed that "John Green was more forgiving toward adults than Salinger was, but he shared Salinger's conviction that they underestimate the emotional depth of adolescents. Green told me, "I love the intensity teen-agers bring not just to first love but also to the first time you're grappling with grief, at least as a sovereign being—the first time you're taking on why people suffer and whether there's meaning in life, and whether meaning is constructed or derived. Teen-agers feel that what you conclude about those questions is going to *matter*. And they're dead right. It matters for adults, too, but we've almost taken too much power away from ourselves. We don't acknowledge on a daily basis how much it matters."<sup>5</sup>

While delivering a conference in 2014, the writer himself confessed that the first inspiration for The Fault in Our Stars was to be traced in his experience as a student chaplain at a children's hospital. On this occasion, he found the children to be as human as healthy people, and wanted to capture the feeling that "the stories that I was reading sort of oversimplified and sometimes even dehumanized them. And I think generally we have a habit of imagining the very sick or the dying as being kind of fundamentally other. I guess I wanted to argue for their humanity, their complete humanity."6 Although initially both intimidated and challenged by the idea, the author knew this was not his story to tell; highly encouraged by all the positive comments from all the sick children he talked to, he eventually decided to give it a try. The novel was mainly influenced by Esther Earl, a girl whom John Green was friends with and who died when she was 16 years old of thyroid cancer. The author credits Esther for inspiring him to finally write the book, as she demonstrated how a short life could also be a full one. Although feeling under a lot of constant pressure, being actually afraid of telling somebody else's story and above all being terrified of his incapacity of truly capturing both the characters and their lives complexity, he was nevertheless able to add the humor he intended to the story, thus escaping any trace of soap-opera labeling.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>4</sup> According to Zareen Jaffery, executive editor of Simon & Schuster Books for Young Readers.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>5</sup> Margaret Talbot, *The Teen Whisperer. How the author of "The Fault in Our Stars" built an ardent army of fans.*, in The New Yorker, June 9 & 16, 2014

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>6</sup> See Rosen, Rebecca J (25 February 2013), How John Green Wrote a Cancer Book but Not a 'Bullshit Cancer Book'. The Atlantic.

The very basis of the story is that a sixteen-year-old girl named Hazel who has cancer and who is forced by her parents to attend a support group meets; here, she falls in love with the seventeen-year-old Augustus, a former basketball player and recently amputee. The novel's title is actually inspired by W. Shakespeare's play, in which the nobleman Cassius says to Brutus: "The fault, dear Brutus, is not in our stars, / But in ourselves, that we are underlings". Both protagonists are trying to deal with cancer, love, and books. One might say it's after all everybody's average story about a boy meeting a girl, but this time both the girl and the boy deal with a fatal diagnosis and they talk about how a fictional book might end. The whole story is beautifully written and it is just breathtaking. There are meta-textual elements with references to the fictional book which the two are both fans of: An Imperial Affliction signed by the also fictional author Peter Van Houten. Much of the novel's vibrancy comes from the first-person narrative voice of Hazel, which is irreverent but never nihilistic, as noticed by Margaret Talbot7. After the female protagonist reads online tributes to a girl who has died of cancer, she notices that the girl "seemed to be mostly a professional sick person, like me, which made me worry that when I died they'd have nothing to say about me except that I fought heroically, as if the only thing I'd ever done was Have Cancer."8 John Green paradoxically enough treats his grownup characters with unusual empathy. In this respect, Hazel worries a good deal about how her death will affect her parents: "There is only one thing in this world shittier than biting it from cancer when you're sixteen, and that's having a kid who bites it from cancer."9 The writer gives Hazel's mother not only a devoted temperament but also a sense of humor; she watches "America's Next Top Model" with her daughter and takes her to Amsterdam to meet her favorite author, Peter Van Houten. John Green's book seems calibrated for an era in which parents - vigilant and eager not to seem out of touch - would often read the books that their children are reading.

Besides the most obvious interpretation to the novel, that of a romance, of an ultimately tragic love story lived to the fullest by two very sick teenagers, *The Fault in Our Stars* may be read as well as the post-modern relationship between authors and readers. The idea is basically resumed in Hazel's opinion stated as it follows: "Sometimes, you read a book and it fills you with this weird evangelical zeal, and you become

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>7</sup> Margaret Talbot, *The Teen Whisperer. How the author of "The Fault in Our Stars" built an ardent army of fans.*, in The New Yorker, June 9 & 16, 2014.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>8</sup> John Green, *The Fault in Our Stars*, Penguin Books Australia, 2012, p. 14.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>9</sup> John Green, quoted edition, chapter 1.

convinced that the shattered world will never be put back together unless and until all living humans read the book. And then there are books like 'An Imperial Affliction' - Peter Van Houten's novel - which you can't tell people about, books so special and rare and *yours* that advertising vour affection feels like a betraval."10 In other words, the novel hosts another novel, the story hunts another story, the protagonists - Hazel and Augustus - travel by plane to find another heroine; both primary story/ characters and the 'secondary' (in terms of visibility within the book's inner dynamics) ones are searching for closure, for meaning in a speedy course of a damned-limited life: fiction within fiction and fictional heroes within fictional heroes – this would be the meta-fictional recipe of this particular novel: reality and imaginary are sharing a frail borderline. That particular issue of one's existence fragility and lack of substance is uttered by Gus, while playing on his computer: "All salvation is temporary," Augustus shot back. "I bought them a minute. Maybe that's the minute that buys them an hour, which is the hour that buys them a year. No one's gonna buy them forever, Hazel Grace, but my life bought them a minute. And that's not nothing."<sup>11</sup>

It is immediately obvious that Hazel isn't the typical teenage girl from Indianapolis. Despite the tumor-shrinking medical miracle (which, by the way, does not really exist unfortunately!) that has bought her a few years, Hazel has never been anything but terminal. She is old for her age, in opposition to her friend Kaitlyn, for instance. By comparison, Hazel is far more thoughtful and considerate about her actions, and she is far more analytical. She desperately wants to justify the harm caused by her existence on Earth. Though this outlook on life is dramatically different from Augustus's, over the course of the novel the teens would learn a lot from one another. Hazel's transcendent journey throughout the novel is truly multifaceted. Physically speaking, we witness Hazel grow weaker. (at the beginning of the novel she uses the stairs at the Support Group and near the novel's end she opts for the elevator, as her physical condition deteriorates.) The most subtle aspect of Hazel's journey revolves around her spiritual and philosophical understanding of death. At the beginning of the novel, Hazel obsesses over the impact her death will have on those around her. She fears getting close to anyone because she knows that her death, which isn't far off, will hurt anyone close to her. It makes her, as she puts it, a "grenade." This fear appears most in regard to her mother. Once, when Hazel was near dying, she overheard her mother saying that if Hazel dies she won't be a *mother* anymore, and that thought has stuck in

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>10</sup> Idem, Ibidem, p.12.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>11</sup> Idem, Ibidem, p. 147.

Hazel's mind. This fear motivates Hazel's mission to determine what happens to the characters at the end of An Imperial Affliction. She needs to affirm that everything turns out alright for Anna's mother (the book's protagonist), so that she can convince herself that her parents will end up alright. Through her relationship with Augustus, however, Hazel's perspective changes. When his cancer reappears, she recognizes that, of the two of them, he is now the grenade. But even so, she doesn't regret falling in love with him, even though it will hurt her immensely when he dies. Instead, she cherishes and feels extremely grateful for the time they do have together. The final words of the novel indicate the extent to which Hazel grows spiritually throughout her journey. The implication of the words "I do" are of a marriage that takes place through memory. Though the marriage is symbolic, it is nevertheless real. What Hazel means by saying "I do" is that she will remember and love Augustus for as long as she lives, and in that sense she has learned that death is not the omnipresent finality she had once considered it to be. John Green has stated that the last line of the book, "I do", symbolizes marriage because "Shakespeare's comedies end in marriage and his tragedies end in death, and I [the author] was rather fond of the idea that my book could end (symbolically, at least) in both."<sup>12</sup>

In many respects Augustus performs his own existence. This is why there are two versions of his character within the novel. The first version we meet is the mask called Augustus Waters. Named, quite grandiosely, after the first Roman emperor, Augustus acts as if he were a strong, confident, funny, and charming boy. He is convinced that the importance of life is being heroic, leaving a noble legacy, monumentally impacting humanity. He over-plans Dutch themed picnics, down to the last excruciating detail, purely for stage like effect. He is deluded by showy metaphors of his own construction, like when he sacrifices himself in a video game by jumping on a grenade in order to save children. As his cancer returns, however, all of this performance falls away. What truly remains is simply Gus, a teenage boy in Indianapolis who used to be a star athlete and now finds himself dying from cancer. In fact, Hazel only learns his nickname is "Gus" due to his parents. But Hazel doesn't love him any less for being Gus. On the contrary: she would start calling him Gus rather than Augustus only after they're intimately familiar with each other, once Hazel knows all aspects of him and not just the performed version she is first introduced to. She sees that, underneath the romantic gestures and theatrical grandiosity, Gus is a sweet, caring, and

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>12</sup> See Chang, Jade (December 2012), Interview with John Green, Goodreads, December 2013.

understandably terrified seventeen-year-old guy. As he deteriorates physically, he's forced to confront the fact that he'll die without doing anything humanity at large views as extraordinary, and a deeper spiritual transition takes place. Because of Hazel, he comes to realize that failing to do something extraordinary does not equal being insignificant, because "The real heroes anyway aren't the people doing things; the real heroes are the people noticing things, paying attention. The guy who invented the smallpox vaccine didn't actually invent anything. He just noticed that people with cowpox didn't get smallpox."<sup>13</sup>

Over the course of the novel the true Gus reveals himself through the most emblematic gesture of his Augustinian counterpart: the act of placing a cigarette in his mouth. *The cigarette metaphor* serves as a link that binds the two disparate identities. That's because the cigarette reveals the opposite of what it is meant to project: Augustus wants for the cigarette to represent his control over the thing that could kill him, but really it is a device he relies on when feeling most vulnerable, most like Gus. He grabs for the cigarette at times of uncertainty, like when he first meets Hazel or on board the plane, when he is terrified of flying. "It's a metaphor, see: You put the killing thing right between your teeth, but you don't give it the power to do its killing."<sup>14</sup>

In a novel that is largely structured around *meta-fiction*, with the invented but above all highly believable story entitled *An Imperial Affliction* playing a starring role in the primary fiction, Peter Van Houten is its keenest representative. As such, he reveals the magical power of fiction while simultaneously demystifying the romance attributed to authorship. For most of the novel Hazel considers Peter Van Houten a genuine god, or at the very least, a powerful prophet. *An Imperial Affliction* is Hazel's personal bible. The novel speaks to her about terminal illness in ways that no other medium, or person, or support group would ever do. The act of reading Peter Van Houten's novel is so incredibly personal to Hazel that she mistakenly conflates the novel's magic with its author's greatness. However, when Hazel first meets Van Houten, the charming feeling becomes deflated. She sees him for the sloppy and often mean-spirited drunk he really is. She learns that an author is nothing more than a human being, with human ups and mostly downs.

In his final days, Augustus invites Isaac and Hazel to his prefuneral, where they give eulogies. Hazel quotes Van Houten about "larger and smaller infinities", reaffirms her love for him, and states that she would not trade their short time together for anything in the world.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>13</sup> John Green, quoted edition, p. 203.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>14</sup> Idem, Ibidem, p. 52.

Augustus dies eight days later. At the funeral, Hazel is astonished to find Van Houten attending the event. He explains that he and Augustus maintained correspondence since Amsterdam and that Augustus had demanded he make up for ruining their trip by coming at his funeral. In an attempt for forgiveness, Van Houten tries to reveal the fate of Anna's mother. Hazel, still upset with his behavior, asks him to leave.

A few days later, while talking with Isaac, Hazel learns that Augustus may have been writing a sequel to *An Imperial Affliction* for her. As Hazel searches for the pages, she again encounters Van Houten. He confides in Hazel that his novel was a literary attempt to reconcile with the death of his daughter, Anna, who died from cancer when she was eight. Hazel tells Van Houten to sober up and write another book.

Van Houten wears plenty of masks throughout the novel. One of his most crucial roles is to depict the variety of ways in which people deal with pain. When the readers learn that *An Imperial Affliction* is really a fictional account of the life of Van Houten's daughter, Anna, who died from cancer at a young age, the readers are perhaps able to see the author more sympathetically. He is the real life tragic version of the fictional Anna's mother in his novel. It makes him the living embodiment of Hazel's greatest fear: that her parents will be so distraught by her death that they will not be able to go on.

Critics mostly praised the book for its humor, strong and persuasive characters, language, thematic and new perspective on cancer and romance. In a different era, *The Fault in Our Stars* could have been that kind of *cult-ish book15*. For many young people today, however, reading is not an act of private communion with an author whom they imagine vaguely, if at all, but a prelude to a social experience.

### **References**:

John Green, <i>The Fault in Our Stars</i> , Penguin Books Australia, 2012
---

- Alexandria Alter, John Green and His Nerd fighters Are Spending the Summer Blockbuster Model, The Wall Street Journal.
- Jade Chang, Interview with John Green, Goodreads, December 2013.

Gregory Cowles, Best Sellers - Children's Paperback Books, The New York Times.

- Rebecca J Rosen, How John Green Wrote a Cancer Book but Not a 'Bullshit Cancer Book'. The Atlantic.
- Margaret Talbot, *The Teen Whisperer. How the author of "The Fault in Our Stars" built an ardent army of fans., The New Yorker, June 9 & 16, 2014.*

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>15</sup> See C.J. Westerberg, Why Do We Give Them Short-Shrift?, The Daily Riff, June 2, 2014.
# Beatific or Beaten? Encounters with Nature from Transcendentalists to the Beats and Hippies

#### Andrzej Dorobek, Ph. D.

State School of Higher Education in Płock, Poland

Abstract: Initially, the earliest ideas concerning the relationship between man and nature within the context of American culture are briefly recalled (Columbus, Smith). Then, the transcendentalist view upon this relationship, put forward by Emerson and exemplified by Thoreau, is restated - to be shown as fundamentally questioned from the perspective of existential alienation or cognitive skepticism, first by Poe and later, by Dickinson and Crane. Consequently, the Beat literature is presented both as an attempt at the restoring of the transcendentalist concept of divine harmony between man and nature and as an example of the writers being alienated in the "disenchanted world" of the mid-20th century America - the attempt ultimately unsuccessful, as was proved e. g. by Kerouac's Big Sur. A similar idea of America as never-to-be-regained "paradise" of natural beauty and harmony is featured in the artistic legacy of the Hippie Generation, from Easy Rider film, to Steppenwolf's song Monster or Brautigan's novels such as Trout Fishing in America. Finally, a parallel is drawn between Kerouac and his Polish follower, Edward Stachura, chronologically belonging to the Hippie era and showing in his fiction hypersensitive individuals, tragically alienated both from nature and humanity - which, despite any notes of existential pessimism, was not the case with the Beats.

**Key words**: transcendentalism, harmony, paradise, naturalism, beat, bohemianism, alienation, skepticism, existentialism

#### I. Prelude

It may be reasonably argued that the biblical imperative for man to make any new land his own finds classic exemplification in the economic, social, and, last but not least, literary history of North America. The new continent, with its unknown, frequently dangerous natural environment, provided the most immediate context for any effort to build a new civilization or society there. The environment in question was consequently reflected in the written history of this civilization/society as either fit for God-granted exploitation and genuinely beautiful (if not just divine), or inexorably indifferent (if not plainly hostile).

In this paper, we shall attempt to present a necessarily selective, chronological recollection of American literary encounters with nature, paying special attention to transcendentalists, their Romantic dissenters (Hawthorne), or plain opponents (Poe). First of all, however, we shall concentrate on the Beats and their Hippie followers, generally seen as spokesmen for the "alternative" lifestyle, initiated by Thoreau's Walden experiment and the communes that other transcendentalists started establishing in the USA in the first half of the 19<sup>th</sup> century. Moreover, we shall try to find whether for Jack Kerouac or Jim Morrison the choice of living "outside the society" (as Patti Smith, their legitimate successor, was to put it later) meant returning to the realm of nature in Thoreau's footsteps. We shall also approach this problem from a wider socio-cultural perspective, stressing little known, though relevant nonetheless, Polish reflections of the Beat/Hippie phenomenon.

## **II.** From the Divine Virginity of Nature to its Cold Indifference

The first two features of nature recalled in the opening section, i. e. its beauty and fitness for exploitation, are mentioned already in the earliest document of the European consciousness of America, Christopher Columbus's *Journal*, published only in 1892-1894 in the original version and translated into English in the following century by William Carlos Williams, an eminent American modernist poet. In this text, which, due to relevant socio-cultural observations and the quality of the translation, may be added to the canon of English-language records of the settlers' encounters with the New World, the author stresses both the virgin, or even paradise charm of its vegetation (Columbus 1984: 18), and the inferior status of the original inhabitants, easily satisfied with "things of little value" (Columbus 1984: 18) and thus prospectively considered as cheap labor force.

In the 17<sup>th</sup> century, the idea of people exploiting nature for their concrete needs was developed by John Smith in *A Description of New England* (1616), where he described the North American continent as a land of greater material promise than his native England (Smith 1984: 20). Almost simultaneously, in *History of Plymouth Plantation* (written in 1630-1650, published only in 1856), William Bradford highlighted the initial hostility of the New World's natural environment to Puritan settlers (Bradford 1984: 24-25), in the 20<sup>th</sup> century restated e. g. by Charles Reich (Reich 1976: 40). Still, as the colonization of the continent progressed, this gloomy perspective remarkably changed in favour of the idyllic

vision of pastoral America, to be found in Washington Irving'a short stories, such as "Rip van Winkle" (1820), or "The Legend of Sleepy Hollow" (1820).

The aforementioned vision may be considered, arguably, as one of the sources of the more universal system of American Romantic transcendentalism, informed by the native tradition of unitarianism, German transcendental idealism and, last but not least, perennial philosophy, based upon the ancient Indian principle of the individual self (Atman) and the Universal Mind (Brahman) being virtually identical. This principle was restated by Ralph Waldo Emerson, the founding father of the movement, in his famous essay *Nature* (1836): "I am nothing, I see all; the currents of the Universal Being circulate through me; I am part or particle of God" (Emerson 1984: 161). Simultaneously, however, the serene pantheistic "gospel" of unity of God, nature, and man, preached by this prominent member of the Transcendental Club in Concord, was not totally accepted by Nathaniel Hawthorne, for some time belonging to the most famous transcendentalist commune, Brook Farm Institute of Agriculture and Education. Sharply aware of evil as intrinsic to human nature, probably owing to his Puritan ancestry, he deconstructed, to some extent, the aforementioned idyll in a short descriptive passage of 1844, showing the pastoral silence of "Sleepy Hollow" in Concord, Massachusets (Irving's one being located in the present state of New York), significantly disturbed by "the whistle of the locomotive" (Marx 1977: 13), i. e. technology.

If Columbus's original vision of American paradise - the realm of unspoiled beauty of nature, peopled by naked, uncivilized natives - was historically "disenchanted," to use Max Weber's sociocultural terminology, by the onset of colonial exploitation, then the transcendentalist "gospel" underwent a "disenchantment" in philosophical more methodical than Hawthorne's virtually terms. accidental deconstruction, owing to Edgar Allan Poe. In his non-fiction work Eureka (1848), subtitled by the author as "A Prose Poem" - another, arguably more relevant subtitle being "An Essay on the Material and Spiritual Universe" - he demonstrated that Emerson's bold statements concerning the divine union of the Over-soul, nature, and man were in fact arbitrary, given the unavoidable limits of human cognition.<sup>1</sup> Quite significantly, as well as surprisingly, similar doubts resonate in the words of a prominent English representative of Romantic transcendental idealism, William Wordsworth, expressing his skepticism about the Spirit really rolling

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> This goes some way towards explaining the mutual reluctance between Emerson's "camp" and this enfant terrible of American Romanticism.

through the Eternal Thing, i. e. nature (Graff 1983: 62). However, Poe went remarkably farther, proposing a relativist, if not "deconstructionist" view upon nature and the whole universe (Valery 1966: 106-107), and finally stating: "My whole nature revolts at the idea that there is any being in the universe superior to myself "(Matthiessen 1941: 8).

F. O. Matthiessen, one of greatest authorities on American Romanticism, quotes these words, paradoxically, as an example of extreme solipsistic consequences of transcendentalist philosophical approach - if we recall Emerson's declaration "The individual is the world" (Kadir 2010: 20) - failing to notice "a certain rhetorical ambiguity and epistemological complexity in Poe's reasoning and ironic diction" (Kadir 2010: 20). Indeed, Poe's provocative statement invites the interpretation rather along the lines of decadent Romantic dandvism (bohemianism), tinged with self-mockery and naturally inclined towards narcotics or alcohol as remedies for the numbness of the soul and senses. Towards reaching the most sublime spiritual elevation via a biochemical "short cut," rather than through time- and effort-consuming mystical meditation - which was only logical natural under the conditions of burgeoning modern urban civilization, with its imperative of consumption to possibly quick effect. Towards "artificial paradise": to use the classic phrase coined by the French poet Charles Baudelaire, one of Poe's most avid admirers and most talented followers.

As shall be stressed later, the replacement of genuine mystical initiation into the divine essence of nature with the "artificial" one was of seminal importance also for American Beats and Hippies, who appeared around one hundred years later. Meanwhile, however, let us briefly recall the subsequent stages of American transcendental pantheism becoming consistently undermined and increasingly "disenchanted."

At first, we shall have to elucidate the implications of the aforementioned replacement that virtually meant the substitution of moving higher and higher on the pantheistic ladder of cognition towards true illumination with the logic resembling the one of a vicious circle. Born out of *ennui*, underpinned by the subconscious conviction of *unio mystica* being beyond the human reach - hinted at by Poe and precisely articulated by Baudelaire - the search for "artificial paradise" inevitably lead back to *ennui*, i. e. to "dirty pool" of everyday existence (to refer to Rimabud's famous metaphor from the poem "Le Bateau ivre," 1871). The repeated experience of this uninspiring return automatically bred the feeling of overwhelming dejection or the impression of cul-de-sac that, in philosophical terms of existentialism, was later described as being plunged into existence: intrinsically absurd and inclined towards nothingness (Poe's accidental

death caused by opium and alcohol overdose could be quoted as an adequate, real-life example here).

Simultaneously, in the works of American writers who were relatively closer to transcendentalism, one may hear a more and more audible note of cognitive skepticism, born out of the increasingly sharper consciousness of the limitations of human understanding - the limitations that, let it be stressed once again, Poe was also conscious of. Consequently, the pantheistic unity of man and nature started eroding, which, as we shall see later, also found its conclusion in existential pessimism.

The skepticism in question may be identified already in the poetry of Frederick Goddard Tuckerman (1821-1873). Though sometimes compared to Keats and frequently inspired by the Hudson River landscapes, he goes, in fact, against the tradition of his Romantic predecessors, stressing that the voice of nature is virtually incomprehensible to human ear: see, first of all, "The Cricket," arguably his most appreciated poem, published only in the 20<sup>th</sup> century. The same discrepancy assumes far more dramatic proportions in *Moby-Dick* (1851) by Herman Melville, a writer of well-known transcendentalist connections. He proposes here something of a dialectical opposition of Emersonian "gospel," presenting an archetypal Romantic rebel in ultimately unsuccessful pursuit of the alien force of the Absolute, disguised as an ambiguous phenomenon of nature. In the story "Bartleby the Scrivener" (1856), the writer goes even further, creating a mysterious Romantic anti-hero: "more a man of preferences than assumptions" (Melville 1984: 432), challenging not the Absolute, but the commonplace logic of everyday behaviour, fundamentally disturbed by his being passive. Thus, alienated in a big city that has already replaced the natural environment, he finds himself drifting towards existential randomness and, finally, nothingness suicide - to some extent because of the lack of characterological essence (to refer to existentialist terminology once again).

Emily Dickinson (1830-1886) follows quite closely stating "I dwell in Possibility-" (Dickinson 1984: 262), which, basically referring to her poetic profession, may also invite associations with being plunged into existence of rather indefinite nature – whereas the implication of her hands being too "narrow... to gather Paradise" (Dickinson 1984: 262) in the same poem approximates the aforementioned note of cognitive skepticism that culminates in "Nature' is what we see."<sup>2</sup> In "Apparently

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> "Nature is what we know-/Yet have no art to say" (Dickinson 1984: 263) – to quote the poem further.

with no Surprise," the poet extends this perspective; probably inspired by the theories of naturalism, increasingly popular at the time, she metaphorically shows human being as redundant in the face of indifferent nature.

The latter idea becomes more thoroughly articulated in Stephen Crane's "The Open Boat," which stands in direct opposition to the transcendentalist concept of pantheistic harmony of the universe. This autobiographical story of four survivors floating on the icy Atlantic waters near the Florida coast in a rescue boat that may swamp any time exemplifies not only nature's cold indifference towards man - with God, by then, largely absent from the picture - but also man's condition of a potential victim of blind chance, if not the absurd of existence.<sup>3</sup> It also suggests the affinities between two aforementioned trends of "deconstruction" of Emerson's "gospel," i. e. the growing cognitive skepticism of its followers and its replacement with the mirage of "artificial paradise": considering that "God is cold" (Crane 1976: C276), the refrain of "A Man Adrift on a Slim Spar," the story's poetic conclusion, visibly corresponds e. g. to Poe's "The Raven."<sup>4</sup> Moreover, published in 1900, "The Open Boat" symbolically foreshadowed the mood of existential uncertainty, if not sheer pessimism, that came to define a large number of philosophical and literary milestones of the 20th century - such as Hemingway's The Sun Also Rises (1926), probably the definitive Lost Generation novel. It was also in the century that, in the USA, the Beats and the Hippies marked their artistic and intellectual presence.

## III. The Beats and the Hippies- Natural Paradise Unregained

1. The Beats could be paradoxically identified as the mid- $20^{\text{th}}$  century incarnation of both the Lost Generation and transcendentalists. With the former, they shared the feeling of being plunged into alien, or even oppressive reality,<sup>5</sup> which naturally invited existentialist connotations, emphatically expressed in the famous opening line of Allen Ginsberg's *Howl* (1956): "I saw the best minds of my generation destroyed by madness starving hysterical naked... (Ginsberg 1989: 205). With the latter, including closely related Walt Whitman, they were more

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>3</sup> One of the characters, most likely to survive, dies near the shore (Crane 1987: 200).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>4</sup> Not to mention Baudelaire's *Flowers of Evil*, with their prevailing mood of "empty spirituality" (Friedrich 1978: 72-75).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>5</sup> Considering their anarchic lifestyle and leftist attitudes in the 1950s' conservative America.

profoundly linked: if we recall their stress upon Zen Buddhist meditation practices that vaguely resembled contemplating nature in the manner of Thoreau, or global poetic perspective, in *Howl* extending from the Rockland madhouse to "the ancient heavenly connection to the starry dynamo in the machinery of night" (Ginsberg 1989: 205), as well as freeverse form. Both these traits, obviously inherited from the author of *Song of Myself*, find model exemplification in "Footnote to *Howl*," where Whitmanian enumerations and obsessive, quasi-chamanic repetition of the word "holy" harmoniously combine to convey the mystical, Blake-inspired vision of universal holiness, quite in line with Emersonian "gospel."

There is, however, an important difference, as in the Beat literature transcendental spiritual adventures are usually mentioned in the psychedelic or narcotic context: see at least the second part of *Howl*, inspired by a peyote phantasmagoria, in which the author "saw the facade of the Sir Francis Drake Hotel as the grinning face of Moloch" (Ellmann & O'Clair 1973: 1120). Or the line from its first part, describing those "who… hollow-eyed and high sat up smoking… contemplating jazz" (Ginsberg 1989: 205) – where "high" and "smoking" clearly refer to marijuana of hashish consumption.

The stress upon contemplation being regularly (necessarily?) assisted by drugs is only natural, considering that the Beat movement was seen as a belated American reflection of European *fin-de-siecle* bohemia: vide at least the second chapter of Down and In, Ronald Sukenick's story of New York artistic underground after WWII, entitled "Bohemia Is a Country in Europe" (Sukenick 1995: 55-108). This book plainly demonstrates that the movement in question was born under the conditions of American modern urban culture: those who contemplated jazz in *Howl* were "floating across the tops of cities" (Ginsberg 1989: 205), while California, the longest-lasting remnant of the American paradise, was metaphorised as "supermarket" in another classic poem by Ginsberg. The rural America of Thoreau's Walden Pond meditations, or of the Brook Farm Institute of Agriculture and Education, established in 1841, was far behind – remembering that it was already Walt Whitman, an immediate follower of Emerson and Thoreau, who saw himself as "one of the citizens" (Whitman 1984: 249) of the New World conceived as "the city" (Whitman 1984: 249). Consequently, it was only logical that the Beats should follow their 19<sup>th</sup> century bohemian predecessors into the elusive realms of "artificial paradise," away from the pantheistic union of God, man and nature. Still, it is impossible to claim that the latter was reduced in their works to the background of searching "a unique narcotic" (Burroughs 1982: 253), in Burroughs and Ginsberg's The Yage Letters (1963) called "yage," or to the landscape changing quickly behind the windows of cars in which the characters of Kerouac's *On the Road* (1957) chase the thrill of narcotic or sexual adventures.

Among the works of the latter writer, there are, in fact, at least three novels where nature is assigned a more prominent place. Still, the scenarios of the characters' encounters with it are remarkably different from Emerson's or Thoreau's spells of solitary contemplation.

Thus, in The Dharma Bums (1958), Ray Smith, i. e. Kerouac himself, and Japhy Ryder, i. e. Gary Snyder, a poet considered by the Beats an authority in Zen Buddhism, follow the teaching of Siddartha Gautama renouncing the "supermarket" of contemporary American consumerism and preaching the art of facing "only the essential facts of life," as Thoreau would have put it (Thoreau 1984: 173). Still, as "bums," i. e. dissolute tramps seeing themselves as the seekers for spiritual illumination, they feel free to take advantage of consumer goods, drinking huge amounts of wine and devouring salami, cheddar cheese, or Hershey chocolate. Thus, they approximate to some extent the characters from Hemingway The Sun Also Rises, even though the latter are driven to empty hedonism by the sense of existential aimlessness and emotional wasteland. In this context, even Ryder's peyote-inspired vision (Kerouac 1994: 34), barely transcends the level of consumption, while Smith's solitary spell of meditation on Desolation Peak in the Cascade Mountains in the state of Washington ultimately proves rather ambiguous from the perspective of transcendental wisdom in the Buddhist version.

This ambiguity is even more clearly visible in *Desolation Angels* (written also in the late 1950s, though published only in 1965), sharing with the former novel both the subject matter and the setting. Kerouac, this time as Jack Dulouz, in the initial section describes the time he spent as a fire lookout on Desolation Peak – becoming, however, increasingly less angelic in the Buddhist sense, as well as tempted by narcotic pleasures (after a large dose of opium, his mind becomes profoundly confused). Ultimately, having chosen to live in the world of nature, he finds himself alienated from it: in obvious contradiction to Emersonian "gospel."

Quite significantly, Dulouz goes through this unwelcome experience once again in *Big Sur* (1962), which may be tentatively considered the Beat equivalent of *Walden*. He escapes from the intensity of bohemian life in San Francisco to his friend's cabin in the Big Sur woods, on the rocky Pacific coast of California, to live in complete solitude. He indulges in long walks around this wild though enchanting area, contemplating birds, flowers, or trees. The analogy to Thoreau's Walden experience is reinforced by mystical insights into the divine harmony of nature, where "the leaf is paradise... the man is paradise... the sea is paradise" (Kerouac 1963: 29),<sup>6</sup> as well as by references to Emerson and Whitman (Kerouac 1963: 24).

Still, the American Paradise of harmony both between man and nature and within man himself may be regained only for a while: differently from Thoreau, who spent more than two years on the Walden Pond, Kerouac/Dulouz already on his fourth day at Big Sur "began to get bored" (Kerouac 1963: 24). Thus, he opted to follow his "DESIRE" (Kerouac 1963: 33), i. e. to return to the common bohemian pleasures of alcoholic/psvchedelic/narcotic consumption.<sup>7</sup> The latter's effects are presented here as mind-boggling rather than mind-expanding: excessive drinking results in delirium "horrors," whenever "the bottle is gone" (Kerouac 1963: 89), while marijuana puts the narrator/main hero into a paranoid mental condition (Kerouac 1963: 103). Consequently, his final illumination of being "perfectly normal again" (Kerouac 1963: 177), and, in line with the Buddhist principle of *tathata*, reconciled to everyday reality, his friends and the woman he hardly empathized with, becomes even more controversial than Smith's meditation on Desolation Peak. In other words, in the world consumed by existential anxiety, along with increasingly unrestrained hedonism, the noble transcendentalist idea of harmony of God, nature, and man appears to be little more than a passing fancy.

2. Even though Lawrence Ferlinghetti, a renowned Beat poet, dismissed the Hippies as a product of "a nonliterate age" (Wright 1985: 36), there were, nonetheless, important links between these two movements, both of which originated in California, traditionally known for liberal socio-cultural atmosphere. First of all, however, they rejected the same middle-class America (in the countercultural jargon of the 1960s defined as "square") in favour of alternative (bohemian) values and lifestyle – even though, with the Hippies, it was rather a case of "bohemianism for the masses," according to Czesław Miłosz's ironic remark (Jarzyńska 2013: 136).

Still, as far as the attitude towards nature was concerned, the Hippies seemed to be definitely closer to the tradition of American

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>6</sup> Another obvious analogy, within the Beat literary circle, is to "Footnote to *Howl*;" further parallels with Ginsberg's free verse at its most visionary may be found in "Sea: Sounds of the Pacific Ocean at Big Sur," the poetic appendix of the novel, featuring loose, "far out" associations, reminiscent also of French surrealism (A. Breton, referred to in Chapter 7)

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>7</sup> The DESIRE in question may well seem to illustrate the bohemian rule of addiction, according to which life is just boring without drugs or alcohol (as Amy Winehouse, a profusely talented pop/R&B singer, fatally dependent on both, used to repeat).

transcendentalism. Additionally inspired by Fourier's version of utopian socialism<sup>8</sup> and, first of all, by the works of the German philosopher Herbert Marcuse, who in *Eros and Civilization: A Philosophical Inquiry into Freud* (1955) questioned the conflict between Freudian pleasure and reality principles, they widely practiced living in communes, in harmony both with natural environment and their own instincts. Simultaneously, while opposing the conscription for the Vietnam war, they directly referred to Thoreau's philosophy of civil disobedience. To what extent, however, did their anti-establishment communal experiment prove efficient?

The answers provided by the movement's literary legacy are rather ambiguous, to say the least. Even Richard Brautigan, described either as "one of the youngest members of the Beat Generation and one of the oldest members of the Hippie Thing" (Welch 1983: 24), or, most significantly, as "all the novelist the hippies needed" (Wright 1985: 36), in the majority of his writings remained rather skeptical about the possibility of the alternative utopia being actually implemented. The best example here is, arguably, presented in his first published novel, A Confederate General from Big Sur (1964), whose main hero decides to challenge the contemporary American establishment by settling down in a cabin, in the place mentioned in the title, and establishing a commune there. The reference to Kerouac's *Big Sur* is evident, not only in terms of the setting. Strictly speaking, the effort to rediscover the American Dream in the pantheistic sense of transcendentalists, this time by "some hippies and their girls and a rich madman" (Waugh 1971: 287), fails once again, becoming pathetically reduced to fruitless marijuana-smoking and alcohol-drinking sessions, as well as to collecting cigarette butts along the highways of California.

In his most revered novel, *Trout Fishing in America* (1967), Brautigan largely discarded this rather subdued irony in favour of a depressing vision of "the Cleveland Wrecking Yard" (Brautigan 1967: 164), i.e. industrial "waste land" where one can buy e. g. a bathroom, or encounter a trout stream that has already been used. Painting this picture of American Paradise being technologically "disenchanted," to some extent in line with Eliot's or Fitzgerald's pertinent imagery, he simultaneously provided the answer to Jim Morrison's dramatic question: "What have they done to the Earth?/What have they done to our fairest sister?" in The Doors' epic song "When the Music's Over" (1967). The question was actually more audible than the answer, as it was songs of this kind that, rather than any piece of poetry or fiction, represented the

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>8</sup> Fourier's falansters being notorious for free-love practices.

mainstream of the Hippie culture, articulating itself primarily through music and film.

As could be expected, the answer provided by Morrison himself in this song was remarkably similar. Elsewhere, he occasionally referred to the original American Paradise of harmony between people and nature, showing it as dramatically violated by modern technological civilization: see his childhood memories of Indian workers lying along the motorway and bleeding to death after a car accident, as marginally referred to in the song "Peace Frog" (1970) and thoroughly recalled on the posthumous poetry/music album An American Praver (1978). At the same time, however, as a keen observer of the contemporary American reality. Morrison hardly saw any viable solution in the youthful revolt against "the Moloch" (to refer to the famous metaphor from Howl), describing the members of a Hippie commune in the realm of Nature as "stoned immaculate" in the song "The WASP (Texas Radio and the Big Beat)" (1971). And, despite straightforward praising the unspoiled "country" as infinitely superior to the hectic, polluted "city," e. g. in Canned Heat's "Going Up the Country" (1969), the irreversible decay of American Paradise was almost just as often observed by other leading Hippie rock artists from this country. One of the most pertinent examples is Steppenwolf's epic "Monster" (1969), impressively reconstructing the process of idyllic pre-Columbian America turning into an inhuman oppressive technocratic "monster": as the new rebellious generation chose to rename Ginsberg's "Moloch."

To conclude this section of the present essay, let us recall one of the most relevant sequences of the film Easy Rider (1969) whose two main heroes, one of them significantly nicknamed "Captain America," embark on a motorcycle odyssey, smuggling cocaine from Mexico to Los Angles and attempting to rediscover the American Paradise: the tanks of their Harley-Davidsons being proudly painted in the Stars and Stripes. In the sequence in question, they are having a marijuana-smoking session with a counterculturally-oriented lawyer who, having joined them on their journey, reflects upon the continent's pristine, pre-Columbian past, concluding that once this land was beautiful and friendly. The lawyer being killed soon afterwards by blood-thirsty "squares,"<sup>9</sup> as well as subsequent deaths of both main characters, suggest that this is "no country for open-minded men," to paraphrase the title of Cormac McCarthy's later novel. Men who at least try to live in harmony with themselves and the world around them, even though they ultimately fail to revive the traditional American idealism of nature

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>9</sup> In the countercultural jargon, "square," commonly used to identify the middle-class attitudes or values, basically meant "conventional" and "materialistic."

## IV. Polish Footnote to the Beat/Hippie Paradise Unregained

With reference to the Beat literary movement, the notion of "beat" has a number of contradictory references mirroring the complexity of the writers' perspective upon themselves. On the one hand, they preferred to be seen as "beaten," e. g. by the "Moloch" of corporate post-WWII American state – on the other hand, though, they rose to the level of "beatitude," owing to their exercises in (psychedelically stimulated) meditation. Thus, with respect to our topic, one may wonder whether the outcome of their encounters with nature should be summed up as being gloriously "beatific" or pathetically "beaten."

Taking into account the Hippie sequel of these encounters, as exemplified by Easy Rider, the second option would be more plausible, since "Captain America" and his partner, apart from being literally "beaten" to death by the "Monster's" slaves, conclude earlier that they "blew it:" finding their ambition to rediscover the American Paradise reduced to drug-smuggling or visits to brothels. As for the classic Beat writers, such as Kerouac, the issue in question appears to be more ambiguous: considering at least Dulouz's final illumination in Big Sur. This novel would also suggest that, for anyone identifying with the Beat credo and its practical consequences, nature was rather an asylum from the excesses of "artistic" lifestyle than a source of divine consolation or universal harmony. Thus, in contrast to the eternal pantheistic presence in Emerson's sense, enveloping every human being, here it was assigned almost the function of a hotel one could always leave: feeling the need to return to bohemian pleasures (as in Big Sur), or finding oneself alienated (as in Desolation Angels), and ultimately proving the Beats to be "disaffiliated,"<sup>10</sup> not only from the "square" middle class, but, paradoxically, even from their own transcendentalist heritage.

Still, approaching the latter issue from the perspective of existentialism, which remarkably affected the philosophy and literature of the first half of the 20<sup>th</sup> century (to mention at least Hemingway), we shall observe that the problem of alienation may hardly be solved by moving somewhere else, according to the "on the road" pattern. Being alienated in the existential sense is not bound to be appeased by any fleeting pleasures; instead, it seems to be inwardly directed towards its own absolute, i. e. nothingness. The latter perspective, largely absent from the classic works of Beat literature, quite unexpectedly marked its presence in a Polish novel, undoubtedly inspired by Kerouac.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>10</sup> The term originally used by Kenneth Rexroth - a poet and jazz essayist, strongly "affiliated" with the Ginsberg-Kerouac circle, though remarkably older - in Lawrence Lipton's *The Holy Barbarians* (1959), a highly relevant publication on the Beat phenomenon.

With respect to the thematic perspective of this essay where we devoted some attention to transcendentalists, naturalists, or even modernists, it may be worth recalling, at this point, the philosophical and spiritual affinity between R. W. Emerson's circle and the leading poets/thinkers of Polish Romanticism. Thus, we should mention here Adam Mickiewicz's correspondence with Margaret Fuller, or Juliusz Słowacki's concept of spiritual/divine genesis of nature and man, conceived along the lines of transcendental idealism. Going further into the 20<sup>th</sup> century, we shall notice that Ernest Hemingway's stylistic approach, manner of literary characterization, and "macho" philosophy of life influenced Marek Hłasko, one of the most promising Polish fiction-writers of the 1950s and 1960s. We shall even observe that, some time earlier, Zbigniew Uniłowski's Wspólny pokój ["Common Room," 1932] accidentally came guite close to the formula of *roman a clef*, regularly exploited by the Beat novelists (radical differences in style and mode of narration notwithstanding). We shall have to admit, nonetheless, that the first genuinely conscious example of receptiveness towards this American literary trend in Polish literature was, arguably, the aforementioned Kerouac-inspired work: Edward Stachura's Siekierezada ["Axerezade," 1971].<sup>11</sup>

This affinity may seem quite surprising: considering that, at the time, Kerouac's works were unavailable in Polish translation, and Stachura hardly knew English (as this author was reliably informed by Krzysztof Karasek, a renowned Polish poet and the writer's close friend, in August 2014). Born in France and familiar with this country's literature, as a later student of Romance languages at the University of Warsaw, he must have read *On the Road, The Dharma Bums*, or *Desolation Angels* in French; it is mainly the latter novel that is reflected in *Siekierezada*, along with such features of Kerouac's writings as autobiographical approach and "freely improvised" syntax.

Its main character, Janek Pradera, a sensitive, poetically inclined loner and, obviously, the author's porte-parole, arrives in some wild area of Polish mountains to work as a wood-chopper. The analogy to Dulouz's occupation and place of residence in *Desolation Angels* is instantly evident – even though Pradera, as a citizen of the communist Poland, can hardly afford opium, satisfying himself with vodka at the local inn. Another difference, despite his being constantly "on the road," is that the Polish equivalent of Dulouz does not conform to the idea of "dharma bum," as he abstains both from Buddhist meditation practices and

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>11</sup> This literal English equivalent of the Polish neologism, produced by the fusion of "siekiera" ("axe") and "Szecherezada" ("Sheherazade"), could be possibly replaced by more descriptive – and, arguably, more informative - "One Thousand and One Tree-Cutting Nights."

bohemian orgies. In line with Melville's Bartleby, representing a classic, already existential case of alienation, he is basically different from everybody: both primitive, albeit friendly fellow wood-choppers, and his only friend, whom he ultimately leaves. The reason is that the friend, in spite of hardships and depressions he has experienced, ultimately finds himself on the side of life and its unpredictable beauty – whereas Pradera, again in line with Bartleby, is instinctively driven towards nothingness, experienced via suicide.

The latter means, of course, the conclusion of the alienation in the realm of nature from the perspective of existentialism in its nihilistic variety. The perspective that was quite natural for Stachura - well-versed in Heidegger and especially Sartre, as well as displaying suicidal tendencies that led to his premature death in 1979 – and fundamentally alien to the Beats. Being to some extent heirs to transcendentalists and their "gospel," in the minimalist variant summarized by Thoreau as "However mean your life is, meet it and live it; do not shun it and call it hard names" (Thoreau 1984: 175), they unavoidably were, despite any self-destructive bohemian excesses, too strongly devoted to life and its diverse charms to allow themselves to be seriously tempted by nothingness. Thus, they appear to be relatively close to Pradera/Stachura's friend from Siekierezada, or, first of all, to their Hippie successors, such as Janis Joplin or Tim Buckley, famous acid-rock<sup>12</sup> artists.<sup>13</sup> Let us recall here that both Joplin and Buckley died of accidental heroin overdoses, following the lifestyle of their generation that largely consisted in having as much "fun" as possible, i. e. in hedonism that apparently outdistanced even the one of the Beats. After all, both heroes of Easy Rider also die by accident, which means: definitely against their will.

## V. Postlude

Recollecting the history of American literary encounters with nature, one may notice that its Emersonian pantheistic concept was gradually "deconstructed:" either by the bohemian quest for "artificial paradise," or, more sytematically, by naturalism, stressing man's redundance in the eyes of indifferent nature, and existentialism, highlighting the absurd of his being as

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>12</sup> The term synonymous with "psychedelic rock" ("acid" being a slang name for LSD), and thus defining the music of the Hippie Generation.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>13</sup> Considering real-life examples alongside the ones from the realm of literary or film fiction is justified by the Beat/Hippie artistic productions being heavily reliant on the lives of pertinent writers and musicians; for example, Stachura used to define his approach to writing as "życiopisanie" ("real-life writing"), to which Kerouac, or even Burroughs could readily subscribe.

undetermined by any metaphysical factors. The American Beat movement that came later was frequently considered as transcendentalism reborn in the mid- $20^{\text{th}}$  century – though, as has been observed, its representatives were generally more inclined to discard the genuine pantheistic mysticism in favour of the decadent searching for "artificial paradise" and, consequently, treating nature rather as a temporary asylum from the intensities of bohemian lifestyle. On the other hand, the Beats, as well as their Hippie successors, were rather reluctant to follow the path of alienation from nature to its suicidal end – as was the case under the extreme philosophical conditions of existentialism in its nihilistic version (Melville's Bartleby). Incidentally, this alternative route was chosen by the writers from other counries, such as the Polish poet and novelist Edward Stachura, influenced both by Kerouac and by French and German existential thinkers.

The question why this pessimistic scenario remained only potential for the contemporary American followers of transcendentalism is, arguably, open for further discussion. Trying to provide an answer on the basis of the above discourse, we would have to pay special attention to this philosophical/sociopolitical movement's attractive power that, despite Emersonian "gospel" having been effectively questioned by naturalist/existentialist "deconstruction", survived until the second half of the 20<sup>th</sup> century (as, at least, Thoreau-inspired civil-rights protest actions were to show).

Arguably, the apparent timelessness of the transcendentalists' heritage is due to its being, ultimately, an affirmation of life – no matter how cliched, old-fashioned, and arbitrary, under (post)modern philosophical conditions, the latter concept might actually appear to be. As we have seen, it was this particular affirmation that, in the century increasingly marked by skepticism, ironic deconstruction, and transience of literary/philosophical fashions, American Beats and Hippies remained faithful to, despite their seemingly suicidal hedonistic excesses. And, possibly, this is what fundamentally defines the aforementioned dialectics of being "beatific" and "beaten."

## References

## Books

Brautigan, R. 1970. *A Confederate General from Big Sur*. New York: Grove Press. [originally published in 1964].

Brautigan, R. 1967. Trout Fishing in America. New York: Dell Publishing.

Burroughs, W. S. *Naked Lunch*. 1982. New York: Grove Press [originally published in 1959].

- Burroughs, W. S. and A. Ginsberg. 1963. *The Yage Letters*. San Francisco: City Lights Books.
- Ellman, R. and R. O'Clair, eds. 1973. *The Norton Anthology of Modern Poetry*. New York: W. W. Norton & Company.
- Friedrich, H. 1978. *Struktura nowoczesnej liryki*. Trans. E. Feliksiak. Warszawa: PIW.
- Kerouac, J. Big Sur. 1963. New York: Bantam Books [originally published in 1962].
- ---. Desolation Angels. 1995. New York: Riverside Books [originally published in 1965].
- ---. On the Road. 1957. New York: Viking Press.
- ---. *Włóczędzy Dharmy*. 1994. Trans. M. Obarski. Poznań: Dom Wydawniczy Rebis [originally published as *The Dharma Bums* in 1958].
- Marx, L. 1977. *The Machine in the Garden. Technology and the Pastoral Ideal in America.* New York: Oxford University Press [originally published in 1964].
- Matthiessen, F. O. 1941. American Renaissance: Art and Expression in the Age of Emerson and Whitman. Oxford: Oxford University Press.
- Reich, Ch. 1976. Zieleni się Ameryka. Trans. D. Passent. Warszawa: Książka i Wiedza [originally published as *The Greening of America* in 1970].
- Sukenick, R. 1995. Nowojorska bohema. Trans. A. Dorobek. Warszawa: PIW [originally published as Down and In Life in the Underground: Bohemian to Hip to Beat to Rock and Punk Mutiny in American Culture in 1987].
- Welch, L. 1983. *How I Work as a Poet & Other Essays*. Bolinas, CA: Grey Fox Press.

#### **Texts in Anthologies**

- Bradford, W. 1984. "Of Plymouth Plantation." in *American Literature*. G. Kearns (ed.). New York: Macmillan Publishing Company. 24-28.
- Columbus, C. 1984. "Journal." Trans. W. C. Williams. In *American Literature*. G. Kearns (ed.). New York: Macmillan Publishing Company. 15-18.
- Crane, S. 1976. "A Man Adrift on a Slim Spar" in *The United States in Literature: "All My Sons" Edition*. J. A. Miller, Jr., R. Hayden and R. O'Neal (eds.). Glenview, Illinois: Scott, Foresman and Company. C276-C277.
- Crane, S. 1987. "The Open Boat" in *Literature: an Introduction to Fiction, Poetry and Drama.* X. J. Kennedy (ed.). Boston/Toronto: Little, Brown and Company. 183-200.
- Dickinson, E. 1984. "I dwell in Possibility-" in *American Literature*. G. Kearns (ed.). New York: Macmillan Publishing Company. 262.
- Dickinson, E. 1984 . "'Nature' is what we see-" in *American Literature*. G. Kearns (ed.). New York: Macmillan Publishing Company. 263.
- Emerson, R. W. 1984. "Nature" in *American Literature*. G. Kearns (ed.). New York: Macmillan Publishing Company. 161-162.

- Ginsberg, A. 1989. *Howl* in *The Longman Anthology of Contemporary American Poetry: 1950 to the Present.* S. Friebert and D. Young (eds.). New York: Longman. 205-212.
- Graff, G. 1983. "Mit przełomu postmodernistycznego." Trans. G. Cendrowska. In Nowa proza amerykańska. Szkice krytyczne. Z. Lewicki (ed.). Warszawa: Czytelnik. 56-96.
- Kadir, D. 2010. "Edgar Allan Poe: America's Conscience and Epistemic Anxiety" in *Poe Alive in the Century of Anxiety*. L. Juarez (ed.). Alcala de Henares: Instituto Franklin-UAH. 17-30.
- Melville, H. 1984. "Bartleby" in *American Romantic Tales*. S. B. Belov (ed.). Moscow: Raduga Publishers. 382-461.
- Smith, J. 1984. "A Description of New England" in *American Literature*. G. Kearns (ed.). New York: Macmillan Publishing Company. 20-21.
- Thoreau, H. D. 1984. "Walden" in *American Literature*. G. Kearns (ed.). New York: Macmillan Publishing Company. 171-176.
- Valery, P. 1966. "On Poe's 'Eureka" in *The Recognition of Edgar Allan Poe*. E. W. Carlson (ed.). Ann Arbor: University of Michigan Press. 102-110.
- Whitman, W. 1984. "Song of Myself" in *American Literature*. G. Kearns (ed.). New York: Macmillan Publishing Company. 247-250.

#### **Texts in Periodicals**

- Jarzyńska, K. 2013. "Pochwała ograniczeń, czyli Miłosza próba antyutopii" in Dekada Krakowska 3. 130-141.
- Waugh, A. 1971. "Auberon Waugh on the Rest of the Iceberg" in *Spectator* 266. 287-288.
- Wright, L. 1985. "The Life and Death of Richard Brautigan" in *Rolling Stone* 445. 29, 31, 34, 36, 38, 40, 59.

#### Films

Easy Rider. Dir. D. Hopper. Columbia: 1969. Film.

#### **Sound Recordings**

Canned Heat. "Going Up the Country." Liberty, 1969. SP.
Doors, The. "When The Music's Over." *Strange Days*. Elektra, 1967. LP.
Doors, The. "Peace Frog." *Morrison Hotel*. Elektra, 1970. LP.
Doors, The. "The WASP (Texas Radio and the Big Beat)." *L. A. Woman*. Elektra, 1971. LP.
Morrison, J. / The Doors. *An American Prayer*. Elektra, 1978. LP.

Steppenwolf. "Monster." Monster. Dunhill, 1969. LP.

# The Manipulation of World-Building Conventions in Woody Allen's Short Fiction

Amelia Precup Babeş-Bolyai University

**Abstract:** World de/re-construction is most definitely one of the favorite games postmodernist writers play. As is the case of many other postmodernist writers, Woody Allen's use of spatiality and his world building strategies represent both a disruption and a continuation of the techniques of modernist narrative. He does manifest considerable allegiance to form and structure, but, at the same time, he exhibits a powerful tendency to open up space and distort conventions by incorporating entropy and chaos and aligning his 'zone' building strategies to the postmodern sense of the world.

Key words: postmodern, manipulation, conventions, fiction

In *Annie Hall*, young Alvy Singer refuses to do his homework because "the universe is expanding" and, despite his mother's and Dr. Flicker's attempts to convince him of the contrary, he still believes that "if it is expanding, someday it will break apart and that will be the end of everything" (Allen and Brickman 1977), so there is no point in doing one's homework, nor anything else for that matter. The claim of Alvy's mother that "Brooklyn is not expanding" does not hold, especially in the case of Woody Allen's short fiction, since the fictional universe he creates is definitely expanding, distorting, colliding with other universes and even breaking apart, but, contrary to Alvy's expectations, this is only 'the beginning of everything' in the postmodernist fictional game.

World construction in postmodernist fiction contests one of the core pretences of realist fiction, "that the fictional world it creates exists in its entirety, is analogous to the real world, and that writing is, consequently, 'referential'" (Nicol 2009: 24). Although postmodernist fiction is viewed as both a continuation and a disruption of modernist literary strategies, it distanced itself to a considerable extent from the modernist tendency to integrate the outer world into the realm of psychological explorations and to focus on a synthesis of internal and external realities. By pleading allegiance to metafiction as the guiding

aesthetic belief, postmodernist writers construct fictional worlds using techniques which disclose the make-believe literary mechanisms employed during previous literary periods and perfected by realism.

Postmodernism in general is characterized by fragmentation and the loss of the centre, which makes room for the creation of what Fredric Jameson describes as an "extraordinarily demoralizing and depressing original new global space which is the 'moment of truth' of postmodernism" and which leaves individuals "bereft of spatial coordinates" (1991: 49). Jameson's perspective holds true for the narrated space as it reflects upon the loss of spatial centrality in postmodernist fiction as well. As Gerhard Hoffman also states, the postmodern narrated space lost "its spatial self-containedness and its geographical, relatively homogenous societal basis" (2005: 359).

The reinterpretation of space and the de/re-construction of worlds is one of the favorite writerly exercises in postmodernist fiction. Space is no longer defined in its conventional functionality; spatial forms are challenged, loosened and dissolved, leaving fictional worlds in complete disarray, governed exclusively by the rules of the exuberant and playful postmodern imagination. Gerhard Hoffmann (2005) views world construction in postmodernist fiction as characterized by the dialectic of continuous connection and separation. He has identified three major dominants for the use of spatiality in postmodernist fiction, which define it in terms of a shift from its previous representational role and point towards its deconstructive tendency. Hoffmann writes:

First, the appearance-disappearance paradigm reigns in the presentation of space; second, space is liberated from the concept of (determinate) milieu, from the projection of inner into outer, and from elaborate description; and, third, movement is transformed into a mere operation in space and time: beginning, end and goal are lost or suspended. (364)

The problematic interaction of fictional worlds and the question of plausibility in postmodernist fiction is designed "for the purpose of ontological propositions" (McHale 2004: exploring 43). thus subordinating the question of (un)reliability to ontological issues. In his book Postmodernist Fiction, Brian McHale explores spatial structures and the strategies of spatial organization in postmodernist fiction and identifies four major techniques used in postmodernist texts to juxtaposition, fictional worlds: (de)construct interpolation. superimposition, and misattribution (45).

The first strategy McHale identified presupposes the creation of an impossible map out of randomly juxtaposing real-world geographic

locations. Interpolation refers to "introducing an alien space within a familiar space, or between two adjacent areas of space where no such 'between' exists," while superimposition involves a construct in which "two familiar spaces are placed one on top of the other, as in a photographic double-exposure" (46). Misattribution refers to an arbitrary association of places and characteristics or clichés which, in the real world, have nothing in common. All these fictional strategies result in the creation of a heterotopian space. Heterotopia, a concept coined by Michel Foucault, who described it as "the disorder in which fragments of a large number of possible orders glitter separately in the dimension, without law or geometry, of the heteroclite" (qtd. in McHale 44) was borrowed by Brian McHale in his attempt to define a functional paradigm for the postmodernist rendering of spatiality. Brian McHale associates the Foucauldian heterotopian space with what he calls 'the zone' which is just as "radically discontinuous and inconsistent" and "juxtaposes worlds of incompatible structure" (44).

Woody Allen is no stranger to the playful manipulation of worldbuilding conventions and, often enough, he completely removes the fictional realm of his short stories from the immediate world of reference. Still, he sticks to certain fundamental coordinates which are best described in "My Philosophy" where he writes: "The reality I speak of here is the same one Hobbes described, but a little smaller" (1991: 171). Thus, the reality of Woody Allen's fiction presents the world as matter in motion, the soul as mortal, and the individual as being caught in biological determinism – of course, on a smaller scale. This view of the world becomes the working principle of Woody Allen's world construction strategies and constitutes the basis for the ethos underlying his entire fiction.

The dialectic of connection and separation is very much at work in Woody Allen's short fiction as he distorts spatial coordinates, he materializes spatial metaphors, he plays with overlapping worlds, and he profits from the strategic benefits of these techniques by allowing the displacement of the real and the perverting of experience. Woody Allen's short fiction presents instances of juxtaposition, interpolation, superimposition, and misattribution as defined by Brian McHale. Although the postmodern play which underlies Woody Allen's worldbuilding strategies is generally put to humorous use, it also performs a critical revision of reality.

Young Alvy Singer's above-mentioned concerns about the expansion of the universe are confirmed in "The UFO Menace" where the narrator tells us that: "[t]he key factor in thinking about the universe, however, is that it is expanding and will one day break apart and

disappear" (1991: 326). "The UFO Menace" is intended as a report on extraterrestrial contacts, written in the journalistic vernacular, featuring a historical approach, an analysis of various testimonials on the subject, as well as personal insights. The story is built on a series of misattributions whose main purpose is to amuse and mock the clichéd hysterical approaches to this topic. The text plays a game of superimposing a surreal, absurd, even grotesque sequence of events over what it attempts to describe as an accurate representation of the real world, in order to emphasize the mock-comic effect. For example, Sir Chester Ramsbottom reports that he had been terrorized by an unidentified, cigar-shaped flying object and because of this traumatic event, he ended up in a hospital. However, "[u]pon investigation, experts determined that the 'cigar-shaped object' was Sir Chester's nose. Naturally, all his evasive actions could not lose it, since it was attached to his face" (328). An alien encounter is also misattributed to Goethe who recounts the event as follows:

En route home from the Leipzig Anxiety Festival, [...] I was crossing a meadow, when I chanced to look up and saw several fiery red balls suddenly appear in the southern sky. They descended at a great rate of speed and began chasing me. I screamed that I was a genius and consequently could not run very fast, but my words were wasted. I became enraged and shouted imprecations at them, whereupon they flew away frightened. (327)

Woody Allen uses a technique based on the paradoxical synthesis of the real and the misattributed as Goethe's misattributed statement is followed by a series of true details of his life (his visits to Beethoven after the latter had already lost his hearing). The 'true' and the 'logical' surrender to the postmodernist playful avoidance of reality which might not have any other finality than to expose the world as a universe of empty utterances. Another of Woody Allen's short stories, "Reminiscences: Places and People" is the result of an ebullient surrealist imagination which plays with comic metamorphoses and with the literalization of metaphors and cultural clichés, a very appealing strategy among postmodernist writers. It is a collage of memories recounted by an unnamed narrator. This new environment of reality mediated through the consciousness and memory of the narrator is literally turned upside-down from the very beginning:

*Brooklyn*: Tree-lined streets. The Bridge. Churches and cemeteries everywhere. And candy stores. A small boy helps a bearded old man across the street and says, "Good Sabbath." The old man smiles and empties his pipe on the boy's head. The child runs crying into his house... Stifling heat and humidity descend on the borough.

Residents bring folding chairs out onto the street after dinner to sit and talk. Suddenly it begins to snow. Confusion sets in. A vender wends his way down the street selling hot pretzels. He is set upon by dogs and chased up a tree. Unfortunately for him, there are more dogs at the top of the tree. (389)

The world is distorted and misrepresented like in a carnival mirror as the 'upside-down-ness' affects not only the environment, but also subjective perception, as is the case with the visit to Paris: "I come upon a man at an outdoor cafe. It is André Malraux. Oddly, he thinks that I am André Malraux. [...]Years later, we meet at a dinner, and again he insists that I am Malraux. This time, I go along with it and get to eat his fruit cocktail" (391).

The narrator insists on invoking a series of realistic topographic details (the Brooklyn Bridge, Ebbets Field close to Bedford Avenue, Beauregard Square in New Orleans, Les Halles in Paris, Old Brompton Road in London) and temporal clues (before the Luftwaffe bombed London) in an attempt to create the illusion of identity between the fictional world and the real world of the reader, thus emphasizing the disquieting effect resulting from the distortion of spatial coordinates and the superimposition of an absurd series of events. The reality of the fictional dimension alters with the literalization of cultural clichés and metaphors. It transforms into a surreal 'zone' which continuously attempts to mediate order and chaos. The London episode offers such an example:

Now we stroll up Old Brompton Road, and the rains come again. I offer my umbrella to Maugham and he takes it, despite the fact he already has an umbrella. Maugham now carries two open umbrellas [...] Maugham pauses to buy and open a third umbrella. (286) [...] A gust of wind lifts Maugham off his feet and slams him into a building. He chuckles. (392)

The text is constructed on the dialectic of construction and deconstruction, of connection and separation. It simultaneously constructs and deconstructs the plausibility of reality and drives it to entropy by continuously vacillating between the real and the absurd and extending the possible into the illogical. The overlapping of oppositional matrices is meant to build the meaning of the text which actually becomes the synecdoche of a disturbed and disturbing society, and accounts for the ineluctable deficiencies of a world which fails to provide credible and

meaningful landmarks. The usage of such fictional strategies results, of course, in the triumph of the absurd.

Woody Allen's penchant for the absurd creation is shared by most postmodernist writers who use it "as an identified word for purpose of reference, as a framework for reflection, as a fictional matrix for the fictional design, or as atmospheric background for existential fears and needs" (Hoffman 2005: 209). In Woody Allen's fiction, the absurd appears in all the contexts mentioned by Gerhard Hoffmann. This type of absurdist, surreal distortions as those described above are emblematic for the strategies of spatial representation and world construction in Woody Allen's short fiction. Still, in many cases, he takes things even further. For example, in "Above the Law, Below the Box Springs" any possible real-world equivalence withdraws from the text from the very beginning, for he creates the setting of this absurd story with the interpolation of two alien elements between familiar spaces:

Wilton's Creek lies at the center of the Great Plains, north of Shepherd's Grove, to the left of Dobb's Point, and just about the bluffs that form Planck's constant. The land is arable and is found primarily on the ground. Once a year, the swirling winds from the Kinna Hurrah rip through the open fields, lifting farmers from their work and depositing them hundreds of miles to the south, where they often resettle and open boutiques. (Allen, 2008: 133)

While Wilton's Creek, the Great Plains, and Shepherd's Grove can be easily found on the map, the attempt would be completely unsuccessful if we were to look for "the bluffs that form Planck's constant" or for "Kinna Hurrah rip". Through the use of geographic puns and references to quantum mechanics and to the Jewish tradition, the construction of this implausible space hides more than mere distortion. Planck's constant reflects the smallest scale on which the effects of quantum mechanics can be observed, thus introducing elements which do not belong to the spatial coordinates of classical physics. The other intrusive topographic reference points in a completely different direction. Kinna Hurrah, or Ken Ayin Hara, is Yiddish for "May there be no evil eye" and 'rip' can also refer to a dissolute person whose ceaseless use of the Kinna Hurrah incantation could cause the swirling wind effect. As logic is erased from the story from the very beginning, the narrated events can continue in the same line, losing the schemata of conventional logic and hyperbolizing contemporary hysteria by means of Woody Allen's specific comic mode.

The geometry of overlapped dimensions culminates in Woody Allen's short fiction with "Surprise Rocks Disney Trial" which presents an excessive and fantastic fictional heterocosm, a celebration of the absurd, where, following the Baudrillardian 'formula', the real and the simulated merge, creating what Baudrillard defines "a real without origin or reality: a hyperreal" (1994: 2). In "Surprise Rocks Disney Trial" Woody Allen collides the real and the simulated, effaces the boundaries between the two, and creates a world in which Baudrillard's *hyperreal* assumes its full meaning. The short story is written in the form of a courtroom transcript which registered Mickey Mouse's deposition in the trial of the Walt Disney Company suit against Michael Ovitz, an event which actually occurred in reality. The formal mimicking of a serious real-life trial emphasizes the comic effect. Woody Allen writes:

Counsel: Will the witness please state his name. Witness: Mickey Mouse. C: Please tell the court your occupation. W: Animated rodent. C: Were you friendly with Michael Eisner? W: I wouldn't say friendly—we had dinner together a number of times. Once he and his wife had Minnie and me to their house. (2008: 147)

Mickey Mouse and his other animated colleagues have been given the opportunity to travel one ontological level up. Although Mickey Mouse is fully aware of his condition of "animated rodent," this does not prevent him from interacting with Steven Spielberg or Tom Cruise, or from attending the party which Barbara Streisand had thrown for Jiminy Cricket. The high permeability of ontological realms hastens the entropic process and allows for the creation of a world which is increasingly divorced from the 'real', a hopelessly illogical 'zone,' triumphant through misplaced identities.

The disorder of the narrated world, nurtured by recurrent references to real-life people and places and their interaction with animated cartoon characters, creates the strong illusion that reality has been corrupted, not by a fictional counterpart, but by its own regressive puerile imaginary which comes to question contemporary sanity and enhances the entropic process. This text represents the fictional translation of what Fredric Jameson describes as the "hysterical sublime" when referring to the postmodern spatial exploration of a world which "loses its depth and threatens to become a glossy skin, a stereoscopic illusion, a rush of filmic images without density" (1991: 26). The fictional world of the story is a bizarre, surreal and implausible construct which translates Baudrillard's theory according to which Disneyland is emblematic for the new simulated order which represents American contemporary reality. According to Baudrillard (1994), Disneyland functions as a "simulation of the third order" (12) which represents what he identified as the third 'phase of the image', in which image "masks the *absence* of a profound reality" (6). In Woody Allen's short story, the representation of the fictional world erases the boundaries between the real and the simulated; it turns the simulated into the real and contests the real by transforming it into one of the many possible variants of the simulated.

"The Kugelmass Episode" is another good example of ontological boundaries transgression. The short story emphasizes the importance of illusion for psychological survival and, at the same time, exposes the shortcomings of the delusional tendency embedded in human nature and used as a coping mechanism. In this short story Woody Allen toys with overlapping fictional worlds, with breaking ontological boundaries and with the violation of different narrative levels. Woody Allen breaks the diegetic boundaries between two fictional worlds, without working as hard to create the illusion of s corrupted reality as he did in the text analyzed above. As Brian McHale (2004: 123-124) noted, in "The Kugelmass Episode", the main character descends into the fictional world of Flaubert's novel *Madame Bovary*, he goes 'down' one ontological level, not 'up' towards the real world of the reader.

World de/re-construction is most definitely one of the favorite games postmodernist writers play. As is the case of many other postmodernist writers, Woody Allen's use of spatiality and his world building strategies represent both a disruption and a continuation of the techniques of modernist narrative. He does manifest considerable allegiance to form and structure, but, at the same time, he exhibits a powerful tendency to open up space and distort conventions by incorporating entropy and chaos and aligning his 'zone' building strategies to the postmodern sense of the world which is, according to McHale, "restlessly plural" (1992: 8). Woody Allen explores the manifoldness of postmodernist world-building strategies and uses them to give a symbolic meaning to his constructs. He creates a captivating, but antagonistic universe, and populates it with characters stumbling among its absurdities.

Woody Allen's short fiction always explores plurality and the multiplicity of perspectives, but his play is never gratuitous; he always directs his spatial disruptions towards a second, higher meaning, which transcends the mere comical effect and absolves his writing of the 'anything goes' attitude. The illogical and absurd fictional world he builds testifies for the same existentialist aesthetic creed that governs his entire work: reality is absurd and not even the fictional reinvention of the world can make it meaningful. Therefore, both the real and the imaginary worlds are but an infinite source of disillusions.

#### **References:**

- Allen, Woody. "Above the Law, Below the Box Springs." In *Mere Anarchy*, by Woody Allen, 133-140. London: Edbury Press, 2008.
- Allen, Woody. "My Philosophy." In *The Complete Prose of Woody Allen*, 167-174. e-book. New York: Wings Books, 1991.
- Allen, Woody. "Surprise Rocks Disney Trial." In *Mere Anarchy*, by Woody Allen, 147-154. London: Edbury Press, 2008.
- Allen, Woody. "The Kugelmass Episode." In *The Complete Prose of Woody Allen*, 347-360. e-book. New York: Wings Books, 1991.
- Allen, Woody. "The UFO Menace ." In *The Complete Prose of Woody Allen*, 323-332. e-book. New York: Wings Books, 1991.
- Allen, Woody and Marshall Brickman. *Annie Hall.* CD. Directed by Woody Allen. Produced by Rollins-Joffe Productions. Performed by Woody Allen and Diane Keaton. 1977. Film.
- Baudrillard, Jean. *Simulacra and Simulations*. Translated by Sheila Faria Glaser. 1981. Michigan: Ann Arbor : University of Michigan Press, 1994.
- Hoffman, Gerhard. From Modernism to Postmodernism. Concepts and Strategies of Postmodern American Fiction. Amsterdam & New York: Rodopi, 2005.
- Jameson, Fredric. *Postmodernism, or the Cultural Logic of Late Capitalism.* London & New York: Verso, 1991.
- McHale, Brian. *Constructing Postmodernism*. London & New York: Routledge, 1992. Print.
- -... Postmodernist Fiction. 1987. London & New York: Routledge, 2004.
- Nicol, Bran. *The Cambridge Introduction to Postmodern Fiction*. New York: Cambridge University Press, 2009.

# **CULTURAL STUDIES**

## **Geoffrey Chaucer - the Astrolabe and the Arab Connection**

#### Sorin Ciutacu

King Khalid University, Abha, KSA / Universitatea de Vest din Timisoara, Romania

**Abstract**: The paper sets out to discuss the less known Treatise on the Astrolabe written by Geoffrey Chaucer at the end of the 14th century, its circumstances, its pedagogic significance and its possible multiple sources connecting Chaucer to the Arab world as this instrument was developed by some Arab scientists in the Middle Ages although it had been invented by the ancient Greeks.

Key words: connection, Arabic, names, definition

The paper spots and discusses the Arabic names present in the treatise and sheds light on their meaning and function within the whole treatise on the astrolabe. The Arabic etymologies of some star names will also round up the intriguing picture of the complex interaction between European and the Arab science and culture in the Middle Ages.

This treatise has been a hunting ground for clues helping scholars to sort out astrological hints in The *Canterbury Tales*. The book throws up clues regarding the outlook on Cosmos displayed by the medieval mind. It must have proved valuable for many users in the 14<sup>th</sup> century as we are aware of the fact that many copies were printed out (Morrison, 2007).

Seen from a modern perspective, the manual looks a bit too loosely arranged and it lacks a glossary comprising propaedeutic definitions meant to lead the user into the intricate world of astronomy. "Presumably, Chaucer felt that his son, Lewis, the addressee of the treatise, would already have some background in basic astronomy, which was a required educational element at that time" (Morrison, 2007).

Chaucer took a genuine interest in the astrolabe as he had retired to Woodstock and performed different latitude measurements in this quiet place. He wrote the first scientific treatise in a fluent and clear Middle English language in about 1391. As I said before, the book was written for Lewis, a boy of ten, Chaucer's son or godson (according to some scholars). By authoring the treatise, Chaucer became just another scholar in a long tradition that wrote about the hallmarks of the Islamic science in the Middle Ages.

The definition of the astrolabe as given by Lane (2010) runs as follows:

The astrolabe is more commonly used by the Arabs than any other instrument for astronomical observations. It is generally between four and six inches in diameter. It consists of a circular plate with a graduated rim, within which fit several thinner plates; and of a limb, moving on a pivot in the centre, with two sights. The plates are engraved with complicated diagrams, &c, for various calculations. The instrument is held by a ring, or by a loop of cord attached to the ring, during an observation : and thus its own weight answers the same purpose as the plumb line of the quadrant (which the Arabs sometimes use in its stead) : 'the position of the moveable limb, with the sights, marking the required altitude." (Lane, 2010 chap, v., note 57).

An astrolabe is basically a two-dimensional map of the celestial sphere. The major stars and the major circles in the sky are projected onto a metal sheet. This component of the astrolabe is called a rete, Latin for 'net' or 'web', because the cut-out piece at the front of the astrolabe looks like a spider's web. Below the rete lie several plates, allowing the user to measure parameters in different latitudes. The rete and plates are lodged in a hollowed out container, the 'mater', which features special markings on the front and back. Connected to the back is a ruler, called the 'alidade', with two sighting vanes (small pierced metal juttings on the edge of the ruler) (Khalili, 2012: 259).

Astrolabes are highly complex instruments. The beginnings hark back to classical Greece around the beginning of the first century AD. We know that Muslim scientists improved the unit further from the eighth century onwards. Astrolabes began to be widely known in Western Europe around the tenth century. An astrolabe, for example, allows its user to tell the time during day and night with the help of the position of the sun and certain stars. An astrolabe can help one to sort out horoscopes and to engage in surveying (Khalili, 2012).

Christian scholars used to go Moorish Spain and learn science from the Arab and Jewish scholars there and translated or adapted their works into Latin or even write original works drawing upon the Islamic science in Spain (Hamilton, 2007).We surmise that Geoffrey Chaucer might have had multiple sources for his treatise due to this busy intellectual traffic along certain *cultural exchange corridors*.

One of the possible secondary sources for Chaucer might have been a manuscript from the tenth century preserved in the Archives of the Crown in Barcelona. This one describes the astrolabe and lists down the brightest stars approximately as we find them with Chaucer: Altair, Vega, Rigel, Aldebaran, and Algol (Freely, 2009).

Another possible secondary source might be Al-Kindi's astrology treatise "*MathematicaAlhandreiSummiAstrologi*", which features all the 28 constellations which sway our destiny, according to Al-Kindi. This manuscript is preserved at the BibliothequeNationale de Paris (Freely, 2009).

A very likely source for Chaucer must have been Gerbertd'Aurillac (to become Pope Sylvester II), who wrote a treatise on the astrolabe as early as 10<sup>th</sup> century and William of Malmesbury says of Gerbert that he left the monastery to study astrology and occult arts and magic with the Saracens (Freely, 2009).

Another European figure who delved into Islamic science and spread the knowledge of astronomical instruments was the German Hermannus the Lame in the eleventh century. Hermannus introduced three instruments which were in current use by the Arabs: the astrolabe, the cylinder and the quadrant in his treatises *De MensureAstrolabi De UtilitatibusAstrolabi*. The upgraded version of these navigation instruments was the sextant which was to be invented much later.Hermannus' books may have been a very accurate source for Geoffrey Chaucer's treatise (Freely, 2009).

Another Arab forerunner of astronomy was Abu Maslama Al-Majriti whose book on the astrolabe was translated by Plato di Tivoli from Arabic into Latin. Plato di Tivoli must have translated some by books by Ptolemy from Arabic into Latin, including the *Tetrabiblos*. Al-Majriti might have inspired Chaucer a great deal when Chaucer used accurate details probably taken from this astrolabe treatise, too (Freely, 2009).

Among the Muslim astronomers stands out Abu al-Husayn 'Abd Al-Rahman al-Sufi (903-986), also known also by the name of Azophi in its Latinised version, who did a thorough revision of Ptolemy's catalogue of stars. Al-Sufi churned out a revised and updated version of Claudius Ptolemy's *Almagest* in an important book called *Kitabsuwar al-kawakib* (*The Book of Fixed Stars*), authored around 964 CE.

Drawing on the Greek astronomical science, the work of Al-Sufi brought out an array of the Arabs' own star names accompanied by their magnitudes computed by al-Sufi himself, and two drawings of each constellation, one as it is observed in the sky and one unfoldedfrom right to left as it would be seen on a celestial globe. The oldest surviving copy was produced by his son around 1010 CE and may be found in the Bodleian Library, Oxford (MS Marsh 144). His famous *Book of Fixed*  *Stars* was translated into Latin and had an important influence in Europe starting with the 13th century, both in virtue of its text and images (Khalili, 2012).

Another highly credible source is brought to our attention by Jambeck and Jambeck (1974:120-121). They state that "Chaucer translated his treatise in large part from the extant *Compositio et Operatio Astrolabii* of Messahala, an Egyptian astronomer of the eighth century, has been well established. In fact, as has been frequently noted, Chaucer follows Messahala's organizational scheme rather closely, beginning, like the Latin original, with a description of the astrolabe, its workings and capabilities, and concluding with a series of practical problems of graduated difficulty in its operation. But Chaucer's treatise is by no means a slavish rendering. Therein lies its importance. On the one hand, the collation of the two texts serves to illustrate Chaucer's mode of adapting his source to the needs of a ten year old; on the other, while Chaucer never explicitly defines his concept of childhood, implicit in his adaptation are certain fundamental attitudes about children, their formative experience, and the literature."

In fact, Chaucer confessed to his son that he had adapted another treatise into English for the sake of his son's study: "I n'am but a lewd compilator of the labour of oldeastrologiens, and have it translatid in mynEnglisshoonly for thy doctrine." (Chaucer, 2010)

The structure of the treatise, which aimed at a wider audience, is the following:

The work has an introduction and five sections, of which only section one and two exist:

The First section of this treatise describes the components of the astrolabe in such a way that a ten year old boy like Lewis can understand it and operate it.

The second section instructs the user as to the smallest parts of astrolabe and it unfolds as a rough outline of a instructions manual.

The third section holds sundry tables of longitudes and latitudes of fixed stars for the astrolabe, a table of declinations of the Sun, tables of longitudes of places, tables for setting a clock and to sort out the meridian altitude and other figures from the calendars of Chaucer's two priests, probably his personal acquaintances: John Somer and Nicholas of Lynn (Chaucer, 2010).

The fourth section is supposed to show forth a theory that features the movements of the celestial bodies and their causes. Actually, the fourth section shows a table of the moon's motion for every hour of every day and for every zodiac sign. It lays down a rule adequate to indicate the movement of the moon based on the table which permits one to know the degree of the zodiac in which the moon rises for any given latitude and the rising of any planet based on its latitude from the ecliptic.

The fifth section is supposed to be an introduction to the science of "astrologie", which we deem to have taken in both what we nowadays call astronomy and astrology summing up the knowledge in these fields in the 14<sup>th</sup> century.

It is interesting to notice some of the star names Chaucer uses in his treatise.

He indicates the names on the rete of his astrolabe. Here is a list of stars in Arabic as they appear with Chaucer. The name in parenthesis is the genuine Arabic name (if available) and the translation follows it; after this the Latin/Greek name is provided (Khalili, 2012) and (Al-Hassani, 2012).

Alkab; Iota Aurigae Aldebaran; (Ad-Dabaran); "Follower" of the Pleiades; Alpha Tauri Alpheta;(Al-Fakkah); The broken ring of stars; Alpha Coronae Borealis Alramih: Arcturus Alkaid (AlQa'id) The leader of the mourning maidens; Eta **UrsaeMajoris** K.Alasad;(Al-Asad);The lion;Alpha Leonis Algomisa;(Al-Gumaisa); The bleary-eyed one; Procyon Alhabor; Sirius Alghul: Beta Persei Alnath; (An-nath) The butting of the bull's horns; Beta Tauri Altair;(Al-Ta'ir);The flying eagle; Alpha Aquilae Markub:(Markib al Faras);The shoulder of the horse;Alpha Pegasi Alradif ;(Al-redif);The follower;Delta Cephei Rigel;(Ar-Rijl);The foot; Beta Orioni Vega;( Al-Waqi);The stooping eagle; Alpha Lyrae Alnasir; Alpha Andromedae

Chaucer's Treatise on the Astrolabe remains a terminological monument of written science in English, studied for the sake of language rather than for the sake of information. What oozes out is his passion for science and his love of teaching son, Lewis how to operate such a unit. Chaucer admits that he wrote it at the request of his son. As the son hunkered after the science with numbers and figures, the father wanted to quench his thirst for knowledge.

A glimpse into Chaucer's private life is afforded by the motives for Chaucer's writing this book. Jambeck and Jambeck (1974:122) remark that "traditionally, social historians have rejected the notion that there existed in the Middle Ages either a concept of the child or a concomitant theory of his education. In his Centuries of Childhood, Philippe Aries, for example, notes that not until the fifteenth century does there appear an awareness of the special nature of the child and an educative process suitable to his condition. We have then, according to Professor Aries, "a change corresponding to a desire, new as yet, to adapt the master's teaching to the student's level. The desire to bring education within the pupil's understanding was in direct opposition not only to the medieval methods . . . but also to humanist pedagogy which made no distinction between child and man. . . ." The Treatise on the Astrolabe belies both the date and the attitude, for within its brief compass there emerges a consistent, thoughtfully conceived, and humanely executed principle of instruction which attests not only Chaucer's awareness of his son as a child but also his concern for an appropriate pedagogical discipline."

When he penned the treatise, Chaucer was aware of the risk of intricacy and technical complexity of the astrolabe for his son. He conceived of his treatise as an *enkyklopaideia* to whet his son's intellectual appetite and to allow information to trickle so as to be adjusted to his son's capacity of comprehension and learning. He wants his treatise to be internalized step by step, its rules to be comprehended in plain English, adapted to the age of his son. There can be no denial that the astrolabe is a useful instrument, which can solve real problems and help one explore the world.

Geoffrey Chaucer pulls off both a scientific, pedagogical and literary feat by writing the first science treatise in English, which he dedicated to his son, and he did this in a free flowing, natural and accurate English, which shows that Middle English had reached its mature efficiency by the close of the 14th century.

It is known that Geoffrey Chaucer was connected with Richard II's reign. In 1389 he was appointed chief clerk of the king's works in Westminster. Previously he had been a soldier under Edward III and then a *diplomat* in Italy, in 1372, and Flandersand a *comptroller of customs*. Chaucer was a *writer* and a *polymath* and dabbled in occult sciences, too. The fact that he was interested in writing this treatise in English comes as no wonder if we take into reckoning his wide interests and his *pedagogical intention*.

## References

 Al-Hassani, S.T.S. 2012.1001 Inventions: The Enduring Legacy of Muslim Civilization. Washington, DC: National Geographic
 Chaucer, G. 2010. A Treatise on the Astrolabe, Charleston, SC: Nabu Press
- Freely, J.2009.*Aladdin's Lamp:How Greek Science Came to Europe through the Islamic World*. New York: Knopf
- Hamilton, M. M. 2007. Lost History: The Enduring Legacy of Muslin Scientists, Thinkers and Artists. Washington, DC, National Geographic.
- Jambeck, T.J., Jambeck, K.K.1974. 'Chaucer's Treatise on the Astrolabe: A Handbook for the Medieval Child'in *Children's Literature* Volume 3.
- Lane, E.J. (translator). 2010. The Arabian Nights, Charleston, SC: Nabu Press.
- Al-Khalili, J. 2012. *Pathfinders: The Golden Age of Arabic Science*, London: Penguin Books.

Morrison, J.2007. The Astrolabe, Rehoboth Beach, DE: Janus.

# Black Female Ethics and Subjectivity in the Black Church

Peter Gaál-Szabó

Debrecen Reformed Theological University

Abstract: The roles of women in the black church and in the broader community make up an endless list. The sources show that beyond the actual roles and positions that black women have occupied in the church and in the community, their conduct in the family as mothers and wives cannot be neglected, either. The interpersonal ties in the church and the community have constituted a genealogy which explains female adherence and loyalty to the church. Despite the fact, however, those most African American churchgoers are women and despite the many roles and positions they take including the pastorate, they still remain in adjacent positions most of the time.

Key words: ethics, role, female, phenomenon

Eric C. Lincoln's statement that "the black church is the defining reference of the black community" (1999: xxiv) can be fine-tuned as the women of the black community have proved a determining force both due to their majority presence in the church and their conduct in the church and community; so much so that many have come to claim that the "Black Church is a female assembly" (Wiggins 2005: 30). So while the church is historically the primary microcosm of the African American community leading back to the times of the peculiar institution, black female loyalty has become one of the major factors to the construction, maintenance, and survival of the black church. As Delores Williams observes, "it is this female care, commitment and charity that have preserved the life of the African-American community" (1993: 238).

The substantial contribution of black women to the black church and their wider community is not a phenomenon of the past century. The interviews with former slaves in the Louisiana narrative yield apt data concerning female participation in communal life. There were midwives among them as the example of Martha Grayson (Clayton 1990: 89) shows us. Daffney Johnson tells us about her duty that was "to mind the children" (Clayton 1990: 129), while later she also worked on the sugar cane field as a sharecropper. It proved to be a common destiny for black women to attend to family and domestic matters, and simultaneously to support the family, like Charity Parker, who worked as a cook (Clayton 1990: 176) or Lydia Lee who reports of her child who became a missionary (Clayton 1990: 151). Sharing their plight, Mandy Rollins reasserts: "I've plowed, hoed, stripped cane, pulled corn, and most everything dat a man ever did" (Clayton 1990: 187). Others took part in the life of their congregation as, for example, Julia Woodrich did, who was a church mother (Clayton 1990: 218).

The latter is especially in accordance with Lincoln and Mamiya's list of black female roles and positions in black churches: "evangelists, missionaries, stewardesses, deaconesses, lav readers, writers on religious subjects, Sunday School teachers, musicians, choir members and directors, ushers, nurses, custodians, caterers and hostesses for church dinners, secretaries and clerks, counselors, recreation leaders, and directors of vacation Bible schools [and] 'church mothers'" (1990: 275). Apart from the ways in which black women sustained their family and community materially and spiritually, they also helped them politically within the church and outside it, including both advancing civil rights issues and addressing gender controversies. The abolitionist black woman, Sojourner Truth yields the most powerful 19<sup>th</sup> century evidence of this. Erlene Stetson and Linda David remind us, for example, of Truth's memorable conduct at the Convention at the Unitarian Church in Akron, Ohio in 1851 as her "performance was a historic joining of abolitionism and feminism bodied forth in her own person" (1994: 112). In her "Ain't I a Woman?" speech delivered at the convention, she exclaimed vehemently:

Then that little man in black there, he says women can't have as much rights as men, 'cause Christ wasn't a woman! Where did your Christ come from? Where did your Christ come from? From God and a woman! Man had nothing to do with Him.

If the first woman God ever made was strong enough to turn the world upside down all alone, these women together ought to be able to turn it back, and get it right side up again! And now they is asking to do it, the men better let them. (2006: 12)

Redefining black female resistance, she had a lasting impact on black female struggle, influencing subsequent generations of black feminists (bell hooks's 1981 *Ain't I a Woman?: Black Women and Feminism* establishes a clear genealogy to her).

The extensive list of roles in the black church and community taken by women unfolds a web of interpersonal relations that lends a

strong gendered aspect to the notion of church. As Daphne C. Wiggins points out, "the sacred space and experience are constituted primarily by women fosters an allegiance to the church. In addition to the church's being a female enclave, women's experience of being trained in the faith by women and their observing women responding to each other's needs as well as those of the larger community foster an additional level of loyalty" (2005: 30). During slavery faith was often the only perceived bond giving hope for families, often communicated by mothers. As Sojourner Truth remembered her mother confessing, "My children, there is a God, who hears and sees you [. . .] He lives in the sky, and when you are beaten, or cruelly treated, or fall into any trouble, you must ask help of him, and he will always hear and help you" (qtd. in Haskins and Benson 2008: 28).

It is thus often black female spirituality and religiosity that contribute to loyalty among women and to the church as well as to religious female genealogy. Delores S. Williams constructing the antitype of the biblical story about Hagar, relates to black female religiosity, which she calls "the *survival/quality-of-life tradition of African American biblical appropriation*" (1993: 6). Her ultimate argument is that the "Great Mother" (Whitford 1995: 263) of African American women is Hagar, who can offer a liberation theology for her modern daughters that live under similar deprived and isolated circumstances marked by exploitation, discrimination and abuse on all levels of their lives. Jacqueline D. Carr-Hamilton goes further by connecting the archetypal figure of Hagar to Egyptian and other African female deities, arguing for a universal female spirit. (1996: 76). Alice Walker, too, suggests a close tie between women:

For these grandmothers and mothers of ours were not Saints, but Artists; driven to a numb and bleeding madness by the springs of creativity in them for which there was no release. They were creators, who lived lives of spiritual waste, because they were so rich in spirituality – which is the basis of Art – that the strain of enduring their unused and unwanted talent drove them insane. (1983:233)

She believes that a timeless relationship can be observed beyond contemporary sisterhood, precipitated in a common shared heritage and a rich creative spirituality that has been handed down throughout generations.

The common heritage is identified as *motherwit*. Carr-Hamilton asserts, "Motherwit is the collective body of female wisdom—both formal and informal, oral and written, spiritual and social—passed on

from generation to generation by African American females" (1996: 72). This collective wisdom rests on collective experiences, the grand metaphor of which is in Williams' interpretation the wilderness experience<sup>1</sup>.

Especially in the black female experience, the wilderness experience has two sides. The one is sacred and the other secular. Both of them, however, refer to initiation as part of individuation. As Rev. Jackson of Bible Way Atlas Road, South Carolina, remarked once, the wilderness is but holy ground. Furthermore, it denotes trying times that has become the permanent signifier *per excellence* of black women's life, therefore it also marks the psychic morphogenesis of the individual. Katie G. Cannon points out that African American women are caught between two fires. As she puts it, they are "stigmatized—once for race and once for gender" (1988: 108). Carr-Hamilton adds a further category to Cannon's stigmatization, by making black women's fate a class issue (1996: 74). Nanny's motherwit in Their Eves Were Watching God has become the motto of description of black females: "de Nigger woman is de mule uh de world" (Hurston 1990: 14). They conceptualize their presence in this light, claiming that liberation must be effected on all levels of existence.

Walker's feminization of art, an existential necessity as it is to women, Williams's black womanist theology, Cannon's black female ethics, but even Carr-Hamilton's argument for a pan-African female spirit devise an ultimately political understanding of the black female subject even in the religious social space of the black church. bell hooks's philosophy crystalizes this notion in an outspoken way when speaking up for the liberation of the female voice as women "are rooted in language, wedded, have our being in words" (1989: 28). From an existentialist viewpoint, she states that "Moving from silence into speech is for the oppressed, the colonized, the exploited, and those who stand and struggle side by side a gesture of defiance that heals, that makes new life and new growth possible. It is this act of speech, of 'talking back,' that is no mere gesture of empty words, that is the expression of our movement from object to subject-the liberated voice" (1989: 9). It appears that the ultimate objective of the black female theoretician is to politicize the subject matter in question, thus effecting liberation (see Wilkinson 1997),

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> Walker adds "*the notion of song*" (1983: 237) that includes form and content; and another archetypal notion: "[the] face [of her mother], as she prepares the Art that is her gift, [which] is a legacy of respect she leaves to me, for all that illuminates and cherishes life. She has handed down respect for the possibilities—and the will to grasp them" (1983: 241-42).

however the fact that there is a distinct female genealogy in the black church proves the "loud" presence of black women, rendering them structural elements in its life.

The black church has played a significant role in women's breaking their silence historically, too, as it was the black church that first offered them a platform to articulate their discontent and to anchor their female identities through taking on different roles. Schools for black women were founded, such as the Atlanta Baptist Female Seminary (1881) later to become Spelman College, whose principle is "to develop prepared leaders who followed a spiritual roadmap" (Johnson 2000), or the Hartshorn Memorial College (1883) functioning also as "the linchpin of northern Baptist missionary efforts" (Harvey 1997: 65) and "with the single purpose of raising up a body of thoroughly educated Christian women as consecrated workers in the harvest field of the world" (First Annual Catalogue 1884: 9). The establishment of black female organizations such as the Women's Convention of the National Baptist Convention established in 1900 contributed significantly to the advancement of women's issues. Importantly, this organization gave women the platform to give "speeches and lectures across the country, outlining high moral and ethical necessary for the uplifting of the black race," while regarding women "as holders of the keys to social transformation" (Hicks 2009: 264). Emphasizing the relevance of such female institutions, Evelyn Brooks Higginbotham asserts, "The leadership of the women's convention movement formed part of an emergent class of school administrators, journalists, businesswomen, and reformers who served in all-black community" (1994: 14).

From a more religio-cultural point of view, Lincoln and Mamiya point out that a seminal determining factor of the construction of the black church is the African religious heritage in which women played roles as "priestesses, queens, midwives, diviners, and herbalists" (1990: 276). In the Christian tradition, however, women were denied the office of preachers. Andrew Billingsley reports of an outstanding dissenter, Jerena Lee, who eventually became the first woman to be ordained (1999: 135) in the AME church in 1819, having been offered "an unofficial preaching role in Philadelphia's churches" (Peterson 1995:17) even if never to "become an integral and authoritative member of its organizational structure" (Peterson 1995: 74). Eric C. Lincoln and Lawrence Mamiya bring further early examples of black women preachers in the persons of Amanda Smith and Rebecca Cox Jackson (1990: 280-81)—though not void of supernatural or conjure traditions (see Chireau 1996: 187).

Apart from such scarce examples, black females could not be preachers in the black church, so they found other outlets of service within the church and without it, yet deeply connected to it. A wonderful example provides the case of Onnie Lee Logan, a midwife in Alabama. Onnie Lee Logan in her autobiography entitled *Motherwit* testifies about the hardships of midwifery. In this manner, she becomes a storyteller while introducing herself as a freely handling subject and creator in hooks's and Walker's fashion. It might be argued that midwifery is a folk religious expression of a surrogate for black females' preacher role, as Logan herself practices womanist God-talk consciously during deliveries. At one point, she remembers childbirth: "I went in the bathroom, closed the do' after I got her comfortable, and I talked to God. When I talked to Him, He talks back to me ... Got on my knees and consult God and I come outa there knowin what to do cause He just guided my hands" (1989: 144). She reclaims the lost property of women by asserting, "He gave me knowledge and wisdom along with a whole lot a experience. My faith in God is what carries me" (1989: 145). She, too, calls her pragmatic insight motherwit that had been passed down throughout generations. She gives witness about her mother, when, dying, her mother said: "Try to take care of one another. Try to take care of yo' daddy" (1989: 71). She obeyed her calling and served her family, her church, and her community, which is why she ends her story by saying that "I was a good midwife. One of the best as they say" (1989: 177). Even though midwifery was not always looked upon as a respected profession as it was often connected to poverty (Fraser 1998: 147), conjure traditions (Fraser 1998: 141), and awe as "preparing the dead for burial" (Fraser 1998: 143) belonged to the scope of their profession; it takes on special significance in African American memory as a token reminiscent of the time of slavery and thus of black socio-economic status, but also of African American folk (religious) traditions.

Even these days black women's active presence in black congregations becomes visible primarily in their taking leadership roles in adjunct institutional units. Here I am going to enumerate briefly some examples I witnessed during a study visit to Columbia, South Carolina. Zion Baptist Church in Columbia, SC, provides evidence of its women taking active part in the church community. For example, the usher board that was established in 1911 has practically been entrusted to women's care, since black women have assumed leadership since 1976, as Sis. Lila Mae Richards did. The youth choir, too, established in 1948 has had a number of black female counsellors and directresses. In Bethel African Methodist Episcopal Church, SC, the case has been similar. The wives of the leaders of the church stand for female involvement in both the church and the community. Dolly Deselle Adams, the wife of John Hurst Adams, the bishop of the Episcopal District of South Carolina from 1992 to 2000,

holds a doctorate in education. She has also assumed leadership roles in the National Board of Directors of United Negro College Fund (U.N.C.F.), in the African American Black Women's Agenda, and, as the eighth national president, in the Links-one of the largest volunteer service organizations of women—among others. At the time of the survey she presided over the Women's Missionary Society (W.M.S.) and Ministers' Wives of the Seventh Episcopal District. The wife of the pastor, Rev. Carolyn E. Brailsford, herself a pastor, is the choral director and music advisor of Allen University, but she is also the minister of the Music of Bethel A.M.E. Church. Other women have fulfilled various duties in the Food Committee, the Souvenir Journal/Program Committee, the Resource Development Committee, Public Relations Committee, Music & Praise Committee, and they have also worked as trustees, stewardesses, and class leaders. Other secular examples we can find in the Waverly community in Columbia. Ginetta V. Hamilton's edited volume, Waverly: A Historical Perspective through the Eyes of Senior Citizens (1995), reports of Waverly's manifold diversity in the middle of the 20th century, of which women have been critical constituents. Examples include the community's first black female doctor, Dr. Matilda Evans, Mrs. Williams, who operated the Town and Tourist Motel, and others, who were involved with pottery, boutiques, beauty salons, restaurants, dry cleaning, teaching, and nursing, among others.

The roles of women in the black church and in the broader community make up an endless list. The sources show that beyond the actual roles and positions that black women have occupied in the church and in the community, their conduct in the family as mothers and wives cannot be neglected, either. The interpersonal ties in the church and the community have constituted a genealogy which explains female adherence and loyalty to the church. Despite the fact, however, those most African American churchgoers are women and despite the many roles and positions they take including the pastorate, they still remain in adjacent positions most of the time.

# References

- Bethel African Methodist Episcopal Church. 1996. '131<sup>th</sup> Anniversary and Cornerstone Laying Service.' Columbia, SC : Bethel African Methodist Episcopal Church.
- Billingsley, A. 1999. *Mighty Like a River: The Black Church and Social Reform*. New York/Oxford : Oxford UP.
- Cannon, G.K. 1988. Black Womanist Ethics. Atlanta: Scholars' P.

- Carr-Hamilton, J.D. 1996. 'Motherwit in Southern Religion' in "Ain't Gonna Lay My 'Ligion Down:" African American Religion in The South. A. Johnson and P. Jersild (eds.). Columbia, SC : U of South Carolina P.
- Chireau, Y. 1996. 'The Uses of the Supernatural: Toward a History of Black Women's Magical Practices' in *A Mighty Baptism: Race and Gender, in the Creation of American Protestantism.* S. Juster and L. MacFarlane (eds.). New York : Cornell UP.
- Clayton, R.W. 1990. Mother Wit: The Ex-Slave Narratives of The Louisiana Writers' Project. New York : Peter Lang.
- First Annual Catalogue of the Officers and Students of Hartshorn Memorial College: Richmond, Va., 1883-84. 1884. Richmond : WM Ellis Jones, Steam Printer.
- Fraser, G.J. 199. African American Midwifery in the South: Dialogues of Birth, Race, and Memory. Cambridge, Massachusetts : Harvard UP.
- Hamilton, G.V. ed. Waverly: A Historical Perspective through the Eyes of Senior Citizens. Columbia, SC : n.p. 1995.
- Harvey, P. 1997. *Redeeming the South: Religious Cultures and Racial Identities among Southern Baptists, 1865-1925.* Chapel Hill, NC. : U of North Carolina P.
- Haskins, J. and Benson, K. 2008. *African American Religious Leaders*. San Francisco, CA, Wiley.
- Hicks, D.S. 2009. 'National Baptist Convention, USA, Inc.' in *African American Religious Cultures*. Anthony B. Pinn (ed.). Santa Barbara, California : ABC-CLIO.
- Higginbotham, E.B. 1994. *Righteous Discontent: The Women's Movement in the Black Baptist Church, 1880-1920.* Cambridge : Harvard UP.
- hooks, b. 1981. *Ain't I a Woman?: Black Women and Feminism*. Winchester, Mass. : Pluto P.
- ---.1989. Talking Back. Boston : South End P.

Hurston, Z.N. 1990. *Their Eyes Were Watching God*. New York: Harper & Row, Publishers.

- Johnson, P.G. 2000. 'History of the NAASC' in *Spelman Messenger* 114.1 (Winter/Spring) [Online]. Available at: http://naasc.org/about/history.html [retrieved on 2015-05-15]
- Lincoln, C.E. 1999. 'Introduction' in *Mighty Like a River: The Black Church and Social Reform*. By A. Billingsley. New York/Oxford : Oxford UP.
- Lincoln, C.E. and Mamyia, L.H. 1990. *The Black Church in the African American Experience*. Durham and London : Duke UP.
- Logan, O.L. 1989. Motherwit. New York : E. P. Dutton.
- Peterson, C.L. 1995. "Doers of the Word": African-American Women Speakers and Writers in the North (1830-1880). New York : Oxford UP.
- Stetson, E. and David, L. 1994. *Glorying in Tribulation: The Lifework of Sojourner Truth.* East Lansing, MI. : Michigan State UP.
- Truth, S. 2006. 'Ain't I a Woman?' in *Great Speeches by African Americans: Frederick Douglass, Sojourner Truth, Dr. Martin Luther King, Jr., Barack Obama, and Others.* J. Daley (ed.). New York : Dover.

- Walker, A. 1983. 'In Search of Our Mother's Garden' in *In Search of Our Mother's Garden*. A. Walker (ed.). New York : Harcourt Brace Jovanovich.
- Whitford, M. 1995. *Feminism and Psychoanalysis: A Critical Dictionary*. E. Wright (ed.). Oxford : Blackwell.
- Wiggins, D.C. 2005. *Righteous Content: Black Women's Perspectives of Church and Faith*. New York and London : New York UP.
- Williams, S. D. 1993. Sisters in the Wilderness. New York : Orbis. Wilkinson, S. 1997. 'Prioritizing the Political: Feminist Psychology' in Critical Social Psychology. T. Ibanez and L. Iniguez (eds.). London: SAGE Publishing.
- Zion Baptist Church. 1997. 'Zion Baptist Church Ushers' 86<sup>th</sup> Anniversary.' Columbia, SC : Zion Baptist Church.

# Gulliver Travels Well in the 21st Century, Thanks to Jack Black

Valeria Palut University of Oradea

**Abstract**: In this paper I will look at the strategies adopted by Rob Letterman in adapting Gulliver's Travels by Jonathan Swift in a way to be relevant and appealing to the 21st century audience. I will present some elements from the book that were explored in the film, and I will discuss the relation between high and low culture using Umberto Eco's Travels in Hyper-reality.

Keywords: Gulliver's Travels, adaptation, 21<sup>st</sup> century, audience, high and low culture

I decided to undertake the study of Jonathan Swift's *Gulliver's Travels* because of a question that had puzzled me ever since reading the book: how come people still find it a popular subject nowadays, 288 years after being published? The book has been representative of the eighteenth century and it was and is still considered to be a masterpiece.

I could fathom *Gulliver's Travels*'s popularity by reading an article which explains *Hamlet*'s popularity all over the world. It was thereby claimed that the actors of each generation played *Hamlet* not only in different ways, but also in such a way as to reflect what made the generations so different from one another. Thus, they never played the "real *Hamlet*", but their own *Hamlet*. It seems to me that the same algorithm applies to Swifts's *Gulliver's Travels*. I am arguing that what makes Swift so interesting and appealing derives from the fact that we as readers, hold to it in order to see ourselves. Therefore, the book has been read differently from generation to generation as being about the relation between individual and society, politics, religion, the limits of understanding, the utopian movements and the advancement of technology. *Gulliver's Travels* influenced the modern media in a big way, starting from movies, music to opera and the theater, due to its outstanding literary devices, especially symbolism.

#### The analysis of the film as a narrative

When we talk about adaptations, the question that we have to keep in mind is that "adaptations are studied under the sign of literature, which provides an evaluative touchstone for films in general."

In this part of the paper I would like to analyse the narrative of the film *Gulliver's Travels* (2010) and how this is different from that of the book. One should take into account the general preferance for the book over the film as Leich states in his book (2007).

More specifically, studies of adaptation tend to privilege literature over film in two ways. By organizing themselves around canonical authors, they establish a presumptive criterion for each new adaptation. And by arranging adaptations as spokes around the hub of such a strong authorial figure, they establish literature as a proximate cause of adaptation that makes fidelity to the source text central to the field.

Although the film I analyse in this essay was generally badly received at the time, I would like to focus on several elements before labeling it as a cheap, entertaining or simply a cliché film. In his book, *Travels in Hyper-Reality*, Umberto Eco talks abou high and low culture and captures accurately the attitude of the contemporary spectator towards more modern adaptations."A month ago the TV gave us chance to see again a classic we remembered with admiration, affection, and respect; I refer to Kubrick's 2001. After this revisitation, I talked with a number of friends, and their opinion was unanimous: They were disappointed."

In his book, *Novels into Film* (a book considered to be a founding text in adaptation study) George Bluestone claims that "changes are *inevitable* the moment one abandons the linguistic for the visual medium," and he concludes, "It is as fruitless to say that film A is better or worse than novel B as it is to pronounce Wright's Johnson's Wax Building better or worse than Tchaikowsky's *Swan Lake*."

*Gulliver's Travels* directed by Rob Letterman and written by Joe Stiller and Nicholas Stoller is a loose adaptation of Part One-*A Voyage To Liliput* of Swift's book. In the film, Lemuel Gulliver (Jack Black) is a mailroom clerk at a New York newspaper, who leads an ordinary life and who is in love with the travel editor Darcy Silverman (Amanda Peet). He pretends to be an experienced writer in order to impress her. Therefore, he plagiarizes information from different websites which contrasts with Swift's Gulliver who tries to be as accurate as possible as the reader is told in the beginning of the book by the so-called 'publisher'- "There is an air of truth apparent through the whole; and indeed the author was so distinguished for his veracity, that became a sort of proverb among his neighbours at Redriff, when anyone affirmed a thing, to say, it was as true as if Mr Gulliver had spoke it."

In the film, the lie determines the action that is going to take place. Impressed by his writing skills, Darcy sends Gulliver to the Bermuda Triangle in order to write a story. He gets trapped here and opens his eyes just to find himself on the land of Lilliput, with his "arms and legs strongly fastened on each side to the ground; and my hair, which was long and thick, tied down in the same manner."

In the film, Gulliver seems to be a big, careless child that does not care about details and who does not seem to understand the deep meaning of things. For example, after defeating the Blefuscu people, Gulliver cares more about singing than about finding a strategy to protect Lilliput in the near future. Even if Swift's Gulliver does not seem to know exactly where he is going and why he is doing certain things, he is more sensitive to the conceptions and reactions of the Liliputeans and never makes fun of them.

This resolution perhaps may appear very bold and dangerous, and I am confident would not be imitated by any prince in Europe on the like occasion; however, in my opinion it was extremely prudent as well as generous. For supposing these people had endeavoured to kill me with their spears and arrows while I was asleep....

Another difference between Gulliver in the film and the one in the book is that the former does not pay attention to details, while the latter presents accurate descriptions several times: "Five hundred carpenters and engineers were immediately set at work to prepare the greatest engin they had. It was a frame of wood raised three inches from the ground, about seven foot long and four wide, moving upon twenty-two wheels."

Language is another feature that creates a distinction between the book and the novel, the film striking through the daring language. At the sight of Gulliver, the queen says: "I wanted a bracelet, not a great, big, hairy beast". Gulliver refers to the Liliputans as "the little guys", while he is refered to as the "beast" 33 times in the movie. There is a sense of irony in this film which is suggested in the beginning of the movie, when the new employee tells Gulliver that he will never get any bigger than that. In the film this alludes to the position Gulliver has at work, but the spectator clearly understands the link between these words and the fact that he will be a giant in Lilliput.

One scene that is faithful to the book is the one when Gulliver estinguishes the fire by using his urine: "Urine, which I voided in such a Quantity, and applied so well to the proper Places, that in three minutes the Fire was wholly extinguished."

Another amusing moment is when Gulliver asks where he is and he is told "All hail Lilliput! All hail Lilliput!" At which he replies: "This is insane! Come out with the funny cameras!", as if it were a game. The comic dimension is also realised by the repetition in dialogues such as when the people from Liliput ask Gulliver what function he has in the country he comes from.

Were you the President - Of course he was, Mother! He's the most powerful gentleman in all the land. So sorry mother embarrassed you. No, no, it's a common mistake|to not think I was President. Are you a victorious President? Oh, yeah, pretty victorious Noble as well? Yeah, I was eh.....Super noble. I was actually known as 'President the Awesome'. 'President the Awesome'. Pretty unlikely title.

Language becomes a mixture of high and low culture. Representative in this sense is the scene when Horazio wants to conquer the princess and adresses her as if they were in Shakespeare's *Romeo and Juliet* just to change it for the lyrics of Prince's Kiss.

Wherefore art thou, Princess? Princess! Oh, Princess! Hello, who calls? It's I, Horatio! Why are you so far away? I don't want to invoke the ire of thy father. But I must be honest. And tell ye ... And tell ye ... Tell me what, Horatio? You don't have to be rich to be my girl." "Say it!" You don't have to be rich to be my girl. You don't have to be rich to be my girl. You don't have to be cool to rule my world. You don't have to be cool|to rule my world." There is no particular sign...that I'm more compatible with. I just want your extra time and your.....kiss."

Another aspect that the film presents is the ambiguous relation between past and present represented by the Liliputians and Gulliver. Therefore, when the princess who is the traditional busybody asks Gulliver (the one who represents everything that is modern in this film) whether he is "forlorn" and he asks her what it means, just to make sure that they are talking about the same thing: Why do you look so forlorn, noble protector? Me? Forlorn, no way. You do look quite forlorn. Just for the record, what does 'forlorn' mean again? Is it like sad? Basically, just a bit more dramatic sounding. Oh, well, in that case, I guess I'm a little 'forlorn'.

The beginning of the movie is very important for several reasons. It introduces the spectator to modern society and prepares him/ her for being more flexible towards what is coming up. Thre is a plethora of means of transport that appear on the screen: cars, boats, ships, trains, buses. All these vehicles hint at consumer society, at the advancement of technology, at the flux of information that has increased. A thing that is worth writing is that the first words of Gulliver are not his own; he plays, he interprets, he pretens to be Darth Vader who curiously asks for the press badge, at which Luck answers, "No way. You're not my dad!" to which Vader replis "Then I shall take it by force!" This change of lines suggests the theatricality of the film, the theme of pretending, of rearranging old elements into new ones. Thus, when we refer to *Gulliver's Travels* adaptation (2010) we can talk about intertextuality since many films intermingle here.

# Contextual analysis. High and low culture

In this sub-section of the paper I set out to analyse how this film is representative of popular culture and how it stands for a rich source of references from different fields. Before going any further, we should make the distinction between what people call "high" and "low" art. Eco explained this difference very well, saying that:

We still tend to speak of culture only with reference to "high" culture (literture, philosophy, classical music, gallery art, and stage theater), so the phrase "culture as show business" is meant to denote something quite specific-and to denote it in the light of an ideology (however unspecific) of culture with a capital C. In other words, the premise is that show business is amusement, faintly culpable, whereas a lecture, a Beethoven symphony, a philosophical discussion are boring experiences (and therefore "serious").

Consumerism and nowadays people's preference for anything that is new is reflected when Gulliver is again lying by fabricating his biography in the little-theater by conflating stories like *Titanic* and *Star Wars* (he claims to have conquered Darth Vader after surviving the sinking of Titanic and fantasies of his true love Darcy. Another post-modernist feature or approach of this movie is humanity's capacity of reinvention reversed from how it is presented in the book. While in Swift's novel, the Lilliputians are great constructors (page 61), in the movie, Gulliver uses Lilliputians to reenact favorite movie scenes and video games as well as to construct a foosball table and he teaches Horatio, the other prisoner on the island, how to conquer the heart of the princess by whispering him words from Prince's song. Another difference between the book and this adaptation is that in the former, the Lilliputians embrace wholeheartedly Gulliver's modernist ideas, do not oppose them, and prove flexibility of thought, whereas in the latter they are very narrow-minded and reticent to novelty:

For as to what we have heard you affirm, that there are other kingdoms and states in the world, inhabited by human creatures as large as yourself, our philosophers are in much doubt, and would rather conjecture that you dropped from the moon, or one of the stars, because it is certain, that an hundred mortals of your bulk world, in a short time, destroy all the fruits and cattle of his Majesty's dominions. Besides, our histories of six thousand moons make no mention of any other regions, than the two great Empires of Lilliput and Blefuscu.

The movie has got elements of *Shrek* and *Night at the Museum*, *Avatar*, *Transformers*. Another dimension that is tackled through popular culture is politics and religion, which is at the core of the novel. Swift satirizes the absurd conflicts between Lilliputians and Blefuscu based on the doctrinal differences concerning the proper way to crack eggs. This absurdity is rendered at the end of the film, as a moral lesson, when Gulliver starts singing Edwin Starr's song-War (1969) which says: "War, huh yeah/ What is it good for?/ Absolutely nothing, oh hoh, oh."

#### The flux of information

One characteristic of the novel under scrutiny here can be found in other novels of the eighteenth century like *Robinson Crusoe*, is the use of lists describing different objects, habits, rules. In *Gulliver's Travels* on pages 104-106, one can read the Articles of Impeachment Quinbus Flestrin (the Man- Mountain). All these are replaced in the film by gadgets such as computers, laptops, e-mails, iphones, which suggest the shift of generation as well as consumer society. This way of putting things on screen is not an innovation; this technique has been used before in movies such as *Shakespeare in Love* where the classical mingles with the modern. At one point when Shakespeare has a writer's block, he goes to his psychoanalyst to ask for his advice. So there are references to Freud in Shakespeare's time and this is again a way of bringing past and present together since the very advent of Psychoanalysis is a modern event. The question that rises is who influences whom? Who produces the message (and its ideology)? Is it the spectator that determines the director/ writer to adopt the position s/he adopts or is it the director/ writer who determine us as readers and spectators to tolerate the new approach?

The ending of the movie creates an interesting link between the book and the film. On the screen, there is a newspaper that informs the spectator in a written form about Gulliver's adventures, mentioning elements like the dimensions of the Lilliputans, the "Yahoos". Nevertheless, these are presented in a humorous way; the article starts: "The causes of Gulliver's *misadventures* become more *malignant as* time goes on- he is first shipwrecked, and then attacked by his own crew. Gulliver's attitude hardens as the book progresses- he is genuinely surprised by the viciousness and politick [...]" (Appendix fig. 2).

# Conclusion

I started my journey into Jonathan Swift's *Gulliver's Travels* on the premise that he occupies a unique position in the literary pantheon and that the book is a representative book for the eighteenth century, but eager to discover the secret ingredient that made it such a great source of inspiration for every generation. It seems to me that the image of Gulliver remains one of complete interest in the modern society due to the inexhaustible source of mystery, as it is stated in the introduction: "Gentleness, playfulness, irony, finely poised argument and lacerating invectives are so carefully enfolded one within another that it is evident Jonathan Swift created the endless mystery on purpose."

Even if I am a big fan of classic films and I started this project having many doubts about the value of Lettersman's movie, I ended up by considering Eco's words that we cannot simply label popular culture as low and inferior but we should approach it as being *different* and we should rather embrace it as being part of the diversity of the society we are living in.

# References

#### **Primary Sources:**

Swift, Jonathan, *Gulliver's Travels*, Harmondsworth: Penguin Books, 1967. *Gulliver's Travels* (film 2010)

#### Critical bibliography: Books

Aumont, J., Marie, M., L'analyse des films, Paris: Nathan Université, 1988.

Bluestone, George. Novels into Film, Baltimore: Johns Hopkins University Press, 1957.

Eco, Umberto, Travels in Hyper-Reality, London: Pan Books, 1986.

Leitch, Thomas, *Film Adaptation and Its Discontents: from Gone with the Wind to The Passion of the Christ*, Baltimore: The Johns Hopkins University Press, 2007.

#### Internet

<http://www.hawthorneinsalem.org/ScholarsForum/MMD2004.html retrieved at 23.06.2013>

www.metrolyrics.com/war-lyrics-edwin-starr.html retrieved at 06.12.2014 http://www.metacritic.com/movie/gullivers-travels retrieved at 03.12.20

# *"What's in a Name?"* or Defining Others through their Dietary Practices

**Delia-Maria Radu** University of Oradea

**Abstract:** One way of defining stereotypes is by explaining them as characteristics we apply to others on the basis of their national, ethnic, or gender groups. "Frog eaters", "spaghetti heads", "taco benders" or "pretzels", "beefheads" and other such words and concepts have been used to identify (and usually disconsider and marginalize) certain groups, not only in everyday life, but also in fiction and films.

Key words: food, stereotypes, defining, characteristics, Otherness

"Heaven is where the cooks are French, the police are British, the mechanics are German, the lovers are Italian and everything is organized by the Swiss.

Hell is where the cooks are British, the police are German, the mechanics are French, the lovers are Swiss, and everything is organized by Italians."<sup>1</sup> This is a joke about Heaven and Hell, making use of the stereotypical thinking which attributes certain qualities to certain nations.

#### What are stereotypes?

A stereotype develops, exaggerates, and exploits one or two attributes of a given group or class of people, and applies those attributes to *all* members of that group without any distinction. Geist, Nelson, (in Nachbar, Lause, 1992:262)

Craig McGarty, Vincent Y. Yzerbyt and Russel Spears explain stereotypes through three guiding principles:

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> http://politicalhumor.about.com/library/jokes/bljokeheavenhell.htm retrieved on March, 22, 2015.

- stereotypes are **aids to explanation**, helping the perceiver make sense of a situation;
- stereotypes are **energy-saving devices**, formed to reduce effort on the part of the perceiver;
- and stereotypes are **shared group beliefs**, in line with the accepted views or norms of social groups that the perceiver belongs to. (see McGarty, Yzerbyt, Spears, 2002:2)

According to Nachbar and Lause (1992:236-237), in popular culture, people are often stereotyped around characteristics of

- *age* ("All teenagers love rock and roll and have no respect for their elders"),
- *sex* ("Men want just one thing from a woman"),
- *race* ("All Japanese look alike and think alike"),
- *religion* ("All Catholics love the Pope more than their country"),
- *vocation* ("All lawyers are greedy weasels")
- and nationality ("All Germans are Nazi warmongers").

Food influences the way we perceive and represent ourselves as individuals and as members of social groups (Parasecoli, 2008:4). There are foods people associate with their own families and communities, to create an ethnic identity (see Luanne Roth, 2005:163). Similarly, food is used to define alterity, and real or imagined food behaviour of others, the stereotypes about the food of other groups, have been used to justify the colonization of many cultures and to express racism and hatred. But they may also be funny and make us smile.

# National stereotypes

Speaking about stereotypes and ethnocentrism, Igor de Garine (2001:489) points out that human groups are not charitable to each other, and food is a good field to demonstrate ethnicity or ethnocentrism, through praise or depreciation ranging from derision to contempt and disgust.

He also reminds us that today Italians are still called "macaroni eaters" by the French (a variant of "spaghetti bender" or "spaghetti head", used in the US, or "luksen" and "loksh", which means "noodle", "spaghetti", in Yiddish American slang (see Allen, 1990:49)), while Germans were called "kraut and potato eaters" by the French during First World War. (Germans are still known to love beer, like the Czechs, while Russians are connected to vodka).

Belgians are said to eat fries, mussels, chocolate and waffles at every meal, and have beer running through their veins.

Bulgarians are said to survive only on tomatoes, cucumber and goat cheese, whereas the Brits are seen as pukingly drunk football fans, and their food is bad.

The Norwegians are unsophisticated fish-eaters, while Finns are pictured as being hard vodka-drinkers, with an old-fashioned moustache, bad fashion sense and abusive wives, who live in the woods and split their time between hitting themselves with birch branches in the sauna and hunting bears.

The Dutch' greediness may have led to calling splitting the bill "going Dutch".

The French are laughed at, mentions the same De Garin, for consuming snails, frogs and horse meat, although it is a rather episodic aspect of their behaviour, a mark of true stereotypes and the expression of social prejudice. According to Irving Lewis Allen (1990:48), the English considered bizarre and loathsome the French taste for frog legs, and began calling the French "*frog eater*", "*froggy*", and young French women were sometimes called "*frog legs*", evoking the image of spread and kicking legs. By extension, French and French Canadian immigrants to the US were called "*crapauds*" (toads).

Mexicans are nicknamed "tortilla eater", "taco head", or "tamale", or even "chili bean", "beaner", "bean choker" (Allen, 1990:50).

The English came to be called "*beefeaters*" (while Texans are "*beefheads*"), Hungarians are nicknamed "*goulash*", "*Whiskey mick*" is an Irishman, while members of Chinese or other Asian groups are "*chop sticks*", and an attractive young Chinese woman might be called a "*fortune-cookie*".

As we know, Romanians are called (even by our own fellow countrymen) "*strawberry pickers*", but we are not the only ones connected to harvesting food. Czechs are *mushroom pickers*, Mexicans are *chili pickers*.

De Garin also mentions discriminations operating within a country (2001:492), citing as example the fact that in the 15<sup>th</sup> and 16<sup>th</sup> centuries, the inhabitants of Sicily and Genoa, where the pasta industry developed, were called "*mangiamaccheroni*" (i.e. macaroni eaters), whereas the people of Naples were named "*mangiafoglia*" (leaves eaters), because of the greens they consumed with their meals, those of Tuscany are called "*mangiafagioli*" (beaneaters), and the people of Veneto are considered heavy drinkers. Today, he concludes, the people of the Mezzogiorno are still called "*macaroni eaters*", while those of Northern Italy are called "*polenta eaters*" (– a common feature with Romanians, who are supposedly called "*eaters of mamaliga*" by the Ukranians).

Other common images of Italians are that they have an incredible *coffee culture* (*ristretto*, i.e. short, expresso coffee, drank several times

during a day) and love pizza. A funny stereotype represents most Italian men as dark-haired, olive-skinned plumbers, who spend their work day jumping on turtles, eating mushrooms, and saving princesses. (Baldwin, 2013) Meanwhile, the Turks are supposed to eat kebab all the time.

Adrian Miller reminds us that food stereotypes were another way of pushing African-Americans back to society's margins (Miller, 2013). Cartoons, jokes, poems and songs depicting African-Americans eating chicken and watermelon sent the message that these people were a child race, unworthy and incapable of being full citizens, therefore not needing any civil rights.

Talking about the association of black people to the image of watermelons, Lisa Wade (2012) explains that it has roots in American slavery, as defenders of slavery used the watermelon as a symbol of simplicity, claiming that African Americans were happy as slaves, and didn't need the complicated responsibilities of freedom. Another explanation was that in the late 19<sup>th</sup> century and early 20<sup>th</sup> century Black people were stealing chickens and watermelons – survival strategies to help supplement the insufficient food they had.

Fabio Parasecoli (2008:107) writes that culinary themes were especially common in blues music. A desirable young girl was called a *"biscuit"*, and a good lover was called a *"biscuit roller"*. The complexion of a black person was also hinted at by using *"honey"* for light skinned persons, while *"coffee"* referred to darker ones, a lover being metaphorically named *"honey dripper"* or *"coffee grinder"*. Having sex was *"grinding"* or *"squeezing lemon"*.

# **Implicit stereotypes**

Nathan Abrams (2004:87-88) deals with ways in which Jews were represented and stereotyped in visual popular culture through food, and starts with the traditional stereotype of the Jewish mother, usually presented as an overeating, overcaring, and overbearing matriarchal figure, who stuffs her children with far more than they can possibly digest. (An exception to the rule would be Fran's mother in the sitcom *The Nanny*, who – although stereotypically obsessed with food, and usually seen in the kitchen or around food, is more preoccupied to cook for herself and help herself with food than feeding her child.)

The question is, however, what is the difference between this stereotype of the Jewish mother, and what we see in the film *My Big Fat Greek Wedding*, in which Greek moms are portrayed in a similar way. "My mom was always cooking foods filled with warmth and wisdom<sup>2</sup>,"

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> Lines from the movie

Toula says, "and never forgetting that side dish of steaming guilt." Following tradition, "Nice Greek girls are supposed to do three things in life: marry Greek boys, make Greek babies, and feed everyone until the day we die", Toula is regularly told throughout her childhood.

Ian's parents, Caucasians, members of a Country Club and rather formal, even in their relationship with their son, are doumbfounded when they meet Toula's family for the first time. It is supposed to be a quiet dinner with her parents, but the entire family is present, a lamb is roasted on a spit in the front lawn and people eat with their fingers, drink lots of Ouzo and have fun.

The Millers are seated in the Portokalos' living-room, and Aunt Voula, whom they have just met, tells them the story of a lump that grew on her neck and which, after the biopsy, turned out to contain the teeth and spinal chord of her twin. Just when she finishes, a tray of food is thrust in front of the Millers (with the words "Spanakopita! You hungry?"). Their reaction is one of disgust, as they are still "digesting" Aunt Voula's story. After countless shots of Ouzo, they are once more served with food, with meat this time. The Millers look away in disgust as they are about to vomit at the thought of eating the "Greek meat, very good, very good". Their reaction dismays Mr. Portokalos and makes him consider them "dry people". To him, they are a bland, "toast family" incapable of enjoying their hospitality, and his efforts of being nice, of putting, as he says, "a little marmalade", fail miserably, as they like being the way they are. Thus, the Millers are characterized by the Portokalos family by the hole in the cake they have brought with them (i.e. incomplete), their rejection of meat and other treats, the absence of flavor/texture/moisture, and the refusal to be sweetened up. (see Roth, L. 2005:165)

In 1954 appeared in France a book entitled *Les Carnets du Major Thompson*, by Pierre Daninos, with a secondary title that read "*An Englishman Discovers France and the French*", and which a year later (in 1955) was turned into a film entitled "*The French, They Are A Funny Race*".

Criticizing his fellow countrymen's behaviour (like Montesquieu in *Lettres Persanes/Persian Letters*, 1721) and Jonathan Swift in *Gulliver's Travels*, in 1726). the author freely plays with stereotypes about Englishmen and Frenchmen, using William Marmaduke Thompson's point of view, that of an Englishman retired from the army and settled in the country of his second wife, more precisely in Paris, and trying to understand the natives. ("I feel doubly privileged", he writes, "I am an Englishman nourished à *la française*.")

Each chapter approaches a topic in which the Major tries to show the differences between the French and the British. According to Thompson's fictional biography he appears to have retired from the army in 1945, and so he is a relic of the British Empire, serving in India, Palestine, and Egypt. He ticks a lot of stereotypes related to Englishmen, and yet at the same time he is a bit dated.

What is a Frenchman? – he wonders, and then goes on telling the reader a story about what makes an Englishman (revealed during a brain surgery performed by one of his friends):

He discovered the following: one of Her Majesty's battleships, a mackintosh, a royal crown, *a cup of tea*, a bobby, the Rules and Regulations of the Royal and Ancient Golf Club of St. Andrews, a Coldstream Guard, *a bottle of whisky*, a Bible, the Calais-Mediterranean timetable, a nurse from the Westminster Hospital, a cricket ball, some fog, a bit of earth upon which the sun never sets, and – at the very bottom of his lawn-covered-subconscious – a cato'-nine-tails (a whip for flogging) and a black-stocking schoolgirl. [...] the doctor was obliged to admit that all this went into the making of a really good Englishman.

When thinking of the Brits, one of the first stereotypical image that comes to one's mind is their habit of drinking tea. The issue is dealt with in a conversation the Major has with a Frenchman on the subject of habits and meals. The English waste less time over meals than the French, states Major Thompson, only to be contradicted by the Frenchman: "Have you calculated that the Englishman who takes his early morning tea at 7 A.M., more tea at breakfast, tea in the office for elevenses, tea at lunch, tea at tea, and finally a cup of tea before he goes to bed, spends (roughly) four years of his life in front of a tea pot?" (Daninos, 1955:26)

"I have often wondered what my friend would find if he opened up a Frenchman," the major writes. (Daninos, 1955:10). Which is, of course, a good pretext to provide us the "recipe" for a Frenchman's "brain composition"? The footnote of the same page contains a piece of information supposedly written by the surgeon's nurse, who assisted the above-mentioned operation, fell in love with the surgeon (who was, in fact, French) and explained what was revealed when he, himself, underwent a similar procedure:

To the general amazement, when his skull was opened, there were found nineteen Presidents of the Council, three dancers from the Folies-Bergère, *half a box of ripe Camembert*, a complete Maginot Line, and several lorry loads of devaluated francs." (Daninos, 1955:10-11)

As we can see in Daninos' book, one of the basic "ingredients" of the British, respectively French, identities is linked to the stereotypical image people have of the two nations: the British are defined by their five o'clock tea habits and the French are famous for their love of strong cheese selections and fine cuisine, but not for their hospitality<sup>3</sup>

#### References

- Abrams, Nathan. 2004. "I'll Have Whatever She's Having": Jews, Food, and Film, pp. 87-100, in Bower, Anne L. (ed.) 2004. Reel Food: Essays on Food and Film. New York: Routledge.
- Allen, Irving Lewis. 1990. Unkind Words: Ethnic Labelling from Redskin to WASP, New York: Bergin&Garvey.
- Baldwin, James. 2013. *European Stereotypes*, in National Stereotype, November 15, 2013, available at <u>http://www.nationalstereotype.com/european-stereotypes/</u>, retrieved on 2015-03-25.
- Conner, Mark. Armitage, Christopher J. 2002. *The Social Psychology of Food*. Philadelphia: Open University Press.
- Daninos, Pierre. 1955. The Notebooks of Major Thompson: An Englishman Discovers France & the French. Robin Farn, translator. New York: Knopf.
- De Garine, Igor. 2001. *Views about Food Prejudice and Stereotypes*, Social Science Information, Vol. 40, no 3, pp. 487-507.
- Geist, Christopher D. Nelson, Angela, M.S. 1992. From the Plantation to Bel-Air: A Brief History of Black Stereotypes, pp. 262-276, in Nachbar, Jack (ed.). Lause, Kevin (ed.) 1992. Popular Culture: An Introductory Text. Bowling Green: Bowling Green State University Popular Press.
- McGarty, Craig. Yzerbyt, Vincent Y. Spears, Russel. 2002. Stereotypes as Explanations. The Formation of Meaningful Beliefs about Social Groups. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Miller, Adrian. 2013. Food and Racial Stereotypes, Denver Post, 1 Sept. Available at: <u>http://search.proquest.com/docview/ 1429624668?a</u> <u>ccountid=15533</u>, retrieved on 2015-03-21.
- Nachbar, Jack (ed.). Lause, Kevin (ed.) 1992. *Popular Culture: An Introductory Text*. Bowling Green: Bowling Green State University Popular Press.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>3</sup> "As for hospitality as such", writes the British Major, "I believe it is easier for an American to gain admittance to the drawing-rooms of Buckingham Palace than to lunch with the Taupins. On arrival he is told: "You really must come to lunch with us. Yes, yes, indeed you must!" Weeks pass. Something unforeseen happens: the children are ill, the cook has given notice. The Parisian ends by taking the foreigner, so avid for local color, to an American grill where the menu is not even printed in French, as it would be in the U.S.A." (Daninos, 1955:38)

Parasecoli, Fabio. 2008. *Bite Me: Food in Popular Culture*. New York: Berg. Roth, Luanne. 2005. *Beyond Communitas* ...

Wade, Lisa. 2012. *Watermelon: Symbolizing the Supposed Simplicity of Slaves*, <u>http://thesocietypages.org/socimages/2012/12/26/slavery-and-the-</u> <u>watermelon/</u> retrieved on March, 21, 2015.

# Miss Representation of Women in Today's Romanian Mainstream Media

**Giulia Suciu** University of Oradea

**Abstract**: Taking as a starting point the motto "You can't be what you can't see" (Marian Wright Edelman), the present paper tackles the issue of women misrepresentation in mainstream media, analysing through gender lens the models offered to teenagers by the media, thus shaping their perceptions of themselves and of the world around them, reinforcing dominant ideas about masculinity and femininity.

Key words: gender, femininity, masculinity, media, misrepresentation.

#### The Power of the Media

We live in a mediated world and we all experience the power of the media in our lives due to its massive outreach. The media is all around us and it has such a great impact on what we do, on how we think, on how we perceive reality etc. Mainstream media is designed to appeal to as large as an audience as possible – hence the name 'mainstream'.

An average teenager spends around 31 hours a week watching TV, 17 hours listening to music, 3 hours watching movies, 4 hours reading magazines, 10 hours online – huge amount of media consumption. Today's children and teenagers live in a world saturated by the media, with very few or no restrictions – they have almost unlimited access to television, music, movies, the Internet, mobiles phones with easy access to the Internet all the time etc. You cannot hide from the media, and you cannot stay immune to its messages, to its influence. Teenagers learn from media more than from anything else. But what do they learn?

Feminists have long tried to raise people's awareness to the representation, or rather the misrepresentation, of women in the media. Mainstream media continues to commodify and sexualize women, presenting us with limited gender roles and limiting labels.

It is said that if you want to know what's going on in a society, all you have to do is take a look at its media...Starting form Marian Wright

Edelman's quotation **"You can't be what you can't see"**, I decided to take a look at contemporary Romanian media and analyse with gender lens the models it offers to teenagers, thus shaping their perceptions of themselves and of the world around them. I decided to take different examples from music, advertising and movies – since all these are part and parcel of any teenager's life – so as to see the way in which women are miss/represented in the above mentioned fields.

# Advertising

Advertising seems to be part and parcel of our lives nowadays; we typically watch TV, read magazines, pass billboards which means that our brain inevitably processes a lot of information. Ads offer the readers advice on how to behave, how to look like, how to live your life, which unconsciously influences our expectations regarding the way we or others look, the way we are supposed to behave in certain circumstances etc. Advertising doesn't simply advertise a product, it deals with ideas, attitudes, and values and gives them cultural form through its practices. Media constructs our cultural identity; ads show us what we want and what we are afraid of losing.

Although ads persuade consumers to buy products, they do more than sell products. "They sell values and concepts. They present images of sexuality, popularity, success and normalcy. They tell us who we are and who we should be." (Romaine 1999: 252).

Gender is an important variable in advertisements, because we are always defined by our gender. In its visual or verbal representation of the sexes, advertising represents a mirror of our gender identities.

Whether we are talking about magazine ads, TV ads, billboards etc. the message appears to be the same: the way in which women are portrayed emphasizes the traditional view that women's place is in the home (most often in the kitchen, bathroom or in the baby's room) as wife and mother, thereby upholding a feminine ideal of domesticity. If women are portrayed outside the home, they are not business executives or successful career women, but rather secretaries or young and beautiful fashion models. "Advertising's general overrepresentation of the young and beautiful is a symbolic statement about the value our society attaches to youth and beauty." (Courtney 1971: 94)

One TV ad that reinforces this feminine ideal of domesticity and which can be seen several times a day on TV, is the Maggi ad.<sup>1</sup> In the ad three guys remember their childhood times. They have been friends for over 25 years, now they are married with kids. Among other things that

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> Available at https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=jKVyPc0Ft5c

haven't changed throughout the years, is the taste of the soup cooked by their wives, soup that tastes exactly like the one cooked by their mother, due to the secret Maggi ingredient.

The ad is quite disappointing by its insistence to put women where they belong: in the kitchen, cooking for the family and friends, conveying the stereotyped image of the woman whose sole worry is to please the family by cooking something good, and the stereotyped idea that you have to cook something new to keep your husband next to you. Maggi seems to have forgotten that things have changed and that the question "What are we cooking today?" can be addressed to the man too.

Another similar ad, an ad for spices<sup>2</sup>, portrays the woman solely as a mother, whose only preoccupation is the happiness of the family: she is not even present in their daily activities – whether they are eating, or having fun; she is there only to make sure her family is well-taken care of. She has no ambitions, no personality, no life.

Though things have changed throughout the years, women continue to be faced with this strange discrepancy between the reality of their lives as women and the images offered by the media. The above examples are not singular. Advertising continues to present images of fulfilled, happy women in their role as housewives and mothers, suggesting that they have no other ambitions in life.

But whether we are talking about ads promoting the housewife or ads promoting the 'independent' woman, outside the home, but who is nevertheless dependent on the cosmetics industry, all ads portraying women have one thing in common: the gratuitous use of the female body in order to sell products. The use of sex in advertising can be highly overt (displaying images of almost naked women) or extremely subtle (cosmetic ads focusing on the physical aspect of the person using the product, sexual innuendos, puns etc.)

Since the 1980s we have witnessed a relaxation of rules in advertising, allowing the use of explicit sexual images in ads. The result? Never before was a culture so obsessed with the issue of sexuality and gender. Over and over again ads bombard us with the same stereotypical message: it's all about the body, not the brains – whatever you do, whatever your achievements are, it's all about the looks.

But this beauty ideal offered by ads becomes unachievable nowadays. If it in the past it could be achieved by using cosmetics, corsets etc., nowadays, thanks to the technological advances, all the images are digitally altered, therefore creating a fake beauty standard, almost inhumanly perfect.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> Available at https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=aHO-cuJaU7k

Women measure themselves against an unreal standard – experience feelings of inadequacy, are unhappy with their bodies – eating disorders, depression etc. This slim, glamorous sexy ideal is nothing but "the new straight-jacket of femininity, requiring women to compete through their appearance for the attention of their husbands, lovers, bosses and any other specimen of the male sex they happen to encounter." (Vestergaard, T. 1985: 8)

# Movies or "the Fifty Shades of Grey" Hysteria

The book, - an erotic novel that passes for an excellent piece of romantic literature - and then the movie – released on Valentine's Day, as if it had anything to do with love - created some sort of hysteria in Romania; everybody was talking about the 'masterpiece' and people (mainly girls) waited in line to buy the tickets, which - by the way were sold out 5 or 6 days in advance.

Though the ratings were pretty low, 4.2 out of 10, though it's just a R-rated movie about bondage and kinky sex that's getting bad reviews and opposition from many women's organizations, people still continued to buy the tickets, proving one more time that **sex sells**.

The message that the movie sends and the lessons to be learned by the teenaged spectators are the following:

- women as sex objects to men
- women can experience sexual gratification sometimes while playing typical subservient roles to male gratification
- women seeking for a powerful, rich Prince Charming to save them from their ordinary lives
- it teaches that women should seek pleasure in their submission
- it teaches that emotional manipulation is acceptable and even desirable
- to please a man, it's ok to subject yourself to verbal and emotional abuse
- an abusive relationship, which on top of that presupposes signing a lengthy and detailed contract – only on her part, obviously – may be viewed as an ideal romantic relationship
- traditional gender roles of women's submissiveness to men

Not to mention that the movie abounds in gender stereotypes: he is older, wiser and wealthier, he is experienced and controlling, he is the strong, quiet type, he owns a helicopter; she is young and poor, she is naïve and submissive, she is frail, she is talkative, she drives and Volkswagen Beetle.

# Music

One cannot envisage teenagers separate from music. Music is part and parcel of their everyday life. Music plays a crucial role in their lives, as they try to identify with musicians and music styles that reflect their identity as individuals and as a generation. Whether we are talking about pop music, rap, R&B etc, each genre is capable of expressing gender roles and gender stereotypes in its lyrics and videos. This puts pressure on youth culture to fit these roles if they want to be 'cool' and trendy in the eyes of friends, colleagues etc.

I decided to have a look at Romanian music channels and top 50 songs and see the role-models they offer teenagers, what messages they send, what impact these songs may have and how so they shape teenagers' perception of themselves and of the world around them.

At first look it appeared that women are quite well represented in the field of music; female pop stars seem to be taking over the world. All music tops feature songs by Rhianna, Beyonce, Lady Gaga, Katy Perry etc. But the message they send is not that smart, independent, fulfilled women, capable of making their own decisions, of being themselves, despite what is considered trendy. All the videos on music channels present us with images of provocative, sexual performers, sending the message that being the object of desire is tantamount to their purpose in life. And the message is all too easy to be absorbed. This message sent by the lyrics is accompanied by music videos that do nothing but reinforce and perpetuate gender stereotypes – women valued only for their looks, gratuitous display of naked female bodies, women used as sex objects, as mere body props.

# Instead of a Conclusion

The media should be considered the most significant instrument in the construction and development of one's identity. In our society, the media is the most convincing force shaping norms.

Media has been overwhelmingly in the hands of men, therefore offering their point of view; the visions of women are therefore contaminated by male-defined notions of the truth of femininity. By perpetuating gendered images and gendered stereotypes, the media are misleading people into accepting a biased, unreal point of view, meant only to maintain the status-quo.

Standards of feminine beauty are abundant in all types of media, bombarding us with images of 'the ideal beauty'. But such standards are completely unattainable for most women; the use of such unrealistic models sends the message that in order to be beautiful, you must be unhealthy. Men, on the other hand, being presented over and over again with images of slender, perfect models, eventually end up judging real women harshly.

By focusing almost exclusively on women's aesthetics, on their appearance, using them as sex objects, as mere body props, presenting them in stereotyped gender roles – the media trivialise women, making them appear less powerful, inferior. The misrepresentation of women in media leads to an under-representation of women in positions of power (glass ceiling effect), and to the perpetuation of the existing status quo, because "The most common way people give up power is by thinking they don't have any." (Alice Walker)

#### References

- Butler, M. and Paisley, M. 1980. *Women and the Mass Media*. New York: Human Science Press.
- Courtney, Alice and Sarah Wernick Lockeretz. "A Woman's Place: An Analysis of the Roles Portrayed by Women in Advertising". In *Journal Of Marketing and Reasearch* 8, No1 febr. 1971:92-95
- Gauntlett, David. 2002. Media, Gender and Identity: An Introduction. London: Routledge.
- Gill, Rosalind. 2007. Gender and the Media. Cambridge: Polity Press
- Kilbourne, Jean. 1999. Deadly Persuasion. New York: The Free Press.
- Kimmel, Michael. 2000. The Gendered Society. New York: Oxford University Press
- Lambiase, Jaqueline and Tome Reichert. 2003. Sex in Advertising: perspectives on the Erotic Appeal. Mahwah: Lawrence Erlbaum Associates
- Romaine, Suzanne. 1999. Communicating Gender. Mahwah NJ Lawrence Erlbaum Associates
- Ross, Karen (ed) and Carolyn Byerly. 2004. Women and Media: International Perspectives. Oxford:Balckwell Publishing
- Thornham, Sue. 2007. Women, Feminism and Media. Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press
- Vestergaard, Torben and Kim Schroder. 1985. *The Language of Advertising*. New York: Basil Blackwell, 1985.

# "An Elegant Suicide is the Ultimate Work of Art". Symbolic Meanings of the Movie *Stay*

Sonia Vass "PetruMaior" Univesity of Târgu-Mures

**Abstract:** The following paper deals with one of the most underrated movies of 2005, "Stay", directed by the famous Marc Forster. Resulting in an explicit box office failure, the general critical reaction was "Beauty lies in the eyes of the beholder" are the words of a common saying negative, the movie being labeled as pretentious, ridiculous and empty. The paper aims to reinstate the picture by unveiling its psychological depths and penetrating symbolic imagery, still undisclosed to the ignoring eyes of the common viewer.

**Keywords:** symbolic, effect, critical reaction, story

That paraphrases Plato's statement from "Symposium": "in that communion only, beholding beauty with the eye of the mind, he will be enabled to bring forth, not images of beauty, but realities". (Plato: 173) But the eye of the beholder is a subjective detriment, an obstacle, especially when it comes to the eye of the common cinephile that is used to process the fallacious, "chewed up" mainstream movies.

Due to its masterfully carved narrative layers, the movie "Stay" cast the Rashomon effect among viewers. However, its subtle visual strategy has not been overlooked by some film critics like the acclaimed Roger Ebert: "What Forster is doing in *Stay*, I think, is suggesting we are watching the movie on two levels, although the deeper level can be glimpsed only at a tangent, passingly. There is so much happening on the surface and in the story that we may get entirely involved up there." (the complete review of the movie can be found at http://www.rogerebert.com/reviews/stay-2005).

Basically a psychological thriller at its core, "Stay" engages the viewers into a journey through the fundamental themes of our existence: reality, identity, memory, failure, perception, tragedy, pain, fatality, guilt, grief. The movie opens with the scene of a horrible car crash on a bridge, with a flaming car in the background, and a young man, suspiciously without a scratch, crouching in the middle of the road, and then slowly walking away

from the dreadful site. His name is Henry Letham, the character played by Ryan Gosling. Supposedly having torched his car, he turns for help to Dr. Sam Foster, the psychiatrist played by Ewan McGregor. His record states that he's a Junior at the college, majoring in Fine Art. He strikes the audience as an unstable, troubled student, stubbing out cigarettes on his arm, carrying a gun and constantly complaining about hearing voices. His character is remorseful and tormented, dealing with an inner suffering that is later revealed as a poignant sense of guilt.

At first glance, the action of the movie allegedly encompasses the last three days of Henry's existence. Throughout this time he keeps paying unexpected, concerning visits to his shrink. He announces Dr. Sam of his intention to commit suicide next Saturday at midnight, exactly while turning 21.Henry is obsessed with Tristan Reveur, an artist who burned all his paintings before he killed himself on his  $21^{st}$  birthday, leaving a one line note: *An Elegant Suicide is the Ultimate Work of Art*. So far, the movie seems to make sense, until the director decides to utterly confuse the viewer. In fact, Tristan Reveur, from the French *rêve*, (*dream*), is just a fictitious character. Once introduced to the audience, the mysterious artist's legacy reveals new layers of interpreting the movie.

Symbolically, the reference to Tristan Reveur emphasizes the condition of the failed artist in the real world, as opposed to the highest reality of "the ideal state", like Plato called it. Yukio Mishima was one of the writers who tackled the problem of suicide as a glorious attempt to reinstate the great values of past times. In one of his interviews, not long before committing sepukku, the Japanese writer mentioned the so called "boredom of living", that obscene state of the human beings who chose to "live only for themselves": "Human lives are mysterious in that human beings are not strong enough to live and die just for themselves. It is because human beings always think of living for some kind of ideal (...) It is because of this that the need to die for something arises. That need is the great cause that people talked about in the past. Dying for a great cause was considered the most glorious, heroic, or brilliant way of dying."(Quote from an old footage showing Yukio Mishima; it can be found at http://www.complex.com/style/2013/04/the-25-best-performance -art-pieces-of-all-time/mishimas-suicide.)

If solving the contradiction of his existence through writing was not a solution for Mishima, an honorable suicide seemed to be a plausible form of expression. In the movie, dr. Sam's girlfriend, Lila, suffers from the fear of having missed *the great cause* of her life and seeks the same recognition from the world. She is also familiar with Tristan Reveur's beliefs.("Bad art is tragically more beautiful than good art because it documents human failure" is a statement attributed to the unknown artist.)
Rescued in time by Sam, Lila is now a college teacher who has failed as an artist, and bears the scars of a former suicide attempt on her wrists. After giving up on taking the prescribed panic attack prevention drugs, Lila is depending on Sam to restore her confidence: "Tell me I'm good... Tell me the world will remember me".

As Henry's psychiatrist, Sam's required to take any action possible in order to prevent his patient's suicide. He visits his apartment and finds the phrase *forgive me* written all over the walls; when playing the messages from the answering-machine, he's puzzled to recognize his own voice saying "Henry, listen to my voice, stay with me!" By now, the viewer is totally confused and incapable of telling if Sam is truly a doctor or a deranged individual whose actions are a product of his imagination.

Henry keeps coming back to his psychiatrist, because he's the only one able to help him. Holding Sam at gunpoint, Henry confesses having killed his own parents. Dr. Sam tries to contact his girlfriend, Athena, a waitress; according to Henry's statements, he was planning to marry her, although they've never spoken to each other outside the diner. Athena is taking acting classes, and it is not incidentally that Sam encounters her playing the part of Hamlet. The lines inserted from the original play reproduce the discussion between Hamlet and Rosenkranz on the world as a prison. It becomes clear that Henry's name, Letham, is an anagram of Hamlet, which whom he identifies in the movie: "I could be bounded in a nutshell and count myself a king of infinite space, were it not that I have bad dreams". The drama club's setting also resembles a dark prison made of thick, stone walls. Rushing to find Henry, Sam runs and falls down a spiraling staircase, resembling a repetitive DNA sequence and the scene with Athena playing Hamlet is retaken.

Up to this point, all the symbols inserted in the movie indicate a fractured reality, while the director is constantly harvesting the state of confusion. Throughout the whole movie, the transition of the scenes, overlapping, dissolving one into another happens just like in a dream. Characters are being mistaken for each other, they blend into each other: Sam- Henry, Lila-Athena.

The amount of details and symbols give birth to an almost organic universe full of meanings and interpretation. It is no coincidence that one of the lectures Henry attends at the University focuses on three major works of renowned painters. First of all, *Dona Juana la Loca*, Pradillo Ortiz' masterpiece, "emphasizing the almost claustrophobic and oppressive aspect"<sup>1</sup> of Queen Juana's captivity. (The symbolic meanings of the painting, explained by Jose Luis Diez Garcia, the renown Spanish art historian, can be

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> citation translated by the article's author from Spanish;

found at https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=BSBPOej9ztg.) Juana's trapped in a dark room, her gaze absent due to her mental illness that led her to refuse to be separated by her husband's coffin.

The lecturer goes on with Goya's painting, *The Third of May, 1808*, which commemorates the Spanish Resistance to the invasion of Napoleon's troupes. We cannot see the faces of the French executioners, whereas the faces and the expressions of the Spanish patriots are obvious. The central figure of the painting has "his arms raised above his head, he's on his knees as if he's cowardly begging for his life";(Explanation of the painting can be found at https://www.youtube.com/ watch?v=e7piV4ocukg.); His pose resembles a crucifix, and the mark of a stigmata is barely noticeable. A strange lantern on the ground illuminates only the prisoners from the front, and behind them the hill is closing in, refusing the path to escape, suggesting that they are completely trapped.

The third painting discussed belongs to Manet; "*The Dead Toreador* was originally part of a larger painting, *Incident in a Bullfight*. After the painting was mocked by critics and viewers, Manet, angrily, sliced it in half, removing the fallen hero from his arena and accidentally creating one of his most enduring works". (Explanation from the movie, min. 23:10.)

The three main figures in the paintings assemble the allegorical image of Henry Letham. Sharing the same bleak and somber mood, all the paintings are connected by death as central motif. Moreover, the first two masterpieces suggest the idea of entrapment, of intermediary or transitory state. Goya's prisoner is trapped between the past - the dead men lying on the ground and the future - the long line of those waiting to be shot. On the other hand, the last painting offers the promise of freedom. Torn from the original context, the body of the toreador seems somewhat suspended in the absence of gravity, therefore symbolizing the composition's timelessness.

The movie's explanation lies in two anchor phrases: "The Buddhists had it right all along. The world is an illusion" and "If this is a *dream*, the whole world's inside it". The viewer sees the movie from Sam - the psychiatrist's perspective, when, in fact, it is Henry's point of view, from the beginning to the very end. The whole action of the movie is meant to be a dream, Henry's delirious, between-life-and-death state. The car crash was an accident. Henry was driving his parents and his fiancé home when one of his front tires blew. In reality, Sam's a doctor and an eye-witness, as he was driving behind him before the crash and rushed to the scene to help. During these 5 or 10 minutes, while fighting for his consciousness, flashbacks of his entire existence roll before Henry's eyes. Just like the sound of an alarm or a ringing telephone sometimes find their

way into our dreams, audiovisual sequences from the past overlap with what we might have thought was the actual plot: he remembers the sound of him crying as a newborn, memories of him as a child along with his parents are projected on a television screen from a night club he visits, he sees a walrus he visited at the aquarium in the distant past. With Henry as the conductor of his dream, the delirious world gets populated with the onlookers from the crash scene, who are turned into characters.

He blames himself for the accident and uses Raveur's death to validate his own. Just like Reveur had planned his majestic escape from this world, Henry tries to elude the culpability that keeps him trapped in between life and death, and transforms the Hamletian dilemma into his own "to be or not to be". The movie is packed with symbolic imagery, therefore it takes the viewer more than one time to decode all the messages hidden beyond the screen: spiraling staircases, mirrors and reflecting windows, triplets and twins indicating the multiple perspective, one of Henry's shoelaces is untied, Sam's pants are too short and his ankles are showing throughout the movie most likely because Henry's view is that of Sam crouching next to him while lying on the road.

One can also find hidden references and intentionally confusing and erroneous information: for example Henry states that his parents are buried in "Mahlus Gardens", a Cemetery in Jersey, which is not the name of a cemetery, but of a song from the movie's own soundtrack; the phrase "your troubles will cease and fortune will smile upon you", that recurs several times during the movie, represents the title of a song interpreted by "After the Funeral", included on an album suggestively named "In Dreams".

Towards the end of the movie, the director offers the viewers a beautiful reinterpretation of "the dream of the burning boy" referred to by Freud: "A father had been watching day and night beside the sick-bed of his child. After the child died, he retired to rest in an adjoining room, but left the door aiar so that he could look from his room into the next, where the child's body lay surrounded by tall candles. An old man, who had been installed as a watcher, sat beside the body, murmuring prayers. After sleeping for a few hours the father dreamed that the child was standing by his bed, clasping his arm and crying reproachfully: Father, don't you see that I am burning? The father woke up and noticed a bright light coming from the adjoining room. Rushing in, he found that the old man had fallen asleep, and the sheets and one arm of the beloved body were burnt by a fallen candle."(Freud:) Henry's father is portrayed in this dream world as a Dr. Patterson, a friend of Sam's, who is blind. As a projection of Henry's subconscious, Patterson is not recognizing him as his son. Henry sneaks into his apartment hoping to find forgiveness and peace. Henry's request, "Father, look at me" represents a wake-up call; his words are the equivalent of the "burning boy's" cry. Symbolically, dr. Patterson regains his eyesight, he is now "awake" and able to forgive and grant his son the permission of moving on to the afterlife.

### **References**:

- Elderfield, J. 2006. *Manet and the Execution of Maximilian*.New York: The Museum of Modern Art.
- Freud, S. 1997. Interpretation of Dreams, Hertfordshire: Wordsworth Editions.
- Plato.2007. Six Great Dialogues: Apology, Crito, Phaedo, Phaedrus, Symposium, The Republic, NewYork: Dover Publications.

#### Other sources:

http://www.rogerebert.com/reviews/stay-2005[accessed on 2015-11-20, 22:45].

- Yukio Mishima on suicide, http://www.complex.com/style/2013/04/the-25-bestperformance-art-pieces-of-all-time/mishimas-suicide[accessed on 2016 -01-17, 17:30].
- *Dona Juana la Loca*, Pradillo Ortiz, https://www.youtube.com/ watch?v=BSBPOej9ztg[accessed on 2016 -02-12, 22:30].
- *The Executions of the Third of May, 1808*, Francisco de Goya, http://www.artmuseums.com/goya.htm[accessed on 2016 -02-28, 18:50].

# LANGUAGE STUDIES

### Gringo Words: On Anglicisms in Mexican Spanish

Ioana Alexandrescu, University of Oradea Octavio Cano Silva, University of Barcelona

Abstract: More than three thousand kilometers of border join and separate Mexico and the United States. This very long demarcation line is incessantly being crossed, on both ways, by people. Some of them come to Mexico on holiday, some of them looking for cheap medication etc. As for the Mexicans, many of them go to the United States to work, as mojados (with the border being crossed by 3 million illegal immigrants every year), or legally. Goods come and go from one country to another, merchandise of various types, especially from North to South, since Mexico, with its 100 million inhabitants is the United States' second largest export market, with more than \$1 billion in cross-border commerce taking place every day. Wall-Mart, Sam's Club are present in Mexico, so are guacamole, tacos, tortilla, cilantro (as opposed to Brit. Coriander), in the US. With people and things, come, naturally, words. Some of the English words traveling to Mexico make it to penetrate the speech and become part, as Anglicisms, of Mexican Spanish.

Key words: Anglicism, words, lexical, meaning, pronunciation

Our paper brings some considerations on these Anglicisms (only lexical, not syntactical), as compared to the Anglicisms registered in peninsular Spanish, that is, spoken in Spain, since the very different geographical distance Mexico and Spain have to an English speaking country is likely to translate into important differences in the impact of the English lexis on both variants of Spanish<sup>1</sup>.

In order to tackle this issue, we first made a list of Anglicisms from:

1. the main dictionaries of Spanish (*Diccionario del Español de Mexico* [DEM], printed 2011; *Diccionario de la Real Academia Española*, [DRAE] printed 2001, internet 2014, *Diccionario Panhispánico de Dudas* [DPD] 2005),

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> On this topic, see Moreno de Alba (1999). Also, on Anglicisms in Mexican Spanish, Lope Blanch (1977) and López Chavez (1991).

- 2. the main corpora of Spanish (CREA; CORDE),
- 3. the Internet and
- 4. our personal experience as native and non native Mexican Spanish speakers.

In the second stage, we pre-fabricated three simple categories in order to distribute these Anglicisms:

- ★ Anglicisms that are used in Spain AND in Mexico
- ★ Anglicisms that are used in Mexico, NOT in Spain<sup>2</sup>.
- ★ Anglicisms that are used in Spain, and are NOT used in Mexico.

By fitting the list of Anglicisms we had made into these three categories, other subcategories arouse:

### 1. Anglicisms that are used in Spain AND Mexico

1.1 Words having the same form, the same pronunciation and the same meaning in both variants of Spanish: *internet, web, jazz, blues, blazer, flash, hall, jet, hockey, lady,* etc. Most of the Anglicisms we found fit into this category; they are international Anglicisms, that are present in other languages as well (see Görlach 2002). What makes the difference is that some of them are italicized in the DRAE, or even disappearing from this dictionary, for instance *stock,* italicized in the DRAE and dismissible in its 2014 edition. (the DPD also considers this word unnecessary, as there already is a word in Spanish with the same meaning, *existencias*).

1.2 Words having the same form, the same meaning and a different pronunciation: *iceberg, Diesel, gay, charlestón-charleston<sup>3</sup>*, *coctel-cóctel, video, surf, manager, bulldozer*. In these words, peninsular Spanish tends to "spanishize" their pronunciation, while Mexican Spanish is closer to the original<sup>4</sup>.

 $<sup>^2</sup>$  This slightly unfortunate and clumsy way of putting it is due to the fact we wanted to avoid the use of the adverb *only*, as in better resounding "only used in Mexico", or "only used in Spain", since these Anglicisms may not be exclusive of these countries.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>3</sup> In Mexico, it is *charleston* and *coctel* while in Spain, *charlestón*, *cóctel*.As we can see, in these two cases, there is also a slight formal, accent related difference.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>4</sup> «En los países que tienen o han tenido menos contactos con EE.UU. se tiende más a una adaptación gráfica y morfológica al sistema español que en los países con fuerte influencia norteamericana (México, Caribe, Centroamérica y, en parte, también Chile)». (Haensch 2005: 250)

1.3. Words with the same meaning, the same pronunciation and a different form: *jeans—yins, whisky— güisqui, hippy—jipi, smoking— esmoquin, banjo—banyo, crawl—crol, nylon—nailon, baseball—beisbol, pudding—pudín, leader—líder, meating—mitín, poker—póquer, penalty— penalti* (the DPD proposes *penal*). Mexican Spanish keeps the English word as it is, while peninsular Spanish "spanishizes" it, adapts it to its own writing rules, by applying it transformations that range from the very light (*beisbol*) to the unrecognisable (*yins, güisqui*). Since transformation occurs and adaption has been made, adoption takes place and the word is not italicized.

1.4. Same form, same pronunciation, different meaning: *junior*, *lunch* 

1.5. Different form, different pronunciation, same meaning: *box*—*boxeo, shampoo*—*champú catsup*—*kétchup* 

1.6. Same form, different pronunciation, different meaning: *jersey* 

In conclusion, Peninsular Spanish tends to "spanishize", to adapt Anglicisms to its own rules of writing and pronunciation, while Mexican Spanish appears to be more willing to embrace words in their original form, although they might pronounce it "the Mexican way": smoking [ez 'mo kin], lunch ['lon tJ]. The geographical distance translates into pronunciation and writing efforts to *put a distance* between peninsular Spanish and the original English word, also by italicizing words, which leaves their integrity untouched but somehow outside "genuine" Spanish. The tendency of the DRAE is to censor Anglicisms and to take them out when considered unnecessary.

### 2. Anglicisms that are used in Mexico, NOT in Spain.

For instance, with the Mexican Spanish word at left and its peninsular correspondent at right : keynote-toallita higiénica, basket-baloncesto, vollevball—balonvolea. *coach—entrenador.* hostess—azafata. Bye(babay)—hasta luego, locker-taquilla, jeep—todoterreno, troca\*5 camioneta, pick-up—camioneta, watchear\*—ver, cash—al contado, Bro\*-broder—colega, pants—chándal, pantimedia—media, reversa marcha atrás, hapi\*-borracho, nerd—empollón, pay—tarta, checar *checador—timbradora rentar—alquilar*, averiguar, babv doll. penthouse—ático, folder—carpeta, overol (overall)—mono, trailer camión tractor, raund—asalto (box), hot dog-perrito caliente, zipper, sprint, manager, T-bone steak (tibonestik), bistéc—filete, (ropa, coche)sport-deportivo, rin-rueda, socket-portalámparas, switch-

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>5</sup> \* Argotic

apagador, lop seat—sofá de dos plazas, laptop—portátil, cornflakes copos de maíz, jumper—falda escolar.

Some of the Anglicisms of this category include:

- 1. words that do not form part of the peninsular Spanish active vocabulary, such as words related to baseball: *bat, home run, strike, hit*<sup>6</sup> etc.
- 2. words to whom peninsular Spanish prefers Gallicisms: computadora/ordenador; licencia de conducir/carnet de conducir, reporte/informe, extinguidor (from extinguisher) /extinctor, (from extincteur), clutch-embrague.
- 3. words to whom peninsular Spanish prefer their translation: *tanque de gasolina/depósito de gasolina, hot dog/perrito caliente; (ropa) (coche) sport / ropa deportiva, coche deportivo*

3. Anglicisims that are used in Spain, NOT in Mexico.

This category is very limited, and might be considered a category of exceptions to the main tendency: *flipar*, *parking* (Mex: *estacionamiento*) marketing (Mex: *mercadotecnia*), *footing*, *legging*, *jogging*.

# Illustrative charts of some Anglicisms registered in the main dictionaries of Spanish

## IN BOTH MEXICAN AND PENINSULAR SPANISH WITH GRAPHIC OR PRONOUNCIATION DIFFERENCES

	DRAE / DPD
myo [ba 'ñ yo]	banjo refers to banyo / DPD → banyo
ldócer (buldóceres) uλ do θer]	<i>bulldozer</i> / DPD → buldócer
nampú [t∫am 'pu]	champú / DPD→champú
narlestón	charlestón / NO
ol	$crol / DPD \rightarrow crol$
esel	diésel / NO
'la <i>blazer</i> la 'θer]	<i>blazer</i> (ambiguous) DPD → bléiser
	ldócer (buldóceres) uλ do θer] nampú [tĴam 'pu] narlestón ol esel la <i>blazer</i>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>6</sup> Roughly 33% of the 170 unit list in Lope Blanch's study (1977) on Anglicisms in Mexican Spanish are sport-related words.

gay ['ge j]	gay ['ga i]	gay (regular) / DPD → gay
iceberg ['a jz βer g]	Iceberg [i θe 'βer g]	iceberg (regular) DPD→ iceberg / <i>iceberg</i>
hippie ['xi pi], sometimes written <i>jipi</i>	Jipi	<i>hippie</i> or <i>hippy</i> (new edition: jipi) DPD→ jipi
mánager ['ma na yer]	Mánager ['ma na xer]	mánager (regular) / DPD→ [mánajer]
nylon ['na j lon]	Nailon	nailon, nilón / DPD→ nailon
Póker, póquer refers to pókar	póquer	póquer / DPD→póquer

# IN BOTH MEXICAN AND PENINSULAR SPANISH WITH DIFFERENT MEANINGS

DEM	ESPAÑA	DRAE / DPD
jersey ['yer sej] or ['yer si]	YES	jersey (regular) / DPD→ jersey
lunch ['lon t∫]	YES	<i>lunch</i> / DPD $\rightarrow$ lonche
junior ['yu njor]	YES	júnior (with a different meaning: religion) / DPD→ júnior
lady ['le j ði]. Pl. l <i>adies</i> ['le j ðis] 'dama nobleza inglesa', 'lesbiana'	YES (only 'dama nobleza')	$lady / DPD \rightarrow lady,$ plural <i>ladies</i>

IN BOTH WITHOUT DIFFERENCES (EXCEPT FOR THE ITALICS)				
DEM	ESPAÑA	DRAE / DPD		
blues ['blus]	YES	<i>blues</i> / DPD $\rightarrow$ <i>blues</i> , blus		
flash (no remarks on its pronounciation)	YES	<i>flash</i> / DPD $\rightarrow$ <i>flash</i> , flas		
hall ['xol]	YES	<i>hall</i> / DPD $\rightarrow$ recibidor, entrada		
handicap ['xaN di kap]	YES	<i>handicap</i> - hándicap (new edition/ DPD $\rightarrow$ hándicap		
hobby ['xo βi]	YES	<i>hobby</i> / DPD→ afición, pasatiempo		
flash (no remarks on its pronounciation) hall ['xol] handicap ['xaN di kap]	YES YES YES	$flash / DPD \rightarrow flash$ , flas hall / DPD $\rightarrow$ recibidor, entrada handicap - hándicap (new edition/ DPD $\rightarrow$ hándicap		

DEM	ESPAÑA	DRAE / DPD
hockey ['xo ki]	YES	<i>hockey</i> / DPD $\rightarrow$ joquey
Jazz ['yaθ]	YES	$jazz / DPD \rightarrow jazz$
jet ['ye t]	YES	jet / NO
penalty [pe 'nal ti] or ['pe nal ti]	YES	penalti / DPD $\rightarrow$ penal
play off ['ple j 'o f], pl. play offs	YES	NO / DPD $\rightarrow$ <i>play-off</i> , fase final, desempate
pool ['pul]	YES	NO / DPD → consorcio, agrupación, cooperativa, grupo o equipo
ragtime ['řag ta jm]	YES	ragtime o rag-time / NO
Rally ['řa li]	YES	$rally / DPD \rightarrow rali$
record ['ře kor d]. sometimes written <i>récord</i> . Pl. <i>records</i> )	YES	récord / DPD→rejects the acception 'registro, historial'
set (no remarks on its pronounciation)	YES	set (regular) / DPD $\rightarrow$ set
slogan [ez 'lo γan]	YES	eslogan / DPD→eslogan
smoking [ez 'mo kin]	YES	esmoquin / DPD→esmoquin
software ['so f t gwer]	YES	<i>software</i> / DPD→programas (informáticos), aplicaciones (informáticas), soporte lógico
sport [es 'por t]	YES	<i>sport</i> / DPD→deporte, comodo, informal
squash [es 'kwas]	YES	NO
Staff [es 'ta f]	YES	NO / DPD→ personal o plantilla, plana mayor o equipo directivo
status [es 'ta tus] (usually written <i>estatus</i> )	YES	estatus / DPD→estatus, <i>condición, posición, estado</i>
stock [es 'tok]	YES	stock (suppressed in the 22 <sup>nd</sup> ed.) / DPD→existencias, mercancías almacenadas o en depósito
stress [es 'tres]	YES	estrés / DPD→estrés

### 'Gringo' Words: On Anglicisms in Mexican Spanish

DEM	ESPAÑA	DRAE / DPD
Strip-tease [es trip 'tis]	YES	striptease / DPD->estriptis
waffle	YES	NO / DPD→NO
match ['ma t∫]	YES	NO / DPD $\rightarrow$ partido, combate
sketch [es 'ke t∫]	YES	NO

### ANGLICISMS THAT ARE NOT USED IN SPAIN

DEM	SPAIN	DRAE / DPD
baby doll ['be j βi ðol]	NO	NO
basket ['bas ke t] basquet ['bas ke t] refered to basquetbol	NO	básquet (Americanism) / DPD → baloncesto, básquetbol, basquetbol
Blue jeans ['blu yj 'n s]	NO	bluyín (Americanism / added in the 22 <sup>nd</sup> ed) / DPD → vaquero, bluyín, yín
catcher ['ka t∫er]	NO	NO / DPD $\rightarrow$ cácher, receptor
cachar recibir /sorprender	NO (agarrar/pillar)	cachar (Americanism) / DPD → cachar
clutch ['klo t∫]	NO (embrague)	NO / DPD $\rightarrow$ cloche, embrague
coach ['ko w t∫]	NO	NO / DPD $\rightarrow$ entrenador
Fade ['fe jd]	NO (desvanecimiento)	NO
happening ['xa pe niŋ g]	NO	NO
hit ['xi t]	NO	NO / DPD→ gran éxito, jit
hollywoodense [xo li γu 'ðen se]	NO	NO
home ['xom]	NO	NO / DPD <i>home run→</i> jonrón
hot cake [xo t 'ke jk]	NO (panqueque)	NO
hot dog [xo 't dog]	NO	NO
jacket (also <i>jaket</i> . ['ya ke t] ) 'Revestimiento de una corona dental'	NO	NO

jeans [yj 'n s] (sometimes <i>jean</i> )	NO
Jeep ['yj p] pl. <i>jeeps</i> [yj 'p s] )	NO
jumper ['yom per]	NO
kleenex ['klin eks]	NO
kotex ['ko t eks]	NO
masking tape ['mas kiŋ g 'te jp]	NO
newcastle [nju 'kas tle]	NO
night club ['na j t 'klob]	NO
out ['aw t] estar out	NO
Pick up ['pi kop]	NO
pie ['paj]	NO
pitcher ['pi t∫er]	NO
round ['řa wN d]	NO
sandwich ['saŋ gwi t∫]	NO
score [es 'kor]	NO
scout [es 'ka w t]	NO
short (no remarks on its pronounciaton)	NO
skeet	NO
swing	NO
upper ['o per]	NO
uppercut ['o per ko t] or [o per 'ko t]	NO
videotape	NO
soccer	NO

NO / DPD→ vaquero
NO / DPD $\rightarrow$ todoterreno
NO NO / DPD→ clínex NO
NO / DPD→ cinta adhesiva NO
NO
NO
picop (added in the 22 <sup>nd</sup> ed.) / DPD→ picop NO
NO / DPD→ pícher, lanzador
NO / DPD→asalto
NO/ DPD→sándwich, emparedado
NO / DPD→puntuación, tanteo or marcador
NO / DPD→escultismo
short (suppressed in the 22nd ed) / DPD→pantalón corto
NO
NO
NO
NO
NO / DPD→cinta (de video or de vídeo), videocinta or videocasete NO

ANGLICISMS THAT ARE	E NOT REGISTERED IN	N THE DRAE
DEM	ESPAÑA	DRAE / DPD
baby doll	NO	NO
Fade	NO (desvanecimiento)	NO
Happening ['xa pe niŋ g]	NO	NO
hollywoodense [xo li γu 'ðen se]	NO	NO
hot cake	NO	NO
hot dog [xo 't dog]	NO	NO
jacket (also <i>jaket</i> ['ya ke t] ) 'Revestimiento de una corona dental'	NO	NO
jumper ['yom per]	NO	NO
kotex ['ko t eks]	NO	NO
newcastle [nju 'kas tle]	NO	NO
night club ['na j t 'klob]	NO	NO
out estar out	NO	NO
skeet [es 'ki t]	NO	NO
sketch [es 'ke t∫] , pl. <i>sketchs</i> or <i>sketches</i>	YES	NO
soccer ['so ker]	NO	NO
squash [es 'kwas]	YES	NO
swing [su 'in] or [su 'iŋ g]	NO	NO
upper ['o per]	NO	NO
uppercut ['o per ko t] or [o per 'ko t]	NO	NO
pie <sup>2</sup>	NO	NO

# ANGLICISMS THAT ARE NOT REGISTERED IN THE DRAE, BUT ARE REGISTERED IN THE DPD

DEM	ESPAÑA	DRAE / DPD
catcher ['ka t∫er]	NO	NO / DPD → cácher, receptor
clutch ['klo t∫]	NO (embrague)	NO / DPD $\rightarrow$ cloche, embrague
pool	YES	NO / DPD $\rightarrow$ consorcio, agrupación, cooperativa, grupo o equipo
coach ['ko w t∫]	NO	NO / DPD $\rightarrow$ entrenador
match ['ma t∫]	YES	NO / DPD →partido, combate
home ['xom]	NO	NO / DPD <i>home run→</i> jonrón
masking tape	NO	NO / DPD→ cinta adhesiva
kleenex	NO	NO / DPD $\rightarrow$ clínex
hit	NO	NO / DPD→ gran éxito, jit
staff [es 'ta f]	YES	NO / DPD→ personal o plantilla, plana mayor o equipo directivo
pitcher ['pi t∫er]	NO	NO / DPD→ pícher, lanzador
Play off	YES	NO / DPD $\rightarrow$ <i>play-off</i> , fase final, desempate
Jeep ['yj p]	NO	NO / DPD $\rightarrow$ todoterreno
jeans [yj 'n s]	NO	NO / DPD $\rightarrow$ vaquero
round	NO	NO / DPD→asalto
videotape	NO	NO / DPD→cinta (de video o de vídeo), videocinta o videocasete
score [es 'kor]	NO	NO / DPD→puntuación, tanteo o marcador

#### References

Görlach M. 2002. English in Europe. Oxford: Oxford University Press.

Haensch G. 2005. "Anglicismos en el español de América". *ELUA. Estudios de Lingüística*, n. 19

: 243-251.

- Real Academia Española. 2001. *Diccionario de la lengua española*. 22 ed. Madrid: Espasa-Calpe.
- Real Academia Española. 2005. *Diccionario Panhispánico de dudas*. Madrid: Santillana.
- Lara, L.F.(dir.). 2010. *Diccionario del español de México*. México: El Colegio de México.
- Lope Blanch J.M. 1977. "Anglicismos en la norma lingüística culta de México", en Lope Blanch. *Estudios sobre el español hablado en las principales ciudades de América*. México: Universidad Nacional Autónoma de México, 271-279.
- Lopez Chávez J. 1991. "Préstamos, extranjerismos y anglicismos en el español de México. Valores lexicométricos" en C. Hernández et al. *El español de América. Actas del III congreso internacional de El español de América. Vol II*, Valladolid: 775-786.

Moreno de Alba, J.G. 1999. El Lenguaje en México. México: Siglo Veintiuno.

- Real Academia Española. [15-09-2013]. Online database. Corpus diacrónico del español. <http://www.rae.es>.
- Real Academia Española. [15-09-2013]. Online database. *Corpus de referencia del español actual.* <a href="http://www.rae.es">http://www.rae.es</a>.

## **Issues in the Identification of Varieties of English**

Andrei A. Avram

University of Bucharest

**Abstract:** The aim of the present paper is to discuss some of the controversial issues involved in identifying and classifying varieties of English. The main concern of the paper is a critical examination of the relevance of the various criteria and classifications proposed in the literature to the study of the speech forms that are frequently lumped together under the name "varieties of English", with a focus on the so-called "New Englishes" and on English-lexifier pidgins and creoles.

Key words: varieties, speech form, dialects, language

### Introduction

The paper is structured as follows. Section 2 is a presentation of some criteria suggested in the literature for distinguishing types of varieties. Section 3 is an overview of the main attempts at identifying and categorizing varieties of English and of the main models aiming at capturing the extent and diversity of variation in English. Section 4 is concerned with the varieties known as "New Englishes". Section 5 deals with English-lexifier pidgins and creoles. Section 6 summarizes the conclusions.

### 2. Varieties

As is well known, "variety" or "speech form" are blanket or cover terms widely used in the literature. The main types acknowledged are accent, dialect, and language. While the definition of the former is uncontroversial, the differentiation between dialects and languages and the criteria upon which this should be based are difficult and a matter of debate.

Accents are generally taken to be varieties which differ at the level of phonetics and phonology only.

Dialects are sub-varieties of a single language, and are characterized not only by a distinctive phonetics and/or phonology, but

also by a particular set of morphosyntactic structures, and a particular set of lexical items. Generally, a distinction is made between regional and social dialects (sometimes called "sociolects"). The criterion for identifying the former is geographical/ regional/territorial variation whereas the latter are identified on the basis of variation reflecting social factors such as social class, gender, education, age, etc.

A notoriously difficult distinction is that between dialects and languages, for which both linguistic and extra-linguistic criteria have been suggested. The "traditional" view resorts exclusively to two linguistic criteria: mutual intelligibility and/or structural similarity. Varieties which are mutually intelligible are dialects of the same language, whereas varieties which are not mutually intelligible are languages. However, while this criterion does apply to many situations, it does not account for several facts: there are dialects which are not mutually intelligible (examples include the dialects of Italian, German or Chinese); there are mutually intelligible languages (examples include: Bulgarian and Macedonian; Bosnian, Croatian, and Serbian; Danish, Norwegian, and Swedish; Hindi and Urdu); there is no unanimously accepted threshold for mutual intelligibility; mutual intelligibility may be asymmetrical, with speakers of one variety understanding more of the other one. According to the criterion of structural similarity, varieties which are structurally similar are dialects of the same language, whereas varieties which are structurally different are languages. This criterion is also problematic. Dialects of the same language may display significant structural differences. This is the case of the so-called "polytypic languages", i.e. of varieties which are structurally so diverse that they should be characterized as different languages, yet they are perceived by their speakers as dialects of the same language. Also, languages may be structurally very similar – the case of the so-called "sibling languages", i.e. varieties which are structurally so similar that they may be considered to be dialects of the same language, yet they are perceived by the speakers/one group of speakers as distinct languages (examples include: Bulgarian and Macedonian; Bosnian, Croatian, and Serbian; Danish, Norwegian, and Swedish; Hindi and Urdu). Furthermore, there is no unanimously accepted threshold for structural similarity. Finally, dialects may display structural similarities in some domains, but significant structural differences in other domains.

Siegel (1985: 365) offers a rather different definition of "dialects". These are varieties which must be "genetically closely related and thus typologically similar enough to fulfill at least one of two criteria: (1) they are mutually intelligible or (2) they share a superposed genetically related linguistic system, such as national standard or literary language".

However, a number of objections can be levelled at this definition. These are summarized as follows: genetic affiliation does not necessarily entail typological similarity<sup>1</sup>; genetically related languages may be typologically different; dialects of the same language may differ typologically; mutual intelligibility is also determined by familiarity<sup>2</sup>; dialects may develop out of contact with a national standard or literary language.

As for the non-linguistic criteria serving for the distinction between dialects and languages, the latter generally meet (all or at least some of) the following requirements: prestige; standardization of the pronunciation and of the orthography as well as codification in dictionaries and grammars; the existence of a literary tradition; national identity; positive perceptions by the speakers; positive attitudes of the speakers. Generally, when linguistic and non-linguistic criteria clash, the latter are likely to prevail. This is particularly evident in the case of the so-called "autonomous" and respectively "heteronomous" varieties. An autonomous variety is perceived by its speakers as a distinct language, no matter how similar it is structurally to some other variety. A heteronomous variety is perceived by its speakers as being the same language as that of an autonomous standard variety, no matter how structurally distinct those varieties are. A case in point reflective of this conundrum is Scots:

Noo, its bin said by fowk that ocht tae ken better that the Gordins hid the knack o killin an bein killt. But they've aye bin a gran clan for haein bairns [...] an there'll aye be plenty left. (Siemund et al. 2012: 84) (noo 'now'; ocht 'ought'; tae 'to'; ken 'know'; hid 'had'; aye 'always'; haeing 'having'; bairns 'children')

The controversy focuses on whether the variety illustrated in (1) is a dialect of English or rather a. distinct language. On historical-linguistic grounds, Scots is a dialect, descended from the Northumbrian dialect of Old English and is therefore closely related to modern Northumbrian dialects. It is, however, officially classified as a "traditional language" by the government of Scotland, and listed as a "minority language" in *The European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages*.

A fundamental distinction in much of the literature is that between native and non-native varieties of English. In a traditional approach, this differentiates English as a Native Language from English as a Second Language and/or English as a Foreign Language. This view has come to

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> See also Mufwene (1997).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> As argued by e.g. Mufwene (1997).

be challenged by proponents of the distinction between "genetic nativenes" and "functional nativenes": the former applies to nativelyspoken varieties of English, whereas the latter applies to English as a Second Language<sup>3</sup>. A related distinction of interest is that between transmission"/"genetic development" "normal and "abnormal transmission"/"non-genetic development" put forth by Thomason and Kaufman (1988). Crucial to these distinctions are issues such as target language and norms. As far as the target language is concerned, three situations are generally distinguished: in first language acquisition; in second language learning; in second language "naturalistic" acquisition. As for norms, work by in particular Schneider (2003, 2007, 2007) has led to the widespread acceptance of the relevance of the dichotomy "endonormative" vs. "exonormative" to the development of varieties of English. The former designates an attitude which promotes language forms used within a community as norm whereas the latter refers to an attitude which promotes language forms within another community (but not one's own) as norm (Schneider 2003, 2007, 2011).

### 3. Varieties of English: Models

Attempts at capturing variation in English have materialized in several models. The list, by no means complete, includes the following six models. The "World Map of English" (Strevens 1982) is a world map with a superimposed tree diagram. In the "Three Circle model" (Kachru 1985a) there are three concentric circles: the "Inner Circle" (English as a Native Language countries), the "Outer Circle" (English as a Second Language countries), and the "Expanding Circle" (English as a Foreign Language countries). The "Circle Model of World English" (McArthur 1987) has World Standard English at the centre, followed (moving outwards) by: standard and standardizing varieties of English, including some varieties of English as a Second Language; peripheral varieties, including natively spoken dialects of English, some varieties of English as a Second Language, English as a Foreign Language, and English-lexifier pidgins and creoles. The "Circle of World English" (Görlach 1990) has International English at the centre, followed (moving outwards) by regional standards of English, semi-/sub-regional standard English, nonstandard English, and English-lexifier pidgins and creoles. The "English Language Complex" (Mesthrie and Bhatt 2008) is discussed in some detail below and the "Dynamic Model" (Schneider 2003, 2007 and 2011) is assessed in section 4.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>3</sup> For a discussion of functional and genetic nativeness see Schneider (2011: 220-222).

A few remarks on the first four models are in order. The "World map of English" model is a tree-diagram classification of the varieties of E, of the type used in comparative linguistics. The "Three Circle Model" is essentially a reformulation of the English as a Native Language vs. English as a Second Language vs. English as a Foreign Language distinctions; the inclusion of English as a Foreign Language is controversial (Avram 2011). As for the "Circle Model of World English", there is no identifiable World Standard English (see also Jenkins 2005); also, it is not clear what the varieties on the periphery have in common. A similar objection applies to the "Circle of World English", i.e. there is no identifiable International English. Note also that both the "Circle Model of World English" and the "Circle of World English" include Englishlexifier pidgins and creoles.

Mesthrie and Bhatt's (2008) much more elaborated model, the "English Language Complex", is worth a detailed discussion. The "English Language Complex" consists of varieties of English as a Native Language: metropolitan standards - at least two, standard English of England and American English; colonial standards: South African [White] English, Australian English, New Zealand English; regional dialects: British English dialects; American English dialects; social dialects: e.g. Cockney, RP and Estuary English; Broad, General and Cultivated Australian English; ethnolects, e.g. African American English. Other members of the "English Language Complex" are: English-lexifier pidgins, defined as "rudimentary languages that have no native speakers, though they may subsequently gain in complexity", but "may be considered to belong to the English family, since they are 'lexified' by English – i.e. English is the source of much of their vocabulary" (Mesthrie and Bhatt 2008: 5); English-lexifier creoles, defined as "fully developed speech forms, which show so much restructuring as to bear little resemblance grammatically to their lexifiers", e.g. Jamaican Creole (Mesthrie and Bhatt 2008: 5); English as a Second Language; English as a Foreign Language; Immigrant Englishes, e.g. Chicano English; languageshift Englishes, which "develop when English replaces the erstwhile primary language(s) of a community", e.g. Hiberno English (Mesthrie and Bhatt 2008: 6); jargon Englishes, "characterized by great individual variation and instability" (Mesthrie and Bhatt 2008: 6); hybrid Englishes, "also called 'bilingual mixed languages", which are "versions of English which occur in code-mixing in many urban centres where a local language comes into contact with English", e.g. Hinglish (Mesthrie and Bhatt 2008: 6).

In their attempt at producing an exhaustive list of varieties of English, Mesthrie and Bhatt (2008) are inconsistent with regard both to

some of their criteria and to the classes of varieties of English which they identify. The examples of social dialects include RP, which is not a dialect, but an accent. The only criterion for including pidgins in the "English Language Complex" is the English-derived vocabulary. Englishlexifier creoles are part of the "English Language Complex", although it is acknowledged that they their grammar differs significantly from that of English. Moreover, Jamaican Creole is said to be "structurally an independent language [which] has overlapping membership with the ELC [= English Language Complex] in terms of its vocabulary and the possibilities of being influenced by English" (Mesthrie and Bhatt 2008: 5). This obviously raises the question of how Jamaican Creole can simultaneously be "a structurally independent language" from English and yet a variety of English. English as a Foreign Language does not qualify for the status of variety of English given that it is not a welldefined system (Avram 2011), but rather a collection of individual "performance varieties" (in the sense of Kachru 1992). Also, if Englishlexifier creoles are varieties of English, it is not clear why they are not included among the language-shift Englishes since creoles also replace the original primary language(s) of a community<sup>4</sup>. Furthermore, jargons are types of pidgins illustrative of the first developmental stage of pidgins (see Mühlhäusler 1997); therefore, jargons are not a distinct class from pidgins. Finally, "code-mixing" is confused with "bilingual mixed languages"; the so-called "bilingual mixed languages", also called "mixed"/"intertwining"/"split" languages, are native languages which exhibit a split either between the lexicon and the morphosyntax or in the morphosyntax<sup>5</sup>.

### 4. "New Englishes"

The term "New Englishes", the one used here for convenience, is but one of a plethora of terms, which include – with various nuances attached: "localized forms of English", "non-native Englishes", "non-native varieties of English", "institutionalized varieties of non-native English", "institutionalized second-language varieties of English", "indigenized varieties of English", and "second language varieties of English".

According to Platt et al. (1984), who coined the term, New Englishes are varieties of English which satisfy the following criteria: they must have developed through the education system; they must have

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>4</sup> Cf. "language shift without normal transmission" (Thomason and Kaufman 1988)

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>5</sup> See Bakker and Muysken (1995), Thomason (1997 and 2001), Myers-Scotton (2002), Winford (2003).

developed in an area where a native variety of English is not spoken by most of the population; they must be used for a range of functions among those who speak/write it in a particular region; they must have become localized by adopting certain phonological, syntactic lexical or idiomatic elements from the mother-tongue languages of the region. Kachru (1982, 1985a, 1985b and 1986) writes that New Englishes have the followings characteristics: acquisitional: they are second languages; sociocultural: they are transplanted varieties; motivational: they are integrative and instrumental: functional: they serve as a national language and/or as an international language. New Englishes are also characterized by a range of functional uses (Kachru 1982): instrumental: as a medium of learning: regulative: they serve as the language used in the administration and in the legal system; interpersonal: they are a "link" language between speakers of various (mutually unintelligible) languages and a symbol of modernization; innovative/ imaginative: they are used in the production of literary works.

The best known accounts of the emergence of New Englishes are those by Kachru (1982) and, more recently, by Schneider (2003, 2007 and 2011). According to Kachru (1982), three stages can be posited for the formation of New Englishes: the non-recognition of the local variety and identification with the native speakers; the extensive diffusion of bilingualism and the slow development of varieties within a variety; the acceptance of the non-native variety as the norm and a reduced division between linguistic norm and linguistic behaviour.

In the "Dynamic Model" of Schneider (2003, 2007 and 2011), the emergence of New Englishes is viewed as a fundamentally uniform process that has operated in the individual cases of transplantation of English to new geographical regions. The model posits five stages. In the foundation stage *koinéization* occurs within the colonizers'/settlers' group (the *S strand*) and there is only limited bilingualism within the indigenous population (the *I strand*). In the exonormative stabilization stage there is political and economic stabilization; the expatriate native speakers consider themselves outposts of the colonial power; while English is regularly spoken in the new environment, the S strand starts to shift towards a localized form of English, but the standard continues to be external, i.e. that of the homeland; the *I strand* begins to expand. This is followed by the crucial nativization stage, of both cultural and linguistic transformations, with significantly increased contacts between the S strand and the I strand, and during which most of the changes conducive to the emergence of New Englishes occur. Next comes the stage of endonormative stabilization, i.e. of the gradual adoption and acceptance of a new, internal standard. The last stage is that of differentiation, during which New Englishes emerge. Particular attention is paid to identity construction under specific socio-historical circumstances: new social roles in the presence of new groups; different historical roots and cultural traditions; the evolving relationship to territories and distant centres of political and military power. Participants in the process experience the emergence of New Englishes in different but complementary ways: whereas the *S strand* shifts from *we* to *other* with respect to the homeland, the *I strand* shifts from *other* to *we* with respect to the settlers; the final outcome is linguistic accommodation, with the *S strand* and the *I strand* becoming more closely intertwined and approximating linguistically each other. Note, finally, that the term "nativization" acquires a new dimension in light of the afore-mentioned distinction between genetic nativeness vs. functional nativeness.

The already vast literature on New Englishes is marred by a number of problems. For instance, the term "New English" is to some extent misleading, since English in India has a longer history than in Australia and New Zealand, yet the latter are not considered New Englishes; this explains why some linguists, e.g. Schneider (2007), prefer to use the term "Postcolonial Englishes". The terms "functional nativeness", as used by Kachru, and "nativization", in the sense of Schneider, are controversial. Also, the criteria for inclusion among New Englishes are arbitrary, as already shown by Todd (1985). Indeed, they exclude e.g. immigrant varieties of English (Todd 1985) and Aboriginal English – since it has developed in an area in which a native variety of English (i.e. Australian English) is spoken by the majority of the population (Mesthrie 2000). Moreover, there are also inconsistencies: Indian English is a New English in India but not in South Africa (Todd 1985); Jamaican English is a New English, but Jamaican Creole English is not, even though there is no cut-off point between acrolectal and basilectal English in Jamaica (Todd 1985); English-lexifier pidgins are not New Englishes, even though the same lectal continuum that exists in Jamaica exists in many communities where such a pidgin and English as an official language coexist (Todd 1985).

Perhaps the most controversial issue is that of the nature of standards, i.e. exonormative or endonormative. It is instructive in this respect to consider first the views of linguists. Kachru (1986: 120), for instance, states that "the non-native varieties of English function in societal, linguistic and cultural networks that are distinctly different from those of America and Britain" and that "since English is used for intercultural interaction across languages in South Asia and Africa, the result has been a slow process of acculturation" which "is impossible to stop, but perhaps difficult for purists to accept". According to Singh

(1995: 283), "English, like any other language, has several varieties, each defined by the praxis of those who can be said to share it; and English, like other languages [...] has varieties in more than one national or geographical unit". On the other hand, Quirk (1991: 158) writes that "there is still no grammar, dictionary, or phonological description for any of these nonnative norms that is, or could hope to become, recognized as authoritative in India", in other words, "a description to which teacher and learner in India could turn for normative guidance, and from which pedagogical materials could be derived". For Quirk (1991: 159), "those who speak of local norms always identify a desirable acrolectal one which bears a striking resemblance to the externally established norms of Standard English." Consider also the views of speakers of New Englishes, as reported in the literature. According to Kachru (1982: 44), "the non-native speakers themselves have not yet been able to accept what may be termed the 'ecological validity' of their nativized or local Englishes", but "the non-native models of English (such as RP or GA) are not accepted without reservations." Sey (1973: 1) states that in Ghana "the type who strives too obviously to approximate to RP is frowned upon as distasteful and pedantic". According to Bamgbose (1971: 41), "many Nigerians will consider as affected or even snobbish any Nigerians who speak like a native speaker of English". Ngefac (2003) makes a similar point with respect to Cameroon: "Cameroonians have a strong attachment for their variety of English" and "feel that Cameroon English is a symbol of their identity and any attempt to approximate a foreign accent is jeopardizing their cultural heritage"; consequently, "Cameroonians who make efforts to speak RP are often looked upon with contempt rather than admiration."

Last but not least, the competing exonormative and endonormative orientations of speakers have implications for English language teaching<sup>6</sup>. This "linguistic schizophrenia", as Kachru (1982: 44) chooses to call it, is further reinforced by the educational authorities in countries where New Englishes are spoken, which for the most part still refer to external norms, e.g. the RP accent (see Schneider 2007).

### 5. Are English-lexifier pidgins and creoles varieties of English?

According to Mufwene (1997), pidgins and creoles should be treated as "contact varieties". It follows that English-lexifier pidgins and creoles should be considered contact varieties of English. Kortmann and

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>6</sup> See in particular Kirkpatrick (2007).

Szremcsany (2009) distinguish between "low-contact varieties" and "high-contact varieties" of English. On their analysis, English-lexifier pidgins and creoles would qualify for the status of high-contact varieties. However, *lato sensu*, all languages are contact varieties. Moreover, English itself may be said to have emerged as a contact variety: language contacts between the Germanic-speaking tribes (the Angles, the Frisians, the Jutes, and the Saxons); language contacts between these Germanic-speaking tribes and the Celtic population<sup>7</sup>; the Old Norse influence<sup>8</sup>. Under the circumstances, it seems difficult to uphold the distinction between "high contact" varieties such as English-lexifier pidgins and creoles, on the one hand, and English, on the other hand.

Creoles have also been said to be actually dialects of their lexifier language (Mufwene 2001, 2005, 2006); hence, English-lexifier creoles are dialects of English. Such a view is not without problems. It has nothing to ay about pidgins. Also, unlike dialects, creoles are the outcome of abnormal transmission/non-genetic development (Thomason and Kaufman 1988). Moreover, and again unlike dialects, most Englishlexifier creoles share with English only the vocabulary.

Occasionally, one and the same speech form is inconsistently treated both as a variety of English and as different language. Melchers and Shaw's (2011: 183) write that Bislama<sup>9</sup> "is an English-lexified pidgin, but the Vanuatu government's website [...] provides examples of how different the *two languages* [my italics] are".

English-lexifier creoles are included by some authors among the so-called "Postcolonial Englishes". A proponent of this view is Schneider (2007, 2011). According to Schneider (2007) "the close relatedness between both types of languages is immediately apparent". Schneider (2007: 11) argues that "both derive from contact situations", that "many [my italics] *pidgins* [my italics] and creoles are spoken in regions and countries where English is an official language", and that "in fact, the relationship between local varieties of English and creoles is not always clear". This line of argumentation calls for several objections. As already mentioned, English itself can be said to derive from contact situations. Many, but not all, creoles are spoken in territories where English is the official language. English-lexifier creoles and Postcolonial Englishes are explicitly referred to as "types of languages", i.e. they are different. Rather inconsistently, the "close relatedness" between English-lexifier creoles and Postcolonial Englishes is demonstrated by including pidgins as well.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>7</sup> For recent reassessments of these contacts see Trudgill (2011) and Millar (2012).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>8</sup> See in particular Thomason and Kaufman (1988).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>9</sup> Spoken in Vanuatu.

Surprisingly, the "close relatedness" also resides in the fact that the relationship between English-lexifier creoles and local varieties of English is not always clear.

Consider next the issues of target language and norms. It is highly debatable whether English-lexifier pidgins and creoles had English as their target language (Thomason and Kaufman 1988, Baker 1994 and 1995, Avram 2005a). Generally, pidgins and creoles may have emerged as solutions to communication in multilingual settings, i.e. as "means of interethnic communication" (Baker 1995). Now, norms presuppose the existence and availability of a target language. If English-lexifier pidgins and creole did not (necessarily) have English as their target language, this entails that English norms, whether external or internal, played no part in their emergence and in their subsequent development (except, perhaps, for mesolectal varieties). Consequently, if the norms of English are irrelevant to the formation of English-lexifier pidgins and creoles, the "Dynamic Model" cannot apply, contra Schneider (2007, 2011).

Muysken and Veenstra (1995: 123) discuss the possibility that a "principled grammatical distinction" should be made "between pidgins – which need not conform to UG[= Universal Grammar] – and creoles – which must conform to UG". This would entail that while creoles are natural languages, pidgins are not – a highly debatable claim, to say the least. Moreover, and more to the point, this raises the following question: if pidgins need not conform to Universal Grammar, how can English-lexifier pidgins be varieties of English, which does conform to Universal Grammar?

According to Schneider (2011: 97), creoles should be regarded "as varieties of their European lexifiers, even if distant and unusual ones, strongly restructured and shaped by language contact". The argumentation is based on the situation in the Caribbean. Schneider (2011: 97) mentions "the existence of "intermediate" varieties (mixed between creole, dialectal and standard English) which can widely be heard throughout the Caribbean". The mesolects are characterized by Schneider (2011: 97) as being "recognizably English [my italics] though with words and patterns modified a bit, but interspersed with characteristically creole forms and patterns". Hence, as put by Schneider (2011: 97-98), "what we frequently encounter in the Caribbean is [...] a continuum of forms, spread out between acrolect and basilect". Schneider (2011: 99-100) does admit that "some Caribbean creole texts, notably those from Suriname may indeed seem difficult to understand for English speakers", but still the conclusion is that "their close proximity with English is more than obvious [my italics] and would render their classification as unrelated to English as counterintuitive or even absurd".

Now, the existence of the so-called "creole continuum" has long been demonstrated and is therefore uncontroversial. Example (2) is illustrative of this lectal continuum in Guyanese Creole (Bickerton 1975). As can be seen, the mesolectal varieties, i.e. from (2b) to (2g), are indeed "recognizably English"; this is particularly true of those closer to the acrolect (2h).

- (2) a. Mi tɛl am.
  - b. Mi tɛl i.
  - c. Ai tɛl i.
  - d. A tɛl Im.
  - e. Ai tɛl Im.
  - f. Ai to:l h**I**m.
  - g. Ai to:ld h**I**m.
  - h. Ai tould h**I**m. 'I told him.'

However, there are a number of problems with the view according to which all English-lexifier creoles are "recognizably English". For instance, "recognizably English" is not defined. English-lexifier pidgins are (rather conveniently) left out. The examples below show that both English-lexifier jargons<sup>10</sup>, such as New Hebrides Pidgin English (from the 1880s) – see (3), and extended/expanded pidgins<sup>11</sup>, such as Bislama – see (4), are hardly "recognizably English":

(3) Misi kamesi Arelu Jou no kamu ruki mi Mi no ruki iou Jou ruku Mai Poti i ko Mae tete Vakaromala mi raiki i tiripi Ausi parogi iou i rukauti Mai Poti mi nomoa kaikai mi angikele nau Poti mani Mae I kivi iou Jamu Vari koti iou kivi tamu te pako paraogi mi i penesi nomoa te Pako Oleraiti.

Literal translation: 'Mr Comins, how are you? You no come look me; me no look you; you no look my boat; he go Mae today. Vakaromala me like he sleep house belong you, he look out my boat. Me no more food, me hungry now, boat man Mae he give you yam very good; you give some tobacco belong me, he finish, no more tobacco. All right.' (adapted from Mühlhäusler 1997: 132) (*kaikai* 'food')

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>10</sup> Also called minimal pidgins or pre-pidgins.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>11</sup> In the sense of Mühlhäusler (1997).

(4) Sapos yu wantem talem tingting, kros o glat blong yu. Plis jusum one samting blong luk luk em.

'For any feedback, complaints, comments. Make your choice.' (Melchers and Shaw 2011: 183)

(sapos 'if' < E suppose; -em/-um 'transitive suffix' < E him; tingting 'thought' < E think; kros 'complaint' < E cross; glat 'satisfaction' < E glad; blong 'marker of possession' < E belong; samting 'thing' < E something; luk luk 'to see' < E look)

Even authors for whom varieties of English include English-lexifier pidgins admit that the latter differ significantly from the former. Melchers and Shaw (2011: 183), for instance, write about Tok Pisin<sup>12</sup> that it is "the best developed pidgin in the world, with standardized grammar and vocabulary and a *very un-English appearance* [my italics]". The argument in favour of the inclusion of English-lexifier creoles among varieties of English is based on Caribbean creoles exclusively. Also, the lectal continuum typical of the Caribbean cannot be extrapolated to other areas. Some English-lexifier creoles spoken in territories where English is not used, such as those spoken in Suriname, are not "recognizably English" and their "close proximity with English" cannot be said to be "more than obvious". Consider the following text in Sranan<sup>13</sup>:

(5) Wi na den uma fu Sranan. Wi na den mama fu a kondre. Na wi e wasi den *pikin*, den mangri anu nanga fesi. Dan wi e luku in' den bigi ay fu wi pikin, pikin nanga angri. En wi e pramisi: 'mama sa tyari a nyan'. Go prey now, go prey now, mama sa tyari a nyan. Wi na den uma fu Sranan. Wi na den Sranan wroko uma. Na wi e wroko na bigi *mevrouw*, luku pikin *sondro* angri. Dan wi e *prakiseri* un *eygi* pikin na oso, pikin nanga angri, en wi e prakiseri san un ben taygi wi pikin. So a ben de so langa ten, so a ben de someni yari, na so den yari ben *pasa*. Dati no wani taki dati a sa tan so bika wi *sabi* taki a dey sa kon dati wi sa fri. Sranan tron fri kondre, uma sa feti ina *strey* fu kon fri.

We are the women of Surinam. We are the mothers of the country. It's we who wash the children, their thin hands and faces. Then we look into the big eyes of our children, hungry children. And we promise: 'mama will bring food'. Go play now, go play now. We are the women of Surinam. We are the Surinam working women. It's we who work for ladies. We see children who are not hungry. And we think of our own children at home, hungry children, and we think of what we have told

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>12</sup> Spoken in Papua-New Guinea.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>13</sup> Spoken in Suriname.

our children. It has been so for such a long time, it has been so for many years, and the years have passed so. That doesn't mean that it shall always be so, because we know that the day will come when we shall be free. Surinam will turn into a free country, women will fight in the battle to become free. (Sebba 1997: 150-152)

(In addition to English-derived lexical items, several words etymologically derived from Portuguese and Dutch occur in the text: *pikin* 'child' < Portuguese *pequenho* 'small, little'; *mevrouw* 'lady' < Dutch *mevrouw* 'Madam; Mrs.'; *sondro* 'without' < Dutch *zonder* 'without'; *prakiseri* 'to think' < (coll.) Dutch *prakkezeren* 'think'; *eygi* 'own' < Dutch *eigen* 'own'; *pasa* 'to pass' < Portuguese *pasar* 'to pass'; *sabi* 'to know' < Portuguese *saber* 'know'; *strey* 'fight, struggle' < Dutch *strijd* 'fight, struggle')

Finally, even creoles spoken in territories where English is also used as the official language, such as Australian Kriol, may not be "recognizably English":

(6) Burrum weya yundubala bin gaman? Burrum tharrei langa awus. Mindubala bin gaman burrum jeya.

Where did you come from? From there at the house. We came from there. (Sandefur and Sandefur 1982: 9) (*burrum* 'from' < E *from*; *yundubala* 'you two' < E *you* + *two* + *fellow*; *gaman* 'to come' < E *come on*; *langa* 'locative/directional preposition' < E *along*; *mindubala* 'we two' < E *me* + *two* + *fellow*; *jeya* 'there' < E *there*)

English-lexifier pidgins and creoles have also been considered in relation to issues such as the simplification, complexification and typology of varieties of English. Szmrecsanyi and Kortmann (2006a and 2006b) illustrate what they call "vernacular angloversals", i.e. universals typical of varieties of English, with examples from English-lexifier pidgins and creoles as well. According to Kortmann and Szmrecsanyi (2009), English-lexifier pidgins and creoles are high-contact varieties of English and hence exhibit a high level of simplification. However, simplification and complexification do not apply "across the board". Consider, for example, the system of personal pronouns of Bislama, as described by Crowley (2004):

(7)		Singular		Dual	Trial	Plural
	1	mi	inclusive	yumitu(fala)	yumitrifala	yumi
			exclusive	mitufala	mitrifala	mifala
	2	yu		yutufala	yutrifala	yufala
	3	hem		tufala	trifala	ol(geta)

Obviously, with its four-fold distinctions in terms of grammatical number, supplemented with the inclusive vs. exclusive distinction, and with a total of 15 pronominal forms, Bislama turns out to be by far more complex than the system of personal pronouns of English, its lexifier language. Similarly, Cameroon Pidgin English – an extended/expanded pidgin – has a system of four different copulas which correspond to just one (the verb *to be*) in English:

(8) a. existential copula

	M <b>ɔ</b> ni dei.
	'There's money.'
b.	locative copula
	I go bi f <b>2</b> haus.
	'He'll be in the house.
c.	equative copula
	Datwan na ma sista.
	'That one is my sister.
4	prodiostivo sopulo

d. predicative copula  $I \oslash big.$ 'He's big.'

Siemund (2013) also examines English-lexifier pidgins and creoles in his typological study of varieties of English. However, there is a significant typological distance between English-lexifier pidgins and creoles and other varieties of English. Consider the following examples illustrative of the tense and aspect system of Cameroon Pidgin English (Todd and Jumbam 1992):

(9)	a.	Di man <i>di fait</i> .
		'The man is fighting.'
	b.	Di man <i>bin fait</i> .
		'The man fought.'
	c.	Di man <i>bin di fait</i> .
		'The man was fighting.'
	d.	I d <b>ɔ</b> n kam.
		'He has come.'
	e.	I <i>sabi ch<b>ɔ</b>p</i> fish.
		'He always eats fish.'
	f.	A f <b>2</b> go if a get chans.
		'I would go if I had the chance.'
	g.	A f d d n go if a bin get chans.
	-	'I would have gone if I had got the chance.'

As can be seen, tense and aspect is formally expressed by means of preverbal markers exclusively. English-lexifier pidgins and creoles also differ significantly from English in their phonology, e.g. their syllable structure (see Avram 2005b).

Whether pidgin and creole languages can be characterized on the basis of diagnostic features is a matter of dispute in the literature. According to Mufwene (1997 and 2001), for instance, pidgins and creoles are not identifiable on purely structural grounds. This would not necessarily be a problem *per se* since, as already seen, English-lexifier pidgins and creoles are not the only alleged varieties of English identified on the basis of non-structural criteria. However, the identification of diagnostic features of English-lexifier pidgins and creoles (see e.g. Baker and Huber 2001, Avram 2004) is useful for establishing historical-linguistic relations between individual varieties. Furthermore, while lists of diagnostic features of varieties of English to the exclusion of English-lexifier pidgins and creoles also exist (Hickey 2004), the synopses in Burridge (2008a, 2008b), Mesthrie (2008a, 2008b), and Schneider (2008a, 2008b), also based on specific diagnostic features, do include data from English-lexifier pidgins and creoles.

### 6. Conclusions

The findings of the present paper can be summarized as follows. Existing models and/or lists of varieties of English are rather unsatisfactory and should therefore be revised.

Also, a stop should be put to the proliferation of new presumably identified varieties, e.g. "Mid-Atlantic English" (Modiano 1996a, 1996b), "English as an International Language", "English as a Lingua Franca" (Jenkins 2000, 2005, 2007), "Euro-English" (Jenkins et al. 2001). As already noted by several authors (Mollin 2006a, 2006b, 2007, Melchers and Shaw 2011), these alleged varieties are rather examples of "learner English" which have not (as yet, at least) reached the point of codification<sup>14</sup>.

The basic native vs. non-native varieties of English should be preserved. Native varieties of English should not include English-lexifier creoles. Non-native varieties of English should include New Englishes (beginning with the nativization stage in the "Dynamic Model" of Schneider 2003, 2007, 2001) and Immigrant Englishes. However, nonnative varieties of English should not include English as Foreign Language and English-lexifier pidgins.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>14</sup> Melchers and Shaw (2011: 203), for instance, conclude that "Euro-English [...] seems rather far from codification".

#### References

- Avram, A. A. 2004. 'Atlantic, Pacific or world-wide? Issues in assessing the status of creole features' in *English World-Wide* 25 (1), 81-108.
- Avram, A. A. 2005a. *Pidginurile și creolele cu bază engleză și franceză ca tip particular de contact lingvistic*. Bucharest: Editura Universității din București.
- Avram, A. A. 2005b. *On the Syllable Structure of English Pidgins and Creoles*. Bucharest: Editura Universității din București.
- Avram, A. A. 2011. 'English between globalization and localization' in *Conference on British and American Studies*. 9<sup>th</sup> Edition. M. Burada (ed.). Braşov: *Transilvania* University Press.
- Baker, P. 1994. 'Creativity in creole genesis' in *Creolization and Language Change*. D. Adone and I. Plag (eds.). Tübingen: Niemeyer.
- Baker, P. 1995. 'Motivation in creole genesis' in *From Contact to creole and beyond*. P. Baker (ed.). London: University of Westminster Press.
- Baker, P. and Magnus, H. 2001. 'Atlantic, Pacific, and world-wide features in Englishlexicon contact languages' in *English World-Wide* 22 (2), 157-208.
- Bakker, P. and Muysken, P. 1995. 'Mixed languages and language intertwining' in *Pidgins and Creoles. An Introduction.* J. Arends, P. Muysken and N. Smith (eds.). Amsterdam/ Philadelphia: John Benjamins.
- Bamgbose, A. 1971. 'The English language in Nigeria' in *The English Language* in West Africa. J. Spencer (ed.). London: Longman.
- Bickerton, D. 1975. *Dynamics of a creole System*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Burridge, K. 2008a. 'Synopsis: phonetics and phonology of English spoken in the Pacific and in the Australasian region' in *Varieties of English*, vol. 3, *The Pacific and Australasia*. K. Burridge (ed.). Berlin · New York: Mouton de Gruyter.
- Burridge, K. 2008b. 'Synopsis: Morphological and syntactic variation in the Pacific and Australasia' in *Varieties of English*, vol. 3, *The Pacific and Australasia*. K. Burridge (ed.). Berlin · New York: Mouton de Gruyter.
- Buschfeld, S., Hoffmann, T., Huber, M. and Kausch, A. (eds.) 2014. *The Evolution of Englishes. The Dynamic Model and beyond.* Amsterdam/Philadelphia: John Benjamins.
- Crystal, D. 2003. *English as a Global Language*, second edition, Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Crowley, T. 2004. *Bislama Reference Grammar*. Honolulu: University of Hawa'i Press.
- Görlach, M. 1990. 'The development of Standard Englishes' in *Studies in the History of the English Language*. M. Görlach. Heidelberg: Carl Winter Universitätsverlag.
- Hickey, R. 2004. 'Checklist of non-standard features' in *Legacies of Colonial English. Studies in Transported Dialects.* R. Hickey (ed.). Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.

- Jenkins, J. 2000. *The Phonology of English as an International Language: New Models, New Norms, New Goals.* Oxford: Oxford University Press.
- Jenkins, J. 2005. *World Englishes. A Resource Book for Students*. London and New Yorl: Routledge.
- Jenkins, J. 2007. English as a Lingua Franca: Attitude and Identity. Oxford: Oxford University Press.
- Jenkins, Jennifer, Modiano, Marko, Seidhofer, Barbara. 2001. 'Euro-English' in English Today 17, 13-19.
- Kachru, B. B. 1982. 'Models for non-native Englishes' in *The Other Tongue*. *English across Cultures*. B. B. Kachru (ed.). Urbana: University of Illinois Press.
- Kachru, B. B. 1985a. 'Standards, codification and sociolinguistic realism: The English language in the Outer Circle' in *English in the World*, R. Quirk and H. G. Widdowson (eds.). Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Kachru, B. B. 1985b. 'Attitudes and usage: English in the world context' in *The English Language Today*. S. Greenbaum (ed.). Oxford: Pergamon Press.
- Kachru, B. B. 1985c. 'Institutionalized second-language varieties' in *The English Language Today*, S. Greenbaum (ed.). Oxford: Pergamon Press.
- Kachru, B. B. 1986. *The Alchemy of English: The Spread, Functions and Models* of Non-native Englishes. Oxford: Pergamon.
- Kachru, B. B. 1992. 'Models for non-native Englishes' in *The Other Tongue*. *English across Cultures*, second edition. B. B. Kachru (ed.). Urbana: University of Illinois Press.
- Kirkpatrick, A. (ed.). 2010. *The Routledge Handbook of World Englishes*. London and New York.
- Kortmann, B. and Szmrecsanyi, B. 2009. 'World Englishes between simplification and complexification' in *World Englishes: Problems, Properties and Prospects.* L. Siebers and T. Hoffmann (eds.). Amsterdam/Philadelphia: John Benjamins.
- McArthur, T. 'The English languages' in English Today 11, 9-13.
- Melchers, G. and Shaw, P. 2011. *World Englishes. An Introduction*, second edition. London: Hodder Education.
- Mesthrie, R. 2000. 'Language contact 2: Pidgins, creoles and 'New Englishes'' in R. Mesthrie, J. Swan, A. Deumert and W. L. Leap, *Introducing Sociolinguistics*, 279-315. Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press.
- Mesthrie, R. 2008a. 'Synopsis: The phonology of English in Africa and South and Southeast Asia' in *Varieties of English*, vol. 4, *Africa, South and Southeast Asia*. R. Mesthrie (ed.). Berlin · New York: Mouton de Gruyter.
- Mesthrie, R. 2008b. 'Synopsis: Morphological and syntactic variation in Africa and South and Southeast Asia' in *Varieties of English*, vol. 4, *Africa*, *South and Southeast Asia*. R. Mesthrie (ed.). Berlin · New York: Mouton de Gruyter.
- Mesthrie, R. and Bhatt, R. M. 2008. World Englishes. The Study of New Linguistic Varieties. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Millar, R. M. 2012. *English Historical Sociolinguistics*. Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press.
- Modiano, M. 1996a. 'The Americanization of Euro-English', in *World Englishes* 15 (2), 207-215.
- Modiano, Marko. 1996b. A Mid-Atlantic Handbook. American and British English. Lund: Studentlitteratur.
- Mollin, Sandra. 2006a. 'English as a Lingua Franca: A new variety in the New Expanding Circle?' in *Nordic Journal of English Studies* 5 (2), 41-57.
- Mollin, Sandra. 2006b. Euro-English: Assessing Variety Status. Tübingen: Narr.
- Mollin, Sandra. 2007. 'New variety or learner English? Criteria for variety status and the case of Euro-English' in *English-World-Wide* 28 (2), 167-185.
- Mukherjee, J. and Hundt, M. (eds.). 2011. Exploring Second-Language Varieties of English and Learner Varieties. Bridging the Gap. Amsterdam/Philadelphia: John Benjamins.
- Mufwene, S. S. 1997. 'Jargons, pidgins, creoles, and koines: What are they?' in *The Structure and Status of Pidgins and Creoles*. A. K. Spears and D. Winford (eds.), Amsterdam/ Philadelphia: John Benjamins.
- Mufwene, S. S. 2001. *The Ecology of Language Evolution*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Mufwene, S. S. 2005. 'Creolization is a social, not a structural, process' in *Degrees* of *Restructuring in Creole Languages*. I. Neumann-Holzschuh and E. W. Schneider (eds.). Amsterdam/ Philadelphia: John Benjamins.
- Mufwene, S. S. 2006. 'The comparability of new-dialect formation and creole development' in *World Englishes* 25, 177-186.
- Muysken, P. and Veenstra, T. 1995. 'Universalist approaches' in *Pidgins and Creoles. An Introduction.* J. Arends, P. Muysken and N. Smith (eds.). Amsterdam/Philadelphia: John Benjamins.
- Mühlhäusler, P. 1997. *pidgin and creole Linguistics*, expanded and revised edition. London: University of Westminster Press.
- Myers-Scotton, C. 2002. Contact Linguistics. Bilingual Encounters and Grammatical Outcomes. Oxford: Oxford University Press.
- Ngefac, A. 2003. 'Homophones and heterophones in Cameroon English' in *Alizés* 25-26.
- Platt, J. T., Weber, H. and Ho, M. L. 1984. *The New Englishes*. London: Routledge and Kegan Paul.
- Quirk, R. 1991. 'The question of standard in the international use of English' in Languages and Standards: Issues, Attitudes, Case Studies. M. L. Tickoo (ed.). Singapore: SEAMEO Regional Language Centre.
- Sandefur, J. R. and Sandefur, J. L. 1982. An Introduction to Conversational Kriol. Darwin: Summer Institute of Linguistics.
- Schneider, E. W. 2003. 'The dynamics of New Englishes: From identity construction to dialect birth' in *Language* 79 (1), 233-281.
- Schneider, E. W. 2007. *Postcolonial English. Varieties around the World.* Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Schneider, E. W. 2008b. 'Synopsis: Phonological variation in the Americas and the Caribbean' in *Varieties of English*, vol. 2, *The Americas and the*

Caribbean, E. W. Schneider (ed.). Berlin · New York: Mouton de Gruyter.

- Schneider, E. W. 2008a. 'Synopsis: morphological and syntactic variation in the Americas and the Caribbean' in *Varieties of English*, vol. 2, *The Americas and the Caribbean*, E. W. Schneider (ed.). Berlin · New York: Mouton de Gruyter.
- Schneider, E. W. 2011. *English around the World: An Introduction*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Sebba, M. 1997. Contact Languages. Pidgins and Ccreoles. London: Macmillan.
- Sey, K. A. 1973. Ghanaian English: An Exploratory Survey, London, Macmillan.
- Siegel, J. 1985. 'Koines and koineization' in Language in Society 14, 357-378.
- Siemund, P. 2013. Varieties of English. A Typological Approach. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Siemund, P., Davydova, J. and Maier, G. 2012. *The Amazing World of Englishes. A Practical Introduction*. Berlin/Boston: de Gruyter Mouton.
- Singh, R. 1995. 'On new/non-native Englishes: A quartet' in *Journal of Pragmatics* 24 (2), 283-294.
- Szmrecsanyi, B., Kortmann, B. 2006a. 'Vernacular universals and angloversals in a typological perspective', Paper presented at the symposium "World Englishes: vernacular universals vs. contact-induced change", 1-3 September 2006, Mekrijärvi.
- Szmrecsanyi, B., Kortmann, B. 2006b. 'The morpho-syntax of varieties of English worldwide: A quantitative perspective' in *Lingua* 119 (11), 1643-1663.
- Strevens, P. 1982. 'The localized forms of English' in *The Other Tongue*. *English across Cultures*. B. B. Kachru (ed.). Urbana: University of Illinois Press.
- Thomason, S. G. 1997. 'A typology of contact languages' in *The Structure and Status of pidgins and creoles*. A. K. Spears and D. Winford (eds.). Amsterdam/ Philadelphia: John Benjamins.
- Thomason, S. G. 2001. *Contact Languages: An Introduction*. Washington, DC: Georgetown University Press.
- Thomason, S. G. and Kaufman, T. 1988. *Language Contact, Creolization, and Genetic Linguistics*. Berkeley: University of California Press.
- Todd, L. 1985. Review of J. T. Platt, H. Weber and M. L. Ho *The New Englishes* in *English World-Wide* 9 (1), 155-163.
- Todd, L. and Jumbam, M. 1992. 'Kamtok: Anatomy of a pidgin' in *English* Today 8, 3-11.
- Trudgill, P. 2011. Sociolinguistic Typology. Social Determinants of Linguistic Complexity. Oxford: Oxford University Press.
- Winford, D. 2003. An Introduction to Contact Linguistics. Oxford: Blackwell.

# To Be Between Conventional and Unconventional

Claudia Leah University of Oradea

**Abstract**: The present paper aims at highlighting the idea that grammar, in general, English grammar included, is conventional, normative and restricted to rules, patterns, structures that should be followed by any speaker who intends to prove his/her mastery of the language. If these rules are broken, grammar becomes unconventional and sometimes, this unconventional means of communication beats the standard, plain good conventional English.

Keywords: conventional, unconventional, rules, structure, pattern

Two relatively recent overheard statements: Unconventional beats conventional., and Grammar is not of utmost importance in communication. represent the starting point of this paper.

A common definition of *conventional* (www.merriamwebster.com/dictionary) refers to the meaning of this term as being something used and accepted by most people, in other words, something usual or traditional, common and ordinary : not unusual. A deeper analysis of the meaning highlights some other nuances: something formed by agreement or compact, something according with, sanctioned by, or based on a convention, something resembling, or relating to a convention, assembly, or public meeting. A possible antonym of conventional could be *nonconformist* (www.merriam-webster.com/dictionary), ie.a person who does not behave the way most people behave, someone/ something that does not conform to a generally accepted pattern.

On the other hand, unconventional means very different from the things that are used or accepted by most people, not traditional or usual, not conventional, not bound by or in accordance with convention : being out of the ordinary <*an unconventional outfit*> <*an unconventional thinker*>.

Anything that's nonconformist or out of the ordinary can be described as unconventional. Every culture has its own conventions, norms, and what may be unconventional in one region might be typical in another. The perception of what's unconventional is determined by context. Therefore, to be *unconventional* means to act, dress, speak, behave or otherwise exist out of the bounds of any kind of norms. (https://www.vocabulary.com/dictionary)

Some of the possible synonyms for unconventional might be, among others: bizarre, eccentric, far-out, way-out, original, irregular, unorthodox, unique, individual, informal, improper, out of the order, uncommon a.s.o.(www.thesaurus.com/browse/)

Grammar is based on formal, normative conventions, on rules and patterns, on more or less fixed structures and constructions, and therefore it is consedered conventional grammar. In Collins English Dictionary (2014), grammar is defined in different ways, according to several criteria, as: the branch of linguistics that deals with syntax and morphology, sometimes also phonology and semantics; the abstract system of rules in terms of which a person's mastery of his native language can be explained; a systematic description of the grammatical facts of a language; a book containing an account of the grammatical facts of a language or recommendations as to rules for the proper use of a language; the use of language with regard to its correctness or social propriety, especially in syntax. Grammar also refers word taxonomy, to the manner in which words can be used and structured in different combinations to form logical, understandable written or spoken communication.

Any rule, pattern, structure which is not respected, accidentally or deliberately, leads to a so-called violation of conventional grammar, which has as a consequence either a misunderstanding of the conventional side of the relation between reality and grammatical forms, or a difficulty in learning or using formal grammatical conventions correctly. This is the characteristic of the unconventional grammar which is that kind of grammar which, although not considered plain good English it is still used, being a sign of poor grammatical abilities.

Eg. I don't know nothing about noone. instead of:

	I don't know anything about anyone.
or:	I wanna go there. instead of:
	I want to go there.
or	Where's ya? instead of:
	Where are you?

The correct usage of pronouns in Nominative or Accusative has become a problem for some speakers. A question like: *Who's there?* may get two answers:

It's me. (Acc) or It's I. (N). Conventionally, the correct form is It's I., but most people use the unconventional, colloquial form It's me. Moreover, informally, a sentence like:

Eg.Me and my parents spent our holidays at the seaside.

is considered correct, although it is a proof of both impolite and unconventional grammar for two reasons:

- The formal, grammatical, conventional form is the Nominative I instead of Me;
- The conventional, place of the two subjects (multiple subject) implies politeness, and therefore, *My parents* should take the first position in the sentence:

Eg. My parents and I spent our holidays at the seaside.

In the example: *I and my parents spent our holidays at the seaside*. rules of grammar apply to unconventional language use.

If we refer to unconventional as irregular, than, the English grammar is full of unconventional grammatical forms. Thus, we may take the plural number of the noun, which may follow the general rule:

eg.boy-boys, lady-ladies (regular plural),

or may be formed with no rule applied:

eg. child-children, man-men, sheep-sheep, datum-data, analysisanalyses (irregular plurals),

or, the unconventional forms may be stronger if the invariable nouns are taken into consideration:

eg. milk, gold, air, money (singular invariable nouns), eg. trousers, scissors, fireworks (plural invariable nouns)

Some interesting unconventional forms occur regarding the pronoun. Conventionally, the possessive pronoun has specific forms, but when we change the pronominal value of the word into an adjectival one, some pronouns simply drop their -s ending:

eg. yours (pronoun)- your (adjective) hers (pronoun)- her (adjective) ours (pronoun)- our (adjective) theirs (pronoun)- their (adjective) while some others, either do not change their form at all

eg. his (pronoun)- his (adjective)

or change it completely:

eg. mine (pronoun)- my (adjective)

The adjective and the adverb form their degree of comparison conventionally, according to two different patterns:

eg.nicer than, the nicest (synthetical degree), eg. more beautiful, the most beautiful (analytical degree),

but their situation becomes unconventional when the debate goes around the irregular way of forming the degrees of comparison:

eg.bad-worse-the worst; well-better-the best,

or around the ungradable adjectives and adverbs:

eg.perfect, superior, orally.

Concerning the verb, this morphological part of speech offers a lot of examples illustrating irregularities, unconventional forms. For example, most modal verbs do not respect the general rules:

- they do not take the -(e)s marker for the 3<sup>rd</sup> person singular: eg. he canØ, he mayØ, he mustØ,
- ✤ or do not take the -ing form,
- they don't have the three basic forms of a common verb (to ask-asked-asked; to take-took-taken) and thus, having no infinitive, their infinitival translation is only conventional: eg. can= to be able to, may= to be allowed to etc;
- they do not take auxiliaries to form different forms and tenses and therefore, they are either replaced by a synonym: eg.*I will be able* (for the future of can)

or behave like auxiliaries:

eg.I cannot, Can you?

Sometimes the question containing a modal verb does not receive a negative answer with the same modal verb in it: Eg.May I smoke here? No, you mustn't. or Must I read this book? No, you needn't.

It is also worth mentioning here the irregular verbs, which are unconventional only in point of the three basic forms:

eg. to go-went-gone; to make-made-made etc.,

except the verb *to be*, which is 'the most unconventional verb', since it does not respect more rules than any other verb:

- > it does not have three basic forms, but four *to be-was/were-been*,
- it doesn't form the present tense according to the pattern: short infinitive plus -(e)s 3<sup>rd</sup> prson singular (ex: to sing-I sing, you sing, he/she/it sings, we sing, you sing, they sing), but differently, without any connection with the infinitive: I am, you are, he/she/it has, we are, you are, they are.
- Moreover, most English verbs are only predicative. Some of them may also be link or/and auxiliary verbs, while to be has four significant values:
  - predicative: *I am in the garden.*,
  - link: *I am happy*.,
  - progressive auxiliary: I am reading. and
  - passive auxiliary verb: *I am asked*.

All these irregularities makes the verb to be an unconventional verb.

If we refer to unconventional as out of the order or uncommon, than some sentence structures may come under analysis. That the word order is of utmost importance in English is well-known. Word order uses conventional patterns, such as:

Subject-Predicate- Indirect Object (non-prepositional)-Direct Object.

eg. I gave John two books.

or, Subject-Predicate- Direct Object- Indirect Object (prepositional).

eg. I gave two books to John.

Sometimes a conventional pattern may be changed, usually in order to obtain a sylistic device or a grammatical device. Therefore, if a conventional structure such as:

eg. I shall never say it again.

changes into: Never shall I say it again.

it means that the speaker wanted to emphasize on the promise, by means of front-shifting the adverb *never*.

Interrogative sentences of different types have their own specific conventional word order:

eg. Do you like oranges? Are you happy? What is your name? How do you spell it?

If this word order is preserved in Indirect questions, it becomes unconventional and ungrammatical, since it needs to change:

eg. He asks me if I like oranges. not He asks me if do I like oranges.

He asks me if I am happy. not He asks me if am I happy. He asks me what my name is. not He asks me what is my name. He asks me how I spell it. not He asks me how do I spell it.

Sometimes, the unconventional grammar, although incorrect, is used more effectively because sentences and advertisements seem to be more eye/ear-catching, exactly because they look or sound strange.

eg. Great show to-nite!

In conclusion, if we were to answer the two questions:

- ✤ Is grammar of utmost importance in communication?
- Does the unconventional beat conventional?

we could give straight answers. Even if we are able to communicate without perfect knowledge of grammar, this would show poor abilities in English grammar, and the language would be a colloquial one, far from plain good formal conventional English.

The examples given in this paper, and many others, show that sometimes, depending on what we mean by unconventional, it beats conventional.

### References

Clark E. V. (2003) First language acquisition, Cambridge University Press.

- Duvignau K. (2003) *Metaphore verbale et approximation*, Revue d'Intelligence Artificielle, Paris, Vol 5/6: 869–881.
- Jagielskaclle-Erss, Dominika (2012) Verb-based approximations in Polish as a first language: acquiring and structuring the verbal lexicon, Toulouse University,
- Viberg A. (2002) *Basic verbs in Second Language Acquisition*, Revue Française de Linguistique Applquee 2002/2, Vol VII: 61–79.
- Collins English Dictionary (2014)– Complete and Unabridged, 12th Edition © HarperCollins Publishers

www.merriam-webster.com/dictionary

https://www.vocabulary.com/dictionary

www.thesaurus.com/

# Translator as a Cultural Mediator

Madalina Pantea University of Oradea

**Abstract**: The present paper tackles the issue of the translator as a cultural mediator and the difficulties s/he has to surpass in order to accurately render the appropriate message in his/her work. Sometimes we think we understand more than we actually do, because we gloss over the differences, the areas of significant misunderstanding; and sometimes we think we understand less than we actually do, because ancient cultural hostilities and suspicions make us exaggerate the differences between us.

Key words: culture, translator, differences, message.

The translation of cultural specifics, in particular, constitutes one of the most challenging areas of intercultural transfer, to the extent that cultural references are traditionally regarded in the literature as being 'untranslatable.' <sup>1</sup>

P.Arson claims that 'language is a guide to social reality' and that human beings areat the mercy of the language that has become the medium of expression for their society.<sup>2</sup>

No two languages are ever sufficiently similar to be considered as representing the same social reality. The worlds in which different societies live are distinct worlds, not merely the same world with different labels attached.

As Susan Bassnet has pointed out: "In the same way that the surgeon, operating on the heart, cannot neglect the body that surrounds it, so the translator treats the text in isolation from the culture at his peril"<sup>3</sup>

Culture compromises the process of making sense of our way of life. Cultural studies theorists, drawing particularly on semiotics, have argued that language is the major mechanism through which culture

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup>Catford, J. C. (1965). A Linguistic Theory of Translation. London, Oxford University Press. <sup>2</sup>Arson, P. (1988).*The Aim and Function of the Subtitle – What It Does and Does Not Do*. MA thesis.Université de Rouen.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>3</sup>Bassnett, Susan.(2002). *Translation Studies*, London, Routledge, p.23.

produces and reproduces meanings. The definition of language developed in this tradition of thought goes well beyond that of normal definition of verbal or written language. For semioticians such as Roland Barthes, 'language' includes all those systems from which we can select and combine elements in order to communicate. So dress can be a language: by changing our fashions (selecting and combining our garments and thus the meanings that culture attributes to them) we can change what our clothes 'say' about us and our place within a culture."<sup>4</sup>

"The operation of language, however, provides us with a central model of the way culture produces meaning, regardless of the medium of communication. Language constructs meaning in two ways. The literal, or denotative, meaning a word is attached to it by usage. It is a dictionary style of meaning where the relation between the word and the object it refers to is relatively fixed.[...] The denotative meaning is not its only meaning( in fact, it is doubtful that anything is understood purely literally). Words and the things to which they refer accrue associations, connotations, and social meanings, as they are used.

The second kind of meaning, the connotative, is interpretative and depends on upon the users experience rather than on a dictionary. It is connotation that we find the social dimension of language. Images, as well as words, carry connotations. A filmed image of a man will have a denotative dimension – it will refer to the mental concept of 'man'. [...] but images are culturally charged: the camera angle employed, his position within the frame, the use of lighting to highlight certain aspects, any effect achieved by color, tinting, or processing, would all have the potential for social meaning.

There is a 'language' for visual representations, too, sets of codes and conventions used by the audience to make sense of what they see"<sup>5</sup>

Translation is always prompted by a societal need, no matter whether it is ultimately requisitioned by the target culture or imposed by the source culture. Such needs are not always easy to identify, and they may indeed take on many forms. This means that in many contexts, translators will have to fulfil a multitude of different roles and they are expected to do many different things.<sup>6</sup>

The strategy chosen depends not only on the translator's deliberate attitudes but on such matters as the clients' view, the general level of

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>4</sup> Turner, G. (2012). *Film as Social Practice*, 4<sup>th</sup>.Edition, Routledge, p.66. <sup>5</sup>Id ibidem, p.68.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>6</sup>Dollerup, Cay. (2006). *Basics of Translation Studies*, Editura Institutul European Iasi, p.110.

education in the country. At the same time, they are also individuals with different backgrounds who interact with other people in specific situations. The translators background also have a bearing, as does the way translators enter the trade.

The size of a country seems to influenced the society's view of translators. The larger the country, the less obvious the need to input from abroad, and the less obvious the importance of translation and translators. Conversely, there is more awareness of the need for communication with foreign cultures in small nations.

The awareness of the strong element of culture is one of the key points in functional approaches. It comprises such obvious aspects as differences in terms of address, greetings, idioms, also the facts that there are different ways of presenting the "same" information in different countries. The awareness that the translator should thus be biculturally competent has been analysed by Heidrun Witte.<sup>7</sup>

Witte divides the cultural "competence" into a general competence of intra- and inter-cultural communication, and a specific one relating to the language pair used in the translation in hand. She stresses that it is not an "objective" competence, but that it is relative to each translator.

Furthermore, translators cannot avoid being bound to their own cultures, as this provides the basis for all comparison of cultural differences. But they should be aware and try to avoid projecting their work, their own culture's view of the source culture. "*They should convey* "*an image of the source culture to the target recipients that corresponds to the image the source culture would claim for itself.*"<sup>8</sup>

Also, Translation is inevitably domesticating since it is usually made to conform to the needs and values of the domestic culture and, therefore, famously advocates foreignizing strategies because they retain the foreignness of the original and encourage readers/viewers of translations to become more open to cultural differences."<sup>9</sup>

## Form (Old Focus) vs. Message (New Focus)

Each language has its own genius. Each language possesses certain distinctive characteristics which give it a special character, e.g., word-building capacities, unique patterns of phrase order, techniques for linking

 <sup>&</sup>lt;sup>7</sup> Witte, H. - Die Kulturkompetenz des Translators: begriffliche Grundlegung und Didaktisierung, *Volumul 9 din Studien zur Translation*, ISSN 0948-1494, Stauffenburg, 2000
 <sup>8</sup>Bassnett, Susan (2002), *Translation Studies*, London, Routledge, p.158-159.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>9</sup> http://www.jostrans.org/issue06/art\_ramiere.php

clauses into sentences, markers of discourse, and special discourse types of poetry, proverbs, and song. Each language is rich in vocabulary for the areas of cultural focus, the specialties of the people.<sup>10</sup>

The issue to be tackled is the dilemma if one should preserve the message with the risk of changing the form.

Since words cover areas of meaning and are not mere points of meaning, and since in different languages the semantic areas of correspondingwords are not identical, it is inevitable that the choice of the right word in the receptor language to translate a word in the sourcelanguage text depends more on the context than upon a fixed system of verbal consistency.

If all languages differ in form (and this is the essence of their being different languages), then quite naturally the forms must be altered if one is to preserve the content. The extent to which the forms must be changed in order to preserve the meaning will depend on upon the linguistic and cultural distance between languages. "European family of languages, the cultural contexts, including many differences of world view, are so diverse that the formal structure patterns, both grammatical and lexical, must be altered more extensively in order to preserve the content."<sup>11</sup>

It goes without saying that translating must aim primarily at reproducing the message. To do anything else is essentially wrong for a translator to do. The older attitude in translating was focused on the form of the message, and translators took particular delight in being able to reproduce stylistic specialities, e.g., rhythms, rhymes, plays on words, chiasmus, parallelism, and unusual grammatical structures. The new focus, however, has shifted from the form of the message to the response of the receptor.,,Even the old question: "Is this a correct translation?" must be answered in terms of another question, namely: "For whom?""<sup>12</sup>

Viewers themselves are in an intercultural position. As observed by Turner in Film as Social Practice,"[t]here is a high degree of crosscultural coding where audiences agree to accept an imported system of meaning for the purposes of enjoying the film".<sup>13</sup>

Language and culture are deeply intertwined, and translators obviously do not translate individual words deprived of context, but

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>10</sup>Nida, A. Eugene, Taber, R. Charles. (2003).*The Theory and Practice of Translation*, Brill, Boston, p.3-4.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>11</sup>idem, p.6.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>12</sup>Nida, A. Eugene, Taber, R. Charles. (2003). *The Theory and Practice of Translation*, Boston, Brill, p.1.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>13</sup> Turner, G. (1993). *Film as Social Practice*, 2nd ed., Routledge, London and New York, p.79.

whole texts which are culturally embedded. Since it brings cultures into contact with one another, translation for the cinema in particular, and the audiovisual world, in general, raises considerable cross-cultural issues.

Context must be understood very broadly and should include:

- Poly-semiotic context (images, sounds, nonverbal signs, camera shots, etc.);
- Technical constraints at that particular moment in the film (e.g. close-up shot causing difficulty in the case of dubbing, long and fast-paced lines of dialogue for subtitling, etc.);
- The genre of the film;
- The target audience;
- General cultural context (the extent in which cultural references are shared between source and target culture);<sup>14</sup>

With this in mind, as previously discussed, translators are given the final decision. It is their choice to choose what the most relevant method of rendering the content having in mind certain contextual factors.

#### **Methods of Cultural Rendition**

"The central issue is whether one should translate "literally" or "freely". The dichotomy between 'literal' and 'free' translation moves at different levels [...] It also includes the rendition of cultural features and the understanding of the concept "equivalence".

"There is a legion of ways in which one may approach a translation assignment. The main problem with using the word approach or strategy is that any word – or rather apposition of words – will conjure up ideas of rigid guidelines in most people's minds, including those who utter the phrases. This leads to much confusion, notably, experts start discussing ways in which one should translate texts. In what follows, some of these points – especially those that still haunt Translation Studies – will be discussed in terms of the central issue 'free' vs 'literal' translation."<sup>15</sup>

"The source author creates special effects by floating maxims considered binding in his or her culture, or perhaps by manipulating other constraints; the translator seeks not to create his or her own special effects but to reproduce the author's special effects for an audience in a different culture."<sup>16</sup>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>14</sup>Nathalie Ramière - *Reaching a Foreign Audience: Cultural Transfers in Audiovisual Translation.*, University of Queensland, Australia,17.04.2016, http://www.jostrans.org/ issue06/art\_ramiere.php

 <sup>&</sup>lt;sup>15</sup>Dollerup, Cay. (2006). *Basics of Translation Studies*, EdituraInstitutul European Iasi. p.101
 <sup>16</sup>Robinson, Douglas, (2003). *Performative Linguistics: Speaking and Translating as Doing Things with Words*, London, Routledge, p.137

"The ideas of the omnipotent translator, the perfect translation, and the supremacy of the source text are incompatible. Attention is then turned towards the concept of equivalence, notably the distinctions made by Eugene Nida and Peter Newmark between differences in the orientation of this 'equivalence.""<sup>17</sup>

<u>Nida</u> introduced a distinction in the thinking about 'equivalence', a concept that roughly refers to 'the sameness of the source and target text:'

- Thus, formal equivalence is achieved when the prime concerns to convey the source text as accurately as possible into the target language. This would be a literal translation, which informs target audiences about the nature andstructure of the source text, and also conveys cultural features to the target language.
- In the case of dynamic equivalence, the relationship between translation and target language recipients should correspond, roughly, to the relationship between the source text and the source language recipients. This allows translators to ensure that the translation sounds fluent and is also culturally adapted to the recipient(s).

These concepts were later modified by Peter Newman who distinguishes between:

- semantic translation, which essentially remains within the Source culture and conveys its values to the TL audience, only allowing for explanation in rare cases, and
- communicative translation, which is focused on the target audience, transfers cultural features to the target culture, and may even be considered 'better' than the original.<sup>18</sup>

But the concept is not clear and cannot easily be applied to translation today, so the term approximation is preferred."<sup>19</sup>

"Once we accept that there is no such thing as an 'ideal' translator and a 'perfect' translation, we can approach many problems in translation by positing that, when we discuss 'real' translations, we are actually discussing tangible approximations of these elusive ideas"<sup>20</sup>

"These approximations to the 'ideal' can then, in terms of their relationship not only to the source texts but also to the parameters that have determined their specific nature be assessed in terms of their adequacy. A translation is adequate when it conveys the meaning of the source text to the target language in a given situation.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>17</sup>Dollerup, Cay. (2006). *Basics of Translation Studies*, EdituraInstitutul European Iasi, p.53 <sup>18</sup>Idem, p.62.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>19</sup>Idem, p.53.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>20</sup>Dollerup, Cay. (2006). *Basics of Translation Studies*, Editura Institutul European Iasi, p.64.

It is only the users, clients, senders, recipients, the parties communicating, that can determine whether this criterion is met or not.[...] But then again. The users, clients, etc., in any chain of translational communication, may, over time, come to the conclusion that a given translator is (or has become) inadequate. So, they are entitled to call for a retranslation, a new translation, which is, in their eyes, a more adequate representation of the source text<sup>321</sup>

It is then pointed out that the supremacy of the original affects the concept of 'equivalence', which is discarded in favor of more realistic concepts, such as approximation and adequacy. It is a view that pays respect to the independent existence of the source and target texts in translation.<sup>22</sup>

As Susan Bassnet once said:

When you work with more than one language, you can say and do things differently in different languages. You learn that there are things that for example you can't talk about or they come more easily in one language or in another. I wanted to portray the changeness of language and cultural perspective like a book. If I read now a book I read when I was 15, I would most probably see it differently because things evolve, changed meanwhile. The same with language, you get new information, a bit of this, of that... you grow, you learn, you bring something to your community"<sup>23</sup>

A cultural rendition asks for a much more widespread knowledge than the text actually provides.,, Hatim and Mason once again assume that the translator is going to want to strive for some sort of equivalent effect in the target language, which means adjusting for different politeness codes in the target culture."<sup>24</sup>

A good translator will:

- Bring creative energy and imagination to the work, without losing the author's style, message or unique flavour.
- Think carefully about substitutions or changes.
- Take careful consideration of humour, puns, jokes and literary allusions, names of places and characters, as well as cultural references and ideology.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>21</sup>Idem, p.64

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>22</sup>Idem, p.65.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>23</sup> Bassnett, Susan.(2002). *Translation Studies*, Routledge,London, p.9

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>24</sup> Robinson, Douglas. (2003). *Performative Linguistics: Speaking and Translating as Doing Things with Words*, Routledge, London, p.156.

- Correctly translate idiomatic expressions, which lend colour and flavour.
- Consider and represent the author's culture, without turning it into a cultural treatise.
- Carefully recreate the nuances of the original language.<sup>25</sup>

"A useful way of thinking about translation and language is that translators don't translate words; they translate what people do with words."<sup>26</sup> The cultural implications for translation may take several forms ranging from lexical content and syntax to ideologies and ways of life in a given culture.

### References

- Arson, P. (1988) The Aim and Function of the Subtitle What It Does and Does Not Do, MA thesis. Université de Rouen.
- Bassnett, Susan, (2002) Translation Studies, London, Routledge Publishing House
- Catford, J. C. (1965) A Linguistic Theory of Translation. London, Oxford University Press
- Dollerup, Cay. (2006) Basics of Translation Studies, Editura Institutul European Iasi
- Gill, Paul. (2009). *Translation in practice: a symposium edited by Dalkey,* Archive Press, First Edition.
- Turner, G. (2012) Film as Social Practice, 4<sup>th</sup>.Edition, Routledge Publishing House
- Ramière Nathalie *Reaching a Foreign Audience: Cultural Transfers in Audiovisual Translation.*, University of Queensland, Australia, 17.04.2016, http://www.jostrans.org/issue06/art ramiere.php
- Robinson, Douglas, (2003). *Performative Linguistics: Speaking and Translating as Doing Things with Words*, London, Routledge.
- Nida, A. Eugene, Taber, R. Charles, (2003) -The Theory and Practice of Translation, Boston, Brill.
- Witte, H. (2000) Die Kulturkompetenz des Translators: begriffliche Grundlegung und Didaktisierung, Volumul 9 din Studien zur Translation, ISSN 0948-1494, Stauffenburg
- http://www.jostrans.org/issue06/art\_ramiere.php

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>25</sup> Gill, Paul. (2009). *Translation in practice: a symposium edited by Dalkey*, Archive Press, First Edition, pp. 67,68.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>26</sup> Robinson, Douglas. (2003). *Becoming a Translator: An Introduction to the Theory and Practice of Translation*, Routledge, London, p.140.

# *That*-omission – the View from Manner of Speaking Verbs

**Irina Stoica** University of Bucharest

**Abstract**: Manner of speaking verbs refer "to intended acts of communication by speech and describing physical characteristics of the speech act." (Zwicky, 1971). The list includes verbs such as babble, bark, chirp, cluck, groan, shout, scream, yell, whisper, shriek, wail, lisp, hoot, growl, grunt, mumble, moan, howl, mutter, whine. Zwicky (1971) identified twenty distinct properties of this class of verbs which, he claims, "are systematically associated" with their semantic representation.

Key words: omission, verbs, class, complementizer

In the present paper we focus on one property of these verbs which is not mentioned in Zwicky's (1971) study. Manner of speaking verbs do not generally allow the omission of the complementizer of their clausal complement (Dor, 2005). In this respect, they differ from verbs of communication, such as *tell*, with which *that*-omission is possible:

a. John muttered \*(that) he would not wait.b. John told the lady (that) he would not wait.

One central question which we address is to what extent the behaviour of manner of speaking verbs with respect to complementizer omission can be accounted for in terms of their semantics, as suggested by Zwicky (1971) for the properties which he discussed in his paper.

The remainder of the paper is organized as follows: Section 2 provides a brief introduction to the class of manner of speaking verbs. The description builds on those syntactic and semantic properties of the class which are directly relevant to our own study. Section 3 focuses on one particular property, namely the impossibility of these verbs to allow the omission of the complementizer *that* in their clausal complement. A brief section 4 summarizes the main findings and draws the conclusions.

### 1. On manner of speaking verbs

Zwicky (1971) identifies a number of twenty properties of manner of speaking verbs. Out of these, the following will be directly relevant to our own study. The verbs in this class can be used both communicatively and non-communicatively, i.e. they do not always denote 'intended acts of communication' (p. 225). For example, unlike other verbs of communication, they can appear with no direct or indirect object, in which case the focus is on the physical properties of the sound:

(2) a. The man mumbled.b. The child whined.

Similarly, when they appear with a direct quotation object (as in 3) or with a cognate object (as in 4), they are used non-communicatively; in this case, the focus is, again, on the physical properties of the sound:

- (3) The captain howled "Retreat!" (example taken from Zwicky 1971)
- (4) The girl whispered a soft whisper.

Moreover, some of the properties are sensitive to whether the verb is used communicatively or not. For example, passivization is possible only when they are not used communicatively (Zwicky 1971: 232):

- (5) a. "Help" was yelled at us by the victim.
  - b. \*"Glop" was mumbled to us by an onlooker. (examples from Zwicky, 1971)

Manner of speaking verbs can take clausal complements, among which *that* complement clauses, which are construed non-factively. The sentence in (6) can only be interpreted as indicating lack of commitment on the part of the speaker with respect to the truth of the proposition denoted by the clausal complement.

(6) The simian usher grunted that all the seats were taken. (example taken from Zwicky 1971)

All manner of speaking verbs have a homophonous nominal, which denotes the speech act. These deverbal nominals can be used as cognate objects and they can appear in *give a* \_ constructions:

- (7) a. The little boy shrieked. /The little boy's shriek petrified her.
  - b. The referee shrieked a shriek.
  - c. The captain gave a shriek. (examples taken from Zwicky, 1971)

In this respect, they differ from other verbs of communication, whose corresponding deverbal nominal is not always homophonous with the verb (e.g. *speak-speech, declare-declaration*).

One further property which is not mentioned in Zwicky's paper but which is directly relevant to our own study is that manner of speaking verbs are non-bridge verbs: they do not allow extraction from their sentential complement (Stowell 1981) (8). In this respect again they differ from other verbs of communication, which allow extraction from their complement (9):

- (8) a. \*Who did you shout [s'[e]<sub>i</sub> [s [e]<sub>i</sub> saw John?]] (example from Stowell, 1981)
  - b. \*Whom did John grunt that Mary likes t? (example from Snyder 1992)
  - c. \*How did he whisper that I behaved \_?
- a. Who did you say[s<sup>·</sup> [e]<sub>i</sub> [s [e]<sub>i</sub> saw John?]] (example taken from Stowell 1981)
  - b. Whom did John say that Mary likes t? (example taken from Snyder 1992)
  - c. How did he say that I behaved \_?

This property has been related in the literature to that of allowing a null complementizer. Verbs which are bridge verbs, i.e. those which allow extraction from their complement, also allow the omission of the complementizer<sup>1</sup> (Erteschik-Shir, 1973). This generalization predicts that manner of speaking verbs will disallow a null complementizer, which is indeed the case, as shown in (1).

Summing up, the few properties illustrated above reveal that MoS verbs can be used both communicatively and non-communicatively. When they are used non-communicatively, the focus is on the physical noise produced by the speech act. When they take a *that* complement clause as their object the embedded clause is interpreted as non-factive. They are non-bridge verbs, a property which can be correlated with the impossibility of taking a complement clause with a null complementizer. One would certainly like to understand the possible relationship between these two properties.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> But see Snyder (1992) who provides evidence that there are bridge verbs which do not allow a null complementizer. This is, according to him, the case of degree-of-desire verbs.

#### 3. On *that*-omission

#### 3.1 The data

As already mentioned in the previous sections, manner of speaking verbs generally disallow the omission of the complementizer of their clausal complements (Hegarty 1992, Dor 2005). For convenience, this property is illustrated again in (10) below:

(10) a. He yelled \*(that) he was scared.b. He shouted \*(that) he left.

This is a property which they share with factive verbs (11a) (Hegarty 1992) or with verbs of instrument of communication (11b) (Dor 2005), but not with other verbs of communication (12):

- (11) a. He remembered \*(that) he was invited to the party.b. They e-mailed Sara \*(that) they would arrive late.
- (12) He told his sister (that) he would be home on her birthday.

In the literature, the phenomenon of *that*-omission has been accounted for both in semantic and in syntactic terms. The present paper presents some of the semantic proposals meant to explain this phenomenon with respect to manner of speaking verbs. We argue however that an account which builds (only) on semantic factors might not be satisfactory.

### 3.2. Semantic accounts

### 3.2.1 That-omission and factivity

A semantic account for the impossibility of MoS verbs to allow the omission of the complementizer *that* comes from Hegarty (1992). According to this approach, *that*-omission is related to factivity. Hegarty claims that factive predicates, such as *regret, forget, realize, notice*, ban *that*-omission:

- (13) a. They accepted \*(that) the analysis was correct.
  - b. The president pointed out \*(that) he could not nominate such a prime-minister.
  - c. She discovered \*(that) she had made a mistake. (examples taken from Hegarty, 1992)

On the other hand, non-factive predicates (*say, believe, think*, etc.) allow the omission of the complementizer.

(14) I think/believe/suppose (that) the bastards will win the game.

Hegarty (1992) argues that these distinctions arise from the fact that the two types of verbs have distinct internal event structures. Hegarty starts from the assumption that it is only in the case of main clauses that Inflection binds the e-variable, thus "discarding the event position in the theta-grid." On the other hand, in the case of subordinate clauses, Tense in the subordinate clause does not bind the e-variable, so it has to percolate to the CP and even higher, to Inflection in the main clause. This phenomenon occurs due to the fact that the complement is s-selected by  $V^0$ , so the semantic properties of the complement are established at this particular level.

Given that the complements of factive verbs are considered to be more "independent" (in the sense that their truth value does not depend on the truth value of the matrix), Hegarty (1992) argues that, in this case, the evariable is actualized independently of the main clause. More specifically, while the e-variable in the case of non-factive verbs is bound by Tense in the matrix, in the case of factive verbs the variable is bound within the CP, by  $C^0$ , as in the structure in (15) below (taken from Cornilescu, 2003). The fact that the variable is bound by  $C^0$  guarantees that an event did in fact occur, the speaker expressing their attitude in this respect.

(15) forget [
$$_{CP}$$
  $\Leftrightarrow$  that [ $_{IP < e>}$  Max [ $_{I' < e>}$  I [VP  $_{}$  visit London.]]]]

On the other hand, in the case of non-factive verbs, the complement clause depends on the main clause event, thus "the e-position of a propositional complement is discharged in semantic composition with the verb that selects the complement", as in (16) below. Here, the complement is interpreted simply as a proposition, with no definite truth value.

(16) believe [CP <e> that [IP <e> Nax [I' [VP <e> visit London]]]] |------|

According to Hegarty (1992), this distinction also accounts for some of the different syntactic properties factive and non-factive verbs have.

For example, the fact that the complementizer plays a semantic role, that of a binder, only in the case of clausal complements of factive verbs could explain why it can never be omitted.

This account, however, is challenged by the behaviour of MoS verbs, which ban *that*-omission in spite of the fact that their clausal complement is construed non-factively (Zwicky, 1971). It is also challenged by the fact that some factive verbs optionally allow a clausal object with a null complementizer:

(17) a. He forgot (that) it was her birthday. (example taken from Macmillan, 2002)

- b. He noticed (that) the light was on. (example taken from Hornby, 2000)
- c. He remembered (that) it was her birthday. (example taken from Macmillan, 2002)

Such data show that semantically unrelated verbs may have similar syntactic properties.

MoS verbs may then belong to the [*-that* omission] class for reasons different from those for which the other verbs belong here.

### 3.2.3. *That*-omission and truth claim

Another (similar) account of *that*-omission based on the semantic properties of verbs comes from Dor (2005), who states that "*that*-deletion is possible under predicates which semantically entail that a cognitive agent (most often their subject) has made an epistemic claim concerning the truth of the proposition denoted by the embedded clause."

Dor (2005) further argues that the subordinate clauses introduced by *that* and those in which the complementizer is omitted represent, in fact, "two distinct semantic entities", the former denoting a proposition and the latter an asserted proposition. At the core of the account lies the idea that *that*-clauses and bare clauses have distinct semantic properties. The difference between the two lies in the fact that, while propositions simply describe a state of affairs, without having an associated truth value, asserted propositions imply a truth value.

Therefore, the author proposes the following classification of predicates:

a) **Type 1 predicates**: predicates which imply the fact that a cognitive agent has made an

epistemic assertion regarding the truth value of the subordinate clause – these predicates will always allow a null complementizer. The predicates belonging of this class denote assertive illocutionary acts (Dor, 2005). Their behaviour is illustrated in (25):

- (24) a. speech act predicates: admit, affirm, argue, claim, confess, demonstrate, disclose, hypothesize, indicate, say, suggest, tell
  - b. predicates of belief: agree, assume, be aware, believe, conclude, suppose, fancy, presume, know, guess, imagine, figure. think,
- (25) a. The accused confessed (that) he had robbed the old lady.b. The little girl imagined that there were monsters under her bed.

However, there are also examples of Type 1 predicates that are only marginally accepted when the complementizer is deleted:

- (26) a. John hypothesized that George made Bill steal for money.
  b. ??? John hypothesized George made Bill steal for money. (examples taken from Dor, 2005)
- b) **Type 2 predicates**: predicates that do not necessarily imply the idea of "truth value", but that allow their meaning to be pragmatically extended, so that the cognitive agent makes an assertion regarding the truth value – these predicates can allow the omission of the complementizer (as in (28) below):
- (27) a. manner-of-speaking predicates: babble, bark, chirp, shout, scream, yell, holler, moan, howl, mutter, whine.
  - b. predicates-of-instrument of communication: cable, e-mail, telecast, telegraph, wire
  - c. emotive predicates: be amazed/ surprised/ annoyed/ amused/ confused/ flabbergasted/ sorry/
- (28) a. John shrieked \*(that) Bill was an undercover agent.
  - b. George was annoyed \*(that) Bill behaved like a clown in that party. (examples taken from Dor, 2005)
- c) **Type 3 predicates**: predicates that do not involve the idea of "truth value" and whose meaning cannot be extended these predicates will always ban *that*-omission. The list includes predicates like those in (29), taken from Dor (2005)
- (29) a. world-to-word predicates: provide, arrange, scheme, plot, legislate, contrive, decide.
  - b. predicates of physical manipulation of text write down, read aloud, record, publish, translate, jot down
  - c. guarantee, warrant
  - d. predicates of occurrence: happen, occur, come about, develop.
- (30) a. Yesterday the Supreme Court decided \*(that) wiretaps must stop.
  - b. Look, you've translated \*(that) Dumas didn't pay debt.
  - c. Our company warrants \*(that) this product will outlast any other on the market. (examples taken from Dor, 2005)

As one can see, according to Dor (2005) MoS verbs belong to the second category, idea supported by the fact that, in the case of these verbs, the physical properties of the emitted sound are emphasized, rather than the communicational act itself. Therefore, the notion of truth claim regarding

the complement in the case of these predicates is not "semantically entailed" by the predicate.

Arguments in favour of this proposal come from the realm of negation as well: as can be seen in the examples below, negation does not limit "the set of possible truth claims", but rather gives information on how the proposition was uttered. Therefore, in (31) the only piece of information we have is that the speaker did not make that truth claim by shouting, but he may have whispered/sobbed/cried instead.

(31) John didn't shout that the little boy hurt him.

However, the meaning of MoS verbs can be extended via pragmatic ways which shift the focus towards the communicational intent. Dor (2005) claims that there are certain MoS verbs which are "pragmatically associated with the communication of certain expressive meanings". This is why sentences like those in (32) are strange:

(32) a. ?? John yelled that he was perfectly calm.b. ?? John whined that he was the happiest guy in the world. (examples taken from Dor, 2005)

Going back to the omission of the complementizer *that*, Dor (2005) also argues that, while omission is banned with most MoS verbs, in the case where the meaning is pragmatically associated with the communicational intent, rather than with the properties of the emitted sound, some speakers can accept the omission of *that*.

(33) a. John whined that Bill was an undercover agent.b. John whined Bill was an undercover agent.

While speakers still prefer such sentences with an overt complementizer, it might be the case that differences in the use of the MoS verb (communicational or non-communication) induce distinct syntactic behaviours.

## **3.3. Against a semantic account**

# 3.3.1. Against *that*-omission and factivity

As was seen above, some studies correlate the omission of the complementizer with factivity, claiming that while non-factive verbs allow *that*-omission, factives ban this phenomenon.

However, evidence from MoS verbs, whose complement is construed non-factively but that behave on a par with factive verbs syntactically, seems to challenge such an account. More recent studies (de Cuba & Ürögdi, 2010) propose other semantic accounts which discard of factivity as the underlying feature that distinguishes between the two types of verbs, emphasizing the role of referentiality.

Returning briefly to the factive-non-factive distinction, Kiparsky & Kiparsky (1971) argue that factive verbs contain the noun "fact", proposing the representations below:

- (34) The syntactic representation of factive verbs (Kiparsky & Kiparsky, 1971)
  NP
  2
  N
  S
  fact
- (35) The syntactic representation of non-factive verbs (Kiparsky & Kiparsky, 1971)

NP | S

There are, however, other studies which contradict this proposal. De Cuba (2007) states that it is non-factives, rather than factives, that project an additional cP layer, headed by a semantic operator [OP]. The role of the semantic operator is to remove the speaker or the subject from the responsibility regarding the truth claim of the proposition in the complement. Therefore, de Cuba (2007) proposes the following representations for factive and non-factive verbs.

(36) The syntactic representation of factive verbs (de Cuba, 2007)



(37) The syntactic representation of non-factive verbs (de Cuba, 2007)



As mentioned above, MoS verbs behave, syntactically, similarly to factive verbs, which leads de Cuba (2007) into postulating that they might have the same representation as in (21) above.

However, in a more recent study, de Cuba & Ürögdi (2010) argue that it is not necessarily the case that all non-factive verbs project an additional cP layer and that "factivity does not determine the difference between the two clause types".

Based on Hungarian data, de Cuba & Ürögdi (2010) argue that it is rather the referentiality of the complement that determines the type of complement a verb takes, be it factive or non-factive.

Therefore, they propose that CPs should be analyzed as "referential entities that denote a proposition without illocutionary force". Therefore, depending on the referentiality of the complement, both factive and non-factive verbs can take CPs as complements. On the other hand, a cP denotes "a non-referential semantic object denoting a speech act". Given that speech acts cannot be presupposed, only non-factive verbs are compatible with such complements.

Evidence in favour of this argument can be seen in the example below:

(38) a. John supposed [that Bill had done it] and Mary supposed [it/so] too.
b. John regretted [that Bill had done it] and Mary regretted [it/\*so] too. (examples taken from de Cuba & Ürögdi (2010)

In (38a), where the verb is non-factive, we notice that the sentential complement can be replaced either with *so* (typical of non-referential

arguments) or with *it* (typical of referential arguments). On the other hand, factive verbs only allow *it* replacement, which is in line with the fact that they can only take referential complements.

Applying this reasoning to MoS verbs, we notice that they only allow the *it* substitution:

(39) a. John whispered that Bill had done it and John whispered it too.b. \*John whispered that Bill had done it and John whispered so too.

The examples above show that, in the model proposed by de Cuba & Ürögdi (2010), MoS verbs would behave on a par with factive verbs, taking only a CP complement.

## 3.3.2 *That*-omission and lexical representation

Another available correlation targets the semantics of bridge and nonbridge verbs. Snyder (1992) suggests that bridge verbs, but not nonbridge ones, imply a propositional attitude of the subject towards the content of the clausal complement. According to him, a verb can take an argumental clausal complement only when it implies this propositional attitude. Given the fact that in this case the clause is selected by the verb, the omission of the complementizer is also allowed.

Snyder (1992) notices that there are three types of relations that can hold between a predicate and a CP. More specifically, the CP can function as an argument, as an adjunction or ,,it can be licensed through some association with another constituent of the predicate". He argues that the ability of a verb to allow extraction strictly depends on the type of relation it imposes on the complement. Therefore, a bridge verb will take a CP as its argument, whereas in the case of non-bridge verbs, the CP is ,,related by apposition to another constituent in the predicate".

Snyder (1992) argues for this approach, stating that MoS verbs actually take an NP direct object, which further imposes the relation of apposition on the CP. In Snyder's opinion, the syntactic structure of a MoS verb such as "grunt" includes a phonologically null "light verb", which takes the NP as its complement, as illustrated below:

 $(40) \qquad [_{V} (make))] [_{NP} (a) [_{NP} grunt]]$ 

In the case of non-bridge verbs, including manner of speaking verbs, the CP merely expresses the "informational content of the NP, independent of anyone's propositional attitude towards this content".

The *bridge-non-bridge* distinction seems to be able to also explain why, in English, only some verbs allow a null complementizer.

Traces and other empty categories must be licensed, they must be "identified" via head movement by the lexical head. Snyder argues that, in order for a verb to allow the complementizer of their clausal complement to be null, it has to identify the CP ("or the chain headed by the CP if the CP has been extraposed") as its argument. Therefore, given that bridge verbs select the CPs as their arguments, they will allow a null complementizer. On the other hand, non-bridge verbs (including MoS verbs), select an NP as their complement and the identification requirement is not met, banning the omission of the complementizer.

(41) He whispered \*(that) he loved her.

#### 4. Concluding remarks

In the sections above we have seen that a strictly semantic account for the impossibility of *that*-omission in the case of MoS might not be satisfactory.

First of all, we saw that the correlation with factivity only seems to argue against a strictly semantic approach. While the complements of manner of speaking verbs are construed non-factively, they seem to behave on a par with factives from a syntactic point of view. Therefore, it is clear that semantically unrelated verbs may have similar syntactic properties.

Second of all, we have also seen that MoS verbs behave both communicatively and non-communicatively, with some properties emerging in one situation but not in the other. It is therefore plausible to assume that whether a MoS verb allows/disallows the omission of the complementizer of its clausal object might also depend on whether it is used communicatively or not.

On the other hand, other proposals argue that the omission of the complementizer could be correlated with other syntactic phenomena, such as extraction from the complement. Therefore, while we cannot discard the possibility of an account in both syntactic and semantic terms, we argue that strictly semantic accounts might not be sufficient to explain the phenomenon of complementizer omission in the case of manner of speaking verbs.

### References

Cornilescu, A. 2003 Complementation in English. A Minimalist Approach. București: Editura Universității din București.

De Cuba, C. F 2007, Negative polarity licensing, factivity and the CP field. ASJU, XLI-2, 11-24.

- De Cuba, C.F & Ürögdi, B. 2010 Clearing Up the "Fact" on Complementation, University of Pennsylvania Working Papers in Linguistics 16 (1): 40-50.
- DOR, D. 2005. Toward a semantic account of that-deletion in English, *Linguistics* 43(2): 345-382.
- Erteshik-Shir, N. 1973 On the Nature of Island Constraints. PhD Dissertation, MIT. Hegarty, M. 1992, Adjunct extraction and chain configuration. Phd Dissertation, MIT,
- Cambridge, Mass.
- Hornby, A. S & Wehmeier, S. (eds.), Oxford Advanced Learners Dictionary, Oxford
- University Press, Oxford, 2002.
- Kiparsky, P., C. Kiparsky 1971. Fact. In D. Steinberg, L. Jakobovits (eds.) Semantics.
- Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Macmillan English Dictionary for Advanced Learners, Macmillan Education, Oxford, 2002.
- Snyder, W. 1992, Wh-extraction and the lexical representation of verbs. Ms MIT, 6 May 1992.
- Stowell, T. 1981 'Complementizers and the Empty Category Principle'. In V.Burke and J.
- Pustejovsky (eds.) Proceedings of the Eleventh Annual Meeting of the North Eastern
- Linguistic Society, 345-363, Amherst, Mass.: GLSA.
- Zwicky, A.M. 1971. In a Manner of speaking, Linguistic Inquiry 2 (2): 223-232.

## **On Lexical Blends**

#### **Anca Tomoioagă** Emanuel University, Oradea

**Abstract**: Although considered a marginal lexical phenomenon, there has been written a considerable number of studies on lexical blends. In the late years, researchers have noticed an increasing occurrence of these lexical constructions not as much in the literary field, but mostly as a stylistic device in various domains such as marketing, entertainment, media, and advertising. As their presence has been noticed even since the 15<sup>th</sup> Century, they gained an increasing usage during the 19<sup>th</sup> Century when the lexical blend was coined by Carroll Lewis in his "*Alice's* Adventures in Wonderland" through one of his character's expression: portmanteau. Later on, the English language has enriched itself by means of these novel lexical formations which make use of the specific English linguistic disposal to playfulness and creativity.

Key words: lexical, constructions, linguistic, blends

The linguistic flexibility, less present in some of the other languages, has explored the English language potential and easily offered creative terms for recent apparitions such as Internet devices, for instance (see the word *wikipedia* which comes from the words *WikiWikiWeb*, www, and *encyclopaedia*).

Lexical blends, portmanteau words or telescoped words have constituted the object of different studies. Researchers have approached the lexical blends from different perspectives: the mechanisms of their construction, the subtypes and their variety, their computational schemas/ models, their functionality and their gratuitousness, the phonological, morphological and semantic aspects. In a study from 1996, Fauconnier and Turner (2003: 57-86) took further the problematic and opened the discussion about conceptual blending.

The present study is focused on lexical blends as actual linguistic constructions which express not only human creativity and spontaneity, but also the contemporary human need for extending the limits of language as much as to make it able to express the inexpressible. The two parts that compose the study are intended to present, firstly, the researchers' main observations regarding the ways blends are constructed, and secondly, the contextual arguments that could possibly explain lexical blends as necessary lexical structures in nowadays culture. English language has flourished when it comes to lexical blending, that is why most of the present study remarks will refer to English lexical blends.

Most of the studies on lexical blending have been written quite recently in a trial not only to search for an appropriate definition of lexical blends, but also to identify the subtypes of blends and the mechanisms the human mind works with in creating such words. Generally speaking, a lexical blend may be defined as "the result of telescoping of two or more separate forms into one, or, rarely, a superposition of one form upon another."(Cannon 1986: 730) A telescoped word results from combining parts of two or three words into one single word: *jazzercise (jazz +* exercise), brunch (breakfast + lunch), televangelist (television+ evangelist), charactoons (character + cartoons), foodataiment (entertainment + food), and rockumentary (rock+ documentary). These combinations are produced through overlapping or substitution. Stephan Gries's (2004: 639) definition focuses on these modalities: "It can be roughly defined as the intentional coinage of a new word by fusing parts of at least two source words of which either one is shortened in the fusion and/or where there is some form of phonemic or graphemic overlap of the source words." The two lexemes the blend comes from are considered source words and the parts of the source words that form the lexical blend are to be called splinters. Adrienne Lehrer (2007: 120) has identified words that have more than two splinters such as: intelevisionary made of intel- televisionvisionary. Moreover, splinters make the difference between the compound and the lexical blend, as the first is composed by full words, while the latter is made of parts from the source words. Peter O'Connolly (2013: 3) accentuates this difference, emphasising the spontaneous and creative aspect of blends: "However, where compounding is often a regular, productive process, as noted in the previous paragraph, blending tends to be irregular and unpredictable. Examples such as brunch (<motor+hotel) (*<breakfast+lunch*), motel and breathalyser (<breath+analyser) are well-established in the English lexicon."

Most of the researchers have been preoccupied of how speakers spontaneously select the two or maximum three splinters in order to create new words and, also, of which part of the base words enter the lexical blend and how this happens successfully. According to the rules that create the portmanteau word, several classifications of the lexical blends subtypes had been made. One of the most cited studies is John Algeo's (1977:47-64) *Blends, a structural and systemic view* where the author distinguishes between blends with phonemic overlap, blends with clipping and blends with both clipping and overlapping. This classification that verifies the external modalities of construction is doubled by a second one that regards the syntagmatic blends and the associative blends. The two classifications John Algeo's uses in his description establish the two perspectives lexical blends as linguistic phenomenon have been studied from.

Firstly, researchers have studied the lexical blending from outside, as an engineering device, trying to describe the mechanisms that work inside such spontaneous method of using language. Therefore, blends subdivide into intercalative blends, overlap blends and substitution blends, as Suzanne Kemmer (2003: 69-98) clearly delimitates them.

The intercalative blends imply the insertion of one splinter inside the other splinter on the basis of phonemic similarity, as Adrienne Lehrer (2007: 118) asserts, "involve a discontinuous element" like in *swifting* (shifting and switching) where the splinter *wi* is intercalated in the interrupted splinter *s...fting*.

The second type, the overlap blends share the same phonemic sequence like in *slanguage*, where the *lang* part is common to both source words: slang and language. In addition, Adrienne Lehrer (2007: 118) identifies several overlap blends where overlapping may produce not only totally, but also partially, and even discontinuously.

Also, the third type refer to the substitution blends as lexical blends made of a whole source word that substitutes a part of another source lexeme, like in *carjacking*, where the lexeme *car* substitutes the *hi* part from the second source word *hijacking*.

Secondly, from a different point of view, John Algeo identifies two types of lexical blends *i.e.* syntagmatic blends and associative blends. The first type includes in its sphere the great majority of blends that imply two source lexemes that are interconnected and follow one after the other, like in: *alcoholidays* (alcohol + holidays). The associative blends depend mostly on how different notions interconnect in the speaker's mind. These intuitive associations are happening due to various aspects such as culture, history and linguistic competence. Unexpected associations might be quite relevant for various domains. Consequently, Stephan Th. Gries (2004: 649) stresses two categories of lexical blends too: the intentional and the accidental blends.

Therefore, while accidental blends more probably appeared because of lexical derailments, lexical contamination and other such situations, (which may preoccupy psycholinguistics), intentional blends reflect more about the background they have been constructed in.

Beyond the phonological correspondence between the two source lexemes of a blend, such constructions are mainly defined by a semantic correspondence as for a portmanteau word to be successful it is necessary for the notional spheres of each of the two source words to intercross in what Turner and Fauconnier (2003: 57-86) defined as semantical blended space. This is possible because blends are indeed formed from words which tend to be semantically similar. Though, at first, the associations are probably stirred by phonological similitudes, the successful semantic blending occurs due to a certain specificity that belongs to speaker's culture and necessity of expression.

Lexical blends have become abundant and enriched English language "in part due to the centuries-old tradition of unscrupulous borrowing from a number of languages". (Brdar-Szabó, 2008: 186). However, portmanteau words are more numerous today not only because of historical reasons that refer to the evolution of any language, but more because of the modern man's need to democratize the language, expanding its limits. Diversity, the intercultural dialogue, globalization, otherness might impose such semantic mingling for expressing efficaciously and inclusively the today's world.

As long as different cultural and social domains interconnect, the words of a language meet in spontaneous or deliberate such constructions as lexical blends that refresh the language. Lexical blends as emoticon, wiktionary, Wikipedia, smog, brunch, advertorial are not only intentional, but also more than necessary to name a contemporary reality. Other words such as infanticipate (to expect a baby), slanguage (the slang language), motel do not just name a (new) reality, but result from nowadays interest in efficiency and rapid communication, rapid exchange of information. Similar to human multitasking, the word should embrace this vision, developing through a sort of horizontal evolution, being more and more profitable in communication. The word comprises, through blending, more than one evident meaning, usually transmitting the message of a simple phrase. Still, its semantic verticality seems to proportionally diminish; as the meaning becomes more and more concrete and well defined, the semantic depth diminishes, as words get too descriptive. The interest for the lexical effects at the surface of the word has intensely increased in the late years. Novel words are being created not only for the sake of necessity or efficiency, but also to shock, persuade or just for gratuitously play (e.g. eggocado). Speakers construct new words using the perceivable phonological material of the words just to create a certain quick reaction of surprise. In this respect, especially advertising makes use of these special properties of the lexical blends. More and more commercial products are named using blended words, just for making them noticeable: *likeapella*, *cheermageddon*, *frutasia*.

As Adrienne Lehrer (2007: 128) noticed, portmanteau words appear mostly in newspapers, magazine headings, advertisements. This is

due also to the social function these blends accomplish. Several constructions are interesting not only for their combining modality, but especially for the contemporary problems that they denote. Such words like *ipaddiction, foodentaiment* or *advertaiment* are neither cute, nor funny, but revelatory, because they describe nowadays people's preoccupations. The addiction for gadgets has become a serious problem even among adults. Words like *foodentaiment* or *advertaiment* describe two realities that root in the same aesthetisizing tendency of our world. Food and eating have become modalities of entertaining. Therefore, Food TV programs, the large number of food blogs, the plate decorating are not only meant to teach people how to cook and eat, but also to entertain and relax. This is a reality of the present and lexical blends succeed in denoting such unexpected realities.

There are also several lexical blends that make use of their creativity and playfulness mostly inside the jargons. Their colloquial dimension contributes to their social mission to humorously criticise diverse social aspects. Words such as *mansplaining* (man + explaining), *Chinglish* (English + Chinese), *renovated* (people who quickly divorced in Reno, Nevada), *alcoholiday* (alcohol + holiday – refers to a misspent weekend on alcohol). These words punish through their irony the human weaknesses, human bad habits and superficiality. Moreover, they could be considered quite relevant for gender studies, food studies and so on.

A large number of lexical blends represent nonce formations as they have been created on the spot in order to give a spontaneous name to a recently created reality. Some of the researchers understand the nonce formation as a "cover term for all genuinely new formations, whether perfectly regular outputs of productive rules *or* the result of creative, planned word manufacture." (Peter Hohenhaus, 2007: 18) Most of these words will not enter the lexicon because they depend too much on the context they belong to and their referential horizon is quite contracted. As Munat puts it, these words, as it is the case of some lexical blends, "find their *raison d'etre* exclusively in the text for which they have been created and will be stored in the mental lexicon only for the duration of the reading experience". (Munat, 2007: 166).

Such nonce lexical blends are to be found mostly inside the literary works for children, especially in the case of the characters' names because writers have tried to characterise and describe their personages even through their names. Special, playful and punning charactonyms create a delimited identity mainly for the fantastic characters. Miraculous, unique characters receive proper names, enough creative to maintain the fiction active, enough playful to attract attention, enough short to denote much through little. As Isabel Balteiro (2013: 883-907) asserts in her

study about charactonyms: "the creator may describe the character in very short, comprehensive and playful words, the audience is able to very easily interpret the message transmitted through the character".

One of the most creative and playfulness charactonyms may be noticed in a 2013 American 3D computer-animated comedy film named: *Cloudy with a Chance of Meatballs 2: (Revenge of the Leftovers/Pickles to Pittsburgh.* The most attractive characters of the film are the *foodimals i.e.* different forms of food that look like animals and behave as wellknown jungle animals. As they create a whole ecosystem and represent the specific fauna of a world made of food, these foodimals receive different names by means of lexical blending:

- cucumbird (cucumber + bird– substitution blend);
- buffaloaf (buffalo + loaf– overlap blend);
- flamango (flamingo + mango- overlap blend);
- subwhale (submarine + whale– substitution blend);
- apple pie-thon (pie + python substitution blend);
- shrimpanzee (shrimp + chimpanzee substitution blend);
- susheep (sushee + sheep– overlap blend);
- tacodile (taco + crocodile- substitution blend);
- meatbalrus (meatball + walrus- overlap blend);
- bananostrich (banana+ostrich substitution blend);
- eggplanatee (eggplant + manatee overlap blend);
- mosquitoast (mosquito + toast– overlap blend);
- hippotatomus (hippopotamus + potato intercallative blend);
- double bacon cheespider (cheese + spider– substitution blend);
- watermelophant (watermelon + elephant– overlap blend);

Such creative and ingenious choices for naming the fantastic characters are even more intensified by the design and physical characteristics of such imaginary and funny creatures. The word with its semantic load is doubled by the image of the characters. Name and image dovetail, mostly because: "the charactonym has to agree with these peculiarities and illustrations and, simultaneously, be expressive and descriptive but also readable or pronounceable, understandable and easy to remember for children" (Balteiro, 2013: 7)

The drawing intensifies the suggestions brought by the charactonyms and, therefore, for children the analogies between name and interestingly drawn personages are a real delight. In this particular case, the nonce formations does not lack any function. Peter Hohenhaus (2007:22) insisted that nonce lexical creations accomplish special communicative functions, apart from naming, such as hypostatisation if a lexeme "names

something that does *not* actually exist but is part of the illusion of a fictional context, thus further increasing the overall fictional illusion". More than hypostatisation, these lexical blends might "illustrate the way in which the manipulation of word forms serves the author's stylistic purpose." (Munat, 2007: 173). Literature has always made use of these lexical formations for world play, but also as stylistic device. The charactonyms of foodimals reveal that, in the children's minds, nonce lexical blends will always be functional, because they give lexically expressed identity to fantasy, making language playful as a child, beyond its boundaries.

Conclusively, the contemporary intense usage of lexical blends is not arbitrary, coincidental, on the contrary. Following some specific rules in their process of formation, overlap, intercalative and substitution blends reflect the way the society that produced them aim to communicate: efficiently, quickly and comprehensively. Despite the fact that, at a first sight, they are created on a phonological basis, most of them are semantically processed. That is why intentional lexical blends reveal more than just playfulness because they might be good descriptors for our pluralist society. Furthermore, the lexical blend may be one of the properties to ironize and to impress a rushed society. Even as nonce words, lexical blends are not dysfunctional, but serve as stylistic device to activate the potentialities of a language.

### References

- Algeo, John 1977. Blends, a structural and systemic view, in *American Speech* 52;
- Balteiro Isabel. 2013 'Blending in English Charactoons' in *English Studies* 94/8 (https://www.academia.edu/6917412/Blending\_in\_English\_Charactoo ns. Retrived at 25.02.2016)
- Cannon, Garland 1986. Blends in English word formation. Linguistics 24,
- Connolly, Patrick 2013. 'The Innovation and Adoption of English Lexical Blends' in *Journal LIPP*, No. 2, Munchen; (https://lipp.ub.lmu.de/index.php/lipp/.../68/57; Retrived on 01.03.2016);
- Fauconnier, Gilles and Turner, Mark 2003. 'Conceptual Blending, Form and Meaning' in *Recherches en communication:* Sémiotique Cognitive, n° 19;
- Gries, Stefan Th. 2004. 'Shouldn't it be *breakfunch*? A quantitative analysis of blend structure in English' in *Linguistics* 42.3
- Kemmer, Suzanne 2003. 'Schemas and Lexical Blends' in *Motivation in Language*, Hubert Cuyckens, Thomas Berg, Rene Dirven, Klaus-Uwe Panther, eds., Amsterdam;

- Lehrer J., Adrienne 2007. 'Blendalicious' in *Lexical Creativity, Texts and Contexts: The Morphology/Stylistic Interface*. Judith Munat, ed. John Benjamins Publishing Company, Amsterdam;
- Munat, Judith 2007. 'Lexical Creativity as a Marker of Style in Science Fiction and Children's Literature' in in Lexical Creativity, Texts and Contexts: The Morphology/Stylistic Interface. Judith Munat, ed., John Benjamins Publishing Company, Amsterdam;
- Peter Hohenhaus 2007 'How to Do (Even More) Things with Nonce Words (Other than Naming)' in Lexical Creativity, Texts and Contexts: The Morphology/Stylistic Interface. Judith Munat, ed., John Benjamins Publishing Company, Amsterdam;
- Brdar-Szabó, Rita Mario Brdar 2008. 'On the marginality of lexical blending' in Jezikoslovlje, IX, 1-2;